

## Webinar

## Preserving Affordable Housing

Date: August 20, 2021

00:00:04> 00:00:08:	Welcome everyone, thank you for joining us this Friday afternoon
00:00:08> 00:00:10:	to discuss preserving affordable housing.
00:00:10> 00:00:12:	My name is Rosie Hepler.
00:00:12> 00:00:16:	I am a director with utilized trigger Center for housing
00:00:16> 00:00:19:	for those who are not familiar with the tour center,
00:00:19> 00:00:22:	we are the content center at Yola headquarters focused on
00:00:22> 00:00:25:	the residential industry and particularly housing affordability.
00:00:25> 00:00:29:	Our activities include research and publications and awards program engagements
00:00:29> 00:00:31:	with our members and district councils.
00:00:31> 00:00:34:	Events including an annual housing conference and this monthly webinar
00:00:35> 00:00:35:	series.
00:00:35> 00:00:38:	If you haven't joined a webinar of ours yet,
00:00:38> 00:00:40:	recordings of our past webinars.
00:00:40> 00:00:43:	Are available to align members on knowledge Binder and next
00:00:43> 00:00:44:	month.
00:00:44> 00:00:46:	Next month webinar will take place on September 17th,
00:00:46> 00:00:49:	so the third Friday of September and it will focus
00:00:49> 00:00:53:	on workforce housing along Grand Blvd using examples in San
00:00:53> 00:00:54:	Francisco and Los Angeles,
00:00:54> 00:00:57:	and I want to take anymore time from today's webinar
00:00:58> 00:01:00:	as we have a great discussion ahead of us.
00:01:00> 00:01:03:	I'm sure everyone on this call is fully aware that
00:01:03> 00:01:07:	we have a supply ship supply shortage of housing in
00:01:07> 00:01:10:	many of our cities and regions in this country and.
00:01:10> 00:01:12:	We need to build more housing,

00:01:12> 00:01:16:	but preserving what is already available and attainable housing is
00:01:16> 00:01:19:	equally important to this to this work and to creating
00:01:19> 00:01:22:	equitable and affordable communities.
00:01:22> 00:01:25:	So without further ado, I'd like to pass it over
00:01:25> 00:01:29:	to our Executive director of UI Philadelphia Lord Slepski.
00:01:30> 00:01:32:	Thank you Rosie. Good afternoon everybody.
00:01:32> 00:01:36:	Thank you for talking about affordable housing on your August
00:01:36> 00:01:37:	Friday afternoon.
00:01:37> 00:01:40:	I'm the executive director, as Rosie said of the Urban
00:01:40> 00:01:43:	Land Institute Philadelphia District Council.
00:01:43> 00:01:46:	We are part of the broader global organization,
00:01:46> 00:01:50:	but we work locally in the Philadelphia metropolitan area,
00:01:50> 00:01:54:	Delaware Southern, New Jersey, Central Pennsylvania and the Lehigh Valley.
00:01:54> 00:01:58:	Really happy to be talking about this critical issue today,
00:01:58> 00:02:00:	both about work that we've just completed.
00:02:00> 00:02:05:	In Philadelphia with our city around naturally occurring affordable housing
00:02:05> 00:02:08:	and also touching on my past experience prior to coming
00:02:08> 00:02:11:	to ULI is in affordable housing at the federal level
00:02:11> 00:02:13:	and locally in New York City,
00:02:13> 00:02:16:	working alongside one of our other panelists.
00:02:16> 00:02:19:	So that's myself just a little bit of the perspective
00:02:19> 00:02:22:	that I can bring in terms of the work that
00:02:22> 00:02:24:	we've just completed.
00:02:24> 00:02:25:	I'll go over that then.
00:02:25> 00:02:29:	Our panelists will all introduce themselves and we will just
00:02:29> 00:02:31:	go ahead and jump.
00:02:31> 00:02:35:	Into the material and address all of the questions that
00:02:35> 00:02:36:	we have time for,
00:02:36> 00:02:38:	so just very briefly in Philadelphia,
00:02:38> 00:02:42:	we have been working with the city around their housing
00:02:42> 00:02:43:	for equity plan,
00:02:43> 00:02:47:	which was we really started the process around 2016 2017
00:02:47> 00:02:49:	and it was completed in 2018.
00:02:49> 00:02:54:	And you know one of the things that we discussed
00:02:54> 00:02:59:	prior to today's discussion is just that there's such a
00:02:59> 00:03:00:	wide range of.
00:03:00> 00:03:04:	Housing stock and actors that are critical to this conversation,
00:03:04> 00:03:07:	but in the particular case of our work,
00:03:07> 00:03:11:	we were asked to really looking at existing housing

	preservation
00:03:11> 00:03:14:	and specifically the city wanted an organization to help think
00:03:14> 00:03:18:	about what we call naturally occurring affordable housing stocks.
00:03:18> 00:03:22:	So preservation of buildings that are not otherwise restricted through
00:03:22> 00:03:23:	another subsidy.
00:03:23> 00:03:26:	So we participated in a working group looking at subsidized
00:03:26> 00:03:27:	housing preservation,
00:03:27> 00:03:31:	but the city really wanted to look at.
00:03:31> 00:03:34:	You know how do we wrap our arms around this
00:03:34> 00:03:35:	universe?
00:03:35> 00:03:39:	Who are owners and how can we work in conjunction
00:03:39> 00:03:42:	with what we think is a really large swath of
00:03:42> 00:03:46:	properties to ensure maintain maintaining quality,
00:03:46> 00:03:48:	supporting tenants and also preserving affordability.
00:03:48> 00:03:52:	So we completed a national study visit in conjunction with
00:03:52> 00:03:55:	the ULI Terwilliger Center last year.
00:03:55> 00:03:57:	Again focused on this scope.
00:03:57> 00:04:01:	The first portion was really a data analysis in conjunction
00:04:01> 00:04:02:	with about.
00:04:02> 00:04:06:	Four or five other organizations in Philadelphia to look at
00:04:06> 00:04:10:	the housing stack and focus on a specific kind of
00:04:10> 00:04:14:	income level and really got our arms around the fact
00:04:14> 00:04:18:	that about 76,000 of these properties are what we called
00:04:18> 00:04:20:	naturally occurring affordable housing.
00:04:20> 00:04:22:	About half of them are vulnerable,
00:04:22> 00:04:25:	either due to condition, displacement risk,
00:04:25> 00:04:27:	strong market value in that neighborhood,
00:04:27> 00:04:30:	or other type of intervention,
00:04:30> 00:04:33:	and about 80% were owned by small.
00:04:33> 00:04:35:	Landlords, so individuals or entities that owned under 10 properties.
00:04:35> 00:04:38:	So we really did a deep dive with a group
00:04:38> 00:04:41:	of ULI members from around the country and Philadelphia with
00:04:41> 00:04:44:	stakeholders thinking about how we could support the city to
00:04:44> 00:04:46:	work with those owners in a different way,
00:04:46> 00:04:49:	and a meaningful way to address the the housing units.
00:04:49> 00:04:52:	So we were happy to share that report.
00:04:52> 00:04:54:	That's one of the things that that Rosie wanted to
00:04:55> 00:04:56:	ensure that we covered today,
00:04:56> 00:04:59:	but I'll stop there. Happy to talk more about it

00:04:59> 00:05:02:	and a lot of the other really critical themes that
00:05:02> 00:05:03:	l know.
00:05:03> 00:05:05:	We would like to address so with that I will
00:05:05> 00:05:07:	introduce Eric under Lynn.
00:05:08> 00:05:11:	Laura, thank you. It is great to be here Lauren.
00:05:11> 00:05:14:	I worked together for years in New York City,
00:05:14> 00:05:17:	so it's especially Nice to reconnect.
00:05:17> 00:05:19:	And join this really important discussion.
00:05:19> 00:05:22:	It's really great to hear this kind of priority that
00:05:22> 00:05:25:	you Ally is putting on preservation in the form of
00:05:26> 00:05:27:	these conversations II.
00:05:27> 00:05:30:	Sometimes working in New York City are housing agency is
00:05:30> 00:05:32:	called housing Preservation and development.
00:05:32> 00:05:36:	So the word preservation is always up front in the
00:05:36> 00:05:38:	title and it's an interesting.
00:05:38> 00:05:41:	I also teach a class and sometimes say this to
00:05:41> 00:05:42:	the students.
00:05:42> 00:05:44:	There's an interesting kind of tension.
00:05:44> 00:05:48:	It feels like sometimes between preservation and new construction sometimes.
00:05:48> 00:05:51:	You know, and it's obviously in that title.
00:05:51> 00:05:54:	Housing, preservation and development. Some people view it as a
00:05:54> 00:05:58:	counter cyclical argument that you do new construction in very
00:05:58> 00:05:58:	hot,
00:05:58> 00:06:01:	very strong markets, and when markets kind of retrench a
00:06:01> 00:06:02:	little bit,
00:06:02> 00:06:04:	maybe you focus on preservation.
00:06:04> 00:06:06:	And that's true for a bunch of reasons.
00:06:06> 00:06:10:	After 2008 910, the city of New York did a
00:06:10> 00:06:12:	lot of focus on preservation,
00:06:12> 00:06:15:	neighborhood stabilization, community investment. But at the same time,
00:06:15> 00:06:18:	the city of New York does a ton of.
00:06:18> 00:06:20:	Preservation work all the time.
00:06:20> 00:06:22:	In fact, our housing plan.
00:06:22> 00:06:25:	We're in the we're in the middle 2/3 through a
00:06:25> 00:06:29:	housing plan that is 300,000 units and every year 60%
00:06:29> 00:06:31:	of that is preservation, and about 40%
00:06:31> 00:06:33:	of it is new construction.
00:06:33> 00:06:36:	So let me back up for a second.
00:06:36> 00:06:39:	Just introduce myself a little bit more too.

00:06:39> 00:06:42:	I started at the New York City Housing Authority as
00:06:42> 00:06:45:	a young urban planner I had worked for the New
00:06:45> 00:06:49:	Jersey Council and affordable housing doing Mount Laurel.
00:06:49> 00:06:52:	KOA planning and housing in the state of New Jersey
00:06:52> 00:06:54:	went to the New York City Housing Authority,
00:06:54> 00:06:57:	then did a lot of work at HPD housing Preservation
00:06:57> 00:07:00:	and development which I just talked about and then now
00:07:00> 00:07:04:	the President of the New York City Housing Development Corporation,
00:07:04> 00:07:06:	which is the city's housing finance agency.
00:07:06> 00:07:09:	So we work to finance a lot of the affordable
00:07:09> 00:07:12:	housing that happens in this city of New York were
00:07:12> 00:07:16:	also one of the oftentimes one of the largest municipal
00:07:16> 00:07:19:	issuers and and oftentimes the largest financeer of affordable housing.
00:07:19> 00:07:22:	In the US. And I'd say that sometimes when I
00:07:22> 00:07:23:	say that about New York,
00:07:23> 00:07:25:	I try to step back from the New York exceptionalism
00:07:25> 00:07:25:	a little bit.
00:07:25> 00:07:27:	Because of this work is.
00:07:27> 00:07:30:	Real hard work at the same level of challenge.
00:07:30> 00:07:32:	Every place New York may have a little bit more
00:07:32> 00:07:33:	resource to do it,
00:07:33> 00:07:36:	but that doesn't mean the work is any harder or
00:07:36> 00:07:38:	any easier than any other place.
00:07:38> 00:07:41:	The reason I'm super excited about this preservation piece is
00:07:41> 00:07:42:	that we have,
00:07:42> 00:07:44:	in addition to working for so long with the City
00:07:44> 00:07:47:	of New York on the housing plan which I just
00:07:47> 00:07:49:	talked a little bit about.
00:07:49> 00:07:51:	Increasingly over the last few years,
00:07:51> 00:07:54:	we've kind of turned and had this one to one
00:07:54> 00:07:59:	relationship with the New York City Housing Authority to preserve
00:07:59> 00:08:01:	public housing,
00:08:01> 00:08:06:	and that has been a a tremendously rewarding and challenging.
00:08:06> 00:08:08:	Exercise to do over the last couple years,
00:08:08> 00:08:10:	we'll talk more about it in the presentation,
00:08:10> 00:08:13:	but just want to kind of cue that up and
00:08:13> 00:08:16:	also point out that HTC the Housing Development Corporation got
00:08:16> 00:08:19:	its start really with a with a program in New

