

Webinar

ULI Ireland: Promoting Affordable Housing

Date: July 02, 2020

00:00:03> 00:00:07:	How everyone and welcome. It's now 12:30,
00:00:07> 00:00:11:	so we will begin. Hello and welcome to today's webinar
00:00:11> 00:00:16:	by the Urban Land Institute on Promoting Housing
	Affordability and
00:00:16> 00:00:21:	recognizing the recent release of the ULI Report on Best
00:00:21> 00:00:25:	Practices to deliver intermediate housing at scale.
00:00:25> 00:00:26:	My name is Tom Faulkner.
00:00:26> 00:00:28:	I'm a development director with Hines,
00:00:28> 00:00:31:	Ireland and a member of the ULI Young Leaders Committee.
00:00:31> 00:00:34:	I'll be moderating today's webinar.
00:00:34> 00:00:37:	Firstly, I'd like to thank the ULI Island for arranging
00:00:37> 00:00:42:	and hosting today's webinar and especially Andy Kessler
	national coordinator
00:00:42> 00:00:45:	for your Lie Island for organizing it.
00:00:45> 00:00:46:	I'd also like to thank Tom,
00:00:46> 00:00:49:	done the chair of LLR Qli Ireland and I'll be
00:00:49> 00:00:53:	handing over to Tom for his closing remarks at the
00:00:53> 00:00:54:	end of today's discussion.
00:00:54> 00:00:57:	We will endeavour to stick to the hour and to
00:00:57> 00:00:58:	wrap up by 1:30 PM,
00:00:58> 00:01:01:	but we do have a few minutes provided to go
00:01:01> 00:01:03:	a little bit over there.
00:01:03> 00:01:05:	I have the honor of being joined today by a
00:01:05> 00:01:07:	very distinguished panel,
00:01:07> 00:01:09:	and I'll introduce them shortly,
00:01:09> 00:01:12:	followed by some brief opening comments.
00:01:12> 00:01:15:	The panel will engage in a discussion in response to
00:01:15> 00:01:18:	those opening comments and field questions from you,
00:01:18> 00:01:21:	the audience, and that is really the purpose of today.
00:01:21> 00:01:24:	This is for you, the UI island members and hopefully

00:01:25> 00:01:28:	providing an opportunity to really engage in this discussion.
00:01:28> 00:01:32:	We very much encourage your questions and please do submit
00:01:32> 00:01:35:	them via the Q&A function on the Zoom toolbar.
00:01:35> 00:01:37:	We will do our best to get through as many
00:01:37> 00:01:39:	questions as we can within the hour,
00:01:39> 00:01:43:	and this webinar is being recorded and will be made
00:01:43> 00:01:44:	available.
00:01:44> 00:01:46:	If you haven't seen the report,
00:01:46> 00:01:49:	we would strongly encourage you to have a look.
00:01:49> 00:01:52:	I notice that the UI island guys emailed that out
00:01:52> 00:01:54:	to all registered attendees this morning,
00:01:54> 00:01:57:	and if you didn't see that it is available via
00:01:57> 00:02:01:	the UI Knowledge Finder along with the European webcast
	for
00:02:01> 00:02:01:	its release,
00:02:01> 00:02:06:	and you can Alternatively email Ireland at uli.org for a
00:02:06> 00:02:07:	copy of the report.
00:02:07> 00:02:10:	I understand that there are on today we have many
00:02:11> 00:02:17:	registered attendees which include representatives from many stakeholders across Ireland
00:02:17> 00:02:21:	and organisations with responsibility for the provision of homes,
00:02:21> 00:02:26:	including public and private sectors and elected representatives.
00:02:26> 00:02:29:	Welcome everyone now to introduce the panel.
00:02:29> 00:02:35:	The panel today consists of distinguished experts who may.
00:02:35> 00:02:38:	Who may be familiar to you as leaders in European,
00:02:38> 00:02:40:	an Irish real estate, namely,
00:02:40> 00:02:41:	we have joining us today.
00:02:41> 00:02:45:	Have your younger the Managing director of Catela residential investment
00:02:45> 00:02:49:	management of Year was in the steering group responsible for
00:02:49> 00:02:53:	the promoting affordable housing Report and Javier joins us today
00:02:53> 00:02:56:	from Berlin I believe. Welcome here.
00:02:56> 00:02:58:	We have Doctor Mark Assilah back,
00:02:58> 00:03:00:	the chief economist for Patricia AG.
00:03:00> 00:03:04:	Marcus is another leading voice in European real estate and
00:03:04> 00:03:08:	also in the steering group for the promoting affordable housing
00:03:08> 00:03:08:	report.
00:03:08> 00:03:12:	Welcome markers. And we have Doctor Bill Nolan,

00:03:12> 00:03:15:	former director of Focus Island founder of Hibernia REIT and
00:03:16> 00:03:19:	managing partner of Oracle Real Estate Strategies.
00:03:19> 00:03:22:	Bill is both passionate and expert in the topic for
00:03:22> 00:03:25:	discussion today with a PhD in social housing finance from
00:03:26> 00:03:27:	the University of Ulster.
00:03:27> 00:03:31:	Welcome Bill and welcome to the panel.
00:03:31> 00:03:34:	To begin some opening remarks and we had the benefit
00:03:34> 00:03:37:	of a really interesting brief discussion yesterday.
00:03:37> 00:03:42:	Identifying that there's so much excellent material and tangible recommendations
00:03:42> 00:03:43:	mapped out in this report.
00:03:43> 00:03:45:	It will be difficult to cover at all.
00:03:45> 00:03:47:	But when we connected briefly,
00:03:47> 00:03:51:	we identified some key themes to the application of this
00:03:51> 00:03:53:	report in an Irish context.
00:03:53> 00:03:56:	And virtually everything we see in the Ulr report is
00:03:56> 00:03:59:	based on cooperation between the private and public sectors.
00:03:59> 00:04:04:	As long term players in the delivery of intermediate housing.
00:04:04> 00:04:08:	This requires an environment of trust and mutual respect between
00:04:08> 00:04:09:	politicians,
00:04:09> 00:04:15:	administrators, developers, an financieres trust which is now not present
00:04:15> 00:04:15:	in Ireland.
00:04:15> 00:04:18:	The Irish system could be referred to as a basket
00:04:18> 00:04:22:	case and without serious institutional reform it runs the risk
00:04:22> 00:04:24:	of remaining that way,
00:04:24> 00:04:28:	thereby inhibiting our deliver. Our ability to deliver on the
00:04:28> 00:04:31:	excellent recommendations in the ULI report.
00:04:31> 00:04:32:	So with that in mind,
00:04:32> 00:04:35:	I might ask Marcus and Javier to assist initially in
00:04:35> 00:04:39:	framing the process that was undertaken to produce that report
00:04:39> 00:04:42:	to help us a little in defining what is intermediate
00:04:42> 00:04:46:	housing and whether you would agree with the observation that
00:04:46> 00:04:47:	intensive collaboration,
00:04:47> 00:04:52:	trust and mutual respect between public and private sectors is
00:04:52> 00:04:53:	indeed crucial.
00:04:53> 00:04:58:	Javier, would you like to start us off there?
00:04:58> 00:05:00:	Yes, thank you Tom. Happy to do so.
00:05:00> 00:05:05:	So we established the European Council for Residential and

	actually
00:05:05> 00:05:08:	it wouldn't take a long time to think about a
00:05:08> 00:05:12:	theme that you know is interesting for all European countries.
00:05:12> 00:05:17:	That theme was obviously portability in housing because for
	those
00:05:17> 00:05:19:	who operate on a continental level,
00:05:19> 00:05:22:	I think we all seem to concur that that this
00:05:23> 00:05:24:	topic of affordability,
00:05:24> 00:05:28:	which has social political financial dimensions.
00:05:28> 00:05:29:	Is one that we see everywhere,
00:05:29> 00:05:31:	so that was quite easy for us.
00:05:31> 00:05:34:	And then we did a first step which is in
00:05:34> 00:05:37:	an analysis where we also had academics and and people
00:05:37> 00:05:40:	in the field kind of help us to define affordability
00:05:40> 00:05:41:	and kind of measure it.
00:05:41> 00:05:44:	That's a report that we didn't think of 1 1/2
00:05:44> 00:05:46:	two years ago and the conclusion was that,
00:05:46> 00:05:49:	well, affordability. It's not that easy to define.
00:05:49> 00:05:52:	No, it's like love, you know we all kind of
00:05:52> 00:05:53:	know what love is,
00:05:53> 00:05:55:	but you know if we all define it and then
00:05:55> 00:05:58:	probably you know the way that Marcus explains it's a
00:05:58> 00:06:00:	little bit different.
00:06:00> 00:06:01:	And how I would do it?
00:06:01> 00:06:03:	But we mean the same thing.
00:06:03> 00:06:05:	So we found out that affordability,
00:06:05> 00:06:08:	actually, you know, we all know what it means,
00:06:08> 00:06:09:	but if you define it,
00:06:09> 00:06:12:	you can have a big academic debate so that we
00:06:12> 00:06:12:	said,
00:06:12> 00:06:15:	well, you know we can do two things.
00:06:15> 00:06:18:	One is do the academic debate or Secondly know park
00:06:18> 00:06:20:	that and try to look for solutions.
00:06:20> 00:06:23:	And that seems to be much better idea.
00:06:23> 00:06:26:	So this report that you are referring to is actually
00:06:26> 00:06:29:	the second report on and there we wanted to kind
00:06:29> 00:06:30:	of.
00:06:30> 00:06:33:	See what kind of solutions could be found to increase
00:06:33> 00:06:38:	the provision of affordable housing and what you basically
	see
00:06:38> 00:06:41:	in the report is kind of a life cycle.
00:06:41> 00:06:44:	Walk through all kinds of sectors or parts of the
00:06:44> 00:06:45:	value chain.

00:06:45> 00:06:48:	I think that's more correct way of seeing it.
00:06:48> 00:06:52:	Where you see that actually there's no silver bullet,
00:06:52> 00:06:56:	but there are sensible things to do in various part
00:06:56> 00:06:57:	of this value chain.
00:06:57> 00:07:00:	And you know if I added a little bit.
00:07:00> 00:07:03:	Up and do some assumptions left and right.
00:07:03> 00:07:05:	I think you're getting to 10:10,
00:07:05> 00:07:08:	perhaps 15% more affordable housing,
00:07:08> 00:07:11:	but that you know, revolutionizing.
00:07:11> 00:07:14:	Either systems or open on new technology,
00:07:14> 00:07:18:	so kind of not realistically looking what is possible.
00:07:18> 00:07:21:	I think that range is possible and it seems to
00:07:21> 00:07:22:	me that that's huge,
00:07:22> 00:07:24:	so that's very positive news.
00:07:24> 00:07:28:	Now your question on what is intermediate housing sort of
00:07:28> 00:07:30:	falling in love question.
00:07:30> 00:07:33:	I will still try to give you my definition of
00:07:33> 00:07:33:	it.
00:07:33> 00:07:37:	It's it's that part of the housing market where key
00:07:37> 00:07:40:	workers should not spend should be able to live decently
00:07:40> 00:07:41:	and not spend.
00:07:41> 00:07:46:	More than 30% of their household income and housing costs.
00:07:46> 00:07:49:	So there are people that.
00:07:49> 00:07:53:	Sick and for longer times unemployed pensioners or students
00:07:53> 00:07:56:	think they've fallen in generally in a different category.
00:07:56> 00:07:57:	If you don't have income,
00:07:57> 00:08:00:	that's for us. Probably a little bit more social,
00:08:00> 00:08:03:	so the price point would be a little bit below
00:08:03> 00:08:05:	and then you have people that are fully active in
00:08:05> 00:08:08:	the in the market with higher salary levels and they
00:08:08> 00:08:11:	are kind of open markets or intermediate is a bit
00:08:11> 00:08:12:	what it says.
00:08:12> 00:08:16:	It's between the. I open market prices and under and
00:08:16> 00:08:19:	the social housing prices.
00:08:19> 00:08:22:	Fantastic thank you and I might look to Marcus for
00:08:22> 00:08:23:	a little bit on your views.
00:08:23> 00:08:27:	In terms of that collaboration factor and whether that crosses
00:08:27> 00:08:29:	international boundaries.
00:08:29> 00:08:32:	The need for such close collaboration.
00:08:32> 00:08:35: 00:08:35> 00:08:38:	I think when what we learned over the the discussion
	when we produce the report and we when we started

