

# Webinar

## ULI Philadelphia: Approaches to Community Engagement

Date: January 12, 2021

00:00:00 --> 00:00:04: Good morning, welcome everyone to today's program for anyone I've

00:00:04 --> 00:00:04: not met.

00:00:04 --> 00:00:06: My name is Laura Slutsky.

00:00:06 --> 00:00:09: I'm executive director of UI Philadelphia and this is our

00:00:09 --> 00:00:13: first public program of 2021 organized by the ULI Philadelphia

00:00:13 --> 00:00:17: Community and Economic Development Local Product Council and after such

00:00:17 --> 00:00:19: a difficult week in our country,

00:00:19 --> 00:00:23: we're all really grateful to the Members who put this

00:00:23 --> 00:00:25: together to focus on something forward.

00:00:25 --> 00:00:28: Looking for our community. Personally.

00:00:28 --> 00:00:31: As a former practitioner and community development,

00:00:31 --> 00:00:33: this one is very. And you're in dear to me,

00:00:33 --> 00:00:36: so I'm really looking forward to the conversation and want

00:00:36 --> 00:00:38: to thank our panelists.

00:00:38 --> 00:00:42: An members specifically Carrie Long and Gina Lavery for organizing

00:00:42 --> 00:00:44: this very important conversation.

00:00:44 --> 00:00:47: Next, slide Kevin. So here's today's agenda.

00:00:47 --> 00:00:49: You can take a look and as as you do

00:00:49 --> 00:00:50: that before you get,

00:00:50 --> 00:00:52: we get started. I want to ask everyone.

00:00:52 --> 00:00:55: As you all know, we try to create a little

00:00:55 --> 00:00:57: bit of an environment over zoom,

00:00:57 --> 00:00:59: even though it's tricky. But if you could,

00:00:59 --> 00:01:02: please go ahead and introduce yourselves in the chat so

00:01:02 --> 00:01:04: that we can see who's here today.

00:01:04 --> 00:01:09: We would appreciate it. While I'm talking.

00:01:09 --> 00:01:11: So while you're looking at that,  
00:01:11 --> 00:01:13: I just want to remind everyone of a fuse in  
00:01:13 --> 00:01:14: reminders.  
00:01:14 --> 00:01:15: I think we're all aware now,  
00:01:15 --> 00:01:18: but we ask that attendees please keep your video and  
00:01:18 --> 00:01:21: audio off until later in the program just so that  
00:01:21 --> 00:01:24: our speakers are front and center throughout the  
presentation.  
00:01:24 --> 00:01:27: Please feel free to put any questions or comments that  
00:01:27 --> 00:01:29: you have in the chat will do our best to  
00:01:29 --> 00:01:31: work through as many as possible.  
00:01:31 --> 00:01:33: We are expecting a pretty large group today,  
00:01:33 --> 00:01:36: but will try to get to as much as we  
00:01:36 --> 00:01:38: can and we do have time for questions at the  
00:01:38 --> 00:01:39: end of every section.  
00:01:39 --> 00:01:41: So now before we get started,  
00:01:41 --> 00:01:44: I want to take a moment to thank our annual  
00:01:44 --> 00:01:47: ULI Philadelphia sponsors for their support and an this year  
00:01:47 --> 00:01:50: more than ever we truly could not do what we  
00:01:50 --> 00:01:53: can deliver in content and our mission without them.  
00:01:53 --> 00:01:56: So thank you to our urban visionary leadership circle and  
00:01:56 --> 00:01:57: platinum sponsors.  
00:02:00 --> 00:02:03: To our goal, gold and silver an friend sponsors and  
00:02:03 --> 00:02:05: like I said without your support.  
00:02:05 --> 00:02:08: Thank you to those who are on this call today  
00:02:08 --> 00:02:10: we could not do our work.  
00:02:10 --> 00:02:13: So Speaking of that, if we have some new friends  
00:02:13 --> 00:02:15: and colleagues here who are not familiar with you,  
00:02:15 --> 00:02:18: well, I welcome. Thank you for being here.  
00:02:18 --> 00:02:21: Everything that we do in our organization is about promoting  
00:02:21 --> 00:02:22: our mission,  
00:02:22 --> 00:02:25: which you can see on the screen of providing responsive,  
00:02:25 --> 00:02:29: providing leadership and the responsible use of land and  
creating  
00:02:29 --> 00:02:30: sustaining,  
00:02:30 --> 00:02:33: thriving communities worldwide. And this year in particular,  
00:02:33 --> 00:02:36: we've been focused on looking at this core mission and  
00:02:36 --> 00:02:39: everything that we do to bring value to our community  
00:02:39 --> 00:02:42: and to our members here in Philadelphia.  
00:02:42 --> 00:02:46: So we're a global membership organization that's  
interdisciplinary.  
00:02:46 --> 00:02:49: We have folks from all aspects of land use,  
00:02:49 --> 00:02:53: planning and development. There's over 45 thousand

00:02:53 --> 00:02:55: members worldwide,  
 00:02:55 --> 00:02:58: and here you'll I, Philadelphia,  
 00:02:58 --> 00:03:01: we have a tristate area footprint that you can see  
 00:03:01 --> 00:03:04: on the screen with around 900 members.  
 00:03:04 --> 00:03:08: Everything that we do is also driven by our Members  
 00:03:08 --> 00:03:08: who are volunteering time to contribute content and lead this  
 00:03:08 --> 00:03:11: work.  
 00:03:11 --> 00:03:12: We have 18 councils and committees that do all kinds  
 00:03:12 --> 00:03:14: of things.  
 00:03:14 --> 00:03:17: I won't get into them now,  
 00:03:17 --> 00:03:19: but everything is about sharing educational experiences,  
 00:03:19 --> 00:03:22: making connections, sharing best practices,  
 00:03:22 --> 00:03:24: and thinking about how we could have A and forward  
 00:03:24 --> 00:03:27: thinking impact on our community.  
 00:03:27 --> 00:03:31: We will run a wide variety of programming like this.  
 00:03:31 --> 00:03:33: Also some more hands-on advisory services and other  
 00:03:33 --> 00:03:36: volunteer work.  
 00:03:36 --> 00:03:38: So if you're not already familiar,  
 00:03:38 --> 00:03:40: we always welcome guests to everything.  
 00:03:40 --> 00:03:43: And we love to meet you and have find out  
 00:03:43 --> 00:03:44: how you can get more involved.  
 00:03:44 --> 00:03:45: I'm going to just give you some quick highlights right  
 00:03:45 --> 00:03:47: now.  
 00:03:47 --> 00:03:50: And then we will get started.  
 00:03:50 --> 00:03:52: I promise go ahead. Next slide,  
 00:03:52 --> 00:03:56: Kevin. I think there there we go.  
 00:03:56 --> 00:03:57: So a few things of this past year which has  
 00:03:57 --> 00:04:00: just been difficult for so many people but also really  
 00:04:00 --> 00:04:00: important.  
 00:04:00 --> 00:04:03: Like I said to think about the core work that  
 00:04:03 --> 00:04:04: we do.  
 00:04:04 --> 00:04:07: So we delivered all of our programming on line in  
 00:04:07 --> 00:04:08: November.  
 00:04:08 --> 00:04:11: You can see there an excerpt of our annual real  
 00:04:11 --> 00:04:14: estate forecast.  
 00:04:14 --> 00:04:17: It was of course entirely virtual and for the first  
 00:04:17 --> 00:04:21: time we had an all day agenda.  
 00:04:21 --> 00:04:23: With four unique discussions, breakout conversations,  
 00:04:23 --> 00:04:26: and this year, we really attacked some important  
 00:04:26 --> 00:04:28: conversations about  
 00:04:28 --> 00:04:31: equity and development,  
 00:04:31 --> 00:04:34: racial injustice, and a number of other areas.

00:04:26 --> 00:04:29: We had 18 presenters and I'm really proud of our  
00:04:29 --> 00:04:33: team for making it happen and convening people during this  
00:04:33 --> 00:04:35: really important time.  
00:04:35 --> 00:04:37: We also ran to technical assistance panels,  
00:04:37 --> 00:04:41: which are programs where you align members can volunteer  
to  
00:04:41 --> 00:04:44: give advice and feedback to the public sector.  
00:04:44 --> 00:04:47: So here the photo you see here is a project  
00:04:47 --> 00:04:49: that we did with PID C on the Bartram's,  
00:04:49 --> 00:04:52: North and South. Sites around life Sciences,  
00:04:52 --> 00:04:56: manufacturing and responsible investment. We also did a  
project for  
00:04:56 --> 00:04:58: West Whiteland Township,  
00:04:58 --> 00:05:01: looking at and development in that report is coming out  
00:05:01 --> 00:05:02: very soon,  
00:05:02 --> 00:05:06: so thank you to any Members here who participated in  
00:05:06 --> 00:05:06: those.  
00:05:06 --> 00:05:10: And then finally, and I think relevant to this discussion,  
00:05:10 --> 00:05:13: we have an upcoming project with the City of Philadelphia's  
00:05:13 --> 00:05:18: Housing Development Organization or round naturally  
occurring affordable housing in  
00:05:18 --> 00:05:18: the city.  
00:05:18 --> 00:05:21: So look forward to that and then the photo.  
00:05:21 --> 00:05:24: The Legos that you see there for anyone who's not  
00:05:24 --> 00:05:26: familiar with our urban plan program,  
00:05:26 --> 00:05:29: this is a real estate training simulation course that can  
00:05:29 --> 00:05:31: be delivered to a range of participants.  
00:05:31 --> 00:05:34: Also run by ULI member volunteers and we will be  
00:05:34 --> 00:05:37: delivering a workshop to a number of our CEO and  
00:05:37 --> 00:05:38: community leaders.  
00:05:38 --> 00:05:39: In a couple of weeks,  
00:05:39 --> 00:05:41: so looking forward to that.  
00:05:41 --> 00:05:43: Urban Plan is a key element of some of the  
00:05:43 --> 00:05:45: work we're doing around diversity,  
00:05:45 --> 00:05:48: equity, and inclusion, so this is just a very very  
00:05:48 --> 00:05:49: brief overview.  
00:05:49 --> 00:05:52: Really scratches the surface, but wanted to give some folks  
00:05:52 --> 00:05:56: an opportunity for a little bit more information about our  
00:05:56 --> 00:05:59: organization and some of the topics that we're thinking about.  
00:05:59 --> 00:06:02: So if you are new or remember and haven't been  
00:06:02 --> 00:06:03: apart of us for awhile,  
00:06:03 --> 00:06:06: please feel free to reach out to any Member.  
00:06:06 --> 00:06:08: We're here to chat and again,

00:06:08 --> 00:06:12: especially during times like these were feeling that it's very

00:06:12 --> 00:06:16: important to provide this connectivity and these issue discussions today.

00:06:16 --> 00:06:19: So with that I will let our program start and

00:06:19 --> 00:06:23: I'm very excited to introduce the moderate are for our

00:06:23 --> 00:06:24: first panel,

00:06:24 --> 00:06:27: who also happens to be my friend and former classmate

00:06:27 --> 00:06:29: Doctor Akira Drake Rodriguez.

00:06:29 --> 00:06:33: Doctor Rodriguez is research examines the politics of urban planning

00:06:33 --> 00:06:38: or ways that disenfranchised groups re appropriate their marginalized spaces

00:06:38 --> 00:06:39: in the city to gain access.

00:06:39 --> 00:06:42: To an sustain urban political power,

00:06:42 --> 00:06:45: Doctor Rodriguez is currently working on her manuscript,

00:06:45 --> 00:06:49: deviance and divergent spaces, the radical politics of Atlanta's public

00:06:49 --> 00:06:49: housing,

00:06:49 --> 00:06:52: which is under contract with the University of Georgia Press.

00:06:52 --> 00:06:56: The book explores how politics of public housing planning and

00:06:56 --> 00:06:59: race in Atlanta created a politics of resistance within its

00:06:59 --> 00:07:01: public housing developments.

00:07:01 --> 00:07:05: This research offers the alternative benefits of public housing outside

00:07:05 --> 00:07:08: of shelter to challenge the overwhelming narrative of public housing

00:07:08 --> 00:07:11: as a dysfunctional relic of the welfare state.

00:07:11 --> 00:07:14: We are really lucky to have her here today to

00:07:14 --> 00:07:16: leave this conversation so Akira,

00:07:16 --> 00:07:17: I will hand it to you.

00:07:17 --> 00:07:20: Thank you, Laura. Thank you so much and you lie

00:07:20 --> 00:07:24: Fillion to Kevin an everyone for being here this morning.

00:07:24 --> 00:07:26: Good morning and happy new year.

00:07:26 --> 00:07:28: As Lord noted I'm cured,

00:07:28 --> 00:07:32: Drake Rodriguez and faculty member at University of Pennsylvania in

00:07:32 --> 00:07:35: the Department of City and Regional planning.

00:07:35 --> 00:07:38: I am super pleased to be moderating this panel very

00:07:38 --> 00:07:39: quickly.

00:07:39 --> 00:07:41: I'm going to introduce our three.

00:07:41 --> 00:07:46: Analysts before allowing them to introduce themselves more fully while

00:07:46 --> 00:07:49: they're doing those introductions.

00:07:49 --> 00:07:52: I think Kevin has a pole that we like to  
00:07:52 --> 00:07:52: launch.  
00:07:52 --> 00:07:56: I see so many different stakeholders here or she is  
00:07:56 --> 00:08:00: and CDC Zan developers just a quick pull of whether  
00:08:00 --> 00:08:04: or not you've been directly involved in negotiating a CBA.  
00:08:04 --> 00:08:07: And if you have, how did it resolve?  
00:08:07 --> 00:08:10: Was it successful? Negotiation resulted in agreement,  
00:08:10 --> 00:08:13: or. Did not result in agreement,  
00:08:13 --> 00:08:15: but there was a negotiation for one.  
00:08:15 --> 00:08:20: Our panelists today are Jamie Gautier who is the  
00:08:20 --> 00:08:25: Philadelphia  
00:08:25 --> 00:08:28: City Council person representing the third district hiring West  
00:08:28 --> 00:08:30: Philadelphia.  
00:08:28 --> 00:08:30: David Ross, who was a partner at the Argo Property  
00:08:30 --> 00:08:33: Group and Nolan Tully,  
00:08:30 --> 00:08:33: who is the board chair of the South of South  
00:08:33 --> 00:08:35: Neighbors Association SOS Na.  
00:08:35 --> 00:08:37: So I will just pass it off to you,  
00:08:37 --> 00:08:43: Jamie quite quickly you can introduce yourself more fully.  
00:08:43 --> 00:08:50: Hello good morning everybody. Councilmember Jaime  
00:08:50 --> 00:08:55: Guardia represent Philadelphia's third  
00:08:55 --> 00:08:58: district that includes large parts of West in Southwest  
00:08:58 --> 00:09:03: Philadelphia.  
00:08:58 --> 00:09:03: I'm excited to be a part of today's discussion.  
00:09:03 --> 00:09:07: We often help community groups and developers to to come  
00:09:07 --> 00:09:10: to agreements or to develop CBS that will help everyone  
00:09:10 --> 00:09:13: to kind of be good neighbors an exist together.  
00:09:13 --> 00:09:13: So thank you.  
00:09:13 --> 00:09:13: David.  
00:09:16 --> 00:09:21: Hey, good morning everybody. David Ross with Argo  
00:09:21 --> 00:09:26: Property Group  
00:09:26 --> 00:09:28: were mid-size developer been focusing in Brewerytown East  
00:09:28 --> 00:09:32: Falls area  
00:09:32 --> 00:09:37: for about five or six years now?  
00:09:37 --> 00:09:39: Excited to be here and we've done a handful of  
00:09:39 --> 00:09:39: Community benefits agreement so just excited about how  
00:09:42 --> 00:09:44: this discussion  
00:09:44 --> 00:09:46: can move that process forward,  
00:09:46 --> 00:09:50: thanks.  
00:09:50 --> 00:09:54: Nelly  
00:09:54 --> 00:09:58: hi everybody, my name is Nolan Tully.  
00:09:58 --> 00:10:00: I'm the chair of the South of South Neighborhood  
00:10:00 --> 00:10:02: Association.  
00:10:02 --> 00:10:04: That neighborhood is bounded by South Street on the North

00:09:54 --> 00:09:57: Washington Ave on the South and then Broad Street on  
00:09:57 --> 00:10:00: the East and the Schuylkill River on the West.  
00:10:00 --> 00:10:04: We've done over the course of the last two years  
00:10:04 --> 00:10:05: or so.  
00:10:05 --> 00:10:08: Two CBA is for larger developments along Washington Ave,  
00:10:08 --> 00:10:12: which is one of the principle kind of commercial corridors.  
00:10:12 --> 00:10:15: And actually, you know, uh?  
00:10:15 --> 00:10:18: An area that Ave that has changed quite a bit  
00:10:18 --> 00:10:21: as it's gone from an industrial use to more of  
00:10:21 --> 00:10:23: a residential mixed use.  
00:10:23 --> 00:10:26: Sector, so we've had some experience in CBS.  
00:10:26 --> 00:10:31: There an that says some successes and and some things  
00:10:31 --> 00:10:33: that we've learned from.  
00:10:33 --> 00:10:36: Protect.  
00:10:36 --> 00:10:38: Kate and so it looks like not a lot of  
00:10:38 --> 00:10:42: us have been involved in negotiation negotiating cvs,  
00:10:42 --> 00:10:44: but for the few for about 1/4 of us you  
00:10:45 --> 00:10:45: have been.  
00:10:45 --> 00:10:48: It looks like it did result in agreement,  
00:10:48 --> 00:10:51: so that's that's good and promising news.  
00:10:51 --> 00:10:53: So let's maybe just kick it off.  
00:10:53 --> 00:10:56: It seems like while there are opportunities there,  
00:10:56 --> 00:11:00: maybe we can talk also a bit about the challenges  
00:11:00 --> 00:11:01: that can arise,  
00:11:01 --> 00:11:05: but also, again, talk about those opportunities that come out  
00:11:05 --> 00:11:06: of implementing.  
00:11:06 --> 00:11:10: CBS and also thinking about what are the different  
00:11:10 --> 00:11:13: stakeholders  
00:11:13 --> 00:11:16: such as CDC's developers and residents,  
00:11:16 --> 00:11:21: can sort of do to mediate these challenges or or  
00:11:21 --> 00:11:22: leverage these opportunities further so you can maybe talk  
00:11:22 --> 00:11:25: from  
00:11:25 --> 00:11:28: personal experience or.  
00:11:28 --> 00:11:30: A cure. I think there was a question in the  
00:11:30 --> 00:11:32: chat about describing what a CBA is,  
00:11:32 --> 00:11:34: which it occurs to me,  
00:11:34 --> 00:11:37: might be worthwhile to start with.  
00:11:37 --> 00:11:39: Yeah, no one. Do you want to coming from someone  
00:11:39 --> 00:11:43: who is sort of done successfully?  
00:11:43 --> 00:11:45: Maybe talk about how you all came into the process  
00:11:45 --> 00:11:48: of thinking about CBS?  
00:11:48 --> 00:11:51: Sure, so. You know, I do think that at its

00:11:49 --> 00:11:50: very most basic level,

00:11:50 --> 00:11:54: a Community benefits agreement is.