00:08:19> 00:08:21:	York City that was kind of a limited equity limited
00:08:21> 00:08:25:	return model of affordable housing called the Mitchell Lama program.
00:08:25> 00:08:27:	But now we've gone on to preserve a huge amount
00:08:28> 00:08:30:	of that Mitchell Lama housing as well.
00:08:30> 00:08:32:	So my point to kind of start the conversation is
00:08:32> 00:08:36:	that while there can be this counterpoint between preservation and
00:08:36> 00:08:40:	new construction sometimes people view the glossy renderings of new
00:08:40> 00:08:44:	construction as. Somehow having a priority,
00:08:44> 00:08:46:	the preservation work is is absolutely critical to the life
00:08:46> 00:08:47:	of the city,
00:08:47> 00:08:49:	and I think it's great that we're going to have
00:08:49> 00:08:50:	this conversation today,
00:08:50> 00:08:54:	so thank you. And I'll hand it over to damn.
00:08:56> 00:09:01:	Thanks, Eric. So to answer the biggest question people have
00:09:01> 00:09:02:	about me,
00:09:02> 00:09:06:	yes, I am wearing basketball shorts right now.
00:09:06> 00:09:08:	Uh, below my suit jacket here,
00:09:08> 00:09:12:	but the as a quick introduction of myself Dan Den.
00:09:12> 00:09:16:	I'm with Amazon. I'm the senior product manager for the
00:09:16> 00:09:20:	Housing equity fund that was launched earlier this year.
00:09:20> 00:09:24:	I joined Amazon this past summer to oversee the fund
00:09:24> 00:09:28:	and taking constant aching deals from concept to execution.
00:09:28> 00:09:33:	As well as being the housing affordability and finance specialist
00:09:33> 00:09:34:	for Amazon and this fund.
00:09:34> 00:09:39:	Prior to Amazon I was at Freddie Mac for the
00:09:39> 00:09:41:	past 14 years,
00:09:41> 00:09:46:	most recently overseeing the underwriting credit platforms for various business
00:09:46> 00:09:46:	lines,
00:09:46> 00:09:49:	including our affordable housing business line,
00:09:49> 00:09:52:	structured finance, seniors, housing arlight equity investments,
00:09:52> 00:09:57:	and actually worked with Eric and his team at ACC
00:09:57> 00:09:59:	on some great NYCHA,
00:09:59> 00:10:02:	a work that he just alluded to.
00:10:02> 00:10:05:	So that was it. It's a very small world and
00:10:05> 00:10:08:	I'm happy to see Eric on this panel with me
00:10:08> 00:10:09:	here.
00:10:09> 00:10:12:	To give you guys a little context of the housing

00:10:12> 00:10:13:	equity funding,
00:10:13> 00:10:16:	kind of where it sits in Amazon.
00:10:16> 00:10:18:	Because Amazon is very large.
00:10:18> 00:10:21:	We I sit in a organization called Amazon in the
00:10:21> 00:10:22:	community.
00:10:22> 00:10:25:	It's the closest thing we have to philanthropy at at
00:10:25> 00:10:26:	at Amazon.
00:10:26> 00:10:30:	But it's not exactly that we are leveraging our tools,
00:10:30> 00:10:33:	the innovation, our speed or scale at Amazon to give
00:10:33> 00:10:35:	back to the community,
00:10:35> 00:10:39:	and we have four main pillars within Amazon and Community.
00:10:39> 00:10:41:	STEM education is one of them.
00:10:41> 00:10:44:	That's future. Our future engineers program.
00:10:44> 00:10:49:	Employee engagement of our 1.3 million employees we have at
00:10:49> 00:10:49:	Amazon.
00:10:49> 00:10:53:	Right now needs which is disaster recovery and the newest
00:10:53> 00:10:54:	one.
00:10:54> 00:10:58:	The Housing Equity Fund which was launched this year in
00:10:58> 00:11:01:	the Housing Equity Fund was launched as a as a
00:11:01> 00:11:06:	addition to one of Amazon's key positions that was outlined
00:11:06> 00:11:10:	last year, which was all people should have access to.
00:11:10> 00:11:13:	Housing they can afford and and you guys as professionals
00:11:14> 00:11:17:	on on this line know the needs of low income
00:11:17> 00:11:20:	minority families that are disappointingly.
00:11:20> 00:11:23:	Affected by affordable housing shortage in the US.
00:11:23> 00:11:27:	And so we want to invest directly to help that
00:11:28> 00:11:28:	out,
00:11:28> 00:11:32:	and so the fund was launched earlier this year.
00:11:32> 00:11:35:	It is a over \$2 billion investment by Amazon towards
00:11:35> 00:11:40:	affordable housing to create 20,000 affordable units in three major
00:11:40> 00:11:44:	markets where Amazon has over 5000 employees in each of
00:11:44> 00:11:48:	these markets. Those markets are the DC area Nashville in
00:11:48> 00:11:50:	the Puget Sound area.
00:11:50> 00:11:53:	Across those three markets in the near future.
00:11:53> 00:11:56:	We'll have over 100,000 employees,
00:11:56> 00:11:58:	and so there is a,
00:11:58> 00:12:01:	you know, as large private employer one,
00:12:01> 00:12:04:	the largest private employer in these three markets.
00:12:04> 00:12:08:	We understand our. We want to be partners with the
00:12:09> 00:12:14:	communities and are committed to leveraging our scale for

	good.
00:12:14> 00:12:18:	And so that is part of this.
00:12:18> 00:12:22:	This investment, as part of that 20,000 units,
00:12:22> 00:12:25:	we have specific areas of focus that we would also
00:12:25> 00:12:31:	like to highlight which are supporting transit oriented projects and
00:12:31> 00:12:37:	supporting minority LED organizations and also supporting local governments or
00:12:37> 00:12:40:	government entity agencies that have innovative tools.
00:12:40> 00:12:45:	You know, unlike many other financial sources out there.
00:12:45> 00:12:47:	Our capital is very flexible.
00:12:47> 00:12:49:	It can range anywhere from grants,
00:12:49> 00:12:54:	which is a very, very small portion of that all
00:12:54> 00:12:55:	the way to.
00:12:55> 00:12:59:	Mezzanine debt and equity investments within projects.
00:12:59> 00:13:02:	And so we definitely get way deeper in in that
00:13:02> 00:13:05:	as we as we get deeper into this panel.
00:13:05> 00:13:09:	But we did have a marquee investment that is a
00:13:09> 00:13:12:	sign of what we are intending to do here at
00:13:12> 00:13:13:	Amazon.
00:13:13> 00:13:17:	That investment is Crystal House at in the Alexander area.
00:13:17> 00:13:21:	It is 13 going to be about 1300 units of
00:13:21> 00:13:25:	preservation and new development right near HQ,
00:13:25> 00:13:29:	two in in Crystal City area and so our investment
00:13:30> 00:13:33:	of \$2 billion is going to be a mix of
00:13:33> 00:13:36:	preservation and construction.
00:13:36> 00:13:39:	But one of our main goals is to think about
00:13:40> 00:13:42:	efficiency of our own capital,
00:13:42> 00:13:47:	and so we're trying to to to preserve 20,000 affordable
00:13:47> 00:13:47:	units.
00:13:47> 00:13:50:	By 2025, a good way to do that is looking
00:13:50> 00:13:53:	at preservation and the stock that's currently out there,
00:13:53> 00:13:56:	not just new development. And so we understand that,
00:13:56> 00:13:58:	and it's part of my role to help balance our
00:13:58> 00:13:59:	portfolio.
00:13:59> 00:14:02:	Against that. We can definitely get deeper in our conversations
00:14:02> 00:14:03:	on that topic,
00:14:03> 00:14:05:	but glad to be here and I'll hand it back
00:14:05> 00:14:06:	over to you,
00:14:06> 00:14:09:	Laura. Great,
00:14:09> 00:14:12:	thank you so much. So we're going to try to
00:14:12> 00:14:14:	keep this relatively informal.

00:14:14> 00:14:17:	We have a few themes that we talked about that
00:14:17> 00:14:19:	will start with,
00:14:19> 00:14:22:	but again, feel free to please submit comments and questions
00:14:22> 00:14:24:	in the Q&A so we talked about,
00:14:24> 00:14:28:	you know this large affordable housing toolbox and that this
00:14:28> 00:14:29:	is a national conversation.
00:14:29> 00:14:33:	So thinking about how the various markets can think about
00:14:33> 00:14:36:	the broad spectrum of housing needs and and you know
00:14:36> 00:14:37:	all the tools that.
00:14:37> 00:14:40:	Eric talked about from preservation to new construction,
00:14:40> 00:14:44:	UM, and then also the roles of the public and
00:14:44> 00:14:47:	private sector and how important that all is,
00:14:47> 00:14:50:	as we just heard from Dan.
00:14:50> 00:14:53:	So I guess maybe to to kick us off.
00:14:53> 00:14:57:	Maybe we can talk about the public private peace and
00:14:58> 00:15:01:	maybe Eric if you could start on New York City
00:15:02> 00:15:04:	and what you see in terms of.
00:15:04> 00:15:07:	You know driving this discussion forward specifically as it relates
00:15:07> 00:15:08:	to the preservation side,
00:15:08> 00:15:10:	how the entities work together.
00:15:10> 00:15:11:	Happy to do that.
00:15:11> 00:15:13:	the IT in such a full topic?
00:15:13> 00:15:16:	I mean, we could probably do a whole panel on
00:15:16> 00:15:17:	that,
00:15:17> 00:15:20:	because you know, we all know many of us on
00:15:21> 00:15:23:	this on this web and R no that.
00:15:23> 00:15:26:	The major way that housing has been produced in the
00:15:26> 00:15:27:	United States,
00:15:27> 00:15:29:	at least for the past few decades,
00:15:29> 00:15:31:	has been in public private partnership for first of all,
00:15:31> 00:15:34:	the vast majority of it is what's viewed to be
00:15:34> 00:15:35:	privately produced,
00:15:35> 00:15:37:	at least on the production construction side.
00:15:37> 00:15:39:	But a very large portion as well.
00:15:39> 00:15:41:	And when you think about the affordable housing stock that's
00:15:41> 00:15:44:	been produced in the last couple of decades,
00:15:44> 00:15:45:	at least since the 1980s,
00:15:45> 00:15:47:	the largest driver of that has been the low income
00:15:48> 00:15:49:	housing tax credit.
00:15:49> 00:15:51:	But as you say that you know you have to