00:08:38> 00:08:39:	the study,
00:08:39> 00:08:43:	I think it's a general challenge for all European cities.
00:08:43> 00:08:47:	I think providing housing for these key workers is something
00:08:47> 00:08:49:	that is really challenging for all cities,
00:08:49> 00:08:53:	and it's also something that the cities need to have
00:08:53> 00:08:54:	a solution for.
00:08:54> 00:08:56:	Becausw we have a division of Labor.
00:08:56> 00:08:58:	We have different salary levels,
00:08:58> 00:09:02:	different qualifications levels and all these people have to.
00:09:02> 00:09:04:	Be able to live within a city,
00:09:04> 00:09:06:	otherwise the city will not function,
00:09:06> 00:09:09:	so it is a challenge for the city to provide
00:09:09> 00:09:09:	it.
00:09:09> 00:09:11:	But we also learned one thing that at the end
00:09:11> 00:09:15:	there are a lot of players within the housing market.
00:09:15> 00:09:16:	Whatever you define it in detail,
00:09:16> 00:09:20:	it's a little bit like everybody knows what the housing
00:09:20> 00:09:20:	market is,
00:09:20> 00:09:23:	but there is not a a very detailed definition about
00:09:23> 00:09:24:	it,
00:09:24> 00:09:26:	but all the players in the market,
00:09:26> 00:09:28:	from developers, investors, the government,
00:09:28> 00:09:31:	maybe also tenant unions and all the other places they
00:09:31> 00:09:33:	need to find commonly a solution.
00:09:33> 00:09:35:	Or maybe the biggest challenge?
00:09:35> 00:09:40:	The new Europe. European cities currently have becausw no single
00:09:40> 00:09:45:	actor will be big enough or or knowledgeable enough to
00:09:45> 00:09:47:	really be able to come up with a.
00:09:47> 00:09:49:	Pop that I wouldn't say optimal,
00:09:49> 00:09:52:	but a very good or the best solution for for
00:09:52> 00:09:53:	for each city,
00:09:53> 00:09:55:	because each city is different,
00:09:55> 00:09:58:	so each city they have to learn from each other
00:09:58> 00:10:02:	but also the different market participants have to learn from
00:10:02> 00:10:03:	each other.
00:10:03> 00:10:04:	How can we do things?
00:10:04> 00:10:07:	What type of framework do we need?
00:10:07> 00:10:10:	What type of collaboration do we need to really come
00:10:10> 00:10:11:	up with a solution?
00:10:11> 00:10:15:	Because otherwise we will possibly fail on their end and
00:10:15> 00:10:18:	we need to be sure that whatever we do.

00:10:18> 00:10:20:	It's not a horizon of 1224 months,
00:10:20> 00:10:23:	it has to be a mid to long-term horizon,
00:10:23> 00:10:29:	creating stability and predictability for all the players.
00:10:29> 00:10:30:	That makes a lot of sense.
00:10:30> 00:10:34:	Thank you Marcus and I know you've identified before that
00:10:34> 00:10:37:	the prominence of Dublin in the European context as an
00:10:37> 00:10:40:	attractive city and there are mega trends pushing on that
00:10:40> 00:10:43:	that demand here, among other cities across Europe.
00:10:43> 00:10:47:	So value those comments in terms of applying that context.
00:10:47> 00:10:50:	Then Bill, I would be very interested in your views
00:10:50> 00:10:54:	on heavier than Max's introduction there and how that might
00:10:55> 00:10:56:	apply in an Irish context.
00:10:56> 00:10:58:	Tom, nice to be here,
00:10:58> 00:11:01:	Tom. You referred in your introduction to Ireland being a
00:11:01> 00:11:04:	basket case in terms of housing and I have to
00:11:04> 00:11:06:	I have to endorse that.
00:11:06> 00:11:09:	And the reason for that is that the housing system
00:11:09> 00:11:12:	that we have was effectively invented well over 100 years
00:11:12> 00:11:15:	ago to solve a rural housing problem.
00:11:15> 00:11:17:	And it did that very effectively.
00:11:17> 00:11:21:	It basically house but 50,000 farm laborers and people
	working
00:11:21> 00:11:23:	in the country that was at a time that nearly
00:11:23> 00:11:24:	80%
00:11:24> 00:11:27:	of the Irish population lived in the country.
00:11:27> 00:11:31:	But the problem we have is that that system has
00:11:31> 00:11:36:	been has been imported into the urban urban situation affectively
00:11:36> 00:11:40:	with only sticking plaster changes and we have to go
00:11:40> 00:11:45:	back and and in invent or create a consensus housing
00:11:45> 00:11:45:	system.
00:11:45> 00:11:50:	We're going forward there. There is huge amount of friction
00:11:50> 00:11:54:	between the different players in Ireland.
00:11:54> 00:11:57:	Between them, social housing providers and.
00:11:57> 00:11:59:	And on the market, I mean,
00:11:59> 00:12:02:	there's a. There's a huge them and us.
00:12:02> 00:12:06:	Element in it in that the social housing providers regard
00:12:06> 00:12:08:	that as their territory in the market,
00:12:08> 00:12:11:	people are told don't don't come into it.
00:12:11> 00:12:14:	On the other hand, we have a situation where because
00:12:14> 00:12:17:	of the failure to provide social housing,
00:12:17> 00:12:20:	the the government have to reach into the market and
00:12:20> 00:12:23:	now rent about 1/3 of the PRS units in the

00:12:23> 00:12:24:	in the market,
00:12:24> 00:12:26:	and then sublet those out at nominal,
00:12:26> 00:12:29:	effectively. Nominal rents to social tenants.
00:12:29> 00:12:32:	So there there is a there is a partnership there,
00:12:32> 00:12:37:	but it is not. A smooth partnership now.
00:12:37> 00:12:40:	I have been arguing for some time with others,
00:12:40> 00:12:43:	including Tom, done that we need to sit down,
00:12:43> 00:12:46:	sit the politicians down and to get them around a
00:12:46> 00:12:48:	table and kill some of the sacred cows.
00:12:48> 00:12:51:	A lot of the problems in the housing situation in
00:12:51> 00:12:53:	the housing market in Ireland,
00:12:53> 00:12:57:	the housing, the housing environment is that there are there
00:12:57> 00:13:00:	are commitments which are argued for by bullet,
00:13:00> 00:13:03:	particular political interests, for for example,
00:13:03> 00:13:06:	our rents in Ireland are for social housing are average
00:13:06> 00:13:07:	about 200.
00:13:07> 00:13:11:	Euros a month. Where is the same equivalent for a
00:13:11> 00:13:13:	social house in Europe?
00:13:13> 00:13:15:	Would probably be 807 hundred,
00:13:15> 00:13:17:	maybe 900 euros a month.
00:13:17> 00:13:21:	Now one of the problems is that they knock on.
00:13:21> 00:13:24:	Effect of that is that the cost that the rent
00:13:24> 00:13:28:	that is collected doesn't actually pay for the cost of
00:13:28> 00:13:31:	management and the knock on effect of that is that
00:13:31> 00:13:35:	the housing stock is actually rundown so but that's a
00:13:35> 00:13:40:	sacred cow and would require political consensus to actually.
00:13:40> 00:13:42:	To actually deal with it,
00:13:42> 00:13:47:	another sacred cow instead of tenant purchase we we built
00:13:47> 00:13:52:	over the years 400,000 houses for social tenants and we
00:13:52> 00:13:56:	have sold 3/4 of those into to the tenants.
00:13:56> 00:13:58:	Reality is when you look at us,
00:13:58> 00:13:59:	those houses that were sold,
00:13:59> 00:14:03:	they actually end up very often back in the housing
00:14:03> 00:14:06:	stuff because they were bought back on the rented back
00:14:06> 00:14:07:	to to the government.
00:14:07> 00:14:11:	So we have huge numbers of these kind of dysfunctionality's.
00:14:11> 00:14:14:	So my starting point is that we need to get
00:14:14> 00:14:17:	all the parties as you said administrators,
00:14:17> 00:14:21:	politicians, financials around the table.
00:14:21> 00:14:24:	We need to get a rent system that actually pays
00:14:24> 00:14:25:	for the accommodation,
00:14:25> 00:14:29:	directly or indirectly.

00:14:29> 00:14:31:	Is that in itself? Would you want to make a
00:14:31> 00:14:33:	move on cost base rents in if you want me
00:14:33> 00:14:34:	to?
00:14:34> 00:14:36:	I think that's perfect. I think we might come back
00:14:37> 00:14:40:	to cost based rates because there is so important in
00:14:40> 00:14:40:	this discussion,
00:14:40> 00:14:42:	but I think I see first of all,
00:14:42> 00:14:45:	I'd just like to remind our audience to to get
00:14:45> 00:14:47:	involved and use the Q&A function there.
00:14:47> 00:14:50:	We have had our first question coming in from John
00:14:50> 00:14:51:	O'Connor.
00:14:51> 00:14:54:	Thank you John and the question for the panel is
00:14:54> 00:14:57:	what is the view of the panel members between affordable
00:14:57> 00:14:59:	housing for purchase and affordable housing?
00:14:59> 00:15:02:	For rent
00:15:02> 00:15:04:	maybe I just pick, pick that up.
00:15:04> 00:15:08:	I think the interesting point is if you look at
00:15:08> 00:15:11:	today's discussion that is taking place across Europe,
00:15:11> 00:15:16:	it's heavily focused. I would say on affordability to rent.
00:15:16> 00:15:20:	I think it is the provision of housing for key
00:15:20> 00:15:21:	workers to rent.
00:15:21> 00:15:25:	If you look at the affordability definition and the concept
00:15:25> 00:15:28:	at how it is and how it is thought of
00:15:28> 00:15:30:	and how it has to be developed,
00:15:30> 00:15:34:	it has the two 2 dimensions of affordability to rent
00:15:34> 00:15:36:	an affordability to own.
00:15:36> 00:15:40:	But I think from the political side currently it's only
00:15:40> 00:15:44:	the affordability to rent that is really taking into into
00:15:44> 00:15:45:	the focus.
00:15:45> 00:15:49:	But ultimately, if you really deal with a Ford ability
00:15:49> 00:15:49:	of housing,
00:15:49> 00:15:52:	it should have both dimensions,
00:15:52> 00:15:55:	because that's what the concept is about.
00:15:55> 00:16:00:	Nevertheless, I'm realistic enough to know that the challenge
	for
00:16:00> 00:16:02:	the cities is to house people.
00:16:02> 00:16:06:	And therefore the for rent might be the more pressing
00:16:06> 00:16:06:	one.
00:16:06> 00:16:10:	Nevertheless, you should not forget the phone to own and
00:16:10> 00:16:13:	in the medium to long term as this is part
00:16:13> 00:16:16:	of the the overall housing spectrum and it gives households
00:16:16> 00:16:20:	the choice the opportunity to go for one or the

