Webinar

ULI Philadelphia: Approaches to Community Engagement

Date: January 12, 2021

00:00:00 --> 00:00:04:	Good morning, welcome everyone to today's program for anyone I've
00:00:04 --> 00:00:04:	not met.
00:00:04 --> 00:00:06:	My name is Laura Slutsky.
00:00:06 --> 00:00:09:	I'm executive director of UI Philadelphia and this is our
00:00:09 --> 00:00:13:	first public program of 2021 organized by the ULI Philadelphia
00:00:13 --> 00:00:17:	Community and Economic Development Local Product Council and after such
00:00:17 --> 00:00:19:	a difficult week in our country,
00:00:19 --> 00:00:23:	we're all really grateful to the Members who put this
00:00:23 --> 00:00:25:	together to focus on something forward.
00:00:25 --> 00:00:28:	Looking for our community. Personally.
00:00:28 --> 00:00:31:	As a former practitioner and community development,
00:00:31 --> 00:00:33:	this one is very. And you're in dear to me,
00:00:33 --> 00:00:36:	so I'm really looking forward to the conversation and want
00:00:36 --> 00:00:38:	to thank our panelists.
00:00:38 --> 00:00:42:	An members specifically Carrie Long and Gina Lavery for organizing
00:00:42 --> 00:00:44:	this very important conversation.
00:00:44 --> 00:00:47:	Next, slide Kevin. So here's today's agenda.
00:00:47 --> 00:00:49:	You can take a look and as as you do
00:00:49 --> 00:00:50:	that before you get,
00:00:50 --> 00:00:52:	we get started. I want to ask everyone.
00:00:52 --> 00:00:55:	As you all know, we try to create a little
00:00:55 --> 00:00:57:	bit of an environment over zoom,
00:00:57 --> 00:00:59:	even though it's tricky. But if you could,
00:00:59 --> 00:01:02:	please go ahead and introduce yourselves in the chat so
00:01:02 --> 00:01:04:	that we can see who's here today.
00:01:04 --> 00:01:09:	We would appreciate it. While I'm talking.

00:01:09 --> 00:01:11:	So while you're looking at that,
00:01:11 --> 00:01:13:	I just want to remind everyone of a fuse in
00:01:13 --> 00:01:14:	reminders.
00:01:14 --> 00:01:15:	I think we're all aware now,
00:01:15 --> 00:01:18:	but we ask that attendees please keep your video and
00:01:18 --> 00:01:21:	audio off until later in the program just so that
00:01:21 --> 00:01:24:	our speakers are front and center throughout the presentation.
00:01:24 --> 00:01:27:	Please feel free to put any questions or comments that
00:01:27 --> 00:01:29:	you have in the chat will do our best to
00:01:29 --> 00:01:31:	work through as many as possible.
00:01:31 --> 00:01:33:	We are expecting a pretty large group today,
00:01:33 --> 00:01:36:	but will try to get to as much as we
00:01:36 --> 00:01:38:	can and we do have time for questions at the
00:01:38 --> 00:01:39:	end of every section.
00:01:39 --> 00:01:41:	So now before we get started,
00:01:41 --> 00:01:44:	I want to take a moment to thank our annual
00:01:44 --> 00:01:47:	ULI Philadelphia sponsors for their support and an this year
00:01:47 --> 00:01:50:	more than ever we truly could not do what we
00:01:50 --> 00:01:53:	can deliver in content and our mission without them.
00:01:53 --> 00:01:56:	So thank you to our urban visionary leadership circle and
00:01:56 --> 00:01:57:	platinum sponsors.
00:02:00 --> 00:02:03:	To our goal, gold and silver an friend sponsors and
00:02:03 --> 00:02:05:	like I said without your support.
00:02:05 --> 00:02:08:	Thank you to those who are on this call today
00:02:08 --> 00:02:10:	we could not do our work.
00:02:10 --> 00:02:13:	So Speaking of that, if we have some new friends
00:02:13 --> 00:02:15:	and colleagues here who are not familiar with you,
00:02:15 --> 00:02:18:	well, I welcome. Thank you for being here.
00:02:18 --> 00:02:21:	Everything that we do in our organization is about promoting
00:02:21 --> 00:02:22:	our mission,
00:02:22 --> 00:02:25:	which you can see on the screen of providing responsive,
00:02:25 --> 00:02:29:	providing leadership and the responsible use of land and creating
00:02:29 --> 00:02:30:	sustaining,
00:02:30 --> 00:02:33:	thriving communities worldwide. And this year in particular,
00:02:33 --> 00:02:36:	we've been focused on looking at this core mission and
00:02:36 --> 00:02:39:	everything that we do to bring value to our community
00:02:39 --> 00:02:42:	and to our members here in Philadelphia.
00:02:42 --> 00:02:46:	So we're a global membership organization that's interdisciplinary.
00:02:46 --> 00:02:49:	We have folks from all aspects of land use,
00:02:49 --> 00:02:53:	planning and development. There's over 45 thousand