00:15:51> 00:15:53:	recognize that this is a.
00:15:53> 00:15:56:	Really is a full public private partnership in that in
00:15:56> 00:16:00:	that sense that those investments that are subsidized and funded
00:16:00> 00:16:03:	on the affordable side the low income housing tax credit,
00:16:03> 00:16:06:	other incentives, leverage resources from the private sector to produce
00:16:06> 00:16:07:	this housing.
00:16:07> 00:16:09:	And I know there's a there's a whole debate,
00:16:09> 00:16:12:	and that debate is really strong in New York right
00:16:12> 00:16:15:	now about how you might D commodify housing how you
00:16:15> 00:16:18:	bring more equity back to communities and neighborhoods,
00:16:18> 00:16:22:	how you balance that, how you kind of.
00:16:22> 00:16:26:	Think about housing less as that.
00:16:26> 00:16:30:	Kind of a product that is produced in ways that
00:16:30> 00:16:34:	are simply a for profit kind of construct.
00:16:34> 00:16:37:	But before you go too far down that road,
00:16:37> 00:16:40:	it's also important to remember that the vast majority of
00:16:40> 00:16:41:	housing is actually subsidized,
00:16:41> 00:16:45:	at least in some way by government and government programs.
00:16:45> 00:16:47:	So when you think about home ownership,
00:16:47> 00:16:51:	which a lot of people in the United States view
00:16:51> 00:16:51:	is,
00:16:51> 00:16:53:	I work hard. I bootstrapped myself.
00:16:53> 00:16:56:	I save up money, and I make a down payment,
00:16:56> 00:16:59:	and I buy a house that house even what is
00:16:59> 00:17:03:	viewed to be market rate housing not affordable in any
00:17:03> 00:17:03:	way,
00:17:03> 00:17:07:	is largely subsidized. By federal programs that people don't even
00:17:07> 00:17:07:	think about.
00:17:07> 00:17:10:	So the mortgage interest deduction is one that people are
00:17:10> 00:17:12:	even a little more familiar with.
00:17:12> 00:17:15:	But when you even think about and and Dan was
00:17:15> 00:17:18:	super close to this in his last job,
00:17:18> 00:17:21:	when you think about ways in which the government actually
00:17:21> 00:17:24:	supports the financing of even what's considered to be market
00:17:24> 00:17:24:	rate housing,
00:17:24> 00:17:27:	there is in nature no such thing as a 30
00:17:27> 00:17:30:	year mortgage at the cost that it's provided to in
00:17:30> 00:17:34:	in the United States and it's it's that 30 years

00:17:34> 00:17:37:	the provision of it. Even sponsored provision of it.
00:17:37> 00:17:39:	It's the implicit backing of it.
00:17:39> 00:17:43:	It's the idea of the insurance that comes with that.
00:17:43> 00:17:46:	That actually incentivizes both the demand for housing and also
00:17:46> 00:17:48:	therefore the construction of housing.
00:17:48> 00:17:51:	So even in the parts of the market that we
00:17:51> 00:17:55:	consider to be fully private and give the appearance of
00:17:55> 00:17:56:	being private,
00:17:56> 00:17:58:	there's a huge public participation in that,
00:17:58> 00:18:01:	and you can when you actually quantify it.
00:18:01> 00:18:03:	And when you look at those numbers,
00:18:03> 00:18:05:	it's fair in the argument.
00:18:05> 00:18:08:	And this statement that the the subsidy that goes to
00:18:08> 00:18:11:	what is deemed to be market rate home ownership is
00:18:11> 00:18:15:	actually larger public subsidy than all the other affordable housing
00:18:15> 00:18:18:	programs put together. So if you take public housing,
00:18:18> 00:18:20:	low income, housing tax credits,
00:18:20> 00:18:22:	Section 8 you could bliss some others in there.
00:18:22> 00:18:25:	You put all of them together and the subsidy that
00:18:25> 00:18:28:	comes through the the federal subsidy to homeownership,
00:18:28> 00:18:31:	which by the way the benefit of which goes largely
00:18:32> 00:18:33:	to middle class,
00:18:33> 00:18:35:	upper middle class and wealthier people.
00:18:35> 00:18:37:	That's so that's a larger subsidy,
00:18:37> 00:18:39:	so that's a good kind of just level setting place
00:18:40> 00:18:40:	to begin with,
00:18:40> 00:18:43:	and then we can go into a whole other piece
00:18:43> 00:18:43:	of conversation.
00:18:43> 00:18:46:	What I what I will say in New York City,
00:18:46> 00:18:48:	though it's important to remember to we have a lot
00:18:48> 00:18:50:	of government intervention in the housing market,
00:18:50> 00:18:53:	and one of the things I'll just tie it back
00:18:53> 00:18:53:	to.
00:18:53> 00:18:56:	Last year I was working together in the middle of
00:18:56> 00:18:58:	the pandemic at the beginning of the pandemic.
00:18:58> 00:19:00:	There's a lot of concern in cities about what was
00:19:00> 00:19:02:	going to happen in quote our portfolio,
00:19:02> 00:19:05:	meaning the subsidized portfolio. This stuff that we either put
00:19:05> 00:19:06:	direct subsidy.
00:19:06> 00:19:08:	Into or the OR the part of the stock that
00:19:08> 00:19:11:	we have tax credits in with partners or all those

11

00:19:11> 00:19:14:	kinds of programmatic things that you think about,
00:19:14> 00:19:17:	but. When you begin to realize when you see something
00:19:17> 00:19:19:	like the COVID pandemic,
00:19:19> 00:19:21:	and there are other moments like this as well that
00:19:21> 00:19:25:	the city's housing Commissioner is the housing Commissioner for this
00:19:25> 00:19:25:	city.
00:19:25> 00:19:28:	So there is an entire set of stock that is
00:19:28> 00:19:31:	vulnerable to those kinds of moves in the world that
00:19:31> 00:19:34:	don't just relate to what we think of as our
00:19:34> 00:19:36:	affordable portfolio. And the reason I.
00:19:36> 00:19:38:	I'll stop with that is because that's the kind of
00:19:39> 00:19:41:	crux point at which preservation becomes critical.
00:19:41> 00:19:44:	If something tips in that world.
00:19:44> 00:19:48:	Would you start to see is a withdrawal of investment?
00:19:48> 00:19:51:	You start to see a deterioration of that stock.
00:19:51> 00:19:53:	You start to see potentially disinvestment,
00:19:53> 00:19:55:	and that's the point at which you're really in a
00:19:55> 00:19:58:	full on preservation conversation that really stemming.
00:19:58> 00:20:01:	This investment in those kinds of moments and those kind
00:20:02> 00:20:05:	of settings are really and having the tools to do
00:20:05> 00:20:08:	that are really the kind of the the critical pieces
00:20:08> 00:20:11:	of a preservation conversation. Another reason why I'm really happy
00:20:11> 00:20:13:	that ULI is having this today.
00:20:14> 00:20:17:	Yeah, I mean that when we were working you ally
00:20:17> 00:20:20:	with saying to the city you know how can we
00:20:20> 00:20:23:	help support this housing plan?
00:20:23> 00:20:26:	We were happy that there was the request was let's
00:20:26> 00:20:29:	look at we have so many units in our city
00:20:29> 00:20:31:	that are not the larger.
00:20:31> 00:20:35:	Even when you're talking about the on the affordable side
00:20:35> 00:20:38:	and you know risk of tax credit projects and losing
00:20:38> 00:20:41:	their affordability terms is a big one that we are
00:20:41> 00:20:45:	focused on. But they we also said we need someone.
00:20:45> 00:20:48:	To also look at this non subsidized world of units
00:20:48> 00:20:53:	because these are really important units for residents that currently
00:20:53> 00:20:57:	are affordable to people in these neighborhoods and and risk
00:20:57> 00:20:59:	not being that way in five years.
00:20:59> 00:21:03:	And these owners don't have the infrastructure that some of
00:21:03> 00:21:05:	the larger owners might have.

00:21:05> 00:21:09:	So you know, that's exactly why we tried to,
00:21:09> 00:21:13:	you know, begin to focus on this population and it's
00:21:13> 00:21:15:	harder and that's why the.
00:21:15> 00:21:18:	You know, we're hoping that with the Terwilliger Center we
00:21:18> 00:21:21:	can work with some other cities that are looking at
00:21:21> 00:21:23:	maybe the same issue. But yeah,
00:21:23> 00:21:24:	Dan, go ahead. Yeah, uh,
00:21:24> 00:21:27:	all really good points and and I said I think
00:21:27> 00:21:30:	about the Amazon investments it they are going to vary
00:21:30> 00:21:34:	depending on the level of public subsidy within a project.
00:21:34> 00:21:37:	One of the key point and so we will play
00:21:37> 00:21:40:	in in the Lightech deal and I was playing in
00:21:40> 00:21:43:	the second or will play all the way to where
00:21:43> 00:21:46:	there's no subsidy and trying to close that gap.
00:21:46> 00:21:49:	And that's why really plays well in preservation,
00:21:49> 00:21:51:	a preservation projects. So you know,
00:21:51> 00:21:55:	one of the key aspects of of Amazon as we
00:21:55> 00:21:57:	evaluate this space is,
00:21:57> 00:22:01:	again is the innovative approach with with efficiency in mind.
00:22:01> 00:22:05:	We're looking at projects that we would invest when invest
00:22:05> 00:22:07:	in that if not for Amazon Capital,
00:22:07> 00:22:09:	this project would be impossible.
00:22:09> 00:22:11:	So if I looked at Lightech project,
00:22:11> 00:22:14:	there you have the equity piece of the debt piece.
00:22:14> 00:22:18:	You have some gap that's filled in by various.
00:22:18> 00:22:23:	Providers, both public and private.
00:22:23> 00:22:25:	But you might not have enough,
00:22:25> 00:22:28:	and so we're looking at filling that gap to make
00:22:28> 00:22:31:	those projects at least feasible to launch for both four
00:22:31> 00:22:32:	percent 9%
00:22:32> 00:22:35:	deals. But you know on the on the preservation end
00:22:35> 00:22:36:	you,
00:22:36> 00:22:38:	as Laura kind of alluded to you,
00:22:38> 00:22:41:	do have a lot of projects that are Noah projects
00:22:41> 00:22:42:	that don't have subsidy,
00:22:42> 00:22:45:	and they are right for value add plays,
00:22:45> 00:22:48:	and that is kind of we're going to get to
00:22:48> 00:22:49:	the market operations.
00:22:49> 00:22:51:	That's kind of what's going on there.
00:22:51> 00:22:53:	Value add, I would say.
00:22:53> 00:22:56:	Took a pause writing very beginning of COVID,
00:22:56> 00:22:59:	but it is back in in full force and everyone

00:22:59> 00:23:02:	is still seeing the the rent growth opportunities in in
00:23:02> 00:23:05:	Noah projects are the best ones for for a lot
00:23:05> 00:23:09:	of for profit developers and owners to look at to
	take over.
00:23:09> 00:23:09:	
00:23:09> 00:23:12:	You know put 10 to \$15,000 a unit into that.
00:23:12> 00:23:16:	Get all that money back plus some on the end.
00:23:16> 00:23:19:	But to do that you're raising rents in this naturally
00:23:19> 00:23:22:	occurring property is not going to be affordable anymore.
00:23:22> 00:23:25:	So what we're looking to do is.
00:23:25> 00:23:28:	Come look at these projects that are the naturally occurring
00:23:28> 00:23:31:	affordable speak to the current owner at that or or
00:23:32> 00:23:33:	if it's an open bid,
00:23:33> 00:23:36:	speak to the bidders of those properties and say hey,
00:23:36> 00:23:39:	are you willing to hold a majority of that property
00:23:39> 00:23:43:	or even entire property at income restrictions below 80%?
00:23:43> 00:23:50:	499 year term UM record against the land so that.
00:23:50> 00:23:53:	Courage is that property that will make that property
	generally
00:23:53> 00:23:53:	affordable,
00:23:53> 00:23:57:	even if that sponsor where they sell the property into
00:23:57> 00:23:57:	future.
00:23:57> 00:23:59:	That's the pie in the sky view.
00:23:59> 00:24:03:	Obviously there's an actual operations of a finance and what
00:24:03> 00:24:04:	needs to actually work here,
00:24:04> 00:24:07:	but we have been able to execute that plan in
00:24:07> 00:24:11:	various markets based on the cost of debt were lending
00:24:11> 00:24:11:	on.
00:24:11> 00:24:15:	And it it is. It is a pretty advantageous comparative
00:24:15> 00:24:16:	to the debt.
00:24:16> 00:24:19:	It's out there. So we at Amazon will lend up
00:24:19> 00:24:20:	to 9095%
00:24:20> 00:24:23:	of the capital stack. If a non profit and I
00:24:23> 00:24:24:	up to 97%
00:24:24> 00:24:27:	of the capital stack at very low rates a couple
00:24:28> 00:24:31:	hundred basis points below what's out there.
00:24:31> 00:24:33:	If for non government agencies lending.
00:24:33> 00:24:37:	All that in trade off to keep that property affordable
00:24:37> 00:24:40:	and so even the stepping to properties that are are
00:24:40> 00:24:41:	at market today say at 80%
00:24:41> 00:24:44:	am I you get everyone on this call you know
00:24:44> 00:24:47:	has observed that the incomes have been been stagnant and
00:24:47> 00:24:50:	cost of housing has continued to increase.