00:16:20> 00:16:20:	other,
00:16:20> 00:16:23:	and choice is always something people like to have.
00:16:26> 00:16:29:	Great question. I'd love to hear Bill's view on that.
00:16:29> 00:16:32:	In terms of that Irish context in terms of build
00:16:32> 00:16:35:	for rent versus build for sale and you were about
00:16:35> 00:16:38:	to allude to the role of cost rental there as
00:16:38> 00:16:40:	well.
00:16:40> 00:16:42:	Anne.
00:16:42> 00:16:46:	The political environment in Ireland is very much trying to
00:16:46> 00:16:50:	trying to have owner occupation that has been a tradition
00:16:50> 00:16:54:	in the in in Ireland and basically the political structure
00:16:54> 00:16:57:	going back. Many decades is to try and support owner
00:16:57> 00:17:02:	occupation and I think our new government have actually written
00:17:02> 00:17:06:	that into their program for government that they actually want
00:17:06> 00:17:10:	to get owner, owner occupation as promotions much as possible.
00:17:10> 00:17:13:	On the other hand, the market is the market is
00:17:13> 00:17:17:	is is going the opposite direction the market is moving
00:17:17> 00:17:18:	towards a 30%
00:17:18> 00:17:22:	rental situation rather than an owner occupation and that comes
00:17:22> 00:17:26:	down to the desire of of tenants to have flexibility.
00:17:26> 00:17:30:	The inability to. October to raise money and the and
00:17:30> 00:17:34:	the needs that the level of deposits that they have
00:17:34> 00:17:36:	to get to actually borrow.
00:17:36> 00:17:39:	So there there is, there is a dynamic going on
00:17:39> 00:17:40:	there.
00:17:40> 00:17:42:	I think that probably at the 30%
00:17:42> 00:17:45:	mix level is where we will stabilize.
00:17:45> 00:17:49:	I think there will be the war and I think
00:17:50> 00:17:51:	there will be.
00:17:51> 00:17:55:	Financial benefits for our encouragement for people to own under
00:17:55> 00:17:57:	the present under the new administration.
00:17:57> 00:18:00:	But I think that the market will actually still be
00:18:00> 00:18:01:	there for rental.
00:18:01> 00:18:03:	And I think if we get if we get to
00:18:03> 00:18:05:	the level of cost rental,
00:18:05> 00:18:08:	I think that and you have security of tenure and
00:18:08> 00:18:08:	cost rental.
00:18:08> 00:18:11:	I think that will move more people into the rental
00:18:11> 00:18:14:	situation rather than owner occupation.

00:18:14> 00:18:16:	One of the problems is we haven't had.
00:18:16> 00:18:19:	We haven't had security of tenure in this country and
00:18:19> 00:18:22:	it comes back to the Anglo Saxon approach to housing.
00:18:22> 00:18:27:	Rather than the European approach to housing which we might
00:18:27> 00:18:28:	touch on later,
00:18:28> 00:18:32:	but security of tenure predictability of rent,
00:18:32> 00:18:36:	they will all come with a cost benefit system and
00:18:36> 00:18:39:	the benefits of owner occupation.
00:18:39> 00:18:46:	May not be as as strong in that situation.
00:18:46> 00:18:49:	Thanks Bill, and I think there's a few questions that
00:18:49> 00:18:52:	came in before the web and R and I see
00:18:52> 00:18:55:	ones come in now from Brian Moran in relation to
00:18:55> 00:18:58:	the public sector actors and with such a big onus
00:18:58> 00:19:01:	on them in that program for government you mentioned at
00:19:01> 00:19:05:	the question is how do we educate the public sector
00:19:05> 00:19:09:	actors, but political actors and state employees on real costs
00:19:09> 00:19:13:	for delivery and to work with the private sector?
00:19:13> 00:19:15:	That collaboration is obviously key.
00:19:17> 00:19:20:	Have you, would you have you or yeah,
00:19:20> 00:19:23:	I think education sounds a bit better nihilistic,
00:19:23> 00:19:27:	but I I think what the question means is that
00:19:27> 00:19:31:	perhaps there's been a leakage of know how within the
00:19:31> 00:19:32:	public sector,
00:19:32> 00:19:34:	to perhaps fully analyze, measure,
00:19:34> 00:19:39:	and then manage the housing challenges that the country has,
00:19:39> 00:19:42:	and that then together with other stakeholders.
00:19:42> 00:19:45:	So this is a bit my my reading of of
00:19:45> 00:19:46:	the question.
00:19:46> 00:19:50:	And and you sense already at your answer is it's
00:19:50> 00:19:51:	not a quick fix,
00:19:51> 00:19:55:	if that's if that's the underlying problem that we want
00:19:55> 00:19:56:	to address,
00:19:56> 00:19:58:	because I think we need law,
00:19:58> 00:20:03:	we need perhaps to pay people in the public sector
00:20:03> 00:20:05:	a little bit more.
00:20:05> 00:20:08:	It's much more movement between public and private sectors,
00:20:08> 00:20:11:	and I also think that.
00:20:11> 00:20:15:	We need to think about institutions that parapublic where they
00:20:15> 00:20:18:	are not dependent of the political cycle,

00:20:18> 00:20:23:	which is much shorter than the cycle of most institutional
00:20:23> 00:20:24:	investors.
00:20:24> 00:20:26:	By the way, so so that you can kind of
00:20:26> 00:20:30:	create also an institution that can really in cap can
00:20:30> 00:20:33:	learn and encapsulate knowledge.
00:20:33> 00:20:36:	That's not an easy fix that needs time,
00:20:36> 00:20:39:	and I'm not sure whether time is now really what
00:20:39> 00:20:42:	you want to go for necessarily,
00:20:42> 00:20:45:	because. A crisis and we are in the post Corona
00:20:45> 00:20:46:	time,
00:20:46> 00:20:48:	I mean.
00:20:48> 00:20:51:	Ability question will be much more important than it was
00:20:51> 00:20:54:	before because we will have much more at higher levels
00:20:55> 00:20:57:	of unemployment in the European countries.
00:20:57> 00:21:01:	So the question will come back again and historically if
00:21:01> 00:21:04:	you see also for kind of what you were referring
00:21:04> 00:21:07:	to them and have rain and the Rhine central for
00:21:07> 00:21:10:	European countries, not other side of the channel.
00:21:10> 00:21:15:	Their housing fundamentals were actually established mostly out of crisis
00:21:15> 00:21:18:	and mostly out of wars or other crisis now.
00:21:18> 00:21:20:	But also financial crisis France,
00:21:20> 00:21:24:	the Netherlands had a huge reform in 211 to 12
00:21:24> 00:21:24:	or 12.
00:21:24> 00:21:29:	Something like that, and that will form of the housing
00:21:29> 00:21:31:	market both.
00:21:31> 00:21:35:	Ownership and social housing and affordable housing challenges so I
00:21:35> 00:21:35:	can access 2.
00:21:35> 00:21:38:	Three legs are quite a clever reform was the only
00:21:38> 00:21:40:	reform since the Second World War.
00:21:40> 00:21:43:	So we had a consensus after the Second World War
00:21:43> 00:21:47:	and it actually was accepted by a different political parties.
00:21:47> 00:21:49:	Everything was challenged a little bit,
00:21:49> 00:21:52:	of course, and there was some minor modifications.
00:21:52> 00:21:55:	Every now and again, but the reset button,
00:21:55> 00:21:59:	kind of that was pushed following the financial crisis because
00:21:59> 00:22:01:	some unintended consequences have gone too big.
00:22:01> 00:22:04:	And a crisis is the moment where you can.
00:22:04> 00:22:07:	Also, you know if you have the matter of courage
00:22:08> 00:22:09:	and of personality.
00:22:09> 00:22:12:	Also next to know how courage is very important that

00:22:12> 00:22:15:	you just take the bull by the horns.
00:22:15> 00:22:18:	Get some friends on the other side of your political
00:22:18> 00:22:22:	or personal convictions and say let's do this together right?
00:22:22> 00:22:26:	Because because that's that's what we want to do and
00:22:26> 00:22:29:	I guess so time is the timing is interesting for
00:22:29> 00:22:30:	Ireland.
00:22:30> 00:22:32:	Because yeah, perhaps Ireland has.
00:22:32> 00:22:36:	An opportunity to kind of engage in a little bit
00:22:36> 00:22:40:	of of a similar ish kind of trajectory.
00:22:40> 00:22:43:	Really interesting, thank you. Have you ran with the new
00:22:43> 00:22:46:	government in place for what less than a week?
00:22:46> 00:22:48:	It couldn't be more critical time.
00:22:48> 00:22:50:	I think that points there about a long term vision
00:22:50> 00:22:54:	that managing that transition period and making sure we don't
00:22:54> 00:22:57:	turn the tap off is that incredibly important.
00:22:57> 00:22:59:	We have another really interesting question here,
00:22:59> 00:23:02:	which I'd like to go around the houses on,
00:23:02> 00:23:05:	given I believe the European context came up in in
00:23:05> 00:23:08:	the report released Webinar previously and that is a question
00:23:08> 00:23:09:	from Sean Golden,
00:23:09> 00:23:12:	which is that. What is the view of the panel
00:23:12> 00:23:15:	members on the use of balanced regional development to quell
00:23:15> 00:23:19:	the immense pressure on the market in Dublin and other
00:23:19> 00:23:23:	urban centres? For example using mechanisms to make it easier
00:23:23> 00:23:26:	for workers to work outside of Dublin or other areas
00:23:26> 00:23:29:	with drastic affordability issues.
00:23:29> 00:23:32:	I think it's it's. It's quite a an interesting one
00:23:32> 00:23:36:	because I think it's something that is discussed all across
00:23:36> 00:23:36:	Europe.
00:23:36> 00:23:41:	Nevertheless, because we have seen urbanization as the main driver
00:23:41> 00:23:44:	of the last decade or two decades or whatever that
00:23:44> 00:23:46:	created that challenge.
00:23:46> 00:23:49:	But why are people moving to the cities?
00:23:49> 00:23:52:	It simply be cause cities offer opportunities,
00:23:52> 00:23:57:	offers choice. Via jobs opportunities to get employment or whatever
00:23:57> 00:24:01:	and also it's about collaboration with colleagues,
00:24:01> 00:24:03:	friends and people and other immunities.
00:24:03> 00:24:06:	So I think the big challenge is how can you