00:11:54 --> 00:11:58: A legally binding contract between a developer or property owner

00:11:58 --> 00:12:03: and the community and the community could be represented by

00:12:03 --> 00:12:07: any number of different entities and it could actually be

00:12:07 --> 00:12:11: a number of different fees on behalf of the community,

00:12:11 --> 00:12:15: whether those are CEOs or CDC's or whatever it might

00:12:15 --> 00:12:15: be.

00:12:15 --> 00:12:19: Um and usually that will provide kind of an exchange

00:12:19 --> 00:12:21: for a development.

00:12:21 --> 00:12:25: Certain benefits that would accrue to the community.

00:12:25 --> 00:12:30: So in our neighborhood, and I think these benefits.

00:12:30 --> 00:12:34: Differ pretty widely depending on what the neighborhood looks like,

00:12:34 --> 00:12:35: and I think whatever your area,

00:12:35 --> 00:12:39: you know what might be suitable for your area or

00:12:39 --> 00:12:39: things.

00:12:39 --> 00:12:41: You want to focus on,

00:12:41 --> 00:12:43: but for us, the items that we looked at were

00:12:44 --> 00:12:49: affordable housing opening greenspaces accessible to community safety and livability

00:12:49 --> 00:12:50: infrastructure.

00:12:50 --> 00:12:54: Example of that would be like expanding sidewalks so that

00:12:54 --> 00:12:58: their wider and provide more space between the car Lane

00:12:58 --> 00:13:00: and the commercial space.

00:13:00 --> 00:13:02: Use of minority and women owned women.

00:13:02 --> 00:13:07: Contractors in the building. Preference for minority and women owned

00:13:07 --> 00:13:10: businesses in the commercial spaces.

00:13:10 --> 00:13:13: Uh, an agreement to work with us to connect our

00:13:13 --> 00:13:17: Neighborhood Association to the tenants in the commercial space is

00:13:17 --> 00:13:21: so that we can prioritize local hiring from a certain.

00:13:21 --> 00:13:24: A subset of ZIP codes that are in the near

00:13:24 --> 00:13:28: community and then some things that I think are just

00:13:28 --> 00:13:30: kind of aesthetic but important.

00:13:30 --> 00:13:36: So things like street trees where trash cans or other

00:13:36 --> 00:13:39: trash disposal items would be.

00:13:39 --> 00:13:41: Would be placed and then some things that are probably

00:13:41 --> 00:13:42: independently legally required,

00:13:42 --> 00:13:43: but are important to us,



00:13:43 --> 00:13:45: such as like 80 accessible infrastructure.

00:13:45 --> 00:13:47: So those are the things we looked at our CBS

00:13:47 --> 00:13:49: don't aren't uniform like some of them will include some,

00:13:49 --> 00:13:50: but not all of those,

00:13:50 --> 00:13:53: but those are the items that we negotiate around.

00:13:53 --> 00:13:57: Listen and Councilmember, could you maybe talk about what this

00:13:57 --> 00:14:00: looks like from the city's perspective?

00:14:00 --> 00:14:03: We did get a question about whether or not they

00:14:03 --> 00:14:04: are required,

00:14:04 --> 00:14:08: but also just thinking, how does the city sorry its

00:14:08 --> 00:14:13: role in CBS that are largely between nonprofits and developers?

00:14:13 --> 00:14:16: Know that there's an overall city perspective.

00:14:16 --> 00:14:20: I think you know Cvas tend to be at this

00:14:20 --> 00:14:20: point,

00:14:20 --> 00:14:24: project specific and neighborhood specific.

00:14:24 --> 00:14:28: You know there was legislation on the table last session

00:14:28 --> 00:14:32: around requiring cvas for projects of a certain size,

00:14:32 --> 00:14:35: but it didn't move forward,

00:14:35 --> 00:14:38: you know, and I don't think it's a bad piece

00:14:38 --> 00:14:39: of legislation.

00:14:39 --> 00:14:43: I just think that it's going to need to be.

00:14:43 --> 00:14:47: Hammered out right because we have to make sure that

00:14:47 --> 00:14:49: everyone's needs an an.

00:14:49 --> 00:14:53: You know what? What communities across the city need?

00:14:53 --> 00:14:55: From my part, you know,

00:14:55 --> 00:14:59: we often act as a facilitator between community members an

00:14:59 --> 00:15:00: and developers.

00:15:00 --> 00:15:06: Whether it's we're developing a formal CBA or not.

00:15:06 --> 00:15:08: And many times and it could be,

00:15:08 --> 00:15:10: you know, sometimes before a project.

00:15:10 --> 00:15:14: That's probably the best time to be having these discussions

00:15:14 --> 00:15:16: around negotiations,

00:15:16 --> 00:15:18: but sometimes it's during construction.

00:15:18 --> 00:15:22: We have several projects that are under construction and you

00:15:22 --> 00:15:26: know the the neighbors feel like they're being infringed upon,

00:15:26 --> 00:15:30: so we've had to step into those situations to to

00:15:30 --> 00:15:35: help create better agreements and understandings between developers and residents.

00:15:35 --> 00:15:37: And I think the opportunity.

00:15:37 --> 00:15:41: That CBA's present is for is the opportunity to create

00:15:41 --> 00:15:46: good relationships between developers that want to work in a  
00:15:46 --> 00:15:49: community and the residents who live there.  
00:15:49 --> 00:15:53: But I also think it's the opportunity to really derive  
00:15:53 --> 00:15:54: benefit for,  
00:15:54 --> 00:15:59: you know, longstanding neighborhood residents from you  
know,  
00:15:59 --> 00:16:02: development that's happening in the Community.  
00:16:02 --> 00:16:06: I think the challenge is making sure that there are  
00:16:06 --> 00:16:10: real discussions between both parties.  
00:16:10 --> 00:16:15: And that both parties are thinking really creatively about what  
00:16:15 --> 00:16:17: that benefit could look like.  
00:16:17 --> 00:16:20: One of the best CBA's in the city,  
00:16:20 --> 00:16:23: I think, relates to a project in my district,  
00:16:23 --> 00:16:29: so Brandywine is creating a major development called  
Schoolyards about  
00:16:29 --> 00:16:32: a 3 billion dollar development.  
00:16:32 --> 00:16:35: But you know, in moving that project forward,  
00:16:35 --> 00:16:40: they created a coalition of for community groups in West  
00:16:40 --> 00:16:41: Philadelphia.  
00:16:41 --> 00:16:44: They call themselves the Mantua Palton Alliance,  
00:16:44 --> 00:16:49: and that joint Coalition is administering about a \$10,000,000  
fund  
00:16:49 --> 00:16:54: over a 15 year period to support affordable housing  
development,  
00:16:54 --> 00:16:58: community capacity, building, economic opportunity,  
00:16:58 --> 00:17:01: and a range of other activities.  
00:17:01 --> 00:17:05: So the opportunity to create real benefit definitely exist here.  
00:17:05 --> 00:17:10: The challenges that sometimes folks aren't really listening to  
to  
00:17:10 --> 00:17:11: each other.  
00:17:11 --> 00:17:16: And it's hard to get to that that true benefit.  
00:17:16 --> 00:17:19: Thank you and David. Maybe you could talk a little  
00:17:19 --> 00:17:22: bit about how users come into communities,  
00:17:22 --> 00:17:25: knowing that CBS or at least in that in the  
00:17:25 --> 00:17:26: air,  
00:17:26 --> 00:17:30: right? You've had some experience where you've been going  
into  
00:17:30 --> 00:17:34: neighborhoods to develop an an people are kind of ready  
00:17:34 --> 00:17:35: with some CBA.  
00:17:35 --> 00:17:38: Yeah, I think it's a CBA is a way of  
00:17:38 --> 00:17:42: formalizing a lot of the promises that they made.  
00:17:42 --> 00:17:45: Over that, you know when you're when you're developer and  
00:17:45 --> 00:17:49: you're proposing something that's generally a variance or or not

00:17:49 --> 00:17:49: by right.

00:17:49 --> 00:17:51: You have to have these.

00:17:51 --> 00:17:55: Real conversations offline with neighbors and community members to say

00:17:55 --> 00:17:57: like here's what we want to do.

00:17:57 --> 00:17:59: You know, is this realistic and?

00:17:59 --> 00:18:02: Um? You know the CBA.

00:18:02 --> 00:18:05: It allows to formalize and hold accountable.

00:18:05 --> 00:18:09: You know what a developer promises.

00:18:09 --> 00:18:13: And it allows for some type of framework of.

00:18:13 --> 00:18:15: Normalcy to go back against,

00:18:15 --> 00:18:17: which is nice when. Yeah,

00:18:17 --> 00:18:20: as a developer you're trying to plug these numbers in

00:18:20 --> 00:18:23: your trying to explain to your investors in your lenders

00:18:23 --> 00:18:25: like what like what are our goals and what we're.

00:18:25 --> 00:18:28: In what we're doing for the project you can.

00:18:28 --> 00:18:31: Account for everything and all the variables so.

00:18:31 --> 00:18:35: MA CVI doesn't need to be a scary mysterious thing.

00:18:35 --> 00:18:37: I think it can be.

00:18:37 --> 00:18:43: It definitely varies from community community somewhere concerned about affordability

00:18:43 --> 00:18:43: and parking.

00:18:43 --> 00:18:47: Some are concerned about aesthetics.

00:18:47 --> 00:18:49: We have done about a half dozen of 'em I'm

00:18:49 --> 00:18:52: I'm in no means like the most experienced person,

00:18:52 --> 00:18:55: but we've we've fumble through a couple and it's been

00:18:55 --> 00:18:59: interesting to see how different neighborhoods approach them.

00:18:59 --> 00:19:05: Some neighborhoods, it's it's a lot of anxiety about affordability

00:19:05 --> 00:19:06: and gentrification,

00:19:06 --> 00:19:10: so those cvs very much look like giving preference to

00:19:10 --> 00:19:13: local minority contractors.

00:19:13 --> 00:19:19: Giving first look in preference to tenants and commercial tenants.

00:19:19 --> 00:19:22: And contributing towards neighborhood activities.

00:19:22 --> 00:19:25: So that's where you are.

00:19:25 --> 00:19:29: I'm in speaking about sort of the differences between communities.

00:19:29 --> 00:19:32: I think that's a really good point of thinking about

00:19:32 --> 00:19:35: our CEO's and capacity and maybe even lends itself to

00:19:36 --> 00:19:39: some of the questions we're seeing in the chat about

00:19:39 --> 00:19:42: enforcement after implementation and monitoring and

accountability.

00:19:42 --> 00:19:46: So thinking about an councilmember really like your point about

00:19:46 --> 00:19:50: the Brandywine CBA and building community capacity outside of just

00:19:50 --> 00:19:51: you know,

00:19:51 --> 00:19:53: affordable housing bricks and sticks stuff.

00:19:53 --> 00:19:55: So maybe thinking about and David,

00:19:55 --> 00:19:58: you can. You can speak about your own relationship in

00:19:58 --> 00:20:03: different communities of thinking about how does Community capacity broadly

00:20:03 --> 00:20:04: outside of RC is?

00:20:04 --> 00:20:05: You know it's more than RC's,

00:20:05 --> 00:20:08: right? There are people who come to meetings were not

00:20:08 --> 00:20:10: affiliated with RC's.

00:20:10 --> 00:20:13: But thinking about how that community capacity and interest can

00:20:13 --> 00:20:16: affect the CBA negotiation process were going bad.

00:20:16 --> 00:20:19: So I know just from my own research how many

00:20:19 --> 00:20:22: people have a large fear gentrification when it's not necessarily

00:20:22 --> 00:20:25: knocking at the door but you still have to deal

00:20:25 --> 00:20:28: with that fear even if it's not actually happening.

00:20:28 --> 00:20:30: And so how do you will?

00:20:30 --> 00:20:32: Kind of see that emerging,

00:20:32 --> 00:20:36: either helping or hindering CBS in the city.

00:20:36 --> 00:20:38: Um, I'll copy it to you.

00:20:38 --> 00:20:42: Oh Councilmember, you gonna get it.

00:20:42 --> 00:20:45: I will say that I think are seals are very

00:20:45 --> 00:20:46: important.

00:20:46 --> 00:20:50: I think every neighborhood should have a vehicle by which

00:20:51 --> 00:20:55: residents can provide input and and make sure that you

00:20:55 --> 00:20:59: know they have a say in development in the future

00:20:59 --> 00:21:02: of what happens in their neighborhood.

00:21:02 --> 00:21:06: And I often feel that our seals are very challenged.

00:21:06 --> 00:21:08: They have a hard job,

00:21:08 --> 00:21:12: most of them are volunteer organizations.

00:21:12 --> 00:21:16: It's a lot of them kind of have active participation

00:21:16 --> 00:21:18: from older retired folks,

00:21:18 --> 00:21:22: but but many neighborhoods you know have younger folks who

00:21:22 --> 00:21:26: want to participate with their working right,

00:21:26 --> 00:21:29: and so the demands on people who run our CEO's

00:21:29 --> 00:21:31: are are a lot right.

00:21:31 --> 00:21:33: But their job is important.

00:21:33 --> 00:21:38: And then you're there in discussions with developers who have

00:21:38 --> 00:21:40: lawyers and designers,

00:21:40 --> 00:21:42: right? And who have paid?

00:21:42 --> 00:21:45: Expertise so from the start I think there's a power

00:21:45 --> 00:21:48: imbalance and what I really like to see is for

00:21:48 --> 00:21:52: us to provide to provide more tools to our CEO

00:21:52 --> 00:21:56: so that they can participate in these conversations from a

00:21:56 --> 00:21:57: position of power.

00:21:57 --> 00:22:01: Sometimes when I look at Community benefit agreements,

00:22:01 --> 00:22:05: I come away thinking that the Community could have gotten

00:22:05 --> 00:22:05: more,

00:22:05 --> 00:22:08: especially when we're talking about real estate.

00:22:08 --> 00:22:10: We're talking about, you know,

00:22:10 --> 00:22:13: developments that are going to be around.

00:22:13 --> 00:22:15: Or maybe 100 years right,

00:22:15 --> 00:22:19: depending on how how well is built an those developments

00:22:19 --> 00:22:22: are going to define who can live in a neighborhood

00:22:22 --> 00:22:23: and who can't.

00:22:23 --> 00:22:26: And so I see my role very much as pushing

00:22:26 --> 00:22:29: for our CEO's and using the resources of my my

00:22:29 --> 00:22:32: office to help build their capacity.

00:22:32 --> 00:22:36: I have a director of Equitable development position in my

00:22:36 --> 00:22:36: office.

00:22:36 --> 00:22:39: That person is an urban planner.

00:22:39 --> 00:22:42: He spends a lot of time with our our CEO's

00:22:42 --> 00:22:44: trying to listening to them.

00:22:44 --> 00:22:46: And getting best practices from them,

00:22:46 --> 00:22:49: but also trying to share best practices with them with

00:22:49 --> 00:22:50: them too.