00:24:50> 00:24:52:	So if we can put that restriction in today we
00:24:52> 00:24:54:	will create affordability,
00:24:54> 00:24:57:	overtime as well. And and that's part of our preservation
00:24:57> 00:25:00:	play as we look at that end of the spectrum.
00:25:00> 00:25:02:	On the other end of spectrum it it's more of
00:25:03> 00:25:04:	Queen make projects.
00:25:04> 00:25:08:	Feasible, and launching it off in terms of new developments
00:25:08> 00:25:10:	and so like I said,
00:25:10> 00:25:11:	it's a range of participation,
00:25:11> 00:25:15:	and I think there are a lot of private companies
00:25:15> 00:25:18:	are looking at how they're giving back,
00:25:18> 00:25:22:	both in the in the total spectrum might be SG,
00:25:22> 00:25:26:	and so this is. This is our play.
00:25:26> 00:25:29:	Right now and it's evolving as it's just launched this
00:25:29> 00:25:29:	past year.
00:25:29> 00:25:31:	So you know, working with Lauren,
00:25:31> 00:25:34:	hearing from Eric of what's going on out there is
00:25:34> 00:25:38:	a constant education from from our standpoint and we are
00:25:38> 00:25:40:	getting a flow of deals and starting to get a
00:25:40> 00:25:43:	view of what what the need is and then our
00:25:43> 00:25:45:	role in that will evolve,
00:25:45> 00:25:47:	but we hope to come to the table as a
00:25:47> 00:25:48:	private organization.
00:25:48> 00:25:51:	We hope that encourages public organizations to come to the
00:25:52> 00:25:54:	table even more than they already are and help innovate,
00:25:54> 00:25:58:	new tools. And we're. Along with them and then we
00:25:58> 00:25:59:	at the same time,
00:25:59> 00:26:01:	we also hope the equity also comes to a table
00:26:01> 00:26:04:	a little more everyones going to little little.
00:26:04> 00:26:07:	Give here to kind of close this affordability gap that
00:26:07> 00:26:08:	exists out there.
00:26:08> 00:26:09:	Not one company or organization,
00:26:09> 00:26:12:	private or public, unless they can tell United States will
00:26:12> 00:26:15:	step in will really solve the housing need.
00:26:15> 00:26:17:	It's out there. Yeah,
00:26:17> 00:26:19:	let's go Eric, you're on mute.
00:26:19> 00:26:20:	But I see you're talking,
00:26:20> 00:26:23:	kind of. Jumping on
00:26:23> 00:26:25:	that, you know to tie together a couple things that
00:26:25> 00:26:26:	you each said.
00:26:26> 00:26:29:	It's a really interesting and for many people and it
00:26:29> 00:26:31:	really a lot of really people have looked at housing

00:26:32> 00:26:32:	for a long time.
00:26:32> 00:26:35:	It's kind of a confusing moment because.
00:26:35> 00:26:37:	You know, on the one hand,
00:26:37> 00:26:39:	when we talk about preservation,
00:26:39> 00:26:42:	we're talking about preserving stock that could experience disinvestment,
00:26:42> 00:26:45:	and I touched on that and I think at the
00:26:45> 00:26:48:	beginning of the pandemic there is a huge concern that
00:26:48> 00:26:50:	everything was going to tank,
00:26:50> 00:26:54:	including the idea of potentially that homeownership would would
00:26:54> 00:26:54:	be hurt.
00:26:54> 00:26:57:	And then Dan, would you just touched on is this
00:26:57> 00:27:01:	phenomenon and it's been really surprising to people that the
00:27:01> 00:27:03:	cost of housing has risen almost universally,
00:27:03> 00:27:05:	and oftentimes rent and ownership.
00:27:05> 00:27:09:	Trade between each other, but at this point we're seeing
00:27:09> 00:27:12:	pressure on both the ownership side and on the rental
00:27:12> 00:27:14:	side and across that entire market.
00:27:14> 00:27:17:	And we're also seeing the risk of inflation on production.
00:27:17> 00:27:20:	For new construction. You're also seeing and,
00:27:20> 00:27:23:	and there's an irony to this because oftentimes you feel
00:27:23> 00:27:25:	like when a market overheats,
00:27:25> 00:27:28:	rents will go up and you could have displacement from
00:27:28> 00:27:28:	that.
00:27:28> 00:27:30:	If you get too much disinvestment,
00:27:30> 00:27:34:	you can have rents fall in the neighborhood and then
00:27:34> 00:27:35:	you see the stock deteriorate,
00:27:35> 00:27:38:	so the. Reservation to do preservation right?
00:27:38> 00:27:40:	You have to be able to handle a hot market
00:27:40> 00:27:43:	where you're displacing people because of rents,
00:27:43> 00:27:46:	but you also have to to handle a cooling
00:27:46> 00:27:49:	market where you lose the quality of the stock or
00:27:49> 00:27:50:	have disinvestment,
00:27:50> 00:27:53:	and then we're in this weird loop and rarely have
00:27:53> 00:27:56:	we had this kind of a cataclysm really where we're
00:27:56> 00:27:59:	pumping so much money through and so much money has
00:27:59> 00:28:02:	gone through on the monetary side that.
00:28:02> 00:28:05:	You know when you think about the trillions of dollars
00:28:05> 00:28:08:	that were pumped through last year to add liquidity at
00:28:08> 00:28:08:	some points,
00:28:08> 00:28:11:	and to actually add income support so you had all

00:28:11> 00:28:14:	that pressure and now we're going to get some fiscal
00:28:14> 00:28:14:	stuff.
00:28:14> 00:28:17:	It looks like some stimulus on top of it,
00:28:17> 00:28:19:	and so you've really got this odd situation where all
00:28:19> 00:28:22:	pieces of the housing market and low interest rates and
00:28:22> 00:28:25:	all pieces of the housing markets seem to be going
00:28:25> 00:28:27:	up at the same time in a way that presents
00:28:27> 00:28:30:	a lot of challenges for the kind of typical thinking
00:28:30> 00:28:31:	around policymaking.
00:28:31> 00:28:33:	So just want to add that.
00:28:33> 00:28:35:	It's 'cause we are in a unique moment that has
00:28:35> 00:28:37:	that and it's hard for people to really figure out
00:28:37> 00:28:38:	what's happening.
00:28:38> 00:28:40:	Sure, I. I mean in.
00:28:40> 00:28:43:	And you know, COVID has been interesting in terms of
00:28:43> 00:28:46:	like we're doing his virtual web and R right now.
00:28:46> 00:28:49:	And and there's been tons of technology advancements due
	to
00:28:49> 00:28:50:	COVID,
00:28:50> 00:28:52:	but on the opposite of an area that's been right
00:28:52> 00:28:55:	for for innovation would be like construction,
00:28:55> 00:28:58:	right? So the cost of housing and inputs in the
00:28:58> 00:29:01:	supply chain have only gone up and there are companies
00:29:01> 00:29:04:	that are working on that and and utilized on studies
00:29:04> 00:29:07:	on on that front. But it's just not there yet,
00:29:07> 00:29:11:	and so. And with the cost of housing going up
00:29:11> 00:29:13:	and opportunities,
00:29:13> 00:29:16:	it costs a billion going up.
00:29:16> 00:29:19:	There's only so much financial tools that you can do
00:29:19> 00:29:22:	to actually create affordability in new construction,
00:29:22> 00:29:27:	right? So? Even giving grant money at 0%
00:29:27> 00:29:31:	interest. The opportunity cost given up to create affordable
	housing
00:29:31> 00:29:32:	just as it exists.
00:29:32> 00:29:34:	You can't. You almost can't get to a really large
00:29:35> 00:29:36:	portion of affordability,
00:29:36> 00:29:40:	so from for my money at Amazon where we're giving.
00:29:40> 00:29:43:	Even if we're giving a really this kind of rate
00:29:43> 00:29:44:	to market,
00:29:44> 00:29:47:	it's 30%, maybe 40% affordable restriction at that property
	because
00:29:47> 00:29:50:	it costs of construction is so high and so then
00:29:50> 00:29:53:	you have to look at other places to create affordability

00:29:53> 00:29:56:	in preservation. What topic of this webinar is so vitally
00:29:56> 00:29:57:	important?
00:29:57> 00:30:00:	Because you can put a little bit less into unit
00:30:00> 00:30:03:	create degradation of stock as you're alluding to Eric,
00:30:03> 00:30:05:	and that money goes further and you.
00:30:05> 00:30:08:	It's a more efficient use of capital,
00:30:08> 00:30:10:	and I've mentioned it a couple of times,
00:30:10> 00:30:13:	that's. A key part part of the private sector is
00:30:13> 00:30:15:	kind of valuation is how do you efficiently use capital
00:30:16> 00:30:18:	to create the most bang for your buck in the
00:30:18> 00:30:18:	end?
00:30:20> 00:30:23:	Yeah, I'd also love 'cause you mentioned.
00:30:23> 00:30:26:	All the different ways to address the gaps and close
00:30:27> 00:30:27:	the deals.
00:30:27> 00:30:30:	If we could talk a little bit about the rent,
00:30:30> 00:30:33:	peace because we're talking about preservation of existing housing,
00:30:33> 00:30:36:	and we talked when we were preparing just about how
00:30:36> 00:30:40:	the various markets have various rent regulatory tools in their
00:30:40> 00:30:40:	toolbox.
00:30:40> 00:30:43:	And I came from New York City where we leveraged
00:30:43> 00:30:46:	a lot of our programming and affordability requirements in and
00:30:47> 00:30:48:	around rent stabilization.
00:30:48> 00:30:51:	And now I'm in a market where that is a
00:30:51> 00:30:52:	very different picture.
00:30:52> 00:30:54:	So I guess maybe. Eric,
00:30:54> 00:30:56:	we could start with you.
00:30:56> 00:30:59:	The New Yorker, just to speak a little bit how
00:30:59> 00:31:00:	you see the rent.
00:31:00> 00:31:03:	Peace playing into the the preservation picture you know,
00:31:03> 00:31:06:	especially at a time with so much pressure on the
00:31:06> 00:31:08:	rent side due to kovid.
00:31:08> 00:31:09:	Yeah, I mean rent
00:31:09> 00:31:12:	regulation in New York City is incredibly important and powerful,
00:31:12> 00:31:15:	and it's also very tricky because you can end up
00:31:15> 00:31:18:	doing things in the market that have unintended
00:31:15> 00:31:18:	doing things in the market that have unintended consequences.
00:31:15> 00:31:18: 00:31:18> 00:31:20:	
	consequences.
00:31:18> 00:31:20:	consequences. And when I say the market,
00:31:18> 00:31:20: 00:31:20> 00:31:24:	consequences. And when I say the market, I just mean in generally the experience of getting housing.