00:24:06> 00:24:08:	make people move outside.
00:24:08> 00:24:12:	'cause if you would have the job opportunity outside for
00:24:12> 00:24:13:	the employer,
00:24:13> 00:24:14:	who then moves out there,
00:24:14> 00:24:17:	he might have the advantage being the only one.
00:24:17> 00:24:21:	So he gets his employees for from the local community.
00:24:21> 00:24:25:	Nevertheless, the talent pool is much more limited so.
00:24:25> 00:24:29:	Did the economically speaking external economies of scale that you
00:24:29> 00:24:32:	have within the city like the good example,
00:24:32> 00:24:35:	is the financial Center of London that I mean the
00:24:35> 00:24:37:	high qualified intelligent people.
00:24:37> 00:24:40:	They they all want to will be attracted to London
00:24:40> 00:24:45:	despite what's currently happening because it simply offers a unique
00:24:45> 00:24:49:	environment to learn to collaborate in to exchange ideas.
00:24:49> 00:24:52:	And therefore I think the challenge getting people to the
00:24:52> 00:24:54:	regions is it sounds easy.
00:24:54> 00:24:57:	And maybe the crisis can be a catalyst for some
00:24:57> 00:24:57:	of.
00:24:57> 00:25:01:	Home working being a possible solution to or work and
00:25:01> 00:25:06:	facilitate Home Office as as a part time solution for
00:25:06> 00:25:06:	that.
00:25:06> 00:25:11:	But ultimately I think urbanization will not be reversed and
00:25:11> 00:25:14:	therefore the challenge will speak to cities.
00:25:14> 00:25:16:	It's maybe not not the answer.
00:25:16> 00:25:20:	A lot of people would like to say to have,
00:25:20> 00:25:24:	but the problem is how can you create incentives for
00:25:24> 00:25:26:	companies to move out too often?
00:25:26> 00:25:28:	Jobs in regional or more.
00:25:28> 00:25:31:	Or less attractive in currently less attractive areas,
00:25:31> 00:25:36:	becausw whoever moves first has the disadvantage that he might
00:25:36> 00:25:37:	fail and which got within.
00:25:37> 00:25:39:	How do you support this?
00:25:39> 00:25:42:	And I think that's it comes back to the knowledge
00:25:42> 00:25:45:	question which other cities at the end you can find
00:25:46> 00:25:49:	a solution via better public transport that people can easier
00:25:49> 00:25:53:	commute. Maybe it's not only car related,
00:25:53> 00:25:55:	it's it's train related or whatever,
00:25:55> 00:25:57:	so that can be a solution,
00:25:57> 00:26:00:	But the question also here is that is something very
00:26:00> 00:26:01:	long term,

00:26:01> 00:26:04:	ten 1520 years it brings us back to where we
00:26:04> 00:26:05:	started.
00:26:05> 00:26:07:	Possibly we need a vision for the next two 1
00:26:08> 00:26:10:	two decades and not a vision for the next two
00:26:11> 00:26:14:	years and maybe 2 to add something to some years
00:26:14> 00:26:16:	words. Education has a lot to do,
00:26:16> 00:26:20:	possibly also with transparency, because I think there's a lot
00:26:20> 00:26:23:	of misconception about what costs and returns are.
00:26:23> 00:26:26:	In the public sector and what we really return in
00:26:26> 00:26:29:	the private sector is always mentioned.
00:26:29> 00:26:32:	You have to double digit returns when you when you
00:26:32> 00:26:34:	do the investments in real estate.
00:26:34> 00:26:37:	And I think if you do the classical multifamily housing,
00:26:37> 00:26:40:	I want to see where you get these double digit
00:26:40> 00:26:43:	returns with a institutional investment class.
00:26:43> 00:26:46:	I think transparency is also something that will help less
00:26:46> 00:26:49:	in addition to increased collaboration.
00:26:51> 00:26:55:	Fantastic. Thank you, bill. Do you have any views on
00:26:55> 00:26:59:	that in terms of the regional question?
00:26:59> 00:27:01:	I would actually agree with Marcus.
00:27:01> 00:27:05:	I think cities are just going to grow and I
00:27:05> 00:27:08:	think politicians don't particularly like it.
00:27:08> 00:27:11:	It doesn't suit their their voter base,
00:27:11> 00:27:15:	but the economies of scale going cities and the attraction
00:27:15> 00:27:18:	for young people to be in cities.
00:27:18> 00:27:20:	I mean I have got my children,
00:27:20> 00:27:24:	my children. I live. I live 30 miles outside Dublin
00:27:24> 00:27:28:	but all my children departed the nest more than 20
00:27:28> 00:27:30:	years ago and insist on living.
00:27:30> 00:27:33:	And in town why? Because their jobs are down the
00:27:33> 00:27:33:	road.
00:27:33> 00:27:36:	This Tennis Club is down the road.
00:27:36> 00:27:37:	The friends are down the road.
00:27:37> 00:27:41:	They go to the restaurants and they meet their friends
00:27:41> 00:27:43:	there and in many ways urban living is.
00:27:43> 00:27:46:	It is a social activity.
00:27:46> 00:27:49:	They they have an integrated life,
00:27:49> 00:27:52:	which is far more complicated than miners are.
00:27:52> 00:27:56:	My never was it's and they could not have that
00:27:56> 00:28:02:	kind of sophisticated relationship driven life in a rural location.
00:28:02> 00:28:05:	And you know the the Tennis Club is 10 minutes
00:28:02> 00:28:06:	away.
	anay.

00:28:06> 00:28:09: 00:28:09> 00:28:13: 00:28:13> 00:28:16: 00:28:16> 00:28:18: 00:28:18> 00:28:20: 00:28:20> 00:28:23: 00:28:23> 00:28:25:	The swimming pool is 15 minutes away and my I don't see my grandchildren very often because they want to be in town too because their friends are in town. So I think we are in a in a trend which is unlikely to change. But you know I've seen so many things that I thought might change my life.
00:28:25> 00:28:29:	I it's possible that that technology will actually move this
00:28:29> 00:28:32:	move this around in a different way,
00:28:32> 00:28:34:	but you know. I, my grandchildren,
00:28:34> 00:28:36:	will not will want to live in in towns and
00:28:37> 00:28:38:	we want to live in large towns.
00:28:38> 00:28:41:	They want to get to the country they want to
00:28:41> 00:28:43:	get to the country in the at the weekends.
00:28:43> 00:28:46:	Of course, I mean, I call it the Paris effect.
00:28:46> 00:28:49:	People want to be in the city during the week,
00:28:49> 00:28:52:	but they want to go to the Britney over their
00:28:52> 00:28:54:	country houses at the weekend or Holidays.
00:28:54> 00:28:58:	I think that's going to be the pattern.
00:28:58> 00:29:02:	Interesting, sounds like there's a real need for infrastructure investment
00:29:02> 00:29:05:	as well to open up more locations for this kind
00:29:05> 00:29:06:	of growth overtime,
00:29:06> 00:29:09:	and it sounds like that might fall into something we
00:29:09> 00:29:12:	spoke about earlier in terms of a robust long-term plan.
00:29:12> 00:29:16:	Some of the questions coming in talk a little bit
00:29:16> 00:29:18:	about the the cost of delivery.
00:29:18> 00:29:21:	And it's really interesting because we have a different narratives.
00:29:21> 00:29:24:	I think in the Irish context around what it actually
00:29:24> 00:29:25:	costs to deliver units.
00:29:25> 00:29:28:	I would be very interested in Bill to continue with
00:29:28> 00:29:29:	you there,
00:29:29> 00:29:32:	just in terms of the cost to deliver units.
00:29:32> 00:29:35:	We get some media suggesting that it's in the two
00:29:35> 00:29:38:	hundreds and yet we on the development side see a
00:29:38> 00:29:42:	very real number that's significantly greater than that.
00:29:42> 00:29:44:	Where do you see that?
00:29:44> 00:29:47:	I think it goes back to the to the to
00:29:47> 00:29:52:	the level of debate that is taking place both in
00:29:52> 00:29:56:	the media and in and very off technically is that.
00:29:56> 00:30:01:	That the. When I moved out of commercial property effectively

00:30:01> 00:30:02:	into residential,
00:30:02> 00:30:05:	I had no idea of the complexity of the residential
00:30:05> 00:30:08:	sector as opposed to the commercial sector.
00:30:08> 00:30:10:	The commercial sector works with tenants,
00:30:10> 00:30:12:	works with landlords, work with builders.
00:30:12> 00:30:14:	When you get into the residential sector,
00:30:14> 00:30:18:	you've got a totally different environment because you're dealing with
00:30:18> 00:30:21:	a more complicated form of real estate.
00:30:21> 00:30:23:	But you're also dealing with the media.
00:30:23> 00:30:27:	You're dealing with politicians, etc etc so.
00:30:27> 00:30:31:	The debate that take that are taking place on provision
00:30:31> 00:30:34:	of housing are are what I would call pub level
00:30:34> 00:30:38:	rather than at A&A long way from academic or informed
00:30:38> 00:30:42:	level. Ann and I think that's one of the changes
00:30:42> 00:30:45:	we have to try and achieve as as as a
00:30:45> 00:30:48:	ULI can change is trying to get people get the
00:30:48> 00:30:53:	level of debate so that people understand that delivering a
00:30:53> 00:30:57:	house you can deliver US 3 bedroom semi D today
00:30:57> 00:31:00:	in suburban Dublin cost about 350 to 400,000.
00:31:00> 00:31:03:	And less than half that is the concrete.
00:31:03> 00:31:06:	The rest of it is infrastructure around certain services,
00:31:06> 00:31:09:	etc. And taxation. There's a big chunk of taxation and
00:31:09> 00:31:13:	I'd be interested in Xavier and Marcus's views on taxation.
00:31:13> 00:31:14:	We charge we charge 13%
00:31:14> 00:31:17:	on the cost of a of building a house here,
00:31:17> 00:31:20:	and that goes straight through into the bottom line and
00:31:20> 00:31:22:	enter into rental levels.
00:31:22> 00:31:25:	And I suspect that that doesn't apply another in other
00:31:25> 00:31:26:	countries,
00:31:26> 00:31:29:	but I'd be interested to hear what their comment is
00:31:29> 00:31:30:	if I may pose a question,
00:31:30> 00:31:34:	but the. Costs are higher here.
00:31:34> 00:31:37:	It then they are in other countries.
00:31:37> 00:31:40:	Why? An? Because? Because we are an island country and
00:31:40> 00:31:43:	a lot of our materials have to be brought from
00:31:43> 00:31:44:	abroad.
00:31:44> 00:31:47:	So where are you importing steel and glass and all
00:31:47> 00:31:49:	those materials from abroad?
00:31:49> 00:31:52:	And there's an add-on cost there.
00:31:52> 00:31:56:	And the second thing is the different differential between houses

00:31:56> 00:31:57:	and apartments.
00:31:57> 00:32:03:	We have been traditionally very efficient at building the semi
00:32:03> 00:32:04:	detached house.
00:32:04> 00:32:08:	Most of our builders builder developers were originally tradesmen,
00:32:08> 00:32:11:	carpenters or block layers and so on,
00:32:11> 00:32:14:	and they know exactly how to achieve economies of scale
00:32:14> 00:32:17:	from building large numbers of semi detached houses.
00:32:17> 00:32:21:	We have not had a tradition of building apartments and
00:32:21> 00:32:23:	we do not have the economies of scale and the
00:32:24> 00:32:28:	experience that that exists in countries like Germany in building
00:32:28> 00:32:31:	apartments are cost of apartments are high because we don't
00:32:31> 00:32:33:	build many of them are.
00:32:33> 00:32:36:	Cost of housing is. Is relatively efficient,
00:32:36> 00:32:39:	so coming back to my house or 350,000 that is
00:32:39> 00:32:43:	50,000 of that nearly \$50,000 made over taxation.
00:32:43> 00:32:46:	So when you take that off your down to 300,000,
00:32:46> 00:32:50:	I'd be interested to hear what a semi detached 3
00:32:50> 00:32:54:	bedroom house cost to build in in Germany or in
00:32:54> 00:32:54:	Holland.
00:32:54> 00:32:58:	Yeah, very interesting go thank you and I think it's
00:32:58> 00:33:01:	interesting to look at the proportion of apartment living in
00:33:01> 00:33:04:	Ireland versus mainland Europe as well.
00:33:04> 00:33:07:	In terms of that level of acceptance demonstrated there and
00:33:07> 00:33:10:	we have a long way to go measured against our
00:33:10> 00:33:13:	earlier discussion there around the houses we want to live
00:33:13> 00:33:16:	in the cities we want to build and the need
00:33:16> 00:33:17:	for that infrastructure.
00:33:17> 00:33:21:	That long term vision to deliver those cities and more
00:33:21> 00:33:25:	apartments coinciding with that culture around apartment building.
00:33:25> 00:33:28:	I'm I guess one of the questions coming in further
00:33:28> 00:33:29:	to that point.
00:33:29> 00:33:32:	Actually, before I do, I would like to grab one
00:33:32> 00:33:35:	of Wills quest bills questions in there,
00:33:35> 00:33:38:	around around taxation and on the the cost stack for
00:33:38> 00:33:40:	any individual unit.
00:33:40> 00:33:43:	We see that as a very significant component as you
00:33:43> 00:33:45:	outlined there that can be 13 1/2%
00:33:45> 00:33:49:	on residential units and for us that's taking a big
00:33:49> 00:33:50:	part of the pie.
00:33:50> 00:33:53:	I'd like to pose a question to to Javier and