00:22:50 --> 00:22:52: And so I see that as a key part of

00:22:52 --> 00:22:52: my role.

00:22:56 --> 00:22:59: David Gunn

00:22:59 --> 00:23:03: um let's see it. There was a couple of questions

00:23:03 --> 00:23:03: there.

00:23:03 --> 00:23:08: I do think the CBA can can.

00:23:08 --> 00:23:10: If it's the first thing that comes up,

00:23:10 --> 00:23:12: I think it's. I generally like it.

00:23:12 --> 00:23:15: Looked at as like animosity.

00:23:15 --> 00:23:17: But the way we've been doing this is if you

00:23:17 --> 00:23:21: want to have a long relationship with where you're building.  
 00:23:21 --> 00:23:23: To know who the community members are,  
 00:23:23 --> 00:23:26: know who's in charge the Councilman,  
 00:23:26 --> 00:23:28: the community leaders, and you say,  
 00:23:28 --> 00:23:30: hey, here's a piece of land.  
 00:23:30 --> 00:23:31: Here's what we plan to do.  
 00:23:31 --> 00:23:36: An have some preliminary meetings around that we've  
 changed almost  
 00:23:36 --> 00:23:39: all of our projects based on feedback to try and  
 00:23:39 --> 00:23:41: push things as much.  
 00:23:41 --> 00:23:44: Thoards residential and parking as possible.  
 00:23:44 --> 00:23:47: Um? And then by the time we get to a  
 00:23:47 --> 00:23:47: CBA,  
 00:23:47 --> 00:23:51: we've already been around and had conversations that we're  
 just  
 00:23:51 --> 00:23:52: formalizing a lot of.  
 00:23:52 --> 00:23:56: Concerns and. Um? I just I just think it's important  
 00:23:56 --> 00:23:59: to say it doesn't need to be this.  
 00:23:59 --> 00:24:02: This point of friction the CBA can be a good  
 00:24:02 --> 00:24:02: thing.  
 00:24:02 --> 00:24:05: That's just locking in. Things have been discussed.  
 00:24:07 --> 00:24:10: Of course, at Nolan, did you want to jump in  
 00:24:10 --> 00:24:10: as well?  
 00:24:10 --> 00:24:14: Talk a little bit about from your perspective?  
 00:24:14 --> 00:24:16: Sure, so there were, as David mentioned,  
 00:24:16 --> 00:24:19: a couple of items that came up in that conversation,  
 00:24:19 --> 00:24:22: which I think were interesting and again.  
 00:24:22 --> 00:24:25: My role on the panel is kind of 1 arceo's  
 00:24:25 --> 00:24:25: viewpoint,  
 00:24:25 --> 00:24:28: right? So I want to reiterate that what's good for  
 00:24:28 --> 00:24:31: sosna is not necessarily good for everybody,  
 00:24:31 --> 00:24:34: and I think what the Council member pointed to in  
 00:24:34 --> 00:24:37: Mount Mantua Powelton area is what was good for that  
 00:24:37 --> 00:24:38: community.  
 00:24:38 --> 00:24:40: But in terms of capacity.  
 00:24:40 --> 00:24:42: Our our CEO was lucky in some sense.  
 00:24:42 --> 00:24:44: I'm a partner at a law firm here in the  
 00:24:44 --> 00:24:48: city Feighery Drinker Biddle and Reath of colleague of mine.  
 00:24:48 --> 00:24:50: On the board was a partner at Duane Morris.  
 00:24:50 --> 00:24:53: There are two big law firms and we were able  
 00:24:53 --> 00:24:55: to get assistance from our law firms on a pro  
 00:24:55 --> 00:24:58: bono basis to help negotiate these CBA's not every arceo

00:24:58 --> 00:25:01: is going to have the ability to do that right

00:25:01 --> 00:25:04: and I think that's an important part of looking at

00:25:04 --> 00:25:05: what we've been able to do.

00:25:05 --> 00:25:07: You know, I think it successfully,

00:25:07 --> 00:25:09: but that is not necessarily replicable.

00:25:09 --> 00:25:11: I'd love to have those types of legal.

00:25:11 --> 00:25:14: Support.

00:25:14 --> 00:25:18: You know available to other arceo's that don't have the

00:25:18 --> 00:25:20: capacity to do it on their board.

00:25:20 --> 00:25:25: The power imbalance that the Council member talked about.

00:25:25 --> 00:25:27: Any arceo that enters into these negotiations?

00:25:27 --> 00:25:29: If the negotiations go South,

00:25:29 --> 00:25:32: basically, one risk of a lawsuit.

00:25:32 --> 00:25:35: Chills the entire conversation because the Arceo can't risk a

00:25:35 --> 00:25:38: lawsuit that exceeds any sort of insurance capacity that they

00:25:38 --> 00:25:38: have.

00:25:38 --> 00:25:41: Otherwise they go out of existence and and in some

00:25:41 --> 00:25:44: instances I think wrote remote instances but potentially risk

00:25:44 --> 00:25:46: personal

00:25:46 --> 00:25:48: liability for the members of that board,

00:25:48 --> 00:25:51: which is completely, you know,

00:25:51 --> 00:25:52: that is a power card that most developers don't play,

00:25:52 --> 00:25:55: but if it comes down to it,

00:25:55 --> 00:25:56: it's happened. I mean, there are examples across the city

00:25:56 --> 00:25:58: of it happening,

00:25:58 --> 00:26:01: and I think one thing that we could do,

00:26:01 --> 00:26:02: either at the Commonwealth level or potentially the state

00:26:02 --> 00:26:05: level

00:26:05 --> 00:26:06: is talk about some sort of.

00:26:06 --> 00:26:08: Of liability shield there for the Arceo is when their

00:26:08 --> 00:26:09: negotiating in good faith.

00:26:09 --> 00:26:13: If folks are negotiating in bad faith or doing something

00:26:13 --> 00:26:17: otherwise inappropriate,

00:26:17 --> 00:26:19: that separate. Anne. Somewhere in the chat,

00:26:19 --> 00:26:21: Sandy, I think mentioned that Cpas only come up when

00:26:21 --> 00:26:24: developers run into a zoning block.

00:26:24 --> 00:26:27: Generally speaking, in my experience,

00:26:27 --> 00:26:30: I think that's true, but not universal,

00:26:30 --> 00:26:34: right? So certainly one of the items that the the

00:26:34 --> 00:26:36: community can negotiate around is you need zoning relief.

00:26:36 --> 00:26:40: We would like you know these things for the community.

00:26:40 --> 00:26:42: That's very simple and I think you're right,

00:26:42 --> 00:26:44: that's what the typical circumstance would would entail.

00:26:40 --> 00:26:42: However, you know it's not a CPA.

00:26:42 --> 00:26:46: But we just recently in our neighborhood had had a

00:26:46 --> 00:26:47: building.

00:26:47 --> 00:26:52: It actually got some publicity from Inga Saffron in The

00:26:52 --> 00:26:59: Enquirer around tearing down of historically aesthetically looking rowhome doctors

00:26:59 --> 00:26:59: row.

00:26:59 --> 00:27:03: And we contacted the developer through Councilman Johnson's office an.

00:27:03 --> 00:27:06: They've come back and revise the plans so I would,

00:27:06 --> 00:27:09: even if there's a buy right project that would encourage

00:27:09 --> 00:27:11: our CEOs to contact the developer utilizing.

00:27:11 --> 00:27:13: I hope it's OK for me to say this Council

00:27:13 --> 00:27:14: member,

00:27:14 --> 00:27:17: but utilized your Council members offices to facilitate that.

00:27:17 --> 00:27:20: 'cause I think that there are developers out there.

00:27:20 --> 00:27:23: In fact, in my experience the majority of developers that

00:27:23 --> 00:27:26: will sit down and listen and they really do want

00:27:26 --> 00:27:29: to do something that the Community wants within reason.

00:27:29 --> 00:27:32: And so I think you can go down this path

00:27:32 --> 00:27:35: even if you don't have a zoning block and then

00:27:35 --> 00:27:36: enforce ability.

00:27:36 --> 00:27:38: Someone raised that you know,

00:27:38 --> 00:27:43: legally speaking, I think enforceability is something that remains to

00:27:43 --> 00:27:43: be seen,

00:27:43 --> 00:27:47: and hopefully we don't see litigation over these at a

00:27:47 --> 00:27:48: very high level,

00:27:48 --> 00:27:52: which is where you would really get a significant court

00:27:52 --> 00:27:53: decision.

00:27:53 --> 00:27:55: Detailing that parameters of enforceability,

00:27:55 --> 00:27:57: I hope we don't get there and I think you

00:27:57 --> 00:28:00: know to David's point a moment ago developers don't enter

00:28:00 --> 00:28:02: into these agreements looking to breach them.

00:28:02 --> 00:28:04: I don't believe I think they enter into these agreements

00:28:05 --> 00:28:07: trying to expedite their projects in a way that's going

00:28:07 --> 00:28:07: to.

00:28:07 --> 00:28:09: If we're being honest, you know,

00:28:09 --> 00:28:12: make them money and get something up for the community

00:28:12 --> 00:28:14: and the community is entering these agreements.

00:28:14 --> 00:28:17: Obviously 'cause they want to get benefits that are laid

00:28:17 --> 00:28:18: out in the agreement.



00:28:18 --> 00:28:20: So I'm hopeful that we don't have to test enforceability.

00:28:20 --> 00:28:23: 'cause I do think in my experience both parties enter

00:28:23 --> 00:28:25: into the agreements in good faith.

00:28:25 --> 00:28:28: An, but I will concede that it is something that

00:28:28 --> 00:28:28: is,

00:28:28 --> 00:28:32: I think, relatively untested, at least in terms of what

00:28:32 --> 00:28:33: I've looked at.

00:28:33 --> 00:28:36: David, were you going to say something and then I'll

00:28:36 --> 00:28:38: just ask one more question before Q&A,

00:28:38 --> 00:28:40: go ahead.

00:28:40 --> 00:28:43: I figure was going to say yeah,

00:28:43 --> 00:28:46: it's the enforce ability is.

00:28:46 --> 00:28:48: Um, it has been tested,

00:28:48 --> 00:28:50: you know, but I think it's.

00:28:50 --> 00:28:54: Reputationally we you know I think we enter into these

00:28:54 --> 00:28:55: because.

00:28:55 --> 00:28:58: I think most developers I can't speak for everybody,

00:28:58 --> 00:29:01: but the goal is to have a long career in

00:29:01 --> 00:29:02: a long relationship so.

00:29:02 --> 00:29:05: The the idea of doing a CBA and going back

00:29:05 --> 00:29:08: on that is what would ruin your career long term.

00:29:08 --> 00:29:10: So I'm sure there's been examples of that,

00:29:10 --> 00:29:14: but that's that's not I would say.

00:29:14 --> 00:29:15: The intent going into most of these.

00:29:17 --> 00:29:21: Against a final sort of way to sort of wrap

00:29:21 --> 00:29:25: this up is to give our audience on a couple

00:29:25 --> 00:29:26: of things.

00:29:26 --> 00:29:30: Nolan, you mentioned a couple of things about CBS,

00:29:30 --> 00:29:34: such as affordable housing and greenspace,

00:29:34 --> 00:29:38: ascetics, women and minority contractors,

00:29:38 --> 00:29:42: and an occupants in the commercial real estate.

00:29:42 --> 00:29:47: What are some things that you know organizations can?

00:29:47 --> 00:29:50: Lead into with developers in these conversations,

00:29:50 --> 00:29:51: that sort of being an easy one,

00:29:51 --> 00:29:53: as the Council members said,

00:29:53 --> 00:29:55: they could have gotten a little bit more.

00:29:55 --> 00:29:57: And what are the ones where it's like OK,

00:29:57 --> 00:29:59: that's not going to happen so that people can,

00:29:59 --> 00:30:02: I guess, sort of temper their expectations when sort of

00:30:02 --> 00:30:03: entering into these agreements.

00:30:10 --> 00:30:13: So here I went through the things that we had

00:30:13 --> 00:30:14: in our agreements.

00:30:14 --> 00:30:18: I did leave one thing out which David mentioned,  
00:30:18 --> 00:30:21: which is parking. We haven't really insisted on parking that  
00:30:22 --> 00:30:25: significantly exceeds the Washington Avenue I RMX  
standard.

00:30:25 --> 00:30:28: But you know, we we do have parking in there.  
00:30:28 --> 00:30:31: The one thing that we.  
00:30:31 --> 00:30:34: You know, I honestly can't say we push for it  
00:30:34 --> 00:30:35: necessarily,  
00:30:35 --> 00:30:37: but the one thing that was kind of off the  
00:30:37 --> 00:30:40: table based on the amount of money that it costs  
00:30:40 --> 00:30:43: to buy land in the city was was affordable housing  
00:30:43 --> 00:30:47: that fell below a certain threshold of area median income.  
00:30:47 --> 00:30:51: What I would call true affordable housing.  
00:30:51 --> 00:30:52: We weren't able to, you know,  
00:30:52 --> 00:30:55: even kind of the first step towards that.  
00:30:55 --> 00:30:58: The affordable housing were able to negotiate around is,  
00:30:58 --> 00:31:02: I think what is typically referred to as workforce rate  
00:31:02 --> 00:31:02: housing.  
00:31:02 --> 00:31:05: It's about 60% of am I with the subsidy available  
00:31:05 --> 00:31:06: for utilities,  
00:31:06 --> 00:31:09: which was negotiated by a sister Arceo that we have  
00:31:09 --> 00:31:11: in our in our neighborhood,  
00:31:11 --> 00:31:13: the North Washington Ave coalition.  
00:31:13 --> 00:31:15: So that would be one thing I would say we  
00:31:15 --> 00:31:17: have not been able to get an and I do  
00:31:17 --> 00:31:20: understand the developers position here.  
00:31:20 --> 00:31:23: When you're paying the amount of money.  
00:31:23 --> 00:31:25: That you're paying for land in the city.  
00:31:25 --> 00:31:28: Plus you're paying the amount of money it costs to  
00:31:28 --> 00:31:31: build these large multi unit buildings.  
00:31:31 --> 00:31:33: I do think it becomes hard to provide,  
00:31:33 --> 00:31:37: you know, true low income housing even though our  
neighborhood  
00:31:37 --> 00:31:39: certainly needs it.  
00:31:41 --> 00:31:45: So affordable housing in high value areas essentially is going  
00:31:45 --> 00:31:47: to be the most difficult part.  
00:31:47 --> 00:31:51: Councilmember, I would say that's the most difficult part and  
00:31:51 --> 00:31:52: an you know.  
00:31:52 --> 00:31:55: Maybe the developers on the call won't like this,  
00:31:55 --> 00:31:59: but I think. I think if communities can often push  
00:31:59 --> 00:32:03: harder on that and stick to their guns an get  
00:32:03 --> 00:32:05: that I've been in,  
00:32:05 --> 00:32:08: you know so so not only do we help facilitate

00:32:08 --> 00:32:09: cvas.

00:32:09 --> 00:32:14: Oftentimes as a council member in discussions directly with developers

00:32:14 --> 00:32:15: about,

00:32:15 --> 00:32:18: you know what they you know would like to get

00:32:18 --> 00:32:22: our buying for it or what they need our approval

00:32:22 --> 00:32:23: for.

00:32:23 --> 00:32:26: And I'm often pushing against affordability.

00:32:26 --> 00:32:28: I find that in. You know,

00:32:28 --> 00:32:31: particularly in the gentrifying areas of the third district,

00:32:31 --> 00:32:35: the developers you know they don't want to include affordability

00:32:35 --> 00:32:35: on site.

00:32:35 --> 00:32:38: They rather pay and they rather like use the mixed

00:32:38 --> 00:32:40: income housing bonus.

00:32:40 --> 00:32:43: For example, when paying to the Housing Trust fund for

00:32:43 --> 00:32:43: me,

00:32:43 --> 00:32:46: we need the units were losing affordable housing,

00:32:46 --> 00:32:48: so it's not good enough to have you know money

00:32:48 --> 00:32:52: going to the Housing Trust fund that can support affordable

00:32:52 --> 00:32:55: housing anywhere we need units in the neighborhood.

00:32:55 --> 00:32:57: And I found when we stick to our guns and

00:32:57 --> 00:32:58: when we say.

00:32:58 --> 00:33:00: Well, you know it's a no go if you can't

00:33:00 --> 00:33:01: do this,

00:33:01 --> 00:33:05: we can often get further than what people originally come

00:33:05 --> 00:33:08: to the table saying that they can do,

00:33:08 --> 00:33:11: and so I encourage communities to push on that point

00:33:11 --> 00:33:15: and to get at least a reasonable amount of affordable

00:33:15 --> 00:33:16: housing.

00:33:16 --> 00:33:20: True affordable housing that people in the in the community

00:33:20 --> 00:33:21: can afford.

00:33:21 --> 00:33:25: I also think that sometimes these discussions folks aren't thinking

00:33:25 --> 00:33:28: creatively enough in these discussions,

00:33:28 --> 00:33:31: so. As an example, we help negotiate a CBA for

00:33:31 --> 00:33:35: our large project that was under construction already,

00:33:35 --> 00:33:39: right? So they didn't really need anything from the community,

00:33:39 --> 00:33:43: but the community was very unhappy with with the developers

00:33:43 --> 00:33:45: and with the construction team.