00:31:30> 00:31:33:	of market in that in the typical way and what
00:31:33> 00:31:36:	I what I really mean by that is it has
00:31:36> 00:31:38:	been incredibly successful,
00:31:38> 00:31:41:	particularly in strong markets where you're able to cap rents
00:31:41> 00:31:44:	and oftentimes it came in exchange for some government investment.
00:31:44> 00:31:47:	Early on it came in exchange for certain tax incentives.
00:31:47> 00:31:50:	Now we also added to our regulatory agreements when we
00:31:50> 00:31:51:	put subsidy in,
00:31:51> 00:31:54:	and they often have have other tax benefits.
00:31:54> 00:31:56:	As well. Or land for example.
00:31:56> 00:31:59:	And so when you look at it,
00:31:59> 00:32:02:	the particularly in the really strong markets of New York
00:32:02> 00:32:02:	City,
00:32:02> 00:32:05:	whether it's Manhattan or parts of Brooklyn and and places
00:32:05> 00:32:08:	where where strength comes through or the market starts to
00:32:08> 00:32:08:	come through,
00:32:08> 00:32:11:	there's a tremendous value where those rents are capped and
00:32:11> 00:32:14:	people don't experience the full pressure of that market when
00:32:14> 00:32:15:	it comes through.
00:32:15> 00:32:18:	And if you look at the discount to market,
00:32:18> 00:32:21:	and you were, if you were to capitalize that rent
00:32:21> 00:32:24:	regulation in New York City has preserved a tremendous amount
00:32:24> 00:32:25:	of public equity or community.
00:32:25> 00:32:29:	Equity or neighborhood equity? I use all of those phrases
00:32:29> 00:32:31:	to kind of get it the ways that you can
00:32:32> 00:32:33:	leave value in a neighborhood.
00:32:33> 00:32:37:	The other really beautiful thing about rent regulation is that
00:32:37> 00:32:39:	it's site specific that it is a value.
00:32:39> 00:32:42:	And the reason you can call it either public or
00:32:42> 00:32:45:	community but also neighborhood is that it is that unit
00:32:45> 00:32:49:	is there in that neighborhood and you know the way
00:32:49> 00:32:50:	rent regulation was just reformed.
00:32:50> 00:32:53:	There used to be a way that you could gradually
00:32:53> 00:32:56:	raise rents and then deregulated that that escape hatch.
00:32:56> 00:32:59:	Has been removed and so that there's a.
00:32:59> 00:33:01:	There's a sense of permanence.
00:33:01> 00:33:04:	Now, obviously policy changes and policy can change.
00:33:04> 00:33:07:	Again, the legislature could do something different over time,
00:33:07> 00:33:10:	but there is a tremendous amount of value that's that
00:33:10> 00:33:13:	endures to communities and neighborhoods.

00:33:13> 00:33:17:	Because of that, same thing is true of inclusionary housing,
00:33:17> 00:33:19:	where you have an affordable requirement.
00:33:19> 00:33:23:	Whether it's mandatory, inclusionary, which we have a very successful
00:33:23> 00:33:24:	new New York program doing,
00:33:24> 00:33:27:	but always had some inclusionary zoning.
00:33:27> 00:33:28:	All those things are critical,
00:33:28> 00:33:30:	but the one thing I'll say,
00:33:30> 00:33:33:	and I think this is more of what you were
00:33:33> 00:33:36:	alluding to a little bit too and wanting to have
00:33:36> 00:33:39:	this conversation if you don't get it right,
00:33:39> 00:33:41:	or if you don't re balance it,
00:33:41> 00:33:43:	or if you don't look at it as a living
00:33:44> 00:33:44:	issue,
00:33:44> 00:33:47:	you can sometimes spur the exact disinvestment that you are
00:33:47> 00:33:48:	worried about,
00:33:48> 00:33:50:	so if in other words you restrict rents so much
00:33:50> 00:33:53:	that people can't have any kind of return unless you're
00:33:53> 00:33:55:	prepared to fully socialized housing,
00:33:55> 00:33:57:	which would be unbelievably expensive to do.
00:33:57> 00:33:59:	If you look at, for example,
00:33:59> 00:34:02:	some measures of what just the latest rent regulation lauded
00:34:02> 00:34:05:	over you know you're allowed to make certain capital improvements
00:34:05> 00:34:07:	certain apartment improvements,
00:34:07> 00:34:10:	certain system improvements, and you're allowed to take a certain
00:34:10> 00:34:12:	limited amount of rent for that,
00:34:12> 00:34:15:	it's very, very limited under the last iteration,
00:34:15> 00:34:18:	and maybe it was right that the pendulum swung back,
00:34:18> 00:34:20:	but there's a concern that overtime,
00:34:20> 00:34:23:	what that's going to mean is that they'll be disinvestment
00:34:23> 00:34:27:	in housing because there's not enough to incentivize the owner
00:34:27> 00:34:28:	of that housing too.
00:34:28> 00:34:31:	Put money back in and you can kind of get
00:34:31> 00:34:31:	it.
00:34:31> 00:34:33:	Some of that right. If you actually talk well.
00:34:33> 00:34:36:	I just talked about like looking at the discount to
00:34:36> 00:34:36:	market.
00:34:36> 00:34:39:	If you really start capitalizing some of that and you
00:34:39> 00:34:41:	say what did that last bill do in terms of
00:34:41> 00:34:43:	limiting that that private investment,

00:34:43> 00:34:46:	whether it's from private rents that can come in because
00:34:46> 00:34:48:	they're capped and then you look at the private financing
00:34:49> 00:34:51:	that can be supported by that increased rental income.
00:34:51> 00:34:52:	It's a lot of money.
00:34:52> 00:34:55:	You know, some estimates close to a trillion dollars of
00:34:55> 00:34:58:	private investment in Brent's over a 10 year period that.
00:34:58> 00:35:02:	Won't come into that market that has real meaning overtime.
00:35:02> 00:35:03:	And as we talked about,
00:35:03> 00:35:07:	it's very hard to imagine a public budget fully compensating
00:35:07> 00:35:09:	that the idea of it is Nice.
00:35:09> 00:35:12:	If if government had enough resource to fully compensate that,
00:35:12> 00:35:15:	but it's very hard to imagine being able to keep
00:35:15> 00:35:18:	up with that kind of change in the balance between
00:35:18> 00:35:20:	public and private investment.
00:35:20> 00:35:23:	And the same thing is true in the experience of
00:35:23> 00:35:25:	public housing as well,
00:35:25> 00:35:26:	but I'll stop there.
00:35:27> 00:35:30:	Yeah, and this is one of the sort of questions
00:35:30> 00:35:33:	that the city asked us in discussions we had,
00:35:33> 00:35:36:	which I think I'll put back to Dan 'cause you're
00:35:36> 00:35:39:	in multiple markets was how do you work with owners
00:35:39> 00:35:43:	for whom all of these structures and regulatory requirements are
00:35:43> 00:35:45:	new, so we also don't want you know,
00:35:45> 00:35:49:	want these individuals in these owners to work with us
00:35:49> 00:35:50:	and invest in the property.
00:35:50> 00:35:52:	You know, of course not.
00:35:52> 00:35:54:	Raise rents too high for the community,
00:35:54> 00:35:58:	but kind of what's that balance and how are ways
00:35:58> 00:35:58:	to?
00:35:58> 00:36:01:	You know, have requirements and keep the properties affordable that
00:36:02> 00:36:05:	aren't so overwhelming that it prevents individuals from working with
00:36:05> 00:36:09:	either government or other entities or investing in the property.
00:36:09> 00:36:12:	But then maybe you could talk a little bit more
00:36:12> 00:36:14:	what what you're seeing,
00:36:14> 00:36:16:	especially across markets with different requirements.
00:36:17> 00:36:21:	I think a key point that that Eric was mentioning
00:36:21> 00:36:23:	in his in talking about,
00:36:23> 00:36:25:	you know, the New York approach.

00:36:25> 00:36:28:	He kind of hit at the very end,
00:36:28> 00:36:31:	which is. Equity needs return and it exists in like
00:36:31> 00:36:35:	any part in any city in home and ownership out
00:36:35> 00:36:35:	there.
00:36:35> 00:36:39:	And there's been an influx of new equity into multifamily
00:36:39> 00:36:42:	because it's been one of the most stable asset classes
00:36:42> 00:36:44:	of any investment out there.
00:36:44> 00:36:46:	And you've seen large private equity,
00:36:46> 00:36:48:	large sovereign wealth all come in,
00:36:48> 00:36:52:	which is a hence compressed cap rates and made the
00:36:52> 00:36:54:	returns even more difficult.
00:36:54> 00:36:57:	So the goal of of Amazon here or any kind
00:36:58> 00:37:01:	of ESG fund that's looking to to invest,
00:37:01> 00:37:05:	is to make up that difference of of that discount
00:37:05> 00:37:06:	to market.
00:37:06> 00:37:10:	So you're going to hold rents and you're giving up
00:37:10> 00:37:12:	a couple \$100 per unit.
00:37:12> 00:37:15:	If you're holding rents versus a value,
00:37:15> 00:37:19:	add play. How much is that impacting your returns?
00:37:19> 00:37:22:	If you were going to hold it,
00:37:22> 00:37:28:	and how much can? R dollars.
00:37:28> 00:37:32:	Compensate for that return and there's only so much and
00:37:32> 00:37:36:	this is kind of talking about how much you can
00:37:36> 00:37:36:	really do,
00:37:36> 00:37:39:	even from a large company like Amazon.
00:37:39> 00:37:43:	And so I, I think that thinking about the reality
00:37:43> 00:37:45:	of of that at the,
00:37:45> 00:37:49:	uh, the the furthest end of equity and equity needing
00:37:49> 00:37:49:	return,
00:37:49> 00:37:53:	we're trying to to operate in in the financial markets
00:37:53> 00:37:55:	of real estate generally.
00:37:55> 00:37:59:	And and so you know the concept of rent stabilization.
00:37:59> 00:38:03:	And come and lack of ongoing investment into that property
00:38:03> 00:38:04:	because of return is.
00:38:04> 00:38:09:	Would this of consideration and and things that we're thinking
00:38:09> 00:38:12:	about at Amazon in terms of how we look at
00:38:12> 00:38:15:	our own or rent restriction that is running with the
00:38:15> 00:38:18:	land and how we look at the refund of capital
00:38:19> 00:38:23:	expenditures into the property that they can be passed
	through
00:38:23> 00:38:24:	to a certain degree?
00:38:24> 00:38:30:	Because that is. Necessary to keep the property.

00:38:33> 00:38:38:	Relevant and lasting throughout nine year term where we're looking
00:38:38> 00:38:38:	for so.
00:38:38> 00:38:42:	The actual operation that is difficult as as the New
00:38:42> 00:38:45:	York example has has shown historically of how you look
00:38:45> 00:38:48:	at cap expenditures at at units and in in how
00:38:48> 00:38:51:	that gets passed through or what that does to the
00:38:51> 00:38:54:	to the to the rent of that unit going forward.
00:38:54> 00:38:57:	And so Erica Duffy speaks that way better than I
00:38:57> 00:38:57:	can.
00:38:57> 00:39:01:	But I definitely saw it in in my prior role,
00:39:01> 00:39:02:	and so it's a difficult answer.
00:39:02> 00:39:06:	Difficult question to answer. And allow this kind of feedback
00:39:06> 00:39:08:	from the market that that's kind of needed,
00:39:08> 00:39:12:	what? What do you need for?
00:39:12> 00:39:15:	What do you need equity player to continue to invest
00:39:15> 00:39:17:	to buy to property?
00:39:17> 00:39:20:	Keep it affordable and continue to invest along the way.
00:39:20> 00:39:24:	And that's both from the public center to consider and
00:39:24> 00:39:25:	from an ESG investment.
00:39:25> 00:39:27:	From my standpoint to consider,
00:39:27> 00:39:31:	does that make sense because I know you equity player
00:39:31> 00:39:34:	as a for profit equity player is is do your
00:39:34> 00:39:38:	return because otherwise you don't have to do any of
00:39:38> 00:39:42:	that and that doesn't get to do a preservation.
00:39:42> 00:39:47:	Standard, so that's that's the \$1,000,000 question and I think
00:39:47> 00:39:51:	it takes multiple parties to to solve that.
00:39:51> 00:39:52:	Conundrum.
00:39:53> 00:39:56:	And if I could just add on to that I
00:39:56> 00:39:56:	you know?
00:39:56> 00:39:59:	I'll take the voice of a little bit further left,
00:39:59> 00:40:01:	and I told Dan and others.
00:40:01> 00:40:03:	I do this in our prep that you know if
00:40:03> 00:40:06:	we undercut your premise of that equity needs return and
00:40:06> 00:40:09:	you take that a little bit further and you say
00:40:09> 00:40:11:	you undercut the premise that we should be dealing in
00:40:11> 00:40:14:	housing as a commodified thing that we're in a market,
00:40:14> 00:40:16:	and you know whether you like it or not,
00:40:16> 00:40:18:	we are at the current moment.
00:40:18> 00:40:20:	I totally understand those arguments and people say,
00:40:20> 00:40:22:	let's read, let's radically rethink it.
00:40:22> 00:40:23:	Let's not undershoot our goal.