	members worldwide,
00:02:53 --> 00:02:55:	and here you'll I, Philadelphia,
00:02:55 --> 00:02:58:	we have a tristate area footprint that you can see
00:02:58 --> 00:03:01:	on the screen with around 900 members.
00:03:01 --> 00:03:04:	Everything that we do is also driven by our Members
00:03:04 --> 00:03:08:	who are volunteering time to contribute content and lead this
00:03:08 --> 00:03:08:	work.
00:03:08 --> 00:03:11:	We have 18 councils and committees that do all kinds
00:03:11 --> 00:03:12:	of things.
00:03:12 --> 00:03:14:	I won't get into them now,
00:03:14 --> 00:03:17:	but everything is about sharing educational experiences,
00:03:17 --> 00:03:19:	making connections, sharing best practices,
00:03:19 --> 00:03:22:	and thinking about how we could have A and forward
00:03:22 --> 00:03:24:	thinking impact on our community.
00:03:24 --> 00:03:27:	We will run a wide variety of programming like this.
00:03:27 --> 00:03:31:	Also some more hands-on advisory services and other volunteer work.
00:03:31 --> 00:03:33:	So if you're not already familiar,
00:03:33 --> 00:03:36:	we always welcome guests to everything.
00:03:36 --> 00:03:38:	And we love to meet you and have find out
00:03:38 --> 00:03:40:	how you can get more involved.
00:03:40 --> 00:03:43:	I'm going to just give you some quick highlights right
00:03:43 --> 00:03:44:	now.
00:03:44 --> 00:03:45:	And then we will get started.
00:03:45 --> 00:03:47:	I promise go ahead. Next slide,
00:03:47 --> 00:03:50:	Kevin. I think there there we go.
00:03:50 --> 00:03:52:	So a few things of this past year which has
00:03:52 --> 00:03:56:	just been difficult for so many people but also really
00:03:56 --> 00:03:57:	important.
00:03:57 --> 00:04:00:	Like I said to think about the core work that
00:04:00 --> 00:04:00:	we do.
00:04:00 --> 00:04:03:	So we delivered all of our programming on line in
00:04:03 --> 00:04:04:	November.
00:04:04 --> 00:04:07:	You can see there an excerpt of our annual real
00:04:07 --> 00:04:08:	estate forecast.
00:04:08 --> 00:04:11:	It was of course entirely virtual and for the first
00:04:12 --> 00:04:14:	time we had an all day agenda.
00:04:14 --> 00:04:17:	With four unique discussions, breakout conversations,
00:04:17 --> 00:04:21:	and this year, we really attacked some important conversations about
00:04:21 --> 00:04:23:	equity and development,
00:04:23 --> 00:04:26:	racial injustice, and a number of other areas.