00:33:45 --> 00:33:48: And we went and they also had concerns about the

00:33:48 --> 00:33:49: development,

00:33:49 --> 00:33:53: like speeding on the road where the development was happening

00:33:53 --> 00:33:56: and feeling like the development was going to bring more

00:33:56 --> 00:33:57: traffic.

00:33:57 --> 00:34:00: Well, we got the developers agreed to pay for safety.

00:34:00 --> 00:34:04: For speed bumps, write an other sort of safety improvement,

00:34:04 --> 00:34:08: and so if you really kind of have real discussions

00:34:08 --> 00:34:09: and listen to each other,

00:34:09 --> 00:34:13: you can sometimes come up with some creative solutions that

00:34:13 --> 00:34:14: may not even be.

00:34:14 --> 00:34:18: You know, a big deal for the developer to provide

00:34:18 --> 00:34:21: that makes the community happy.

00:34:21 --> 00:34:24: David, did you want to comment on things that are

00:34:24 --> 00:34:25: on and off the table?

00:34:27 --> 00:34:30: Um, you know, I, I don't want to stand in

00:34:30 --> 00:34:32: for every developer in the city here.

00:34:32 --> 00:34:34: No sure, no. No one does.

00:34:34 --> 00:34:36: No one does.

00:34:36 --> 00:34:40: But I think the affordability thing is is very challenging.

00:34:40 --> 00:34:42: You know we're penciling out these projects.

00:34:42 --> 00:34:45: What makes affordable housing possible?

00:34:45 --> 00:34:47: Is density. More units, more numbers,

00:34:47 --> 00:34:51: and most of our discussions with the community have been

00:34:51 --> 00:34:52: about.

00:34:52 --> 00:34:54: Getting families and homeowners in.

00:34:54 --> 00:34:57: So we've shifted a lot of our developments from multifamily

00:34:57 --> 00:34:59: to townhouses with parking,

00:34:59 --> 00:35:01: and when you do that.

00:35:01 --> 00:35:04: You kind of take the affordable housing part out of

00:35:04 --> 00:35:07: it because you're slicing things as thin as you can

00:35:07 --> 00:35:09: to to bring the unit count down.

00:35:09 --> 00:35:13: Um? And the other thing that we battle in some

00:35:13 --> 00:35:17: of these more fringe neighborhoods is there is this identity

00:35:17 --> 00:35:21: of like home ownership and affordability and the idea of

00:35:21 --> 00:35:23: apartments are really looked down upon.

00:35:23 --> 00:35:28: There's definitely this people that participate in the Community meetings

00:35:29 --> 00:35:31: are generally homeowners and.

00:35:31 --> 00:35:34: Tenants and renters get vilified because they're not there and

00:35:34 --> 00:35:37: they often don't have a chance to speak for themselves,

00:35:37 --> 00:35:39: so I think it's tough to say like I want

00:35:39 --> 00:35:41: to do in apartment building.

00:35:41 --> 00:35:45: Because there's people that are that will rent this because

00:35:45 --> 00:35:49: the people that are representing the Community groups for the

00:35:49 --> 00:35:51: most part are homeowners.

00:35:51 --> 00:35:53: So we listen to that and we've changed.

00:35:53 --> 00:35:58: But it's definitely it's hard to do affordable housing.

00:35:58 --> 00:36:00: Townhomes without any incentive structure.

00:36:00 --> 00:36:02: We're still buying land at market rate.

00:36:02 --> 00:36:05: We're still doing construction on Mercury.

00:36:05 --> 00:36:06: It's hard to pencil in.

00:36:08 --> 00:36:11: I agree on that point about renters.

00:36:11 --> 00:36:13: There is sometimes, you know,

00:36:13 --> 00:36:17: within neighborhoods a strong bias towards renters and the type

00:36:17 --> 00:36:21: of neighborhood neighbors they'll be and how involved there they'll

00:36:21 --> 00:36:21: be.

00:36:21 --> 00:36:24: I'm a renter like I often have to say that

00:36:24 --> 00:36:27: to people in community meetings to kind of dispel the

00:36:27 --> 00:36:31: notion that renters are people who you know don't care

00:36:31 --> 00:36:33: about the community at the same time,

00:36:33 --> 00:36:36: though, I think a piece of that sentiment comes,

00:36:36 --> 00:36:38: you know when in certain neighborhoods.

00:36:38 --> 00:36:42: Rental is all that's being developed.

00:36:42 --> 00:36:45: So in neighborhoods like Mantua.

00:36:45 --> 00:36:49: Parts of of East Parkside you have vacant land and

00:36:49 --> 00:36:53: you have developers only or coming in wanting to do

00:36:53 --> 00:36:57: rental and people have a different vision for their community

00:36:57 --> 00:37:01: that may include many types of housing and I think

00:37:01 --> 00:37:03: that that sentiment is valid.

00:37:06 --> 00:37:10: Um, I wanted to. We have so many questions in

00:37:10 --> 00:37:10: the chat.

00:37:10 --> 00:37:14: I wanted to get to some of those in the

00:37:14 --> 00:37:17: time that we have we have about.

00:37:17 --> 00:37:20: 8 minutes to go through some of these questions all

00:37:20 --> 00:37:22: kind of bundle them up.

00:37:22 --> 00:37:25: Some of them are like logistical questions and so Council

00:37:25 --> 00:37:29: member you mentioned someone in your office who does equitable

00:37:29 --> 00:37:31: development 'cause she just restate.

00:37:31 --> 00:37:35: Their name? Sure, Andrew Goodman in our office.

00:37:35 --> 00:37:38: He's our director of Equitable Development,

00:37:38 --> 00:37:43: and that's very purposeful. Equitable development is like my main

00:37:43 --> 00:37:44: agenda,

00:37:44 --> 00:37:48: and I want everyone in our communities to benefit from

00:37:48 --> 00:37:52: all of the assets in all the development that's happening.

00:37:52 --> 00:37:56: And so his main job is to.

00:37:56 --> 00:37:59: To make sure that we have a place based strategy

00:37:59 --> 00:38:01: that's designed for equity,

00:38:01 --> 00:38:05: he spends a lot of time in these discussions with

00:38:05 --> 00:38:10: developers and with community members making sure that our residents

00:38:10 --> 00:38:11: are are represented.

00:38:11 --> 00:38:16: Most folks and in Council with most District Council members

00:38:16 --> 00:38:18: do have people who work on zoning,

00:38:18 --> 00:38:22: but I thought it was very important to have an

00:38:22 --> 00:38:26: urban planner in the role just with with everything with

00:38:26 --> 00:38:26: the.

00:38:26 --> 00:38:28: Amount in in the piece of development that we have

00:38:28 --> 00:38:29: in the district.

00:38:31 --> 00:38:36: In jail and there are a couple of other council

00:38:37 --> 00:38:38: offices that have.

00:38:38 --> 00:38:42: Planners in them that are focused on engaging with our

00:38:42 --> 00:38:45: CEO's and so that sort of differs for every Council

00:38:45 --> 00:38:45: office.

00:38:45 --> 00:38:47: There's not like a standard,

00:38:47 --> 00:38:51: certainly not equitable development person in every Council office,

00:38:51 --> 00:38:54: but there are usually someone who deals with land use

00:38:54 --> 00:38:55: issues.

00:38:55 --> 00:38:59: Anne and you can check the Council Members website for

00:38:59 --> 00:39:03: that information with her staff email list.

00:39:03 --> 00:39:09: Talking a little bit. Many of the questions also concern

00:39:09 --> 00:39:15: issues of legal language enforcement oversight and accountability.

00:39:15 --> 00:39:18: And Nolan, I'll just sort of pop this over to

00:39:18 --> 00:39:18: you.

00:39:18 --> 00:39:22: Did you all just sort of Google like CBA agreements

00:39:22 --> 00:39:24: and find like some boilerplate language?

00:39:24 --> 00:39:27: Or how did you get some of that resources from?

00:39:27 --> 00:39:30: Yeah, that's a good question akyra.

00:39:30 --> 00:39:32: It would take a lot of work honestly.

00:39:32 --> 00:39:35: So there were a number of folks on our board

00:39:35 --> 00:39:38: who were intimately involved in this.

00:39:38 --> 00:39:42: We talked to Councilmember Johnson's office and got some guidance

00:39:42 --> 00:39:43: from them.

00:39:43 --> 00:39:44: We talked to council members,

00:39:44 --> 00:39:48: Will's office and got some guidance from them.

00:39:48 --> 00:39:51: Actually saw someone at the beginning.

00:39:51 --> 00:39:55: You had logged in from the Philadelphia Chinatown CDC.

00:39:55 --> 00:39:59: We gotta example from them of a community that had

00:39:59 --> 00:40:03: said that agreement that they had used in Chinatown.

00:40:03 --> 00:40:06: I talked to folks from CHOP and I talked to

00:40:06 --> 00:40:08: folks who had negotiated.

00:40:08 --> 00:40:11: I think it was NKCDC

00:40:11 --> 00:40:13: I could be wrong about that.

00:40:13 --> 00:40:15: Well, I definitely thought down CCDC,

00:40:15 --> 00:40:18: but then I also talked to some of the folks

00:40:18 --> 00:40:23: who negotiated the Sugarhouse Casino Community Benefits Agreement an that

00:40:23 --> 00:40:24: was all great.

00:40:24 --> 00:40:27: Out of the stuff wasn't like as I mentioned at

00:40:27 --> 00:40:27: the top,

00:40:27 --> 00:40:30: it wasn't particularly useful for our,

00:40:30 --> 00:40:32: you know, very. Small ish,

00:40:32 --> 00:40:34: you know. Compared to those projects,

00:40:34 --> 00:40:36: developments. At the same token,

00:40:36 --> 00:40:40: both of the CBS CBS we've negotiated are for projects

00:40:40 --> 00:40:43: bigger than the projects that David has described.

00:40:43 --> 00:40:47: He's negotiated CBS for, so there's a wide range of

00:40:47 --> 00:40:49: things here that.

00:40:49 --> 00:40:51: That would work. There's also a lot of resources online,

00:40:51 --> 00:40:53: accurate to your point about Googling.

00:40:53 --> 00:40:55: I don't want to minimize that an.

00:40:55 --> 00:40:58: Ann and I think.

00:40:58 --> 00:41:00: You know someone just wrote in the chat.

00:41:00 --> 00:41:02: How can someone get examples of CBS?

00:41:02 --> 00:41:03: I would reach out it.

00:41:03 --> 00:41:05: I think it's pretty. It was pretty easy for us

00:41:05 --> 00:41:07: to identify the RC's that have done these before.

00:41:07 --> 00:41:10: And if anyone wants to reach out to.

00:41:10 --> 00:41:14: To me I'm happy with my copies of the ones

00:41:14 --> 00:41:19: we've done it sasna an my email is [email protected] I'm

00:41:19 --> 00:41:21: happy to share those.

00:41:21 --> 00:41:23: And I think there's also a bunch available,

00:41:23 --> 00:41:26: but you just reach out to various CCS or ICO  
 00:41:26 --> 00:41:28: throughout the city that have done that and we were  
 00:41:28 --> 00:41:30: able to get a kind of a bunch of 'em  
 00:41:30 --> 00:41:32: that we were able to use examples,  
 00:41:32 --> 00:41:34: but it did take a lot of work an and  
 00:41:34 --> 00:41:37: again I think that goes to the capacity point that  
 00:41:37 --> 00:41:40: the Council member made earlier in the in the panel.  
 00:41:44 --> 00:41:47: Think, yeah, um, another sort of major question,  
 00:41:47 --> 00:41:50: of course, is about enforcement and the role of the  
 00:41:50 --> 00:41:54: city and sort of managing both the expectations of the  
 00:41:54 --> 00:41:54: Community.  
 00:41:54 --> 00:41:58: We had a really good question about the scale and  
 00:41:58 --> 00:41:58: scope of CBS,  
 00:41:58 --> 00:42:02: how the Brandywine is obviously going to be different than  
 00:42:02 --> 00:42:04: the ones that David engages in.  
 00:42:04 --> 00:42:08: It's different than the ones that's awesome engages in,  
 00:42:08 --> 00:42:10: but thinking also.  
 00:42:10 --> 00:42:13: You know how can we manage the expectations of the  
 00:42:13 --> 00:42:18: community of developers and then talking about  
 enforcement,  
 00:42:18 --> 00:42:22: our developers entering into these things to get good press  
 00:42:22 --> 00:42:26: and move through the process or communities.  
 00:42:26 --> 00:42:29: Being too aggressive is the city being too passive or  
 00:42:29 --> 00:42:30: too aggressive,  
 00:42:30 --> 00:42:33: so those are all sort of.  
 00:42:33 --> 00:42:36: Things that we have to balance in these discussions have  
 00:42:36 --> 00:42:40: both encouraging development in the city while also making  
 sure  
 00:42:40 --> 00:42:41: we don't displace,  
 00:42:41 --> 00:42:43: and that's for the last 15 years,  
 00:42:43 --> 00:42:46: 20 years. At least. That's been a major issue in  
 00:42:46 --> 00:42:48: the City of development without displacement,  
 00:42:48 --> 00:42:51: but I also do think David brings a good point  
 00:42:51 --> 00:42:54: about like what sort of development like yes there and  
 00:42:54 --> 00:42:58: there was someone in the chat that mentioned about East  
 00:42:58 --> 00:43:01: Parkside being 70% rental housing and how there's a ton  
 00:43:01 --> 00:43:03: of rental housing there and we are.  
 00:43:03 --> 00:43:05: We used to be. City of homeowners.  
 00:43:05 --> 00:43:08: But that is changing. So how do you kind of  
 00:43:08 --> 00:43:12: navigate the types of development that people want in their  
 00:43:12 --> 00:43:14: community and those tensions?  
 00:43:14 --> 00:43:17: I don't expect an answer to that question which would  
 00:43:17 --> 00:43:18: solve 90%



00:43:18 --> 00:43:20: of my problems in planning,  
00:43:20 --> 00:43:21: but someone has some ideas.  
00:43:24 --> 00:43:26: So Akira, from my perspective.  
00:43:26 --> 00:43:29: I mean, I think most folks are aware that they  
00:43:29 --> 00:43:33: are the Graduate Hospital South South neighborhood,  
00:43:33 --> 00:43:37: gentrified very, very rapidly over the last 20 years.  
00:43:37 --> 00:43:39: And so we've.  
00:43:39 --> 00:43:40: We've had to deal with that,  
00:43:40 --> 00:43:43: and you know, I don't know how good of a  
00:43:43 --> 00:43:46: job we've done as a neighborhood dealing with it to  
00:43:46 --> 00:43:46: be honest,  
00:43:46 --> 00:43:49: but I do think that one of the things we  
00:43:49 --> 00:43:50: learned in this process,  
00:43:50 --> 00:43:53: especially from our first effort at a CBA which didn't  
00:43:53 --> 00:43:55: result in a successful CBA,  
00:43:55 --> 00:43:57: is that you you really do have to get out  
00:43:57 --> 00:44:00: and do the kind of the shoe leather work of  
00:44:00 --> 00:44:01: community engagement you have to.  
00:44:01 --> 00:44:05: You have to work to get the community to understand  
00:44:05 --> 00:44:06: what you're trying to do.  
00:44:06 --> 00:44:08: And how it's going to impact them,  
00:44:08 --> 00:44:11: if at all? And why you think that the items  
00:44:11 --> 00:44:14: that you're pushing for in the CBA are going to  
00:44:14 --> 00:44:15: be helpful to them?  
00:44:15 --> 00:44:18: You know, one of the items that I think I  
00:44:18 --> 00:44:19: even overlook,  
00:44:19 --> 00:44:22: but I think maybe even the most important item that  
00:44:22 --> 00:44:24: we've negotiated in the CBA's,  
00:44:24 --> 00:44:27: and I think it's often one that the developer is  
00:44:27 --> 00:44:28: happy to do.  
00:44:28 --> 00:44:32: Is an agreement a commitment to connect the Arceo to  
00:44:32 --> 00:44:36: the commercial tenants that are going to come into a  
00:44:36 --> 00:44:40: development that has commercial space in it and work to  
00:44:40 --> 00:44:46: get folks in the Community jobs at those commercial spaces?  
00:44:46 --> 00:44:50: I think jobs an availability opportunity is so important,  
00:44:50 --> 00:44:52: especially in neighborhoods that are,  
00:44:52 --> 00:44:57: you know, going through those types of demographic  
changes.  
00:44:57 --> 00:44:59: An you know I'm pretty proud of some of the  
00:44:59 --> 00:45:02: places that we've gotten commitments you know to work  
with,  
00:45:02 --> 00:45:05: uh, you know our neighborhood groups to connect.