00:40:23> 00:40:25:	That's what would it mean to D commodify housing?
00:40:25> 00:40:27:	And that's a worthy conversation.
00:40:27> 00:40:29:	Would you guys have attached some?
00:40:29> 00:40:31:	In my opinion you have to attach some numbers to
00:40:31> 00:40:34:	that in order to have an honest conversation about it.
00:40:34> 00:40:37:	I remember Sean Donovan is the HUD secretary under
	Obama,
00:40:37> 00:40:40:	but was also the HPD Commissioner in New York City.
00:40:40> 00:40:41:	He want I made the comment.
00:40:41> 00:40:44:	It stayed with me and I've thought about it.
00:40:44> 00:40:45:	It's true, he said, you know,
00:40:45> 00:40:48:	I'm not naive enough to think that you get everything
00:40:48> 00:40:50:	that you need from the unregulated market.
00:40:50> 00:40:52:	But I'm also not naive enough to think that you
00:40:53> 00:40:54:	can get the scale that you need,
00:40:54> 00:40:57:	especially in a place like New York City without the
00:40:57> 00:40:57:	market.
00:40:57> 00:41:00:	At all and and I think there's truth to that,
00:41:00> 00:41:03:	in the sense that if you actually said what would
00:41:03> 00:41:06:	it mean to undercut the premise to say we're going
00:41:06> 00:41:07:	to D commodify,
00:41:07> 00:41:10:	what would be the public contribution that would have to
00:41:10> 00:41:13:	then replace the private systems that are in place and
00:41:13> 00:41:16:	those numbers just become so so large that they're kind
00:41:16> 00:41:17:	of unfathomable? Really, it's just,
00:41:17> 00:41:20:	and that's the kind of piece of conversation that you
00:41:20> 00:41:22:	don't often see in that and,
00:41:22> 00:41:24:	and I want to tie this back to preservation.
00:41:24> 00:41:27:	It particularly gets to a large scale when you think
00:41:27> 00:41:29:	about what it means to.
00:41:29> 00:41:32:	Look out not just for an individual portfolio and not
00:41:32> 00:41:33:	just a developer or HTC.
00:41:33> 00:41:37:	We we actually asset manage about 220,000 units of
	affordable
00:41:37> 00:41:37:	housing.
00:41:37> 00:41:40:	When you look at what is in that portfolio.
00:41:40> 00:41:43:	But when you look at across the entire stock and
00:41:43> 00:41:46:	realize that we're all in some ways just stewards of
00:41:46> 00:41:50:	the housing stock across a very long arc of time,
00:41:50> 00:41:52:	right? We are we think of ourselves in this moment
00:41:52> 00:41:54:	in this particular transaction.
00:41:54> 00:41:56:	But when you think about it,
00:41:56> 00:41:59:	going back to the housing Commissioner is really.

00:41:59> 00:42:02:	Thinking about the entire sity in this kind of urban
	Thinking about the entire city in this kind of urban
00:42:02> 00:42:05: 00:42:05> 00:42:07:	scape of housing and millions of units,
	those numbers become really difficult to imagine.
00:42:07> 00:42:09:	One how you would finance it,
00:42:09> 00:42:12:	but two, how you would even asset manage it without
00:42:12> 00:42:15:	the individual actors that come from some sort of.
00:42:15> 00:42:18:	Even if you call it a modified market.
00:42:18> 00:42:20:	Even if you call it a regulated market.
00:42:20> 00:42:22:	Even if you call it,
00:42:22> 00:42:23:	you know a democratic market,
00:42:23> 00:42:26:	socialism kind of thing to get into that parlance,
00:42:26> 00:42:29:	I think. I think those are the kinds of things
00:42:29> 00:42:31:	that particularly on preservation.
00:42:31> 00:42:34:	Uhm, you really have to concern yourself about because if
00:42:34> 00:42:36:	you let that go for too long you can see
00:42:36> 00:42:40:	massive disinvestment in places that really could become
	concerning overtime.
00:42:41> 00:42:44:	Eric, just to add to to that it's so you
00:42:44> 00:42:46:	know the three markets I covered.
00:42:46> 00:42:48:	DC Nashville and Puget Sound currently,
00:42:48> 00:42:50:	and obviously my in my past role at Friday,
00:42:50> 00:42:54:	I covered the nation. Huge array way way off of
00:42:54> 00:42:58:	kind of where New York is in terms of development
00:42:58> 00:43:02:	of of housing as a commodity at type approach,
00:43:02> 00:43:06:	as you're alluding to in the mountain investment is going
00:43:06> 00:43:08:	to vary from city to city,
00:43:08> 00:43:11:	and that's obviously also going to be factored into the
00:43:11> 00:43:15:	socio demographic and political landscape of those cities.
00:43:15> 00:43:17:	And as you've seen, New York long,
00:43:17> 00:43:22:	long term, highly populated urban centric area for generations.
00:43:22> 00:43:25:	But now you're seeing this influx of people to Nashville
00:43:25> 00:43:27:	to to Texas to the entire sunbelt,
00:43:27> 00:43:30:	where I don't think housing has been thought of it
00:43:30> 00:43:32:	in as highly mature way as New York has and
00:43:32> 00:43:35:	and at that point you're bringing up are are huge
00:43:35> 00:43:38:	and it's kind of why HTC is as the larger
00:43:39> 00:43:41:	is what it is in terms of how large it
00:43:42> 00:43:44:	is and how it operates where.
00:43:44> 00:43:45:	You know the other cities,
00:43:45> 00:43:49:	even some that covered don't have that kind of construct
00:43:49> 00:43:53:	behind it in in until and I don't know how.

00:43:53> 00:43:56:	That becomes. Visible like it is a number one political
00:43:56> 00:43:58:	agenda item for a lot of people,
00:43:58> 00:44:02:	but. Is there enough collaboration between cities between municipalities to
00:44:02> 00:44:06:	understand the tools that are available to actually execute to
00:44:06> 00:44:07:	help those needs?
00:44:07> 00:44:10:	I don't know and I I think each city is
00:44:10> 00:44:14:	going to have to address it differently.
00:44:14> 00:44:17:	Displacement is happening everywhere and it's it needs there needs
00:44:17> 00:44:19:	to be some kind of collaboration to get people aligned
00:44:19> 00:44:21:	to understand what you can do.
00:44:21> 00:44:21:	At
00:44:21> 00:44:23:	the risk of talking too much,
00:44:23> 00:44:25:	I want to I want to posit one thing in
00:44:25> 00:44:26:	response to that.
00:44:26> 00:44:29:	You said I don't know how you address that or
00:44:29> 00:44:31:	how it becomes visible or how you see it,
00:44:31> 00:44:34:	and I think the ways that you see it really
00:44:34> 00:44:36:	are going to be in a lack.
00:44:36> 00:44:37:	An absence of workforce housing,
00:44:37> 00:44:40:	and in another way that is highly visible,
00:44:40> 00:44:42:	and I think this is an important conversation across the
00:44:42> 00:44:45:	country in homelessness the rise of homelessness.
00:44:45> 00:44:48:	Is fundamentally a national problem that has been delegated to
00:44:48> 00:44:50:	localities to solve and has been,
00:44:50> 00:44:53:	you know, there's when my sister lives in Tucson,
00:44:53> 00:44:56:	AZ. There are homeless camps under bridges.
00:44:56> 00:44:58:	If you go out to California,
00:44:58> 00:45:01:	there are homeless camps that tent cities that are set
00:45:01> 00:45:01:	up.
00:45:01> 00:45:04:	If you depending on what environment you're in,
00:45:04> 00:45:07:	you see homelessness proliferating in different ways,
00:45:07> 00:45:10:	but I think the lack of sophistication around housing policy
00:45:10> 00:45:13:	and the lack of a unified National Housing policy that
00:45:14> 00:45:15:	gets those issues.
00:45:15> 00:45:17:	Is a disservice to both workforce housing and kind of
00:45:17> 00:45:19:	Labor issues and labor conversation.
00:45:19> 00:45:21:	But it's also a tremendous disservice to supportive housing and
00:45:21> 00:45:23:	particularly the question of homelessness.
00:45:23> 00:45:26:	It's just, and that's what you're going to see in

00:45:26> 00:45:26:	places.
00:45:26> 00:45:29:	If you really get this influx and this heating,
00:45:29> 00:45:31:	you're going to see a rise in these problems in
00:45:31> 00:45:34:	places that you never really saw them before.
00:45:35> 00:45:37:	Yeah, and sort of how do we we talked when
00:45:38> 00:45:42:	we were preparing in those markets that haven't experienced sophisticated
00:45:42> 00:45:43:	housing financing tools?
00:45:43> 00:45:46:	Kind of. How does everyone prepare for this and address
00:45:46> 00:45:47:	this?
00:45:47> 00:45:50:	I also want to ensure we have time for questions
00:45:51> 00:45:54:	and I see some have come in and Rosie I
00:45:54> 00:45:57:	think is going to read some of them for
00:45:57> 00:46:00:	us sure and so kind of actually building off,
00:46:00> 00:46:03:	but you were just speaking to a question of just
00:46:03> 00:46:06:	come in about talking about community ownership.
00:46:06> 00:46:09:	Uhm, can you talk about how community ownership is in
00:46:09> 00:46:13:	play here as a means to decomp DCOM identification to
00:46:13> 00:46:14:	your firm's work at all?
00:46:14> 00:46:18:	With co-ops? Do your firms work at all with co-ops,
00:46:18> 00:46:21:	or land trusts and another one another question from earlier
00:46:21> 00:46:24:	was to articulate some of the ways in which housing
00:46:24> 00:46:27:	preservation can advance equity and cities,
00:46:27> 00:46:30:	especially with regards to the historical context of settlement
	patterns.
00:46:30> 00:46:33:	So I figured those two might be good to answer
00:46:34> 00:46:35:	together if we can.
00:46:36> 00:46:37:	Work on that if you don't mind,
00:46:37> 00:46:40:	is that good? So what I would just say,
00:46:40> 00:46:43:	yes, all that we are working with co-ops and affordable
00:46:43> 00:46:46:	co-ops and limited equity where we have a huge push
00:46:46> 00:46:49:	in New York City around community Land Trust and Land
00:46:49> 00:46:52:	Trust, work, and understanding that in many ways when you
00:46:52> 00:46:52:	think about it,
00:46:52> 00:46:55:	public housing is often one of the largest community land
00:46:55> 00:46:56:	trusts.
00:46:56> 00:46:58:	It's often doesn't feel as localized 'cause it's across the
00:46:59> 00:46:59:	entire city.
00:46:59> 00:47:01:	But when we think about public housing,
00:47:01> 00:47:04:	there are ways to do this that do keep public
00:47:04> 00:47:04:	ownership.
00:47:04> 00:47:07:	And that's why I talk a lot about public equity
00:47:07> 00:47:09:	and neighborhood equity and community.