00:33:53> 00:33:57:	Marcus around around that and whether taxation concessions on.
00:33:57> 00:34:02:	Intermediate housing or housing generally is something you see elsewhere.
00:34:02> 00:34:03:	If I can pick that one up,
00:34:03> 00:34:06:	you know we see it definitely elsewhere,
00:34:06> 00:34:09:	and I think that's an interesting point in the premise
00:34:09> 00:34:10:	there that you know there's,
00:34:10> 00:34:12:	for instance, if I look at iPhones,
00:34:12> 00:34:14:	there's no lack in iPhones.
00:34:14> 00:34:15:	Everyone can get an iPhone,
00:34:15> 00:34:17:	and I don't eat any kind of tax subsidy to
00:34:18> 00:34:20:	buy my iPhone in housing markets across Europe.
00:34:20> 00:34:23:	the Irish situation specific, and perhaps a little bit more
00:34:23> 00:34:25:	intense and elsewhere,
00:34:25> 00:34:27:	but we have kind of broken housing markets,
00:34:27> 00:34:30:	right? So the market that kind of works for iPhones
00:34:30> 00:34:32:	kind of doesn't seem to work for.
00:34:32> 00:34:36:	For housing, so it's that's an interesting kind of starting
00:34:36> 00:34:36:	point,
00:34:36> 00:34:39:	and if you take that as a starting point that
00:34:39> 00:34:43:	you know the market doesn't seem to function,
00:34:43> 00:34:46:	the market that is currently structured so you know what
00:34:46> 00:34:49:	kind of extra work and the government taken.
00:34:49> 00:34:53:	That's a bit question, then in terms of no taxation
00:34:53> 00:34:57:	or other kinds of subsidies that the government can have
00:34:57> 00:34:59:	to kind of nudge or push prices down,
00:34:59> 00:35:03:	and behavior of people in the right direction.
00:35:03> 00:35:07:	Then of course that's isn't isn't effective instrument.
00:35:07> 00:35:10:	I think the French will have quite a lot of
00:35:10> 00:35:13:	knowledge on both the social welfare state and taxation.
00:35:13> 00:35:17:	They kind of have this logmar intermediary definition,
00:35:17> 00:35:21:	which is almost literally kind of intermediate housing,
00:35:21> 00:35:23:	right? It's the same concept,
00:35:23> 00:35:25:	and it's basically for key workers,
00:35:25> 00:35:29:	so it it's. It's actually what we're talking about.
00:35:29> 00:35:33:	And they have this kind of subsidies that are both.
00:35:33> 00:35:38:	Back to waste. Once you reduce their faith in everything
00:35:38> 00:35:39:	from 20 to 10%.
00:35:39> 00:35:42:	Considerable Ann and also you don't pay property.
00:35:42> 00:35:46:	Local property taxes for period of 20 years if you.
00:35:46> 00:35:49:	If you don't it should keep the the asset in

00:35:49> 00:35:53:	affordable housing rental brackets or there is regulation around now
00:35:54> 00:35:58:	and it has been quite effective in producing intermediate housing
00:35:58> 00:36:01:	in the Netherlands. You have drop off transfer tax.
00:36:01> 00:36:05:	It's not really Viti but it's brand protects that was
00:36:05> 00:36:06:	dropped from 6%
00:36:06> 00:36:09:	to 2% during the crisis and it's also.
00:36:09> 00:36:13:	Was also dropped. A few converted officers into raising right?
00:36:13> 00:36:16:	So that's also kind of instruments to work to work
00:36:16> 00:36:16:	with,
00:36:16> 00:36:20:	so it is an effective instrument to notch behavior.
00:36:20> 00:36:23:	But I also think that the fundamental problem at all
00:36:23> 00:36:23:	of that,
00:36:23> 00:36:27:	it's scalability. We don't have states that have a lot
00:36:27> 00:36:27:	of cash.
00:36:27> 00:36:29:	We on the end of a debt cycle,
00:36:29> 00:36:33:	don't wait. You look at the Bretton Woods styles of
00:36:33> 00:36:36:	a system that levels that we had after World War
00:36:36> 00:36:39:	were kind of restructured and now we have very high
00:36:39> 00:36:43:	levels. So I'm not sure you know how sustainable that
00:36:43> 00:36:43:	is.
00:36:43> 00:36:45:	You would want to see.
00:36:45> 00:36:47:	Also, you know what can we do in terms of
00:36:47> 00:36:51:	affordable social with a market based principles,
00:36:51> 00:36:55:	rather many impact impact investors that think that housing isn't
00:36:55> 00:36:58:	it some sensible social investment.
00:36:58> 00:37:01:	You can make a decent stable return and that doesn't
00:37:01> 00:37:03:	need to be that high.
00:37:03> 00:37:07:	And it is still competitive in this environment because interests
00:37:07> 00:37:09:	are so low if compared to,
00:37:09> 00:37:11:	for instance, state bonds so.
00:37:11> 00:37:14:	It's it's I'm not going into another direction,
00:37:14> 00:37:17:	I know, but I just want to chip it in
00:37:17> 00:37:19:	that that this point of scalability.
00:37:19> 00:37:23:	I think with all tax and subsidy questions is one
00:37:23> 00:37:26:	that you really need to think about.
00:37:26> 00:37:29:	OK, thanks earlier. I think there's a few questions coming
00:37:29> 00:37:33:	in around the content of the report and how we
00:37:33> 00:37:36:	can sort of quick snapshots as to takeaways and the
00:37:36> 00:37:40:	recommendations of the report and in advance of our

	audience.
00:37:40> 00:37:43:	Sort of getting into the detail of that report.
00:37:43> 00:37:45:	I think it would be interesting.
00:37:45> 00:37:49:	There's a question there from Karina works that I might
00:37:49> 00:37:51:	ask Bill to have a look at,
00:37:51> 00:37:54:	and in the interim I just want to look to
00:37:54> 00:37:56:	ask Marcus if if.
00:37:56> 00:37:58:	We could talk about John O'Connor's question here.
00:37:58> 00:38:01:	The key messages from the UI promoting housing affordability report
00:38:01> 00:38:04:	based on our discussion yesterday and and the great discussion
00:38:04> 00:38:05:	we're having today.
00:38:05> 00:38:08:	Marcus, are there some key points that you would highlight
00:38:08> 00:38:11:	there from your experience in in the steering group for
00:38:11> 00:38:11:	the report?
00:38:11> 00:38:14:	We haven't touched on?
00:38:14> 00:38:17:	I think we've we've touched on already on quite a
00:38:17> 00:38:19:	lot of what we have experienced,
00:38:19> 00:38:22:	but I think one of the key learning of when
00:38:22> 00:38:25:	we set up the report and also about the project
00:38:25> 00:38:27:	because I think for for you rely Europe.
00:38:27> 00:38:30:	That report is not the end of the project.
00:38:30> 00:38:32:	We want to keep that ongoing.
00:38:32> 00:38:35:	I think what we learned is there is no one
00:38:35> 00:38:38:	size fits all solution that you can apply across all
00:38:38> 00:38:42:	cities across all countries or called across all regions.
00:38:42> 00:38:46:	It's simply. The idea of the report was show examples
00:38:46> 00:38:49:	that worked and then take your local situation.
00:38:49> 00:38:52:	Take your local market players,
00:38:52> 00:38:57:	your political governmental, whatever players you have and try to
00:38:57> 00:38:59:	figure out how can it be adapted.
00:38:59> 00:39:02:	Not saying this worked in Barcelona,
00:39:02> 00:39:04:	so that's why we do it in Dublin.
00:39:04> 00:39:07:	It's it's a coastal city as well,
00:39:07> 00:39:10:	so it worked in Barcelona and should work in Dublin
00:39:10> 00:39:11:	as well.
00:39:11> 00:39:15:	No, no think about cleverly think about in a group
00:39:15> 00:39:16:	with a group of.
00:39:16> 00:39:20:	Intelligent people operating in that sector and think how can
00:39:20> 00:39:21:	it be adapted?
00:39:21> 00:39:23:	What do we need to change?

00:39:23> 00:39:26:	What can we take on and maybe look at other
00:39:26> 00:39:27:	examples?
00:39:27> 00:39:31:	How can we possibly integrate something that worked in that
00:39:31> 00:39:33:	that special context to that project?
00:39:33> 00:39:37:	So I think the biggest takeaway is also think about
00:39:37> 00:39:37:	it.
00:39:37> 00:39:41:	Take take a look and then discuss what can work.
00:39:41> 00:39:45:	The project of this affordability report is also to create
00:39:45> 00:39:46:	a library of.
00:39:46> 00:39:51:	Different projects across the European countries and across the cities
00:39:51> 00:39:54:	that should grow overtime so that everybody can take a
00:39:54> 00:39:55:	look at,
00:39:55> 00:39:58:	think about, and then how can it be adapted.
00:39:58> 00:40:01:	It's not to say the report tells you how to
00:40:01> 00:40:02:	do it.
00:40:02> 00:40:05:	The report should give you in ideas and ways how
00:40:05> 00:40:07:	you can tackle it,
00:40:07> 00:40:11:	and then discuss how you can implement it.
00:40:11> 00:40:15:	Fantastic collaboration and transparency. Two things that seem to be
00:40:16> 00:40:19:	coming up again and again and the calls for housing
00:40:19> 00:40:22:	Commission or Task Force seem incredibly relevant.
00:40:22> 00:40:25:	A question here from Pat Farrell that I'd like to
00:40:25> 00:40:26:	pose.
00:40:26> 00:40:29:	Or sorry I've I've skipped over the one day and
00:40:29> 00:40:29:	Bill will.
00:40:29> 00:40:33:	Carina Wilkes has asked. It has been reported that unaffordable
00:40:33> 00:40:36:	housing in England is due to four factors.
00:40:36> 00:40:39:	The shortage of land for development,
00:40:39> 00:40:42:	the lack of finance available for major infrastructure.
00:40:42> 00:40:47:	Low productivity growth in construction and insufficient market diversity or
00:40:47> 00:40:50:	a concentrated market does the panel think these apply in
00:40:50> 00:40:51:	Ireland?
00:40:51> 00:40:53:	Wonder if you have any thoughts?
00:40:53> 00:40:55:	OK, let's start on the on the I'm going to
00:40:55> 00:40:57:	ask you to repeat those questions,
00:40:57> 00:40:59:	but that start on the land one.
00:40:59> 00:41:02:	I think there is England is A is a country
00:41:02> 00:41:04:	with the population of 60,000,000 odd.
00:41:04> 00:41:07:	We have a population of just over 4 million.