00:45:05 --> 00:45:08: Folks looking for work for good jobs in our neighborhood  
00:45:08 --> 00:45:09: based on development.  
00:45:09 --> 00:45:13: And I think that can be a real win win.  
00:45:13 --> 00:45:15: And I think it offsets some of the things that  
00:45:16 --> 00:45:18: I think the Council member rightly pointed to about.  
00:45:18 --> 00:45:21: True affordable housing Ann and I don't want to be  
00:45:21 --> 00:45:22: here to say that.  
00:45:22 --> 00:45:24: You know, community shouldn't push for that.  
00:45:24 --> 00:45:27: They should, especially if that's what the community wants.  
00:45:27 --> 00:45:30: But I do think there are real hurdles,  
00:45:30 --> 00:45:34: real challenges to developers being able to provide that.  
00:45:34 --> 00:45:39: Um? I think that I think that the community,  
00:45:39 --> 00:45:44: the developers in the city play a role in making  
00:45:44 --> 00:45:51: sure that the Community benefits agreement is actually  
implemented.  
00:45:51 --> 00:45:54: I'm I'm in my I just crossed my first year  
00:45:54 --> 00:45:57: in office so some of the things that we did  
00:45:57 --> 00:45:57: are,  
00:45:57 --> 00:46:00: you know I'm going to be seeing them come to  
00:46:00 --> 00:46:01: fruition,  
00:46:01 --> 00:46:04: but I plan to play an active role in making  
00:46:04 --> 00:46:07: sure that the agreements are are implemented.  
00:46:07 --> 00:46:10: And also you know when trying to come up with  
00:46:10 --> 00:46:11: CBA agreements,  
00:46:11 --> 00:46:15: we've been thoughtful or try to be thoughtful about who  
00:46:15 --> 00:46:19: would administer those agreements from the community.  
00:46:19 --> 00:46:24: Anan in the hopes that that organization has the capacity.  
00:46:24 --> 00:46:27: I think that a lot of these discussions are going  
00:46:27 --> 00:46:30: to continue to be tailored to neighborhoods.  
00:46:30 --> 00:46:32: The affordability piece of it.  
00:46:32 --> 00:46:36: I'm hoping to see more public policy that that focus  
00:46:36 --> 00:46:38: on that focuses on that part.  
00:46:38 --> 00:46:41: I personally with the pace of development that we have  
00:46:41 --> 00:46:42: in the district,  
00:46:42 --> 00:46:46: I personally find it exhausting to be in a million  
00:46:46 --> 00:46:50: different conversations and trying to force the issue of  
affordable  
00:46:50 --> 00:46:51: housing.  
00:46:51 --> 00:46:53: I would like to see us have.  
00:46:53 --> 00:46:58: Mandatory inclusionary zoning that says that there there has  
to  
00:46:58 --> 00:47:01: be a level of affordability in development on sites.  
00:47:01 --> 00:47:05: I would like to see us use publicly owned vacant

00:47:05 --> 00:47:09: land more effectively towards you know housing that will be  
00:47:09 --> 00:47:11: affordable truly for the community.  
00:47:11 --> 00:47:13: So some of these things.  
00:47:13 --> 00:47:17: I'm hoping I think government has a responsibility to really  
00:47:17 --> 00:47:20: push on so that we're not having all of these  
00:47:20 --> 00:47:24: individual conversations that May or may not pan out.  
00:47:27 --> 00:47:28: Thank you David. Go ahead,  
00:47:28 --> 00:47:31: no, I was just saying I think I think a  
00:47:31 --> 00:47:33: lot of developers would get behind,  
00:47:33 --> 00:47:37: you know, some type of mandatory CBA for projects over.  
00:47:37 --> 00:47:40: You know, modest size because it's it's a known factor  
00:47:40 --> 00:47:42: that we're dealing with.  
00:47:42 --> 00:47:43: You know it is challenging.  
00:47:43 --> 00:47:47: We go into this and you don't know where the  
00:47:47 --> 00:47:50: requests are going to go and it can go.  
00:47:50 --> 00:47:54: From a healthy discussion towards you know.  
00:47:54 --> 00:47:56: To two wins battling, but I think if you can  
00:47:57 --> 00:47:59: go into a project and a piece of land you  
00:47:59 --> 00:48:00: know your costs.  
00:48:00 --> 00:48:03: What you don't know is where the CBA is going  
00:48:03 --> 00:48:03: to end up.  
00:48:03 --> 00:48:05: So if there were something set at,  
00:48:05 --> 00:48:07: you know at the citywide level.  
00:48:07 --> 00:48:10: It's it allows us to know what we're getting into,  
00:48:10 --> 00:48:13: and I think that would help a lot of people,  
00:48:13 --> 00:48:16: and it would save a lot of stress for councilpersons  
00:48:16 --> 00:48:17: community groups.  
00:48:17 --> 00:48:19: And you know, for us.  
00:48:19 --> 00:48:21: But it would also streamline.  
00:48:21 --> 00:48:23: You know this for everybody,  
00:48:23 --> 00:48:29: so I don't see that being something that developers oppose.  
00:48:29 --> 00:48:32: Thank you David, that was as close to an agreement  
00:48:32 --> 00:48:35: across all stakeholders that we're going to get.  
00:48:35 --> 00:48:36: So let's end on a high note.  
00:48:36 --> 00:48:40: I apologize that we didn't get to everyone's questions in  
00:48:40 --> 00:48:41: the chat,  
00:48:41 --> 00:48:44: let I encourage you to join and support your CEOs  
00:48:44 --> 00:48:47: an engage with your Council members on these topics so  
00:48:47 --> 00:48:51: that we can move forward into more sustainable and  
enforceable.  
00:48:51 --> 00:48:53: CBS and I will turn it back to Laura.  
00:48:53 --> 00:48:56: Thank you. Wonderful thank you so much to all of

00:48:56 --> 00:49:00: our panelists to Doctor Rodriguez and all of you for  
00:49:00 --> 00:49:04: submitting so many really important and interesting  
questions.

00:49:04 --> 00:49:08: The conversation obviously is much longer than the time that  
00:49:08 --> 00:49:09: we have allocated,  
00:49:09 --> 00:49:12: so I really do hope that you will continue to  
00:49:12 --> 00:49:16: engage with us and your organ in your local organizations  
00:49:16 --> 00:49:20: around these topics that were just talking about today.  
00:49:20 --> 00:49:22: So now I would like to switch gears.  
00:49:22 --> 00:49:26: We're going to hear from 2 presenters who will give.  
00:49:26 --> 00:49:29: Very specific examples of community engagement,  
00:49:29 --> 00:49:32: one in Philadelphia and one coming to us from Atlanta,  
00:49:32 --> 00:49:35: GA. So first we will hear from Tyrone Rashal,  
00:49:35 --> 00:49:38: president of Urban Key Capital Partners and member of the  
00:49:38 --> 00:49:39: UI public,  
00:49:39 --> 00:49:42: Private Private Partnership, National Product Council.  
00:49:42 --> 00:49:46: Tyrone will share trends on the public sector's role in  
00:49:46 --> 00:49:51: encouraging inclusive development and updated principles  
for community engagement.

00:49:51 --> 00:49:54: So Tyrone, I will pass things to you and a  
00:49:54 --> 00:49:55: reminder again,  
00:49:55 --> 00:49:56: will hear from 2 steak.  
00:49:56 --> 00:49:59: Those two presenters and then we will take questions again  
00:49:59 --> 00:50:01: from the chat at the end of that time,  
00:50:01 --> 00:50:05: so please feel free to continue that discussion so.  
00:50:05 --> 00:50:08: Tyrone, thanks Laura. Good morning everybody.  
00:50:08 --> 00:50:11: Hope everybody is well. Greetings from Atlanta,  
00:50:11 --> 00:50:15: GA. I realized that we're already behind in the schedule,  
00:50:15 --> 00:50:18: so I will make my thoughts quickly.  
00:50:18 --> 00:50:20: But really I am Tyrone Rochelle.  
00:50:20 --> 00:50:23: I am a private sector consultant now but at one  
00:50:23 --> 00:50:27: point in time I ran redevelopment for the City of  
00:50:27 --> 00:50:32: Atlanta through our development authority called investment  
Lana,  
00:50:32 --> 00:50:36: which is really the mechanism for negotiating complex public  
private.  
00:50:36 --> 00:50:40: Partnerships and I want to couch this in the context  
00:50:40 --> 00:50:44: of public private partnerships because typically when CBA is  
come  
00:50:44 --> 00:50:44: up,  
00:50:44 --> 00:50:48: you're really talking about an instance where a private  
developer  
00:50:48 --> 00:50:51: is receiving some type of incentive from the public sector

00:50:51 --> 00:50:55: which creates the need for an agreement for how benefits  
 00:50:55 --> 00:50:58: would be spread. And I think that's reasonable,  
 00:50:58 --> 00:51:01: right? If you're getting something in exchange for providing a  
 00:51:01 --> 00:51:03: public good and service,  
 00:51:03 --> 00:51:06: there should be an agreement around how that works.  
 00:51:06 --> 00:51:09: Whether or not the incentive is necessary and if it's  
 00:51:09 --> 00:51:11: achieving the goals that I mean,  
 00:51:11 --> 00:51:15: it's municipality would have, so I think that's appropriate  
 company  
 00:51:15 --> 00:51:17: to advance to the next slide please.  
 00:51:17 --> 00:51:19: And I started this as an activist,  
 00:51:19 --> 00:51:21: so I wasn't your typical government bureaucrat.  
 00:51:21 --> 00:51:23: I'm gonna lawyer investment banker,  
 00:51:23 --> 00:51:26: and I lived in a community in Atlanta that was  
 00:51:26 --> 00:51:29: being impacted by a large public private partnership called  
 the  
 00:51:29 --> 00:51:30: Atlanta Beltline.  
 00:51:30 --> 00:51:33: And I wanted to be involved in the conversation and  
 00:51:33 --> 00:51:36: I was appointed to an advisory committee with 45 of  
 00:51:36 --> 00:51:37: my closest friends.  
 00:51:37 --> 00:51:39: First of all, never do that.  
 00:51:39 --> 00:51:42: 45 people to get into a room to negotiate anything  
 00:51:42 --> 00:51:43: is chaos,  
 00:51:43 --> 00:51:45: and these were from you know,  
 00:51:45 --> 00:51:48: two dozen different neighborhoods around the city.  
 00:51:48 --> 00:51:52: So, but what I would like to talk about is  
 00:51:52 --> 00:51:53: how these P3.  
 00:51:53 --> 00:51:57: Arrangements are evolving, and particularly where we talk  
 about producing  
 00:51:57 --> 00:51:58: public benefit.  
 00:51:58 --> 00:52:00: If you could go to the next slide,  
 00:52:00 --> 00:52:02: please, and the way they're involving,  
 00:52:02 --> 00:52:06: we really think about the public sector and the private  
 00:52:06 --> 00:52:06: sector.  
 00:52:06 --> 00:52:08: Is these two homogeneous institutions,  
 00:52:08 --> 00:52:11: and they're not right. So these models that have been  
 00:52:11 --> 00:52:14: in an action for decades now that they're changing,  
 00:52:14 --> 00:52:18: particularly when resources are constrained and the projects  
 that are  
 00:52:18 --> 00:52:21: really trying to provide public goods and services that need  
 00:52:22 --> 00:52:22: resources right,  
 00:52:22 --> 00:52:26: affordable housing. But like I heard one of the Palace  
 00:52:26 --> 00:52:29: say it doesn't pencil out in certain communities where land

00:52:29 --> 00:52:30: costs is hard,

00:52:30 --> 00:52:33: right? And you're trying to drive affordability down to 3050%

00:52:33 --> 00:52:36: am eyes. It just doesn't happen with some type of

00:52:36 --> 00:52:36: help.

00:52:36 --> 00:52:39: And we called that help incentive that I and the

00:52:39 --> 00:52:42: first point that I'd like to say is an incentive

00:52:42 --> 00:52:43: is not a giveaway.

00:52:43 --> 00:52:47: I would encourage municipalities or think of incentives as

00:52:47 --> 00:52:50: investments

00:52:50 --> 00:52:53: in future benefits that would not have happened otherwise,

00:52:53 --> 00:52:54: and that could be affordable housing that could be parks

00:52:54 --> 00:52:55: and green space that could be.

00:52:55 --> 00:52:59: Increasing opportunities for job creation and small business

00:52:59 --> 00:53:02: growth.

00:52:59 --> 00:53:02: All of those things come into play in Atlanta.

00:53:02 --> 00:53:05: I'm very proud of how progressive our City has been

00:53:05 --> 00:53:06: around this.

00:53:06 --> 00:53:10: In fact, it's been so progressive that we just created

00:53:10 --> 00:53:12: our first citywide economic mobility plan,

00:53:12 --> 00:53:17: which intentionally economic mobility because it's not just

00:53:17 --> 00:53:19: talking about

00:53:17 --> 00:53:19: one input being affordable housing,

00:53:19 --> 00:53:21: but it's talking about how job quality,

00:53:21 --> 00:53:23: job creation and access occurs.

00:53:23 --> 00:53:26: Where do we spend our money right on?

00:53:26 --> 00:53:30: Affordable housing, can it be affordable to folks that have

00:53:30 --> 00:53:33: to travel is in their job centers very important because

00:53:33 --> 00:53:36: if I gotta now commute 2 hours to get to

00:53:36 --> 00:53:39: my job, I've lost some value right in time and

00:53:39 --> 00:53:41: effort and energy,

00:53:41 --> 00:53:44: but the biggest point that I would take here is

00:53:44 --> 00:53:45: that.

00:53:45 --> 00:53:50: These these agreements get difficult because they happen.

00:53:50 --> 00:53:52: From a transactional standpoint, right?

00:53:52 --> 00:53:55: I mean what that's going to be the toughest agreement

00:53:55 --> 00:53:57: where I'm doing something.

00:53:57 --> 00:54:01: You want something else. We've already made investment

00:54:01 --> 00:54:02: and their

00:54:01 --> 00:54:02: transactions are one off.

00:54:02 --> 00:54:04: So what we've tried to do in it here in

00:54:04 --> 00:54:07: Atlanta is take away the focus on one off transactional

00:54:07 --> 00:54:11: deals and look at this from a holistic perspective of

00:54:11 --> 00:54:14: community engagement and plan these benefits out before

there is

00:54:14 --> 00:54:15: a project,

00:54:15 --> 00:54:19: right? Because we all know that in these community organizations

00:54:19 --> 00:54:22: there there are handful of people that drive the discussion

00:54:22 --> 00:54:22: and.

00:54:22 --> 00:54:26: Oftentimes, I question whether those five people represent the interest

00:54:26 --> 00:54:28: of any particular community,

00:54:28 --> 00:54:30: so we want to hear everyone's voice up front.

00:54:30 --> 00:54:33: I'm gonna fly through this quickly so next slide,

00:54:33 --> 00:54:36: please. This is really what I'm trying to get to.

00:54:36 --> 00:54:39: We really been talking about in our Council at ULI.

00:54:39 --> 00:54:42: We got 100 people nationally that look at these stories

00:54:42 --> 00:54:43: from all across the country.

00:54:43 --> 00:54:46: And we've always concentrated on this public sector.

00:54:46 --> 00:54:50: Being the government, private sector being the big bad developer,

00:54:50 --> 00:54:52: right? And it's just not true,

00:54:52 --> 00:54:54: it's more sophisticated. In that particular,

00:54:54 --> 00:54:58: when you're talking about investing in distressed areas that don't

00:54:58 --> 00:55:00: normally attract traditional forms of capital,

00:55:00 --> 00:55:02: right? So the South side of our city.

00:55:02 --> 00:55:06: If there weren't partnerships that help create incentives to do

00:55:06 --> 00:55:07: certain things,

00:55:07 --> 00:55:09: you would have no development at all,

00:55:09 --> 00:55:11: because it's just harder to do so.

00:55:11 --> 00:55:13: We gotta add the people into this,

00:55:13 --> 00:55:16: and it seems like a presumption that the public sector

00:55:16 --> 00:55:17: and the people are the same.

00:55:17 --> 00:55:19: I would posit to you today or not,

00:55:19 --> 00:55:22: the public sector should represent the interest of all the

00:55:22 --> 00:55:23: people,

00:55:23 --> 00:55:25: but it's more complex. Then saying,

00:55:25 --> 00:55:29: hey, development authority going to this backroom and do what's

00:55:29 --> 00:55:30: best for us.

00:55:30 --> 00:55:32: I just don't think that works for anyone,

00:55:32 --> 00:55:35: so why not include what the people think early in

00:55:35 --> 00:55:38: the process before you embark on any type of master

00:55:38 --> 00:55:38: plan.

00:55:38 --> 00:55:42: Right now we know that you can't plan everything right.

00:55:42 --> 00:55:44: Some projects pop up that don't need any type of rezoning or need any type of subsidy from the city,

00:55:44 --> 00:55:47: so those are as of right there,

00:55:47 --> 00:55:49: other mechanisms to make those go the way that you need to.

00:55:52 --> 00:55:53: But I would argue that that is an important factor.

00:55:53 --> 00:55:56: In this next slide, please.

00:55:56 --> 00:55:59: Then I'll get to the nonprofit and philanthropic sectors in a bit.

00:55:59 --> 00:56:02: But really, this is kind of the point.

00:56:02 --> 00:56:03: Let's focus on equitable development and driving equity through economic

00:56:03 --> 00:56:05: mobility.