00:47:09> 00:47:12:	Equity because you den't have to have fee title expersion
00:47:12> 00:47:12:	Equity because you don't have to have fee title ownership in order to build equity in a neighborhood.
00:47:12> 00:47:14:	In fact, a regulated or rent regulated lease that has
00:47:17> 00:47:17:	a right to renewal is a huge piece of equity
00:47:20> 00:47:22:	that that rental tenant controls.
00:47:22> 00:47:22:	If you control a rent regulated the bread in your
00:47:25> 00:47:28:	
	neighborhood is \$3000 a month and you've got an apartment
00:47:28> 00:47:31: 00:47:31> 00:47:33:	with a regulated lease that you control that lease and
00:47:33> 00:47:36:	have a right to renew at \$800,
00:47:36> 00:47:38:	you have as much equity in that lease as many
	people have in home ownership,
00:47:38> 00:47:41:	so all those are. Tremendously valuable things.
00:47:41> 00:47:45:	Similarly, if you have. Mandatory inclusionary housing that requires rents
00:47:45> 00:47:48:	to be kept affordable on a permanent basis in that
00:47:48> 00:47:51:	neighborhood that is permanent community and neighborhood equity.
00:47:51> 00:47:54:	That's absolutely critical. And let me just say,
00:47:54> 00:47:56:	even in the preservation of public housing,
00:47:56> 00:47:59:	one of the big fears that right now is that
00:47:59> 00:48:03:	somehow that the private sector will get the better of
00:48:03> 00:48:06:	the public sector and it will somehow be privatized.
00:48:06> 00:48:10:	And the truth is that all of that ownership and
00:48:10> 00:48:13:	control can remain on the public side at the same
00:48:13> 00:48:14:	time.
00:48:14> 00:48:16:	That you leverage resources in order to improve quality of
00:48:16> 00:48:17:	life.
00:48:17> 00:48:18:	But you keep it permanently affordable,
00:48:18> 00:48:21:	right? And you can regulate that and do that.
00:48:21> 00:48:23:	So absolutely, we're thinking about this thing.
00:48:23> 00:48:26:	I want people to think that when I talk about
00:48:26> 00:48:29:	the market and I talk about the need for the
00:48:29> 00:48:29:	market,
00:48:29> 00:48:32:	that that means that you're throwing the idea of Community
00:48:32> 00:48:34:	equity out and public equity.
00:48:34> 00:48:36:	Outfit out the window. You're not at all absolutely the
00:48:36> 00:48:37:	opposite.
00:48:40> 00:48:43:	So I think there's a couple questions in there.
00:48:43> 00:48:45:	In, like Eric mentioned, kind of yes.
00:48:45> 00:48:46:	So it all. I mean,
00:48:46> 00:48:50:	Amazon is flexible and the way we're looking at it,
00:48:50> 00:48:52:	but we we hope to be a leader.

00:48:52> 00:48:54:	And so in our financing,
00:48:54> 00:48:57:	and I think one of the questions was how are
00:48:57> 00:49:01:	we thinking about displacement in specific parts of communities that
00:49:01> 00:49:03:	are out there so you know,
00:49:03> 00:49:06:	in a traditional bank financing approach.
00:49:06> 00:49:10:	Your interest rate is kind of charge to the risk
00:49:10> 00:49:13:	of the property and what's what's there.
00:49:13> 00:49:16:	I would say that's part of what's happening here at
00:49:16> 00:49:17:	Amazon,
00:49:17> 00:49:20:	but we're also giving a lot of bonus points for
00:49:21> 00:49:23:	four features of the property,
00:49:23> 00:49:27:	including the property, the property location hires at his placement,
00:49:27> 00:49:32:	if there are community services are are supportive services at
00:49:32> 00:49:34:	the at the property itself.
00:49:34> 00:49:37:	The type of owner and ownership that that's behind that
00:49:38> 00:49:41:	property are all parts of bonus points in terms of
00:49:41> 00:49:43:	getting reductions on your spread,
00:49:43> 00:49:47:	which which makes the property you know would be probably
00:49:47> 00:49:50:	a more feasible property in the end.
00:49:50> 00:49:53:	And so we hope that that becomes a model for
00:49:53> 00:49:56:	a lot of private companies are looking to invest in
00:49:56> 00:49:58:	a lot of the peer group of Amazon has similar
00:49:58> 00:50:00:	funds that are out there,
00:50:00> 00:50:02:	and everyone's doing it a little bit differently.
00:50:02> 00:50:05:	And I think that this is emerging over the past
00:50:05> 00:50:06:	two or three years,
00:50:06> 00:50:08:	and I think that there are some ideas that are
00:50:08> 00:50:10:	great from all these companies.
00:50:10> 00:50:12:	And the more we talk about it,
00:50:12> 00:50:14:	I think that the more tools that are that are
00:50:14> 00:50:17:	out there to to to invest and thinking about financing
00:50:17> 00:50:19:	or thinking about solving the home.
00:50:19> 00:50:21:	Sorry, solving the home affordability.
00:50:21> 00:50:25:	Come in different ways and so so for us.
00:50:25> 00:50:29:	Yes, if you are in a highly displaced area or
00:50:29> 00:50:31:	prime for displacement.
00:50:31> 00:50:33:	There would be a discount or rate,
00:50:33> 00:50:35:	or we would be a little bit more aggressive and
00:50:35> 00:50:38:	how we we financed or gave our money in those
00:50:38> 00:50:39:	projects and so that's.

00:50:39> 00:50:41:	That's how we're doing it,
00:50:41> 00:50:45:	and it is a project or project approach and.
00:50:45> 00:50:48:	More to come with it all.
00:50:48> 00:50:48:	Yeah,
00:50:48> 00:50:52:	great all important topics. The only thing I'll add is
00:50:52> 00:50:56:	that in our market in Philadelphia there are also not
00:50:56> 00:50:58:	as widespread or systematic,
00:50:58> 00:51:02:	but work by various nonprofits and other entities on the
00:51:02> 00:51:06:	city at these various ownership structures that are Community ownership.
00:51:06> 00:51:09:	You know focused and just also that,
00:51:09> 00:51:11:	yes, this is an equity issue.
00:51:11> 00:51:16:	Specifically, you know when it comes to home ownership rental,
00:51:16> 00:51:18:	but you know, looking at.
00:51:18> 00:51:20:	The needs of all the residents in the city and
00:51:21> 00:51:23:	the region in our case is an equity issue and
00:51:23> 00:51:27:	so just having more of those conversations and meeting more
00:51:27> 00:51:30:	people where they are, I think is is an important
00:51:30> 00:51:32:	thing that we're thinking about one topic
00:51:32> 00:51:36:	off of that Lord. Just I forgot to mention and
00:51:36> 00:51:40:	Eric and I made a good point in terms of.
00:51:40> 00:51:43:	How much those leases mean in terms of equity and
00:51:43> 00:51:46:	wealth to the tenants that are there?
00:51:46> 00:51:49:	I think. I think that's an evolving UM,
00:51:49> 00:51:51:	maturing aspect of of rental,
00:51:51> 00:51:54:	the rental tenant base that's out there in in how
00:51:54> 00:51:57:	we look at rent payments towards Twitch,
00:51:57> 00:52:00:	credit building and so merging companies are out there.
00:52:00> 00:52:03:	l'm not gonna plug a specific ones,
00:52:03> 00:52:06:	but you know the GCS on a single family front
00:52:06> 00:52:10:	have already kind of alluded to just recently looking at.
00:52:10> 00:52:14:	Rent payment history as a credit for for home ownership,
00:52:14> 00:52:17:	and I think that there are tools available to owners
00:52:17> 00:52:22:	that could be incentivized by Amazon or other public entities
00:52:22> 00:52:23:	to say that hey,
00:52:23> 00:52:24:	if you use our money,
00:52:24> 00:52:28:	you are required to report on time rent payments of
00:52:28> 00:52:29:	your tenants,
00:52:29> 00:52:33:	which can build credit scores of the tenants upwards of
00:52:33> 00:52:34:	100 points a year.
00:52:34> 00:52:38:	In that improves access to capital and that that is

00:52:38> 00:52:41:	one of the key key portions of.
00:52:41> 00:52:43:	Not only obviously building the down payment,
00:52:43> 00:52:45:	which is hard in itself,
00:52:45> 00:52:48:	but just being able to get mortgage financing for for
00:52:48> 00:52:50:	a single family front of it.
00:52:50> 00:52:53:	Also, it's all tide together between single family and multi
00:52:53> 00:52:56:	family and home ownership in and accessibility.
00:52:56> 00:52:58:	So it it's one giant problem,
00:52:58> 00:53:03:	not just individual problems sitting on their own.
00:53:03> 00:53:03:	Great,
00:53:03> 00:53:06:	I see we have a lot of questions,
00:53:06> 00:53:08:	maybe Rosie time for at least
00:53:08> 00:53:11:	one more. Sure, I think we have a few that
00:53:11> 00:53:13:	relate to each other again.
00:53:13> 00:53:16:	So Dan, I know you spoke about the affordability levels
00:53:16> 00:53:18:	in your projects are about 80%
00:53:18> 00:53:21:	am I Eric? I'm not sure if we got yours.
00:53:21> 00:53:24:	If you could just clarify that and then Dan,
00:53:24> 00:53:26:	what size properties do look at?
00:53:26> 00:53:30:	Would you do with an Amazon do scattered site to
00:53:30> 00:53:30:	achieve scale?
00:53:30> 00:53:33:	And finally any experience in creating mixed.
00:53:33> 00:53:34:	Income properties.
00:53:39> 00:53:41:	No, Eric. You're muted, I
00:53:41> 00:53:43:	just thought about this is an important thing.
00:53:43> 00:53:46:	'cause it it's charged in New York and I'll just
00:53:46> 00:53:49:	say to that am I even though we reference it
00:53:49> 00:53:50:	as am 100%
00:53:50> 00:53:52:	of area median income for a household of three or
00:53:52> 00:53:53:	whatever.
00:53:53> 00:53:56:	We know you can buy down the affordability to be
00:53:56> 00:53:58:	whatever you need so we do a full range.
00:53:58> 00:54:01:	There are units that are affordable even if you lose
00:54:01> 00:54:03:	your job and have no income.
00:54:03> 00:54:06:	You can reapply and adjust your Section 8 so that
00:54:06> 00:54:09:	you're covered so we have a range of housing options
00:54:09> 00:54:12:	that will run all the way from zero income.
00:54:12> 00:54:15:	Uhm two. We finance up to about 120 or 130%
00:54:15> 00:54:17:	of area median income in New York,
00:54:17> 00:54:21:	but it's not that there's just at 80 or at
00:54:21> 00:54:21:	100.
00:54:21> 00:54:25:	We've regularly blend all across that spectrum so that we