00.44.07 > 00.44.00.	
00:41:07> 00:41:09:	We don't have a scarcity of land.
00:41:09> 00:41:10:	We are you just fly over.
00:41:10> 00:41:12:	When you're flying across Dublin,
00:41:12> 00:41:15:	you just look down and you see an awful lot
00:41:15> 00:41:16:	of green.
00:41:16> 00:41:20:	Very close to relatively close to the city center.
00:41:20> 00:41:23:	Now what we do have is a shortage of public
00:41:23> 00:41:26:	transport and particularly rail public transport.
00:41:28> 00:41:31:	Dublin is roughly the same size as in in in
00:41:31> 00:41:33:	in land area as Paris,
00:41:33> 00:41:35:	yet our population is is is is 18 the size
00:41:36> 00:41:36:	of Paris.
00:41:36> 00:41:40:	But if you look at the rail service in Paris
00:41:40> 00:41:44:	you will find that they have multiple rail going out
00:41:44> 00:41:47:	of going out to the land that is available.
00:41:47> 00:41:50:	My father was a town planner and he said,
00:41:50> 00:41:53:	you say that the development followed the pipes and you
00:41:53> 00:41:56:	know that's the reality and if you look at the
00:41:56> 00:42:00:	expansion of London during the end of the beginning of
00:42:00> 00:42:03:	the last century, basically it followed the railway station,
00:42:03> 00:42:07:	railway lines. The railway lines were built very often by
00:42:07> 00:42:11:	by developers are the tube lines and kind of development
00:42:11> 00:42:12:	followed them.
00:42:12> 00:42:15:	So we we have we got caught in that development
00:42:15> 00:42:18:	followed the road so we tend to have a relatively.
00:42:18> 00:42:21:	Low density and the whole the whole emphasis here now
00:42:21> 00:42:24:	is on policy is to try and get people get
00:42:24> 00:42:27:	get density up along transport corridors.
00:42:27> 00:42:30:	The one of the one of the difficulties about that
00:42:30> 00:42:34:	here is that you can build a semi detached house.
00:42:34> 00:42:37:	I said earlier for for 350,000 out in the suburbs.
00:42:37> 00:42:41:	But when you want to build an apartment closer to
00:42:41> 00:42:44:	the city center it's going to cost you 400 or
00:42:44> 00:42:47:	450,000 for a 2 bedroom apartment.
00:42:47> 00:42:49:	But now and the problem is the market,
00:42:49> 00:42:53:	the market is not prepared to pay the price in
00:42:53> 00:42:56:	the extra price for for that for that apartment.
00:42:56> 00:43:00:	So basically we have a an anomaly here with the
00:43:00> 00:43:02:	policy of urbanization,
00:43:02> 00:43:05:	but we have a market situation which is driving sub
00:43:05> 00:43:06:	urbanization,
00:43:06> 00:43:10:	so that is an anomaly that needs to get needs

00:43:10> 00:43:13:	to get sorted out at at policy level and at
00:43:13> 00:43:15:	implementation level problems.
00:43:15> 00:43:20:	A second question. The low productivity growth in construction and
00:43:20> 00:43:24:	insufficient market diversity or a concentrated market I,
00:43:24> 00:43:28:	I think our construction industry is remarkably robust.
00:43:28> 00:43:32:	Its ability to move from zero to producing 20,000 houses
00:43:32> 00:43:35:	in the space of three or four years is absolutely
00:43:35> 00:43:36:	remarkable.
00:43:36> 00:43:38:	So I think we have it.
00:43:38> 00:43:41:	We have a construction industry which is very good by
00:43:41> 00:43:43:	international levels,
00:43:43> 00:43:45:	I mean go back to the bad days of the
00:43:45> 00:43:48:	of the Celtic Tiger we were producing.
00:43:48> 00:43:50:	90,000 houses at the top.
00:43:50> 00:43:53:	Now I know we had we had problems with standards
00:43:53> 00:43:53:	and so on,
00:43:53> 00:43:57:	but still we we poured 90,000 foundations a year and
00:43:57> 00:43:58:	built the houses.
00:43:58> 00:44:02:	You know, we didn't necessarily building with the right place,
00:44:02> 00:44:05:	which was what was a policy problem rather than a
00:44:05> 00:44:06:	construction problem.
00:44:06> 00:44:10:	So I think our construction industry is actually very very
00:44:10> 00:44:13:	good and it is got better and better.
00:44:13> 00:44:17:	And I think the standards that have been imposed on
00:44:17> 00:44:18:	it recently.
00:44:18> 00:44:21:	Have actually improved it. I mean there was a time
00:44:21> 00:44:23:	when you were buying a new house.
00:44:23> 00:44:25:	You have to worry about about whether the proof was
00:44:25> 00:44:28:	properly was was was going to stay there.
00:44:28> 00:44:32:	Nowadays there are so much certification and specification checking I
00:44:32> 00:44:34:	think you know you could almost buy a house off
00:44:34> 00:44:37:	off the peg and know that it's going to be
00:44:37> 00:44:39:	as good as a car that you would get from
00:44:39> 00:44:40:	from Jaguar,
00:44:40> 00:44:42:	Arneson, wherever it happens to be.
00:44:42> 00:44:44:	So I don't think we have any problem with housing
00:44:45> 00:44:46:	standards here provided,
00:44:46> 00:44:50:	provided our enforcement continues. What was the 3rd question?
00:44:50> 00:44:53:	You've covered them all. You've done well.
00:44:53> 00:44:56:	So much Bill now I think of fantastic answer there

00:44:56> 00:44:59:	and LI think it's an interacting comparison to the
	and I I think it's an interesting comparison to the
00:44:59> 00:45:02:	to the to the UK context in question that I'd
00:45:02> 00:45:05:	like to pose to to to have year is when
00:45:05> 00:45:08:	we look at a functioning affordable housing market like the
00:45:08> 00:45:09:	UK,
00:45:09> 00:45:12:	where there's sort of clear regulation and a lot of
00:45:12> 00:45:15:	investment appetite to participate in that market.
00:45:15> 00:45:18:	That's something that we are yet to see developed to
00:45:18> 00:45:21:	the same sort of scale in an Irish context.
00:45:21> 00:45:24:	What are the initial things of the first things?
00:45:24> 00:45:26:	That a housing Commission, for example,
00:45:26> 00:45:30:	needs to discuss in formulating the framework for a functional
00:45:30> 00:45:34:	affordable housing market to come into play in Ireland.
00:45:34> 00:45:37:	But funny that you would take the UK as an
00:45:37> 00:45:40:	example because we would not have chosen the UK as
00:45:40> 00:45:41:	an example,
00:45:41> 00:45:44:	it's a market worth which actually has a longstanding debate
00:45:44> 00:45:47:	since the 70s as well on there and how to
00:45:47> 00:45:50:	increase production of rental and affordable homes.
00:45:50> 00:45:52:	But that's part that I mean it's a it's a
00:45:52> 00:45:53:	different topic,
00:45:53> 00:45:56:	so I think with the key thing that we,
00:45:56> 00:46:00:	the key things were already a little bit sad so.
00:46:00> 00:46:03:	It's it's. It's a matter of courage and courage.
00:46:03> 00:46:06:	You need to kind of define a clear strategy.
00:46:06> 00:46:10:	So I think there is no lack such on knowledge
00:46:10> 00:46:10:	or data.
00:46:10> 00:46:14:	I think everyone knows more or less pretty well where
00:46:14> 00:46:15:	the problems are.
00:46:15> 00:46:18:	We need to find a consensus in Ireland.
00:46:18> 00:46:21:	So you need to kind of go with the people
00:46:21> 00:46:24:	that are on the opposite side of what you think
00:46:24> 00:46:26:	and kind of you know,
00:46:26> 00:46:30:	grab them lovingly in your arms and embrace them and
00:46:30> 00:46:30:	say no,
00:46:30> 00:46:32:	we're going into a room.
00:46:32> 00:46:35:	And we're not getting out until we have a common
00:46:35> 00:46:38:	strategy as to how we will agree on solving the
00:46:38> 00:46:38:	housing crisis.
00:46:38> 00:46:41:	That from my perspective and really boom.
00:46:41> 00:46:44:	Bust boom bust. So only market where we failed to
00:46:44> 00:46:46:	invest in Europe and in only Mark where we wanted

00:46:46> 00:46:49:	to invest and we failed to to invest because the
00:46:49> 00:46:52:	boom bust was kind of too complicated for me to
00:46:52> 00:46:52:	follow.
00:46:52> 00:46:54:	So I think that also the Irish.
00:46:54> 00:46:57:	It makes the Irish housing market and probably also lose
00:46:57> 00:47:00:	a lot of capital and energy because you suffer.
00:47:00> 00:47:03:	Mostly I think of this short boom bust cycle.
00:47:03> 00:47:06:	So you need kind of a strategic plan that is
00:47:07> 00:47:11:	long term and kind of involves the key stakeholders and
00:47:11> 00:47:15:	in that sense you know they'll be careful with examples,
00:47:15> 00:47:18:	but you know the kind of way that the Germans
00:47:18> 00:47:22:	or the French or the Dutch in all different degrees,
00:47:22> 00:47:26:	but they kind of seem to be able the Austrians
00:47:26> 00:47:29:	to take a long term view on solving the housing
00:47:29> 00:47:32:	market with various stakeholders.
00:47:32> 00:47:34:	And it's not. Perfect either,
00:47:34> 00:47:37:	but I think that seems to be missing in Ireland.
00:47:37> 00:47:40:	This long-term approach of consensus,
00:47:40> 00:47:43:	and I think that's the key point.
00:47:43> 00:47:46:	Thanks, thanks for being there was one question that I
00:47:46> 00:47:50:	accidentally dismissed around standards and the cost of
00.47.54 > 00.47.54.	delivery in
00:47:51> 00:47:51:	Ireland,
00:47:51> 00:47:55: 00:47:55> 00:47:56:	suggesting that the quality of housing standards is very high
	by global comparison,
00:47:56> 00:47:58:	which I would agree with.
00:47:58> 00:48:00:	The current standards are very are very high,
00:48:00> 00:48:03:	but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of
00:48:04> 00:48:07:	the other points we've discussed today around the cost of
00:48:07> 00:48:09:	delivery and the standards for housing,
00:48:09> 00:48:13:	whether they should be reduced or or even improved as
00:48:13> 00:48:13:	as some.
00:48:13> 00:48:17: 00:48:17> 00:48:20:	Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from
00:48:17> 00:48:20:	our analysis that the standards are very robust and to
	keep pace with NS AB which is flagged in the
00:48:23> 00:48:27:	question will need to keep those standards relatively high from
00:48:27> 00:48:29:	a constructability point,
00:48:29> 00:48:32:	but I think you know there are other things other
00:48:32> 00:48:35:	opportunities we we can look at we can continue to
00:48:35> 00:48:38:	build fantastic quality homes as Bill said with a very
00:48:38> 00:48:44:	functional construction sector, but standards are something that will need