00:56:05 --> 00:56:09: I think those are the most sustainable ways to impact communities and make them better.

00:56:09 --> 00:56:10: And I'm really talking about communities that don't get a lot of investment at all,

00:56:10 --> 00:56:13: right? And you're gonna see this already happening because cities

00:56:13 --> 00:56:15: are strapped with resources,

00:56:15 --> 00:56:18: right? So to be able to balance those resources across different projects is going to.

00:56:18 --> 00:56:20: Get off Please.

00:56:20 --> 00:56:24: And I'll take these two together really,

00:56:24 --> 00:56:26: when we're talking about distressed communities,

00:56:26 --> 00:56:29: it isn't always the big bad developer,

00:56:29 --> 00:56:31: right? You have nonprofit stakeholders that in some of my communities drive projects,

00:56:31 --> 00:56:32: right? They they are mission based entities that are looking in the example of Covenant House Georgia.

00:56:32 --> 00:56:35: They're trying to help homeless children from 16 to 24 years old.

00:56:35 --> 00:56:37: They just did a project that I helped him close last year.

00:56:37 --> 00:56:39: That has tremendous benefits, not only for that community.

00:56:39 --> 00:56:42: Before our city. And I would argue that.

00:56:42 --> 00:56:45: Those risk return characteristics are different with these types of

00:56:45 --> 00:56:46: sponsors,

00:56:46 --> 00:56:50: so we have to acknowledge them,

00:56:50 --> 00:56:52: and on the next slide,

00:56:52 --> 00:56:55: many of the investors in these communities come from philanthropy,

00:56:55 --> 00:56:56:

00:56:56 --> 00:56:58:

00:56:58 --> 00:56:59:

00:56:59 --> 00:57:02:

00:57:02 --> 00:57:05:

00:57:05 --> 00:57:08:

00:57:08 --> 00:57:09:

00:57:09 --> 00:57:11:

00:57:11 --> 00:57:12:

00:57:12 --> 00:57:16:



00:57:16 --> 00:57:19: right? So when we're talking about philanthropic investors,  
00:57:19 --> 00:57:23: there's a different metric that they're using to make  
investments  
00:57:23 --> 00:57:26: in some of these communities and their project underwriting  
is  
00:57:26 --> 00:57:29: different and benefit is not always about money.  
00:57:29 --> 00:57:32: Sometimes benefit includes things that you don't think you  
can  
00:57:33 --> 00:57:33: measure,  
00:57:33 --> 00:57:35: but I would posit that there is a way to.  
00:57:35 --> 00:57:38: Measure benefits from increased safety.  
00:57:38 --> 00:57:43: More affordable housing, more retail in a particular  
community doesn't  
00:57:43 --> 00:57:43: have it.  
00:57:43 --> 00:57:46: Next slide, please. Then I hear I'm out of time  
00:57:46 --> 00:57:49: so I will go quickly through these and this is  
00:57:49 --> 00:57:52: where I spend most of my time is really on  
00:57:52 --> 00:57:56: financial tools, right? And when you're dealing with municipal  
programs  
00:57:56 --> 00:57:58: that are either making grants,  
00:57:58 --> 00:58:01: property tax abatements, some type of value that is being  
00:58:01 --> 00:58:04: given from the public sector to the private sector,  
00:58:04 --> 00:58:07: that transfer of value should have the expectation of some  
00:58:07 --> 00:58:10: type of framework with the Community benefits,  
00:58:10 --> 00:58:13: right? That is the reason why we are doing the  
00:58:13 --> 00:58:16: deal then why there is a need for incentive.  
00:58:16 --> 00:58:19: I'll give 2 examples really quickly 'cause I know I'm  
00:58:19 --> 00:58:20: running out of time.  
00:58:20 --> 00:58:23: Next slide we have a very big one in our  
00:58:23 --> 00:58:23: city,  
00:58:23 --> 00:58:26: the Atlanta Beltline and I think I mentioned to you  
00:58:26 --> 00:58:29: before just a very hairy project that really has changed  
00:58:29 --> 00:58:32: our city and I think in the positive way.  
00:58:32 --> 00:58:35: But there are also some lessons learned that we had  
00:58:35 --> 00:58:38: because once you create a very valuable asset in your  
00:58:38 --> 00:58:39: city,  
00:58:39 --> 00:58:42: that value is noticed by developers that want to build  
00:58:42 --> 00:58:43: around it right?  
00:58:43 --> 00:58:47: So how do you anticipate that future growth knowing that?  
00:58:47 --> 00:58:50: What's your building is automatically creating value,  
00:58:50 --> 00:58:51: so it's not an issue of.  
00:58:51 --> 00:58:53: Value creation is valued transferring,  
00:58:53 --> 00:58:57: distribution, and all of these components were in our

Community

00:58:57 --> 00:58:58: benefits framework,

00:58:58 --> 00:59:00: and I wouldn't call this a CBA.

00:59:00 --> 00:59:03: It was a larger framework and then when future projects

00:59:03 --> 00:59:04: come up,

00:59:04 --> 00:59:06: there are project specific Cbas that happen.

00:59:06 --> 00:59:10: But one example is we should bonds using tax increment

00:59:10 --> 00:59:13: finance for this district in this district is large.

00:59:13 --> 00:59:16: It's it's one of the largest tags tax allocation districts

00:59:16 --> 00:59:18: we have in the city.

00:59:18 --> 00:59:20: And the focus was affordable housing.

00:59:20 --> 00:59:22: So 15% of all. Net Bond sees went into a

00:59:22 --> 00:59:26: special fund that is used specifically to do mezzanine loan

00:59:26 --> 00:59:29: product grant products to developers that are willing to do

00:59:29 --> 00:59:32: affordable housing. So I won't go through that whole list

00:59:32 --> 00:59:36: 'cause I know I'm running longtime next slide please.

00:59:36 --> 00:59:38: We just did this one last month and and all

00:59:38 --> 00:59:40: of these aren't driven by the community,

00:59:40 --> 00:59:44: right? Sometimes the lenders want to see these community

benefits

00:59:45 --> 00:59:48: qualified so particularly with the new markets tax credit.

00:59:48 --> 00:59:51: Program where I've spent a lot of time and space.

00:59:51 --> 00:59:54: The lender themselves and want to see these outcomes and

00:59:54 --> 00:59:57: quantify them very specifically so that they can report to

00:59:57 --> 00:59:59: the Department of Treasury.

00:59:59 --> 01:00:01: Look at all the great things I did with my

01:00:01 --> 01:00:02: allocation.

01:00:02 --> 01:00:05: Now that I'm reapplying, I can repeat those outcomes and

01:00:05 --> 01:00:08: there's a list of outcomes that was just in one

01:00:08 --> 01:00:12: Community benefits agreement for a roughly 8.1 million

dollar investment,

01:00:12 --> 01:00:14: which isn't a huge investment in the city,

01:00:14 --> 01:00:16: but I think it was a way to to to

01:00:16 --> 01:00:18: get that going to just show that.

01:00:18 --> 01:00:21: It isn't just the public or private sector or the

01:00:21 --> 01:00:25: neighborhood associations that are driving this,

01:00:25 --> 01:00:28: but this evolving set of stakeholders also have a role

01:00:28 --> 01:00:30: in seeing these benefits realized.

01:00:30 --> 01:00:35: With that Kevin, I will hold for comments and then

01:00:35 --> 01:00:37: I'm next speaker get going.

01:00:37 --> 01:00:39: Thank you so much, Tyrone.

01:00:39 --> 01:00:41: Obviously a lot more we can learn from you.

01:00:41 --> 01:00:45: So look forward to continuing this conversation at the end

01:00:45 --> 01:00:47: so I will keep us moving.

01:00:47 --> 01:00:49: Now I will turn it to Maria Sourbeer,

01:00:49 --> 01:00:53: be our Vice President of development for Shift capital to

01:00:53 --> 01:00:57: share a case study on the recently completed Philadelphia project.

01:00:57 --> 01:01:02: Jason trial in Kensington and specifically how your project addressed

01:01:02 --> 01:01:05: some of these issues around community engagement.

01:01:05 --> 01:01:06: So go ahead and read it.

01:01:06 --> 01:01:11: Hello, good morning. Um? So Jason trial,

01:01:11 --> 01:01:13: you know, I was asked here,

01:01:13 --> 01:01:17: I think because we didn't do it CVA on this

01:01:17 --> 01:01:17: project.

01:01:17 --> 01:01:21: But we did address a lot of community programming and

01:01:21 --> 01:01:24: thinking through the process.

01:01:24 --> 01:01:27: So I'm going to talk about Jason Shell,

01:01:27 --> 01:01:29: which is a project in Kensington.

01:01:29 --> 01:01:32: You can move to the next slide.

01:01:32 --> 01:01:36: But first, I just wanted to introduce myself and I

01:01:36 --> 01:01:39: am an architect by license and education.

01:01:39 --> 01:01:44: But I came through. After architecture came through Akarere in

01:01:44 --> 01:01:48: on the nonprofit side of real estate and so I

01:01:48 --> 01:01:49: think.

01:01:49 --> 01:01:52: That gives me a very different perspective,

01:01:52 --> 01:01:54: an when shift was growing up,

01:01:54 --> 01:01:56: I was one of the first hires,

01:01:56 --> 01:01:59: I think because I look at things from an impact

01:01:59 --> 01:02:01: driven community driven POV,

01:02:01 --> 01:02:04: and maybe that's a little bit different than a typical

01:02:04 --> 01:02:05: development,

01:02:05 --> 01:02:08: so I'm definitely the one at the table saying,

01:02:08 --> 01:02:12: well, you know, how's that moving the needle right?

01:02:12 --> 01:02:15: How's that creating jobs? How's that you know,

01:02:15 --> 01:02:18: doing the things that real estate from our perspective is

01:02:18 --> 01:02:19: meant to do,

01:02:19 --> 01:02:23: and so. That's sort of how it comes with these

01:02:23 --> 01:02:23: things.

01:02:23 --> 01:02:24: Next slide.

01:02:26 --> 01:02:30: So just two minutes on shift where a place based,

01:02:30 --> 01:02:34: mission driven organization. So we started doing real estate in,

01:02:34 --> 01:02:39: specifically Northern Kensington, and so we have about 2 million

01:02:39 --> 01:02:43: square feet of property in the Kensington neighborhood,

01:02:43 --> 01:02:46: with the concept being if you focus all of your

01:02:46 --> 01:02:51: energy in one neighborhood and diversifying your asset classes,

01:02:51 --> 01:02:56: then potentially you're providing jobs in these large industrial buildings.

01:02:56 --> 01:02:59: If you're providing jobs, ideally someone might want to live

01:03:00 --> 01:03:01: near where they work,

01:03:01 --> 01:03:04: and so we wanted to provide housing and the commercial

01:03:04 --> 01:03:06: corridor is an important piece.

01:03:06 --> 01:03:08: If you're going to live there and work there,

01:03:08 --> 01:03:10: hopefully you want to shop there,

01:03:10 --> 01:03:13: and those three things together sort of create.

01:03:13 --> 01:03:17: Create a strong neighborhood and so you'll see here just

01:03:17 --> 01:03:19: some snippets of what we've done.

01:03:19 --> 01:03:23: So on the upper left that's making North that used

01:03:23 --> 01:03:24: to be jomar.

01:03:24 --> 01:03:28: Fabric San now it houses 60 about 60 small businesses

01:03:28 --> 01:03:31: on the bottom left is where we're negotiating.

01:03:31 --> 01:03:34: A CBA right now that's it's one one of our

01:03:34 --> 01:03:35: projects.

01:03:35 --> 01:03:40: Outside of Kensington, we have two projects outside Kensington and

01:03:40 --> 01:03:42: that's on N Broad St Jumpstart.

01:03:42 --> 01:03:46: Kensington is some program where we tried to provide education

01:03:46 --> 01:03:50: for folks in the neighborhood that want to get into

01:03:50 --> 01:03:55: development and learn about development and learn about real estate.

01:03:55 --> 01:03:58: You know where the opinion that it takes a village

01:03:58 --> 01:04:01: and that you know we want to help other people

01:04:01 --> 01:04:04: take advantage and and and participate.

01:04:04 --> 01:04:08: In the middle, there just quickly that was Kensington Storefront

01:04:08 --> 01:04:09: Challenge,

01:04:09 --> 01:04:12: which was us trying to brainstorm about how to reinvigorate

01:04:12 --> 01:04:14: the commercial corridor.

01:04:14 --> 01:04:17: We had a few properties that had commercial on the

01:04:17 --> 01:04:20: ground floor and we were trying to think through how

01:04:20 --> 01:04:22: to fill them and we had lots of ideas and

01:04:22 --> 01:04:25: it occurred to us that we should open up that

01:04:25 --> 01:04:28: thinking and so we ran a competition where we invited

01:04:28 --> 01:04:31: people to think with us about what would work well

01:04:31 --> 01:04:35: on that commercial corridor. And we offered a years free

01:04:35 --> 01:04:39: rent and some dollars Tord tenant fit out and.

01:04:39 --> 01:04:41: I can recall being very nervous that no one was

01:04:41 --> 01:04:42: going to apply,

01:04:42 --> 01:04:44: but we had about 30 applicants,

01:04:44 --> 01:04:47: an nine awards, and it's taken a few years.

01:04:47 --> 01:04:48: But so you know, we have,

01:04:48 --> 01:04:52: I think seven of those businesses up and functioning now.

01:04:52 --> 01:04:53: Next slide.

01:04:56 --> 01:04:58: I think you can move to the next slide that

01:04:58 --> 01:04:58: was,

01:04:58 --> 01:05:01: you know, I was just saying we had the almost

01:05:01 --> 01:05:03: 2 million square feet of property there,

01:05:03 --> 01:05:05: and that's sort of the statistics around it.

01:05:05 --> 01:05:08: So Kensington, if you're not familiar with Kensington,

01:05:08 --> 01:05:10: it is, uh, along the.

01:05:10 --> 01:05:14: Public transit line. Jason Trelyn specific is about a block

01:05:14 --> 01:05:16: from the Tioga station,

01:05:16 --> 01:05:19: which is an 18 minute ride to City Hall,

01:05:19 --> 01:05:23: half that to Fishtown, so it's very accessible and Jason

01:05:23 --> 01:05:26: Trails a 2 minute walk from that station,

01:05:26 --> 01:05:28: which is very important to us.

01:05:28 --> 01:05:33: Kensington in General is a challenged neighborhood with

01:05:33 --> 01:05:38: strong bones,

01:05:38 --> 01:05:41: right? There's a lot of dedicated people in the neighborhood

01:05:41 --> 01:05:45: fighting and working hard to maintain.

01:05:45 --> 01:05:49: A lifestyle that's healthy for their children and healthy for

01:05:49 --> 01:05:52: themselves and we're working with those folks to create.

01:05:52 --> 01:05:58: A platform of growth, you know,

01:05:58 --> 01:06:03: an opportunity for wealth building and just thoughtfulness

01:06:03 --> 01:06:06: around.

01:06:06 --> 01:06:06: Around investment in how we're growing in in Kensington.

01:06:06 --> 01:06:06: Next

01:06:06 --> 01:06:06: Netflix.

01:06:09 --> 01:06:12: So the project itself was a furniture store.

01:06:12 --> 01:06:14: Most recently it was diamond furniture.

01:06:14 --> 01:06:16: It's two buildings adjacent to each other,

01:06:16 --> 01:06:19: connected by what you'll see on the lower left is

01:06:19 --> 01:06:23: sort of a courtyard area 155 thousand square feet with

01:06:23 --> 01:06:26: commercial on the ground floor and residential above.

01:06:26 --> 01:06:29: This was our first foray into multifamily sort of mixed

01:06:29 --> 01:06:29: use.

01:06:29 --> 01:06:33: Previous to that, we were really focused on job creation,

01:06:33 --> 01:06:36: so the making North and making South ones that you

01:06:36 --> 01:06:39: saw in the previous slides were all small business driven

01:06:39 --> 01:06:40: where we said,

01:06:40 --> 01:06:43: you know. We're not going to get this single anchor,

01:06:43 --> 01:06:45: you know Coca Cola is not coming in to take

01:06:45 --> 01:06:46: the whole building.

01:06:46 --> 01:06:48: There's not going to be a single user,

01:06:48 --> 01:06:51: and so we went in and broke it the building

01:06:51 --> 01:06:53: up into smaller units so that we could bring in

01:06:53 --> 01:06:54: businesses.

01:06:54 --> 01:06:58: Thinking about who those businesses are an and finding like

01:06:58 --> 01:07:01: minded partners to house and work out of those spaces

01:07:01 --> 01:07:04: has been really challenging and exciting for us.

01:07:04 --> 01:07:08: You know, seeking folks who want to hire local and

01:07:08 --> 01:07:11: who have a similar mission is part of our ethos.