00:54:25> 00:54:28:	make sure we're not delivering housing at just 80 or
00:54:28> 00:54:29:	tax credit rents,
00:54:29> 00:54:32:	which were 60. There's now a strong blend air,
00:54:32> 00:54:35:	so we might have a project that blends all the
00:54:35> 00:54:39:	way from the lowest incomes and include a homeless set
00:54:39> 00:54:41:	aside to a mixed income.
00:54:41> 00:54:42:	That kind of cross subsidizes.
00:54:42> 00:54:44:	Part of the project as well.
00:54:44> 00:54:48:	So and that's important because people raise this question affordable
00:54:48> 00:54:49:	to who and they cite this area,
00:54:49> 00:54:52:	median income number and they forget that citing the area
00:54:52> 00:54:55:	median income numbers like talking about temperature in Fahrenheit or
00:54:55> 00:54:55:	Celsius,
00:54:55> 00:54:58:	it's just a scale. It doesn't mean that every day
00:54:58> 00:55:01:	is 80 degrees some days or 60 and 50 and
00:55:01> 00:55:04:	30 because you can go up and down that scale,
00:55:04> 00:55:06:	and so we subsidise to make sure you go up
00:55:06> 00:55:09:	and down that income scale from very poor to moderate
00:55:09> 00:55:10:	income.
00:55:11> 00:55:15:	Uhm, and Eric is spot on with how I personally
00:55:15> 00:55:16:	look at affordability,
00:55:16> 00:55:18:	but you know the goal.
00:55:18> 00:55:21:	We put Amazon's 20,000 units at 80%
00:55:21> 00:55:25:	am I? But there is a value in mixed income
00:55:25> 00:55:29:	and a lot of our properties are ranging from 60
00:55:29> 00:55:32:	to 80 even though 1:20 and 1:50 and and if
00:55:32> 00:55:36:	you get in that bonus point kind of concept I
00:55:36> 00:55:37:	mentioned earlier,
00:55:37> 00:55:41:	having make some income, there's a value in that beyond
00:55:41> 00:55:41:	just.
00:55:41> 00:55:45:	The rents themselves and and I think that's something we're
00:55:45> 00:55:48:	evaluating at Amazon in terms of giving credit to properties
00:55:48> 00:55:50:	that are restricting out of 120 or 150,
00:55:50> 00:55:53:	let alone the 80. And as they're kind of used
00:55:53> 00:55:54:	analogy of temperature,
00:55:54> 00:55:56:	l mean it's it's, it's all relative.
00:55:56> 00:55:59:	MI is the most spoken to term and in affordable
00:55:59> 00:56:01:	housing at their custom nation.
00:56:01> 00:56:04:	But you know, if we think about cost burden,
00:56:04> 00:56:06:	cities and how much people spend towards housing,

00:56:06> 00:56:10:	that's that's amore Rel. That's almost a more relevant conversation.
00:56:10> 00:56:11:	Especially you think about financing.
00:56:11> 00:56:14:	They give up needed in terms of making efficient capital
00:56:14> 00:56:15:	to create affordability.
00:56:15> 00:56:18:	So if you look at the city of LA.
00:56:18> 00:56:20:	A new construction in the city,
00:56:20> 00:56:22:	LA is at between 170 and 200%
00:56:22> 00:56:24:	of AM I for a new construction.
00:56:24> 00:56:26:	That's everything new being built,
00:56:26> 00:56:28:	and so if I came in there and was like
00:56:29> 00:56:29:	hey,
00:56:29> 00:56:32:	I need you with my financing to restrict your property
00:56:32> 00:56:33:	at 80%
00:56:33> 00:56:36:	am I? You're giving up a lot of rent between
00:56:36> 00:56:37:	80 and 170 or 200%
00:56:37> 00:56:41:	of am I. If you look at in renting a
00:56:41> 00:56:42:	my terms versus.
00:56:42> 00:56:46:	And Nashville, where average rent is probably like 85 little
00:56:46> 00:56:47:	bit less of give up,
00:56:47> 00:56:49:	I can probably get a little warm,
00:56:49> 00:56:51:	but a my moves and so that's it.
00:56:51> 00:56:54:	It's the current construct and it's and easiest way to
00:56:54> 00:56:55:	talk about affordable housing.
00:56:55> 00:56:57:	'cause that's been the history of affordable housing.
00:56:57> 00:56:59:	And that's what we're using here.
00:56:59> 00:57:02:	But I think cost burden something to think about.
00:57:02> 00:57:04:	I think that the value of mixed income is something
00:57:04> 00:57:05:	you think about,
00:57:05> 00:57:08:	uh, across at all, and I think Rosie,
00:57:08> 00:57:10:	you asked about scattered site.
00:57:10> 00:57:14:	Yeah, I think our site is something we could consider.
00:57:14> 00:57:16:	Again, we are focused on our market,
00:57:16> 00:57:19:	so if you're looking at scattered site across multiple cities,
00:57:19> 00:57:22:	that doesn't really work. And and we would have to
00:57:22> 00:57:25:	kind of look at the concentration of location there and
00:57:25> 00:57:26:	and where it works.
00:57:26> 00:57:30:	But you know, the one advantage that Amazon has over.
00:57:30> 00:57:34:	Where I worked previously over the GCS holistically is.
00:57:34> 00:57:38:	I'm. There's not tide to regulations of new products and
00:57:38> 00:57:39:	new programs.
00:57:39> 00:57:41:	So if I wanted to go lend on a great

00:57:41> 00:57:46:	scattered site portfolio or a great single family housing portfolio,
00:57:46> 00:57:50:	or are you know for purpose built rent,
00:57:50> 00:57:54:	single family community or an MHC or an RV resort?
00:57:54> 00:57:57:	All of those have roles and housing in various spots
00:57:58> 00:58:01:	and and you could say that that's not housing.
00:58:01> 00:58:03:	But it is for some people and so I think
00:58:03> 00:58:07:	that's understanding that and having the flexibility of private capital
00:58:07> 00:58:10:	a little bit less regulated by programs is where our
00:58:10> 00:58:13:	money can really go. And that's where the the whole.
00:58:13> 00:58:16:	But for Amazon Capital is is what we're trying to
00:58:16> 00:58:16:	sell,
00:58:16> 00:58:19:	like what could we do because no one else could
00:58:19> 00:58:22:	do it or or just not feasible otherwise.
00:58:24> 00:58:25:	Great
00:58:25> 00:58:29:	thank you uhm. Because I think we are at time,
00:58:29> 00:58:32:	I will just quickly ask Rosie if it's OK putting
00:58:32> 00:58:35:	on my Executive director of you all I had on,
00:58:35> 00:58:37:	I would love to hear you know we had over
00:58:37> 00:58:40:	100 members and just practitioners around the country looking at
00:58:40> 00:58:41:	this issue.
00:58:41> 00:58:44:	If each of you could just share one thing you
00:58:44> 00:58:47:	want to leave the group with one thing you'd like
00:58:47> 00:58:50:	to see members take away and think about in their
00:58:50> 00:58:52:	day-to-day work about what specifically now talk about preservation.
00:58:52> 00:58:54:	So let's start with Eric.
00:58:56> 00:58:59:	Uhm, you know. I think this has been an incredibly
00:58:59> 00:59:02:	valuable conversation and I think and I,
00:59:02> 00:59:05:	there's a question in the in the list that I
00:59:05> 00:59:06:	wanted to get to,
00:59:06> 00:59:08:	and I think it's it's equity and the question was
00:59:08> 00:59:12:	really about equity as relates to historic settlement patterns,
00:59:12> 00:59:16:	and I think we'd be remiss if we didn't.
00:59:16> 00:59:19:	Focus in this conversation to some extent on settlement patterns
00:59:20> 00:59:20:	and race,
00:59:20> 00:59:24:	right? There's a history of racial discrimination and redlining in
00:59:24> 00:59:27:	this country that has been oftentimes focused on ownership.
00:59:27> 00:59:31:	But I think the preservation and rental side is key,

00:59:31> 00:59:33:	and I, I, you know,
00:59:33> 00:59:36:	I don't want to. One reason that even rezonings or
00:59:36> 00:59:41:	significant investment of the type that Amazon does sometimes gets
00:59:41> 00:59:44:	challenged and I really commend down this on for doing
00:59:44> 00:59:47:	this work, but I also think that they have to
00:59:47> 00:59:50:	do the work and it's for that reason is that
00:59:50> 00:59:54:	communities that feel like there may be significant rezoning or
00:59:54> 00:59:58:	cataclysmic investment, have reasons to be concerned about the balance
00:59:58> 01:00:00:	of equity that happens in those communities,
01:00:00> 01:00:03:	and that's the that's a really polite,
01:00:03> 01:00:04:	balanced way of saying it.
01:00:04> 01:00:06:	And so I think that.
01:00:06> 01:00:08:	That is, to me, one of the takeaways,
01:00:08> 01:00:11:	and I think that the pandemic just emphasized that the
01:00:11> 01:00:14:	uneven distribution of health care of services of access of
01:00:14> 01:00:17:	transportation of healthy foods and then with that all the
01:00:17> 01:00:20:	economics that come along with rezonings or huge as Jane
01:00:20> 01:00:23:	Jacobs called it cataclysmic investment at times I think are
01:00:23> 01:00:25:	all things that you have to keep an eye on
01:00:25> 01:00:28:	and that's the role of government to regulate,
01:00:28> 01:00:30:	and particularly when you're dealing with markets to regulate,
01:00:30> 01:00:31:	I'll stop there.
01:00:33> 01:00:36:	Yeah, I'll keep it short from the Amazon,
01:00:36> 01:00:38:	so I kind of did to the beginning.
01:00:38> 01:00:42:	It's this is a this is a people problem that
01:00:42> 01:00:46:	occurs across the entire nation and not one entity is
01:00:46> 01:00:47:	going to solve it.
01:00:47> 01:00:49:	Amazon is doing our part,
01:00:49> 01:00:52:	but I think the cost of housing has just been
01:00:52> 01:00:55:	going up and and then you kind of Lincoln and
01:00:55> 01:00:59:	Erica looted this the the disproportionately in in low income
01:00:59> 01:01:02:	minority communities and that's toppled on a couple.
01:01:02> 01:01:04:	On top of transportation costs,
01:01:04> 01:01:07:	education costs, health care costs that all make it tougher
01:01:07> 01:01:07:	to live,
01:01:07> 01:01:11:	and so I think this conversation on this panel has
01:01:11> 01:01:15:	been really good because this is kind of conversation that
01:01:15> 01:01:16:	needs to happen.
01:01:16> 01:01:19:	Across the country, it's a public private partnership of thinking
01:01:19> 01:01:22:	how everyone comes to the table and make things happen,

01:01:22> 01:01:26:	and. Just 'cause you create a tool or a way
01:01:26> 01:01:30:	of doing something from either side of the world,
01:01:30> 01:01:33:	everyone kind to everyone kind of needs to know that
01:01:33> 01:01:36:	tool and think about how it applies to their own
01:01:36> 01:01:39:	market and every markets a little bit different.
01:01:39> 01:01:43:	And so I think an ongoing conversation is going to
01:01:43> 01:01:47:	be part of it and and constant innovation and thought
01:01:47> 01:01:50:	leadership is is going to be the only way with
01:01:50> 01:01:54:	everyone sitting at the table together to solve this problem.
01:01:54> 01:01:55:	Great
01:01:55> 01:01:57:	yeah, and the only thing I'll add is,
01:01:57> 01:02:00:	you know, having been on the public side and now
01:02:00> 01:02:01:	the nonprofit side.
01:02:01> 01:02:05:	Just we all have a very important role to play.
01:02:05> 01:02:08:	Even those who have not been steeped in affordable housing
01:02:08> 01:02:09:	and 80 versus 50%
01:02:09> 01:02:12:	of am I. You know this is about residents in
01:02:12> 01:02:13:	our communities,
01:02:13> 01:02:16:	people who've experienced discrimination and a lot of other hardships.
01:02:16> 01:02:18:	And so it feels like this is a moment and
01:02:18> 01:02:22:	time when everywhere people are more comfortable addressing this talking
01:02:22> 01:02:25:	about this markets that have not talked about.
01:02:25> 01:02:29:	Housing affordability ever or talking about it so.
01:02:29> 01:02:31:	Everyone has a role to play,
01:02:31> 01:02:33:	you know, in whatever you do and in bringing these
01:02:33> 01:02:36:	conversations forward and and bring people together.
01:02:36> 01:02:38:	So I'll leave us with that and pass it back
01:02:38> 01:02:39:	to Rosie.
01:02:39> 01:02:41:	Sorry, we went over by a few minutes,
01:02:41> 01:02:44:	but thank you for having us and Dan and Eric
01:02:44> 01:02:45:	for this
01:02:45> 01:02:45:	conversation. Yeah,
01:02:45> 01:02:47:	thank you so much. Laura,
01:02:47> 01:02:50:	Dan, and Eric for a great conversation and thank you
01:02:50> 01:02:52:	to everyone who joined us on this Friday afternoon and
01:02:52> 01:02:54:	have a wonderful weekend.

personal use only. Reproduction or use without written permission is prohibited. If you have a correction or for permission inquiries, please contact [email protected].