26

00:48:44> 00:48:45:	to be very.
00:48:45> 00:48:49:	Very intensively looked at by a very informed Council,
00:48:49> 00:48:52:	and I think the Housing Commission has a role to
00:48:52> 00:48:56:	do to oversee the development of those standards without allowing
00:48:56> 00:48:59:	any wins to influence massive shifts in those standards.
00:48:59> 00:49:03:	If we are also to achieve their sustainability goals that
00:49:03> 00:49:05:	ends up prescribed for the EU,
00:49:05> 00:49:08:	I might move on to this question from Pat Farrell
00:49:08> 00:49:09:	an important question.
00:49:09> 00:49:12:	For for targeted for Bill and that is your thoughts
00:49:12> 00:49:15:	on how we close the affordability or viability gap.
00:49:15> 00:49:18:	To assist more people to own their own homes.
00:49:23> 00:49:26:	Who is that question for Tom?
00:49:26> 00:49:31:	For me, sorry. I mean you answer is the answer
00:49:31> 00:49:33:	is it's you know.
00:49:33> 00:49:36:	We were caught it were caught in a in a
00:49:36> 00:49:37:	three legged stool.
00:49:37> 00:49:42:	Situation is affordability, cost, cost of delivery and finance.
00:49:42> 00:49:45:	I mean, those three have to to have to make
00:49:45> 00:49:47:	to make housing viable.
00:49:47> 00:49:49:	All of those have to have to be have to
00:49:49> 00:49:53:	stand together an and the the the weaknesses,
00:49:53> 00:49:55:	the affordability side of it.
00:49:55> 00:50:00:	So basically who? How do you subsidize the difference between
00:50:00> 00:50:04:	what it costs about somebody can afford?
00:50:04> 00:50:06:	And I don't know the answer to that.
00:50:06> 00:50:09:	I mean there you have a concrete block and a
00:50:09> 00:50:13:	yard of gaana meter of concrete cost the same regardless
00:50:14> 00:50:16:	of who's occupying the man.
00:50:16> 00:50:18:	Water, water, water, salary level is.
00:50:18> 00:50:22:	So I mean, various proposals have come forward.
00:50:22> 00:50:25:	You've got the shared equity scheme in the UK where
00:50:25> 00:50:27:	the government owned 20%
00:50:27> 00:50:31:	and put up and could give you alone for that
00:50:32> 00:50:32:	amount.
00:50:32> 00:50:35:	Yes, that could work, but you know,
00:50:35> 00:50:38:	is it just simply going to put up the price
00:50:38> 00:50:42:	of houses by my increasing competition for the available stock?
00:50:42> 00:50:46:	I don't know. That's the state owned equity part of
00:50:46> 00:50:48:	your house is an issue.

00:50:48> 00:50:50:	I have no expertise in at all and my my
00:50:50> 00:50:54:	expertise is in the rental side and on the investment
00:50:54> 00:50:55:	side.
00:50:55> 00:50:57:	So how you do a shared equity?
00:50:57> 00:51:00:	I don't know. So then in terms of the cost
00:51:00> 00:51:01:	rental piece,
00:51:01> 00:51:04:	it was something we were intending to come back to
00:51:04> 00:51:05:	Bill.
00:51:05> 00:51:08:	But your I guess suggestions there about how we could
00:51:08> 00:51:12:	implement an effective cost rental model I think would be
00:51:13> 00:51:16:	a really interesting place to dig in a little deeper.
00:51:16> 00:51:19:	OK, some of you may have seen the paper.
00:51:19> 00:51:22:	The article I wrote in the Sunday business post last
00:51:22> 00:51:23:	10 days ago,
00:51:23> 00:51:26:	basically advocating a cost based rental model,
00:51:26> 00:51:29:	which was what was with the core of my of
00:51:29> 00:51:30:	my PhD thesis.
00:51:30> 00:51:34:	And it's very clear to me that the only way
00:51:34> 00:51:38:	to do that is through through financing and cheap financing.
00:51:38> 00:51:41:	I mean, we the example I put forward in that
00:51:41> 00:51:46:	was that you could have it with with government guarantee
00:51:46> 00:51:49:	to enable cheap financing that you would be able to
00:51:49> 00:51:53:	have a rental of about ???1000 a month or ???250
00:51:53> 00:51:53:	a week.
00:51:53> 00:51:57:	I think that's affordable in the Irish for the average
00:51:57> 00:51:59:	Irish tradesman,
00:51:59> 00:52:04:	Middle Lincoln professional. Anne. I present market rent for that
00:52:04> 00:52:09:	for that house in Dublin is probably 2000 a month
00:52:09> 00:52:12:	or more and probably moves up to 4050%
00:52:12> 00:52:15:	of the of income.
00:52:15> 00:52:18:	As mark aside early, you have to be in the
00:52:19> 00:52:22:	in the range where you're the rent paid by a
00:52:22> 00:52:24:	tenant is is is 30%
00:52:24> 00:52:27:	or less of their income now at at ???1000 a
00:52:27> 00:52:31:	month that would fit the middle link of the average
00:52:31> 00:52:33:	middle income.
00:52:35> 00:52:37:	Tenant.
00:52:37> 00:52:41:	So my argument is that you can provide through an
00:52:41> 00:52:43:	appropriate vehicle,
00:52:43> 00:52:48:	probably through the housing associations are with impact
	investor or

00:52:48> 00:52:50:	impact Investor Company.
00:52:50> 00:52:55:	You can provide high volumes of affordable rental at about
00:52:55> 00:52:56:	1000 euros per month.
00:52:59> 00:53:02:	Provided you will get the support from from the state
00:53:02> 00:53:04:	and that state my proposal.
00:53:04> 00:53:08:	My specific proposal was that that was actually done through
00:53:08> 00:53:12:	the local authorities who would give known as a step
00:53:12> 00:53:15:	in agreement so they would effectively in the event of
00:53:15> 00:53:18:	the promoter of the housing going bust,
00:53:18> 00:53:21:	that the government would step in and make good.
00:53:21> 00:53:24:	The borrower with that structure in place.
00:53:24> 00:53:26:	Then the.
00:53:26> 00:53:30:	Possible to get money long term money on the market
00:53:30> 00:53:31:	at 2,
00:53:31> 00:53:34:	two and a half 3%.
00:53:34> 00:53:36:	Nearby finance cost based housing.
00:53:36> 00:53:37:	Now there was an echo.
00:53:37> 00:53:40:	There needs to be an equity element in it and
00:53:40> 00:53:42:	that can come either from.
00:53:42> 00:53:45:	Housing associations are from impact investors.
00:53:45> 00:53:49:	I have experience of working with impact investors and
	probably
00:53:49> 00:53:53:	the biggest impact investor in Ireland is the state through
00:53:54> 00:53:55:	it through its.
00:53:55> 00:53:59:	Through its investment vehicle.
00:53:59> 00:54:04:	And they are. They are interested in supporting this type
00:54:05> 00:54:08:	of of cost based rental housing.
00:54:08> 00:54:10:	So am I believe that it is doable,
00:54:10> 00:54:14:	but up to now, the Department of Finance in Ireland
00:54:14> 00:54:18:	have been absolutely resolute against any kind of guarantee
	system
00:54:18> 00:54:20:	in respect of borrowing.
00:54:20> 00:54:24:	Now all those kind of guarantees systems do exist in
00:54:24> 00:54:27:	virtually every other European country.
00:54:27> 00:54:29:	the Dutch have a system which is,
00:54:29> 00:54:32:	which is not quite a guarantee the government end up
00:54:33> 00:54:35:	as a long term as a long term long stop,
00:54:35> 00:54:39:	but there's there are insurance.
00:54:39> 00:54:42:	Provisions in the middle. So the guarantee is given by
00:54:42> 00:54:45:	an insurance fund with a long stop from the government.
00:54:45> 00:54:48:	But the the long and the short of it is
00:54:48> 00:54:51:	that the finance year the provider of bond financing is
00:54:51> 00:54:53:	sure that he's going to get his interest,

00:54:53> 00:54:57:	and he's going to get his money back.
00:54:57> 00:55:00:	And I don't think we are going to get cost
00:55:00> 00:55:05:	based housing unless the government changes the Department finance in
00:55:05> 00:55:10:	particular changes their approach to giving or arranging guarantees structures
00:55:10> 00:55:14:	for for long term debt.
00:55:14> 00:55:16:	That's sorry, bit long winded,
00:55:16> 00:55:18:	but that's that's it. If you want to read the
00:55:18> 00:55:22:	whole article and read the Sunday business Post 10 days
00:55:22> 00:55:22:	ago,
00:55:22> 00:55:25:	critically important bill and so important for right now.
00:55:25> 00:55:28:	So thank you so much for that outline.
00:55:28> 00:55:31:	It's interesting as as we've been working through today I've
00:55:31> 00:55:35:	had the the nine recommendations of the report to the
00:55:35> 00:55:35:	side here,
00:55:35> 00:55:38:	and it feels like we've covered a lot of ground,
00:55:38> 00:55:41:	so that's fantastic. I guess before I hand over to
00:55:41> 00:55:41:	Tom,
00:55:41> 00:55:44:	done from the ULI, the Cheruvu Island 2.
00:55:44> 00:55:46:	To provide some closing remarks,
00:55:46> 00:55:48:	I would love to go round the panel swiftly and
00:55:48> 00:55:50:	just capture any final comments.
00:55:50> 00:55:53:	Sort of an elevator wrap up from each of you
00:55:53> 00:55:56:	as to anything you think we may not have covered
00:55:56> 00:55:59:	or you think is critically important to the Irish context
00:55:59> 00:56:02:	for applying the recommendations of the urali.
00:56:02> 00:56:07:	Promoting affordable housing report today and I'd like to start
00:56:07> 00:56:08:	with Marcus.
00:56:08> 00:56:11:	If I mention it quite a several.
00:56:14> 00:56:18:	I all the things of social distancing and code.
00:56:18> 00:56:21:	Look big, look for a big round table and everybody
00:56:21> 00:56:22:	on that.
00:56:22> 00:56:25:	We exchange ideas and and discuss what your long term
00:56:25> 00:56:26:	goals are.
00:56:26> 00:56:29:	Because I think the long term goals is what you
00:56:29> 00:56:30:	easily can agree on.
00:56:30> 00:56:33:	And if you have this then work on achieving these
00:56:33> 00:56:36:	goals and therefore I think you need a big round
00:56:36> 00:56:38:	table in the current situation.
00:56:40> 00:56:42:	Really pertinent, thank you. Have yeah,
00:56:42> 00:56:43:	well you know I was.

00:56:43> 00:56:46:	Luce listening to Pill's last comments and Luces
00:56:43> 00:56:48: 00:56:47> 00:56:49:	I was listening to Bill's last comments and I were thinking it sounds a little bit.
	0
00:56:49> 00:56:52:	Cynical, but but it didn't sound optimistic to me and
00:56:52> 00:56:55:	I know Bill very optimistic and solution and creative thinkers.
00:56:55> 00:56:58:	So you know if if if you have an idea
00:56:58> 00:57:01:	that discourse based rental discussions cannot kind of.
00:57:01> 00:57:04:	It's very important, cannot kind of get to the level
00:57:04> 00:57:06:	that it needs to get at then think about you
00:57:07> 00:57:09:	know what does the other side need and what do
00:57:09> 00:57:11:	you need to give the other side.
00:57:11> 00:57:13:	Kind of two. And in this case it seems to
00:57:14> 00:57:16:	be the finance Department to get them on the table.
00:57:16> 00:57:19:	And you know the housing market has kind of two
00:57:20> 00:57:20:	legs.
00:57:20> 00:57:23:	And those are interconnected and one is the rental lack
00:57:23> 00:57:25:	and has a social component in it.
00:57:25> 00:57:29:	The other one is the owner occupied by the Finance
00:57:29> 00:57:29:	Department.
00:57:29> 00:57:32:	Generally is more interested in the owner occupier,
00:57:32> 00:57:36:	part of the market, because that's where most of their
00:57:36> 00:57:39:	kind of income and incentives are generally to be found.
00:57:39> 00:57:41:	So if you thinking about that,
00:57:41> 00:57:44:	this is the moment to kind of push the reset
00:57:44> 00:57:44:	button.
00:57:44> 00:57:48:	Think about the coherence between the two sides of the
00:57:48> 00:57:51:	housing market and try to find a kind of a
00:57:51> 00:57:51:	package deal.
00:57:51> 00:57:54:	Compromise is that you know you have to be able
00:57:54> 00:57:55:	to compromise.
00:57:55> 00:57:58:	I think if you want to find a solution for
00:57:58> 00:58:00:	this kind of a complex and it seems to be
00:58:00> 00:58:04:	kind of pillar structure argumentation that you have an island
00:58:04> 00:58:06:	where you kind of cannot seem to be able to
00:58:06> 00:58:09:	kind of get out of the cocoon and you need
00:58:09> 00:58:11:	to be able to get out of the computers.
00:58:11> 00:58:14:	Think about those two legs and if you can exchange
00:58:14> 00:58:17:	very important parts for each of the protagonist and and
00:58:17> 00:58:20:	at least you know get together showing them that you
00:58:20> 00:58:25:	have the intention. Find a solution with that.
00:58:25> 00:58:30:	And bill. I think that my wish would be that
00:58:30> 00:58:32:	the level of the base.
00:58:32> 00:58:36:	It goes up from pub level to being an informed
	· · · ·