01:07:11 --> 01:07:14: And so you know, we're very excited to say that

01:07:14 --> 01:07:18: we have those buildings in making North at least stabilized

01:07:18 --> 01:07:21: and we can sell lots of leases in the pipeline

01:07:21 --> 01:07:24: despite Covid. And, um, you know,

01:07:24 --> 01:07:27: I was saying yesterday, it's really heartening to me to

01:07:27 --> 01:07:29: see how many new businesses are coming,

01:07:29 --> 01:07:32: despite the fact that you know the pandemic has been

01:07:32 --> 01:07:35: challenging for some businesses that didn't make it there.

01:07:35 --> 01:07:37: People are creative and steadfast,

01:07:37 --> 01:07:39: and so we're we're moving forward.

01:07:39 --> 01:07:43: So this building we decided we did debate what the

01:07:43 --> 01:07:45: best use was it for was for it,

01:07:45 --> 01:07:48: and if it should be light industrial commercial.

01:07:48 --> 01:07:53: But we landed on three stories of residential and commercial

01:07:53 --> 01:07:54: in the ground floor.

01:07:54 --> 01:07:58: I think mostly because it is nestled a little bit

01:07:58 --> 01:08:00: more away from the industrial piece.

01:08:00 --> 01:08:03: It is at the corner of Kensington Ave,

01:08:03 --> 01:08:07: Anna largely residential area and there is not an abundance

01:08:07 --> 01:08:09: of multifamily housing.

01:08:09 --> 01:08:10: So it is a neighborhood.

01:08:10 --> 01:08:14: But there's not a lot of opportunity for this kind

01:08:14 --> 01:08:16: of this kind of project,

01:08:16 --> 01:08:18: and so we're very excited about it.

01:08:18 --> 01:08:21: It's not a subsidized project,

01:08:21 --> 01:08:24: but we were successful in the large majority of the  
 01:08:24 --> 01:08:26: building is at the 6070%  
 01:08:26 --> 01:08:30: am I an after feedback from the neighborhood,  
 01:08:30 --> 01:08:32: we could find a way to bring in a couple  
 01:08:33 --> 01:08:33: units at 40%  
 01:08:33 --> 01:08:35: am I we had no CVI,  
 01:08:35 --> 01:08:37: but I would say.  
 01:08:37 --> 01:08:42: A common goal for affordability and job creation,  
 01:08:42 --> 01:08:46: and so we worked really hard in.  
 01:08:46 --> 01:08:50: With the contractor on making sure that there were minority  
 01:08:50 --> 01:08:53: and local local hires in the temporary construction jobs and  
 01:08:53 --> 01:08:55: when we're seeking leasing for the building,  
 01:08:55 --> 01:08:59: we certainly look for businesses that.  
 01:08:59 --> 01:09:03: Have have an interest so we have at the corner.  
 01:09:03 --> 01:09:07: Our anchor tenant is Cafe which is a Vietnamese coffee  
 01:09:07 --> 01:09:11: shop that is associated with the nonprofit called 12 +  
 01:09:11 --> 01:09:15: 12 Plus Works with high school students to help them  
 01:09:15 --> 01:09:19: understand the importance and get to higher education and  
 so  
 01:09:19 --> 01:09:24: they funnel those students from their nonprofit 12 plus to  
 01:09:24 --> 01:09:27: be employed at their retail location.  
 01:09:27 --> 01:09:30: That's going to open on the corner so they.  
 01:09:30 --> 01:09:32: There a roaster and retail,  
 01:09:32 --> 01:09:34: so they sell coffee and you can buy that now  
 01:09:34 --> 01:09:35: out of the Roastery,  
 01:09:35 --> 01:09:38: and soon they will be opening here to sell coffee  
 01:09:38 --> 01:09:39: over the counter.  
 01:09:39 --> 01:09:41: We're really excited about them.  
 01:09:41 --> 01:09:44: In addition we have if lab which would be idea  
 01:09:44 --> 01:09:48: Factory and they are small business incubator focused on  
 minority  
 01:09:48 --> 01:09:50: and impoverished neighborhoods,  
 01:09:50 --> 01:09:53: helping people sort of bring their idea to the next  
 01:09:53 --> 01:09:53: level.  
 01:09:53 --> 01:09:56: So they will also be front and center sort of  
 01:09:56 --> 01:10:00: right at the corner of the courtyard and J Street.  
 01:10:00 --> 01:10:02: Next slide I don't know how I'm going on time  
 01:10:02 --> 01:10:03: to it.  
 01:10:03 --> 01:10:05: I'm OK two minute warning.  
 01:10:05 --> 01:10:07: OK, so because there's not a lot of multi family  
 01:10:08 --> 01:10:09: in the neighborhood,  
 01:10:09 --> 01:10:13: we did a lot of brainstorming around how we can  
 01:10:13 --> 01:10:14: make sure that this.

01:10:14 --> 01:10:17: This building was special, like how do these people integrate  
 01:10:18 --> 01:10:20: into the neighborhood an after a lot of sort of  
 01:10:20 --> 01:10:22: back and forth and back and forth.  
 01:10:22 --> 01:10:24: We came up with a good neighbor program and so  
 01:10:24 --> 01:10:27: tenants in this building that were touting as the most  
 01:10:27 --> 01:10:30: civically engaged building in the country.  
 01:10:30 --> 01:10:31: Ideally when it opens at that,  
 01:10:31 --> 01:10:34: is our goal. The tenants in the building are incentivized  
 01:10:34 --> 01:10:37: financially to engage in the neighborhood so they can get  
 01:10:37 --> 01:10:40: up to a \$100 discount on their rent if they  
 01:10:40 --> 01:10:41: put up to four hours every month.  
 01:10:41 --> 01:10:44: So it's \$25.00 an hour towards the neighborhood.  
 01:10:44 --> 01:10:48: Neighborhood cleanups attend your Civic Association  
 meeting etc.  
 01:10:48 --> 01:10:51: So we have I think about 20 four partners right  
 01:10:51 --> 01:10:54: now including the hospital and the local CDC's etc that  
 01:10:54 --> 01:10:56: are going to help us track that.  
 01:10:56 --> 01:10:59: And if people for every hour they donate to the  
 01:10:59 --> 01:11:03: neighborhood every month they will get a discount on their  
 01:11:03 --> 01:11:03: rent.  
 01:11:03 --> 01:11:06: So the good neighbor. Hope program for us is a  
 01:11:06 --> 01:11:09: big incentive so that people will volunteer not only with  
 01:11:09 --> 01:11:10: the neighborhood,  
 01:11:10 --> 01:11:13: but potentially between one another.  
 01:11:13 --> 01:11:16: There are there's an opportunity for digital interaction as well  
 01:11:16 --> 01:11:19: as a lounge an community area where people where people  
 01:11:19 --> 01:11:23: can interact and with one another and in the neighborhood.  
 01:11:23 --> 01:11:26: In addition, we partnered with health plus which is an  
 01:11:26 --> 01:11:29: organization that provides Tele health so every tenant as a  
 01:11:29 --> 01:11:31: part of their rent has access to.  
 01:11:36 --> 01:11:39: I'm sorry to tell help where they can make a  
 01:11:39 --> 01:11:41: phone call and meet with the Doctor as well as  
 01:11:41 --> 01:11:45: a discount on any prescriptions that might come through that  
 01:11:45 --> 01:11:48: and then Rhino is a an organization that eliminates the  
 01:11:48 --> 01:11:52: need for security deposit so that security deposit would be  
 01:11:52 --> 01:11:55: a small fee like a couple of dollars per per  
 01:11:55 --> 01:11:58: month instead of a chunk needed at the beginning.  
 01:11:58 --> 01:12:01: So it allows people lower barrier of entry to move  
 01:12:01 --> 01:12:02: into the space.  
 01:12:02 --> 01:12:06: Next slide. And got a little bit more time out.  
 01:12:06 --> 01:12:09: C Pace is a part of our capital stack to  
 01:12:09 --> 01:12:11: help pay for the building.



01:12:11 --> 01:12:14: And so we were able to achieve some significant.  
 01:12:16 --> 01:12:20: Utility savings for tenants in the building so they are  
 01:12:20 --> 01:12:25: responsible for their electric bills and through this program  
 we  
 01:12:25 --> 01:12:29: were able to use energy efficient recovery units,  
 01:12:29 --> 01:12:33: LED lighting, better windows, local plumbing etc etc.  
 01:12:33 --> 01:12:37: In an effort to lower bills and lower our carbon  
 01:12:37 --> 01:12:38: footprint.  
 01:12:38 --> 01:12:40: Laugh like I think.  
 01:12:40 --> 01:12:43: And this was just, you know.  
 01:12:43 --> 01:12:45: We did a lot of outreach and tried to do  
 01:12:45 --> 01:12:48: our best to listen to people in the neighborhood.  
 01:12:48 --> 01:12:52: We interacted with the local Civic Association Association,  
 01:12:52 --> 01:12:56: two different CBCS, the Locust local business associations  
 we attended  
 01:12:56 --> 01:12:58: all over their meetings.  
 01:12:58 --> 01:13:00: We gave presentations we allowed for,  
 01:13:00 --> 01:13:04: you know, open communication. They could email us or you  
 01:13:04 --> 01:13:04: know,  
 01:13:04 --> 01:13:06: or at anytime or call us at anytime.  
 01:13:06 --> 01:13:10: We had multiple meetings with the Arceo and actually even.  
 01:13:12 --> 01:13:14: Went back so we were at our formal arceo because  
 01:13:15 --> 01:13:15: of our zoning.  
 01:13:15 --> 01:13:18: You know that everybody talked about as part of the  
 01:13:18 --> 01:13:19: process,  
 01:13:19 --> 01:13:21: but at that meeting people weren't satisfied.  
 01:13:21 --> 01:13:23: They still had further further,  
 01:13:23 --> 01:13:25: you know they wanted us to push harder and so  
 01:13:25 --> 01:13:26: we said,  
 01:13:26 --> 01:13:27: well, let's not vote tonight,  
 01:13:27 --> 01:13:30: you know, let's take take some time and we did  
 01:13:30 --> 01:13:31: go back and we thought,  
 01:13:31 --> 01:13:34: you know we got creative about providing more parking and  
 01:13:34 --> 01:13:36: finding a way to increase affordability.  
 01:13:36 --> 01:13:39: And so we try our best to.  
 01:13:39 --> 01:13:42: Despite the fact that we didn't have a CBA.  
 01:13:42 --> 01:13:44: Put our money where our mouth is like.  
 01:13:44 --> 01:13:47: We have a common goal angwe the CBA.  
 01:13:47 --> 01:13:50: Could have been a formalization of those things,  
 01:13:50 --> 01:13:52: and I think that's what people were talking about before,  
 01:13:52 --> 01:13:53: but in this case.  
 01:13:56 --> 01:13:59: We did those things without a formal informal agreement and

01:14:00 --> 01:14:00: ideally.

01:14:00 --> 01:14:01: I'd like to you know,

01:14:01 --> 01:14:04: I like to think that we were very successful at

01:14:04 --> 01:14:05: it at this project.

01:14:09 --> 01:14:12: Great. Thank you so much Maria.

01:14:12 --> 01:14:15: Congratulations on the project and really great to hear a

01:14:15 --> 01:14:19: different very different example than what we just discussed.

01:14:19 --> 01:14:21: So now we have time for questions.

01:14:21 --> 01:14:24: So Tyrone. If you could please on reentering your videos

01:14:24 --> 01:14:25: back on,

01:14:25 --> 01:14:27: you know we have a lot more to hear from

01:14:27 --> 01:14:30: you both so I'll start with the first which actually

01:14:30 --> 01:14:33: I was very excited to hear Maria that you see

01:14:33 --> 01:14:35: pace in your capital. So yeah,

01:14:35 --> 01:14:38: do you have a question about that?

01:14:38 --> 01:14:40: You use that for the residential portion.

01:14:40 --> 01:14:42: This is a priest, no,

01:14:42 --> 01:14:44: no, it was very specific around the commercial an we

01:14:44 --> 01:14:47: were well into the project when we realized we had

01:14:47 --> 01:14:49: a gap and so we did have to go back

01:14:49 --> 01:14:50: and condo as the project.

01:14:50 --> 01:14:53: So we went back in the two commercial levels of

01:14:53 --> 01:14:57: each of the buildings are their own separate separate

condos.

01:14:57 --> 01:15:00: Got it. Great, so I'll again remind the audience you

01:15:00 --> 01:15:04: can go ahead and place your questions into the chat

01:15:04 --> 01:15:05: on either project.

01:15:05 --> 01:15:08: It's even want to mention I forgot to mention that

01:15:08 --> 01:15:10: you know before I came to shift I worked on

01:15:10 --> 01:15:11: the nonprofit side.

01:15:11 --> 01:15:14: I was. I led the real estate team for North

01:15:14 --> 01:15:15: Square and I wrote,

01:15:15 --> 01:15:18: you know, I led the Community Benefits agreement for a

01:15:18 --> 01:15:21: local project that's under construction there now and it was

01:15:21 --> 01:15:24: so interesting to me to sit on both sides of

01:15:24 --> 01:15:25: the table, right? You know,

01:15:25 --> 01:15:27: when I came to shift I was like,

01:15:27 --> 01:15:30: wow, you know it would be asking for this.

01:15:30 --> 01:15:32: If I if I were sitting over there and so

01:15:32 --> 01:15:36: I want to make sure we're providing this over here,

01:15:36 --> 01:15:38: and so the formalization of that,

01:15:38 --> 01:15:41: I'll be important like the end result is what what

01:15:41 --> 01:15:44: we what we tried to try to do right,  
01:15:44 --> 01:15:47: and so I hopefully hopefully have taken us there.  
01:15:47 --> 01:15:50: Absolutely, that's a great point and I have to take  
01:15:51 --> 01:15:53: this 2 seconds to make a plug for urban plan  
01:15:54 --> 01:15:54: program,  
01:15:54 --> 01:15:59: which is exactly providing participants opportunity to get into  
different  
01:15:59 --> 01:16:01: roles on a fake project.  
01:16:01 --> 01:16:04: And as I said mentioned this at the beginning but  
01:16:04 --> 01:16:07: will be doing this with a group of RC Ozanne  
01:16:07 --> 01:16:10: community leaders in Philadelphia in a couple of weeks,  
01:16:10 --> 01:16:13: so hopefully I know we have a lot of participants  
01:16:13 --> 01:16:15: on this call in that program.  
01:16:15 --> 01:16:19: So that's that's exciting and something we're looking forward  
to.  
01:16:19 --> 01:16:22: So Tyrone, you talk, you touched on a lot of  
01:16:22 --> 01:16:26: really interesting mechanisms that you're looking at in  
Atlanta.  
01:16:26 --> 01:16:30: I wonder if you could share if you coming into  
01:16:30 --> 01:16:31: a different municipality.  
01:16:31 --> 01:16:35: And hearing a little bit about what's happening in  
Philadelphia,  
01:16:35 --> 01:16:39: we have a big group today of practitioners from around  
01:16:39 --> 01:16:40: the industry.  
01:16:40 --> 01:16:42: Kind of. Do you have advice or something?  
01:16:42 --> 01:16:45: A couple of specific things that you would want to  
01:16:46 --> 01:16:48: share with our group in Philadelphia?  
01:16:48 --> 01:16:50: Oh man, I could. I could bore you,  
01:16:50 --> 01:16:54: but the one takeaway in this and I see questions  
01:16:54 --> 01:16:55: popping up of.  
01:16:55 --> 01:16:58: How can you do? CBA is if development is as  
01:16:58 --> 01:17:02: of right and there's nothing needed from the municipality.  
01:17:02 --> 01:17:03: I mean, I I would.  
01:17:03 --> 01:17:06: I would try and take it away from the one  
01:17:06 --> 01:17:09: off transactional nature of negotiating agreements,  
01:17:09 --> 01:17:12: right? I mean that if you have the framework right  
01:17:12 --> 01:17:17: and the development community understands what you're  
trying to do  
01:17:17 --> 01:17:18: around the beltline,  
01:17:18 --> 01:17:22: for an example, these aren't surprised conversations when  
they come  
01:17:22 --> 01:17:23: up right,  
01:17:23 --> 01:17:27: particularly if they're trying to induce some type of benefit.

01:17:27 --> 01:17:31: They wouldn't otherwise be able to be induced right?

01:17:31 --> 01:17:35: We hear about in I'm talking true public private partnerships

01:17:35 --> 01:17:39: right where there's capital going into capital stats for private

01:17:39 --> 01:17:43: developers where it should not be a surprise that this

01:17:43 --> 01:17:45: is not just moderating down right there.

01:17:45 --> 01:17:49: This is an investment by the public sector and trying

01:17:49 --> 01:17:51: to achieve certain outcomes.

01:17:51 --> 01:17:53: So the one thing I would do is it if

01:17:54 --> 01:17:57: you could keep these less transactional and one off.

01:17:57 --> 01:18:01: And create frameworks that help codifies the types of things

01:18:01 --> 01:18:03: that your community wants.

01:18:03 --> 01:18:05: That's gonna work better for you,

01:18:05 --> 01:18:08: right? I mean that the worst time to ask somebody

01:18:08 --> 01:18:11: for something is when you want it when you need

01:18:11 --> 01:18:12: it,

01:18:12 --> 01:18:13: right?

01:18:13 --> 01:18:16: Down the road and you find out that you need

01:18:16 --> 01:18:19: something that train has left the building.

01:18:19 --> 01:18:21: That's going to be a very hard negotiation,

01:18:21 --> 01:18:25: so I would encourage everyone to think about larger

frameworks.

01:18:25 --> 01:18:27: In the case of Atlanta,

01:18:27 --> 01:18:30: we put together an economic mobility plan where we

included

01:18:30 --> 01:18:33: a broad section of the entire cities community to ask

01:18:33 --> 01:18:37: them whether the types of things that would help enhance

01:18:37 --> 01:18:40: our entire community and we approach it holistically,

01:18:40 --> 01:18:43: not to mean that there won't be separate agreements.

01:18:43 --> 01:18:45: On a project by project basis,

01:18:45 --> 01:18:49: but I think it really did require some upfront thought

01:18:49 --> 01:18:52: and we could at least say there was broad participation

01:18:52 --> 01:18:55: and not just the five largest people in the room

01:18:55 --> 01:18:58: trying to drive through what's important to them.

01:18:58 --> 01:19:00: So I think it's more holistic that way.

01:19:03 --> 01:19:05: That's great, thank you so much.

01:19:05 --> 01:19:09: Like we have a couple of comments and thanks to

01:19:10 --> 01:19:11: Maria on the project.

01:19:11 --> 01:19:15: Could you let see Maria speak to any of the

01:19:15 --> 01:19:17: challenges that you face?

01:19:17 --> 01:19:21: Or maybe in the project where you discuss that you're

01:19:21 --> 01:19:23: looking at a CBA right now?

01:19:23 --> 01:19:28: Maybe some specific examples around that negotiation that

you could

01:19:29 --> 01:19:30: share with the group.

01:19:30 --> 01:19:33: Sure, you know it is 1 where it was.

01:19:33 --> 01:19:36: By right, I saw somebody asking you know,

01:19:36 --> 01:19:39: how do you do it when it's by right?

01:19:39 --> 01:19:41: And in this case I did,

01:19:41 --> 01:19:43: we had to go through.

01:19:43 --> 01:19:47: The Civic design review. But other than that it was

01:19:47 --> 01:19:48: a buy write project.

01:19:48 --> 01:19:52: I think we got to a CBA because we had

01:19:52 --> 01:19:56: been talking so long with the community like we had.

01:19:56 --> 01:19:59: Informally, we had common goals already,

01:19:59 --> 01:20:01: and so when they proposed a CBA,

01:20:01 --> 01:20:04: I think we were just open to it because we'd

01:20:04 --> 01:20:07: already think we were all clear on what the goals

01:20:07 --> 01:20:10: were and the fact that it would make them more

01:20:10 --> 01:20:13: comfortable and us more accountable to have it.

01:20:13 --> 01:20:17: We were already there like it had been years in

01:20:17 --> 01:20:18: the making.

01:20:18 --> 01:20:21: It's a challenging project, I think because shift doesn't

01:20:21 --> 01:20:23: necessarily

01:20:21 --> 01:20:23: do a lot of public subsidy,

01:20:23 --> 01:20:26: and so the project budgets are really tight.

01:20:26 --> 01:20:27: We're not a Brandywine, right?

01:20:27 --> 01:20:29: We're not a big big developer,

01:20:29 --> 01:20:31: and so our budgets tend to be really tight,

01:20:31 --> 01:20:34: and if there's not public subsidy involved,

01:20:34 --> 01:20:35: you know we're out there.

01:20:35 --> 01:20:39: Writing grants and getting scrappy about our capital stack.

01:20:39 --> 01:20:41: But there's not a lot of fluff to say.

01:20:41 --> 01:20:43: Well, we're going to provide this extra,

01:20:43 --> 01:20:44: and so I think that.

01:20:47 --> 01:20:50: Educating on sort of the strata of what is a

01:20:50 --> 01:20:54: developer has been has been an important part because I

01:20:54 --> 01:20:57: think you used the word developer and everybody thinks.

01:20:57 --> 01:20:59: We're rolling in dough right?

01:20:59 --> 01:21:01: And and that isn't always the case until I think

01:21:02 --> 01:21:04: you need to be realistic and an an open about

01:21:04 --> 01:21:08: communication and what's possible and where the flexibility

01:21:08 --> 01:21:11: points are

01:21:08 --> 01:21:11: like. Well, yeah, somethings totally doable like we can you

01:21:11 --> 01:21:11: know jobs.

01:21:11 --> 01:21:13: I think jobs on the short term,

01:21:13 --> 01:21:16: the construction jobs we're absolutely committed to that and we

01:21:17 --> 01:21:19: want to sort of beat with the city standard is

01:21:19 --> 01:21:22: and do better there because you don't want to bring

01:21:22 --> 01:21:24: a big project to a neighborhood and not benefit the

01:21:25 --> 01:21:26: people that live right there.

01:21:26 --> 01:21:29: And that's really important to us.

01:21:29 --> 01:21:32: At the same time, I don't know who the end

01:21:32 --> 01:21:33: users are going to be.

01:21:33 --> 01:21:36: I'm committed to finding.

01:21:36 --> 01:21:40: Like minded leaseholders who want to hire local and want

01:21:40 --> 01:21:41: to but.

01:21:41 --> 01:21:44: But when I haven't identified them yet and the project

01:21:44 --> 01:21:46: won't sing or work without a lease in place,

01:21:46 --> 01:21:49: I'm very much hamstrung to say I'm going to commit

01:21:49 --> 01:21:52: for someone I haven't even met yet and so that

01:21:52 --> 01:21:54: has been really an interesting part.

01:21:54 --> 01:21:55: Where yes, we want to do that,

01:21:55 --> 01:21:58: but I can't promise something that you know you can't

01:21:59 --> 01:22:00: promise what you can't promise,

01:22:00 --> 01:22:04: so that's been very sticky and kind of like.

01:22:04 --> 01:22:06: Figuring out a creative way to get where we want

01:22:06 --> 01:22:09: to go without committing to something that I just can't

01:22:09 --> 01:22:10: promise.

01:22:10 --> 01:22:11: But but you want to promise,

01:22:11 --> 01:22:14: right? Like that's something that's important to the deal,

01:22:14 --> 01:22:14: but.

01:22:17 --> 01:22:19: But you have to find that partner.

01:22:19 --> 01:22:21: Thank you, I don't know Tyrone.

01:22:21 --> 01:22:24: If you want to fall into that with any.

01:22:24 --> 01:22:27: Thoughts on an example? Building about Maria just said no,

01:22:27 --> 01:22:29: no, not not, not necessarily,

01:22:29 --> 01:22:32: but I see some things that are coming up in

01:22:32 --> 01:22:36: the chat which you know to help you move it

01:22:36 --> 01:22:36: along it.

01:22:36 --> 01:22:40: Equal to build the equitable development is really what I'm

01:22:40 --> 01:22:40: saying.

01:22:40 --> 01:22:44: Major cities start to concentrate on right because each

01:22:44 --> 01:22:45: community

01:22:44 --> 01:22:45: is different.

01:22:45 --> 01:22:48: But I would argue that many of these communities have

01:22:48 --> 01:22:51: similar things and not just in your city and across

01:22:51 --> 01:22:52: the country,

01:22:52 --> 01:22:54: right? And and if that's the case I could argue  
 01:22:54 --> 01:22:58: that if you put five different people in that Neighborhood  
 01:22:58 --> 01:22:59: Association room,  
 01:22:59 --> 01:23:03: you probably have different thoughts on what's important  
 also right?  
 01:23:03 --> 01:23:06: So I'm not trying to concentrate on what's dissimilar,  
 01:23:06 --> 01:23:09: what's different, but there are things that.  
 01:23:09 --> 01:23:13: Are needed in particularly distressed communities that I think  
 if  
 01:23:13 --> 01:23:16: we spend our effort and time and resources on those  
 01:23:16 --> 01:23:17: things,  
 01:23:17 --> 01:23:20: we get better outcomes. One in our city we have  
 01:23:20 --> 01:23:21: an oversized,  
 01:23:21 --> 01:23:25: I think, minority small business community that isn't looking  
 for  
 01:23:25 --> 01:23:26: necessarily.  
 01:23:26 --> 01:23:28: Jaw retail jobs in our community.  
 01:23:28 --> 01:23:31: They could care less if a \$10 job opened up  
 01:23:31 --> 01:23:32: in their community,  
 01:23:32 --> 01:23:35: but want to figure out how they can take their  
 01:23:35 --> 01:23:40: businesses and take advantage of changing communities  
 without being displaced  
 01:23:40 --> 01:23:40: right?  
 01:23:40 --> 01:23:45: With growing market share an if you can help those  
 01:23:45 --> 01:23:46: small business.  
 01:23:46 --> 01:23:49: Owners, they are the people that are driving hiring down  
 01:23:49 --> 01:23:52: the road that look like people in these communities,  
 01:23:52 --> 01:23:54: right? I would argue that my company,  
 01:23:54 --> 01:23:55: which is a small NB,  
 01:23:55 --> 01:23:58: is more likely to hire someone that couldn't get some  
 01:23:58 --> 01:24:00: of these other jobs right.  
 01:24:00 --> 01:24:02: So if you help those people,  
 01:24:02 --> 01:24:04: I think you build organically from the ground up in  
 01:24:05 --> 01:24:05: small business,  
 01:24:05 --> 01:24:08: lending in programs that that isn't.  
 01:24:08 --> 01:24:11: That isn't unique to a particular neighborhood,  
 01:24:11 --> 01:24:14: right? I mean, that is something where you can build  
 01:24:14 --> 01:24:14: a program,  
 01:24:14 --> 01:24:17: figure out what resources are requirement,  
 01:24:17 --> 01:24:19: have the full faith of the city behind you,  
 01:24:19 --> 01:24:22: and helping to roll this out in a broader way  
 01:24:22 --> 01:24:23: where you have more impact.  
 01:24:23 --> 01:24:27: You know, instead of negotiating 1000 separate agreements

01:24:27 --> 01:24:31: with developers  
to try and get small business programs within those agreements,

01:24:31 --> 01:24:33: why not? Why not think big about this?

01:24:33 --> 01:24:36: Yeah, I think that speaks to David's point where he

01:24:36 --> 01:24:37: was saying,

01:24:37 --> 01:24:38: you know, as a developer.

01:24:38 --> 01:24:41: We would know we were stepping into if there were

01:24:41 --> 01:24:41: some broad,

01:24:41 --> 01:24:44: broad strokes that defined what the parameters were.

01:24:46 --> 01:24:49: Oh, that's a good one in your chatroom.

01:24:49 --> 01:24:52: My access to health and educational opportunities.

01:24:52 --> 01:24:55: It's a peeve of mine because I don't.

01:24:55 --> 01:24:58: I believe the one thing that does equalize people the

01:24:59 --> 01:25:02: most is access to educational opportunities.

01:25:02 --> 01:25:05: So they're definitely way that's a good example of talking

01:25:06 --> 01:25:07: about on a citywide basis.

01:25:07 --> 01:25:10: How are we going to increase that access?

01:25:10 --> 01:25:14: What it looks like codifying put it into city legislation

01:25:14 --> 01:25:16: and then as projects come up?

01:25:16 --> 01:25:21: Either whether it's through zoning overlay around a high growth

01:25:21 --> 01:25:23: area in your part of town,

01:25:23 --> 01:25:27: or whether or not a specific incentives designed for educational

01:25:27 --> 01:25:28: assets,

01:25:28 --> 01:25:31: or developers of them. There's a way to tackle these

01:25:31 --> 01:25:33: more efficiently,

01:25:33 --> 01:25:37: faster and with more benefit than going one off CBA

01:25:37 --> 01:25:37: with.

01:25:37 --> 01:25:42: But in Atlanta, no Neighborhood Association thinks about the same

01:25:42 --> 01:25:42: thing,

01:25:42 --> 01:25:45: even when I mean that you would really chase your

01:25:45 --> 01:25:47: tail forever doing that.

01:25:47 --> 01:25:51: So in the 70s we qualified something called neighborhood planning

01:25:51 --> 01:25:51: units,

01:25:51 --> 01:25:55: where those community organizations roll up into an MPU and

01:25:55 --> 01:25:58: they have a true voice and work with the city

01:25:58 --> 01:26:01: on prospects of rezoning and a lot of these issues.

01:26:01 --> 01:26:03: So it's like that in many cities.

01:26:03 --> 01:26:06: But I tell you to have to talk with.



01:26:06 --> 01:26:09: Each party that isn't in the best position to negotiate

01:26:09 --> 01:26:11: a CBA really think about it right?

01:26:11 --> 01:26:14: I mean that that is a that is a relationship

01:26:14 --> 01:26:19: where you have asymmetrical information between a developer that negotiates

01:26:19 --> 01:26:22: agreements everyday and fire people in this room.

01:26:22 --> 01:26:26: So why not give it the support and importance that

01:26:26 --> 01:26:27: it needs citywide?

01:26:27 --> 01:26:30: Yeah, these great points. Thank you so much and and

01:26:30 --> 01:26:31: thinking about this,

01:26:31 --> 01:26:35: you know, holistically, equitably an across multiple projects is,

01:26:35 --> 01:26:37: I think, a great lesson from today.

01:26:37 --> 01:26:39: And I see we did have some questions for the

01:26:39 --> 01:26:40: Councilwoman.

01:26:40 --> 01:26:42: Feel free to answer in the chat.

01:26:42 --> 01:26:44: We are coming on time and I want to be

01:26:44 --> 01:26:45: respectful for everyone.

01:26:45 --> 01:26:47: But you can go ahead.

01:26:47 --> 01:26:50: And I will say, the Pennsylvania Philadelphia Association of CDC's

01:26:50 --> 01:26:52: may have some information.

01:26:52 --> 01:26:55: Obviously, feel free to reach out to your council person

01:26:55 --> 01:26:58: and the Councilwoman if you want to drop some information

01:26:58 --> 01:26:59: in there.

01:26:59 --> 01:27:02: Please do obviously will continue to try to convene these

01:27:02 --> 01:27:03: discussions.

01:27:03 --> 01:27:05: There's so much more to talk about,

01:27:05 --> 01:27:07: not just around this particular area,

01:27:07 --> 01:27:11: but I love that the group our Council really thought

01:27:11 --> 01:27:13: about not just a Community benefits agreement,

01:27:13 --> 01:27:17: but other broader ways of engaging a community and thinking

01:27:17 --> 01:27:19: about equity as we look at projects.

01:27:19 --> 01:27:22: So I will end here by just thanking everybody for

01:27:22 --> 01:27:23: participating.

01:27:23 --> 01:27:26: This is such an important conversation.

01:27:26 --> 01:27:29: Thank you to our presenters are sponsors in the community

01:27:29 --> 01:27:29: and.

01:27:29 --> 01:27:33: Economic Development Council for putting the event together.

01:27:33 --> 01:27:35: Thank you all for being here.

01:27:35 --> 01:27:38: We really appreciate your participation and your time.

01:27:38 --> 01:27:40: As I mentioned at the beginning,  
01:27:40 --> 01:27:42: you lie is here for you.  
01:27:42 --> 01:27:44: We would love to meet folks who are here for  
01:27:44 --> 01:27:45: the first time.  
01:27:45 --> 01:27:48: We would love for you to get involved by joining  
01:27:48 --> 01:27:50: by joining one of our counsels.  
01:27:50 --> 01:27:53: Or you can sit in on anything before you make  
01:27:53 --> 01:27:54: that leap.  
01:27:54 --> 01:27:57: Here are some additional upcoming programs that you can  
see  
01:27:57 --> 01:28:00: here this week on post Pandemic retail.  
01:28:00 --> 01:28:02: January 26th we have a member breakfast.  
01:28:02 --> 01:28:06: That's informal. We'll hear about real estate development and  
other  
01:28:06 --> 01:28:08: social equity project in Philadelphia.  
01:28:08 --> 01:28:11: And then on February 2nd we have a virtual open  
01:28:11 --> 01:28:13: house that's again an informal,  
01:28:13 --> 01:28:16: casual way for people to talk to one another and  
01:28:16 --> 01:28:18: hear more about how to get engaged.  
01:28:18 --> 01:28:20: And there's a lot more where that came from.  
01:28:20 --> 01:28:22: So then you'll also see in the chat,  
01:28:22 --> 01:28:26: Kevin dropped a survey. Your feedback is so important.  
01:28:26 --> 01:28:27: It really we really do value it.  
01:28:27 --> 01:28:30: It helps us shape things and how we move things.  
01:28:30 --> 01:28:33: Or hear you lie so if you could please take  
01:28:33 --> 01:28:36: a few minutes to just click on that probably one  
01:28:36 --> 01:28:39: minute tell us what you thought about today and we  
01:28:39 --> 01:28:40: hope to see you all again soon.  
01:28:40 --> 01:28:43: Thank you so much for an important conversation.  
01:28:43 --> 01:28:46: Everybody stay well nice to see you take care.  
01:28:46 --> 01:28:47: Thank you.

---

*This video transcript has been machine-generated, so it may not be accurate. It is for personal use only. Reproduction or use without written permission is prohibited. If you have a correction or for permission inquiries, please contact [\[email protected\]](#).*