00:58:37> 00:58:38:	discussion.
00:58:38> 00:58:42:	How to achieve that is is challenging?
00:58:42> 00:58:46:	They the if you I have found that if you
00:58:46> 00:58:50:	start trying to explain how the housing system works.
00:58:50> 00:58:54:	People have two interests. One is you're finishing up quickly
00:58:54> 00:58:57:	and the 2nd is what's the price of what my
00:58:57> 00:59:00:	house going to be worth in 10 years time that
00:59:00> 00:59:03:	the that it is hugely complicated and you you have
00:59:03> 00:59:07:	to lift the bonnet of the car to actually understand
00:59:07> 00:59:10:	how the engine works and so few people,
00:59:10> 00:59:13:	particularly politicians are prepared to do that.
00:59:13> 00:59:17:	Very few politicians actually understand the procurement process,
00:59:17> 00:59:21:	the finance process, the actual construction process.
00:59:21> 00:59:23:	And if you understand housing,
00:59:23> 00:59:27:	you have to, you have to understand the makeup and
00:59:27> 00:59:28:	and the working.
00:59:28> 00:59:32:	The motivation of the constituent parts.
00:59:32> 00:59:35:	And you know you take management,
00:59:35> 00:59:39:	the management of social housing and rental housing is is
00:59:39> 00:59:41:	complicated and it is sophisticated.
00:59:41> 00:59:45:	But again, the only person is really worried about the
00:59:45> 00:59:48:	management is it is the guy who's got a leak.
00:59:48> 00:59:52:	He's got his dishwasher leaking either his own one or
00:59:52> 00:59:54:	the one on the roof above him.
00:59:54> 00:59:56:	And that's what management is to him.
00:59:56> 00:59:58:	But you know the management,
00:59:58> 01:00:03:	the delivery, the design, they are all interconnecting parts.
01:00:03> 01:00:08:	Which which are not really understood and people and don't
01:00:08> 01:00:09:	get discussed.
01:00:09> 01:00:12:	The pub in the in the pub discussion and we
01:00:12> 01:00:16:	have so many pub discussions on television and it's wonderful
01:00:16> 01:00:16:	there.
01:00:16> 01:00:19:	Media love it because basically you get three people in
01:00:19> 01:00:22:	and a lot of different views on design that have
01:00:22> 01:00:26:	different views on financing and off you go for an
01:00:26> 01:00:30:	hours entertainment with with with for the actual media sponsor.
01:00:30> 01:00:32:	So get the level of debate up and I think
01:00:32> 01:00:33:	that our housing,
01:00:33> 01:00:37:	age, Housing, Housing Commission backed up by a housing research

01:00:37> 01:00:38:	unit,
01:00:38> 01:00:41:	we don't have a housing research unit we did have.
01:00:41> 01:00:43:	About 30 years ago in the forest,
01:00:43> 01:00:45:	for better. But we really need an in depth housing
01:00:45> 01:00:49:	research unit which is respected by all the players and
01:00:49> 01:00:52:	which can which can pronounce authoritatively on issues as they
01:00:52> 01:00:54:	come up.
01:00:54> 01:00:57:	Interesting thanks bill. And with that I might hand over
01:00:57> 01:01:00:	to Tom Dunn and thank you from myself to all
01:01:00> 01:01:01:	of the panelists.
01:01:01> 01:01:04:	Super interesting Tom and thanks very much Marcus.
01:01:04> 01:01:07:	That was really interesting conversation discussion.
01:01:07> 01:01:11:	I thought the quality of the debate taking Bill's point
01:01:11> 01:01:14:	about the level of debate that point the bill made,
01:01:14> 01:01:17:	certainly would not apply to the conversation.
01:01:17> 01:01:18:	I think we've had here today.
01:01:18> 01:01:21:	I think it's been really in depth and it was
01:01:21> 01:01:24:	of course founded on that very good report that the
01:01:25> 01:01:25:	ULI.
01:01:25> 01:01:27:	Has produced and that is one of the strengths and
01:01:28> 01:01:30:	one of the great benefits that the UI provides in
01:01:30> 01:01:31:	a country like Ireland.
01:01:31> 01:01:34:	Whereas Bill says the level of debate needs to be
01:01:34> 01:01:37:	opted and the UI is making a serious contribution to
01:01:37> 01:01:37:	that,
01:01:37> 01:01:40:	I think through producing reports like this.
01:01:40> 01:01:42:	Can I just make a couple of observations?
01:01:42> 01:01:45:	First of all, I think Marcus made the point that
01:01:45> 01:01:46:	often.
01:01:46> 01:01:49:	Solutions to crisis come solutions to problems,
01:01:49> 01:01:52:	crisis. I was struck by the point you made that
01:01:52> 01:01:56:	you know the long term settle settled approach to housing
01:01:56> 01:02:00:	was only upset by the financial crisis and presumably will
01:02:00> 01:02:01:	be upset by this crisis too,
01:02:01> 01:02:05:	and that this crisis is an opportunity to do something
01:02:05> 01:02:08:	about on about the long term way we've been doing
01:02:08> 01:02:09:	things,
01:02:09> 01:02:13:	particularly in Ireland. And I think this crisis does provide
01:02:13> 01:02:14:	an opportunity,
01:02:14> 01:02:16:	and I think what Bill was saying.
01:02:16> 01:02:19:	Is right that we need some sort of long?

01:02:19> 01:02:24:	Term well constructed discussion about housing in Ireland fitting all
01:02:24> 01:02:27:	the great the actors together and making sure that they
01:02:27> 01:02:31:	all interact and understand the way each other comes at
01:02:31> 01:02:34:	the problem. I I just would make one observation on
01:02:34> 01:02:38:	that which I don't think came up in this conversation,
01:02:38> 01:02:41:	but I think it's kind of important and that is
01:02:41> 01:02:44:	that there's an ideological issue in housing.
01:02:44> 01:02:47:	If I look across the solutions that are put forward
01:02:47> 01:02:50:	in Ireland you can see deep ideological.
01:02:50> 01:02:53:	Foundations for a lot of these which come from views
01:02:53> 01:02:55:	about how big a state we should have.
01:02:55> 01:02:58:	For example, you know in in one world view if
01:02:58> 01:03:01:	the state gets involved and captures a lot of the
01:03:01> 01:03:02:	resource is well,
01:03:02> 01:03:04:	then it will have a lot of resource is to
01:03:04> 01:03:08:	provide housing for a greater proportion of the population than,
01:03:08> 01:03:10:	for instance is done in Ireland.
01:03:10> 01:03:14:	So the ideology about housing is something that maybe you
01:03:14> 01:03:14:	will.
01:03:14> 01:03:17:	I should start thinking about a little bit.
01:03:17> 01:03:18:	So with those few remarks,
01:03:18> 01:03:20:	can I just thank yourself?
01:03:20> 01:03:23:	Comfort doing a great job of moderating a weapon are
01:03:23> 01:03:26:	which is that skill to be watched in the future,
01:03:26> 01:03:29:	because probably we're going to have more of these.
01:03:29> 01:03:32:	If this is the way the world is going to
01:03:32> 01:03:32:	go.
01:03:32> 01:03:35:	And I think thank Marcus and Xavierre for coming in
01:03:35> 01:03:37:	and giving us the benefit of that.
01:03:37> 01:03:40:	I would make the observation that I think somebody in
01:03:40> 01:03:43:	the course of their conversation made the point that asked
01:03:44> 01:03:45:	about the situation.
01:03:45> 01:03:47:	In the UK. One of the problems in Ireland we
01:03:47> 01:03:50:	have been bedevilled with trying to solve problems.
01:03:50> 01:03:53:	Has been that is the first port of call because
01:03:53> 01:03:54:	we speak English,
01:03:54> 01:03:57:	they speak English. If we've got a problem often the
01:03:57> 01:03:59:	first thing we do is find out what has been
01:03:59> 01:04:02:	done in the UK and that overly influences us.
01:04:02> 01:04:04:	I think one of the benefits for island of the

01:04:04> 01:04:07:	UK leaving the European Union is we might stop ourselves
01:04:07> 01:04:10:	doing that because I think a lot of the problems
01:04:10> 01:04:12:	that we have are not going to be solved by
01:04:12> 01:04:14:	looking to what has been done in the UK and
01:04:14> 01:04:17:	I think that's been the case for for about half
01:04:17> 01:04:19:	a century for more than half century for hundred.
01:04:19> 01:04:21:	Since you so can I thank Marcus.
01:04:21> 01:04:24:	Xavier for coming in and giving us the benefit of
01:04:24> 01:04:25:	their worldview.
01:04:25> 01:04:27:	I think this is probably important.
01:04:27> 01:04:31:	Can I thank Andy for organizing this and putting together?
01:04:31> 01:04:33:	And of course, the UI staff are doing all this.
01:04:33> 01:04:36:	These things don't come together that easily.
01:04:36> 01:04:38:	They take a bit of technology and take a bit
01:04:38> 01:04:40:	of effort to put together.
01:04:40> 01:04:42:	So can I just say thanks very much?
01:04:42> 01:04:45:	I actually don't know how you clap on webinars.
01:04:45> 01:04:46:	Tom, do you know?
01:04:50> 01:04:52:	Usually at the end of these sessions,
01:04:52> 01:04:54:	there's a big round of applause,
01:04:54> 01:04:56:	so I don't know if zoom has constructed at a
01:04:56> 01:04:58:	button that I should press,
01:04:58> 01:05:01:	or you should fast to simulate that round of applause,
01:05:01> 01:05:03:	but maybe we will do this waving her hands as
01:05:04> 01:05:06:	they do in the in the in the death circles
01:05:06> 01:05:07:	you know.
01:05:07> 01:05:09:	So thank you very much for coming along,
01:05:09> 01:05:12:	and may I also thank the audience and the people
01:05:12> 01:05:14:	who participated in this seminar,
01:05:14> 01:05:16:	because I think this is very important.
01:05:16> 01:05:19:	Still made the point. To have a discussion and to
01:05:19> 01:05:21:	raise the level of debate in Ireland so can I
01:05:21> 01:05:24:	ask each of you to go away with those words.
01:05:24> 01:05:26:	That Bill said that we've got to elevate the level
01:05:26> 01:05:29:	of conversation about housing in Ireland from the level of
01:05:29> 01:05:30:	the pub,
01:05:30> 01:05:32:	and we've done a good work on that today.
01:05:32> 01:05:35:	So thank you all very much.
01:05:35> 01:05:37:	Thank you, thank you there.
01:05:40> 01:05:42:	Now who presses what button?

This video transcript has been machine-generated, so it may not be accurate. It is for personal use only. Reproduction or use without written permission is prohibited. If you have a correction or for permission inquiries, please contact .