00:04:26 --> 00:04:29:	We had 18 presenters and I'm really proud of our
00:04:29 --> 00:04:33:	team for making it happen and convening people during this
00:04:33 --> 00:04:35:	really important time.
00:04:35 --> 00:04:37:	We also ran to technical assistance panels,
00:04:37 --> 00:04:41:	which are programs where you align members can volunteer to
00:04:41 --> 00:04:44:	give advice and feedback to the public sector.
00:04:44 --> 00:04:47:	So here the photo you see here is a project
00:04:47 --> 00:04:49:	that we did with PID C on the Bartram's,
00:04:49 --> 00:04:52:	North and South. Sites around life Sciences,
00:04:52 --> 00:04:56:	manufacturing and responsible investment. We also did a project for
00:04:56 --> 00:04:58:	West Whiteland Township,
00:04:58 --> 00:05:01:	looking at and development in that report is coming out
00:05:01 --> 00:05:02:	very soon,
00:05:02 --> 00:05:06:	so thank you to any Members here who participated in
00:05:06 --> 00:05:06:	those.
00:05:06 --> 00:05:10:	And then finally, and I think relevant to this discussion,
00:05:10 --> 00:05:13:	we have an upcoming project with the City of Philadelphia's
00:05:13 --> 00:05:18:	Housing Development Organization or round naturally occurring affordable housing in
00:05:18 --> 00:05:18:	the city.
00:05:18 --> 00:05:21:	So look forward to that and then the photo.
00:05:21 --> 00:05:24:	The Legos that you see there for anyone who's not
00:05:24 --> 00:05:26:	familiar with our urban plan program,
00:05:26 --> 00:05:29:	this is a real estate training simulation course that can
00:05:29 --> 00:05:31:	be delivered to a range of participants.
00:05:31 --> 00:05:34:	Also run by ULI member volunteers and we will be
00:05:34 --> 00:05:37:	delivering a workshop to a number of our CEO and
00:05:37 --> 00:05:38:	community leaders.
00:05:38 --> 00:05:39:	In a couple of weeks,
00:05:39 --> 00:05:41:	so looking forward to that.
00:05:41 --> 00:05:43:	Urban Plan is a key element of some of the
00:05:43 --> 00:05:45:	work we're doing around diversity,
00:05:45 --> 00:05:48:	equity, and inclusion, so this is just a very very
00:05:48 --> 00:05:49:	brief overview.
00:05:49 --> 00:05:52:	Really scratches the surface, but wanted to give some folks
00:05:52 --> 00:05:56:	an opportunity for a little bit more information about our
00:05:56 --> 00:05:59:	organization and some of the topics that we're thinking about.
00:05:59 --> 00:06:02:	So if you are new or remember and haven't been
00:06:02 --> 00:06:03:	apart of us for awhile,
00:06:03 --> 00:06:06:	please feel free to reach out to any Member.
00:06:06 --> 00:06:08:	We're here to chat and again,

00:06:08 --> 00:06:12:	especially during times like these were feeling that it's very
00:06:12 --> 00:06:16:	important to provide this connectivity and these issue discussions today.
00:06:16 --> 00:06:19:	So with that I will let our program start and
00:06:19 --> 00:06:23:	I'm very excited to introduce the moderate are for our
00:06:23 --> 00:06:24:	first panel,
00:06:24 --> 00:06:27:	who also happens to be my friend and former classmate
00:06:27 --> 00:06:29:	Doctor Akira Drake Rodriguez.
00:06:29 --> 00:06:33:	Doctor Rodriguez is research examines the politics of urban planning
00:06:33 --> 00:06:38:	or ways that disenfranchised groups re appropriate their marginalized spaces
00:06:38 --> 00:06:39:	in the city to gain access.
00:06:39 --> 00:06:42:	To an sustain urban political power,
00:06:42 --> 00:06:45:	Doctor Rodriguez is currently working on her manuscript,
00:06:45 --> 00:06:49:	deviance and divergent spaces, the radical politics of Atlanta's public
00:06:49 --> 00:06:49:	housing,
00:06:49 --> 00:06:52:	which is under contract with the University of Georgia Press.
00:06:52 --> 00:06:56:	The book explores how politics of public housing planning and
00:06:56 --> 00:06:59:	race in Atlanta created a politics of resistance within its
00:06:59 --> 00:07:01:	public housing developments.
00:07:01 --> 00:07:05:	This research offers the alternative benefits of public housing outside
00:07:05 --> 00:07:08:	of shelter to challenge the overwhelming narrative of public housing
00:07:08 --> 00:07:11:	as a dysfunctional relic of the welfare state.
00:07:11 --> 00:07:14:	We are really lucky to have her here today to
00:07:14 --> 00:07:16:	leave this conversation so Akira,
00:07:16 --> 00:07:17:	I will hand it to you.
00:07:17 --> 00:07:20:	Thank you, Laura. Thank you so much and you lie
00:07:20 --> 00:07:24:	Fillion to Kevin an everyone for being here this morning.
00:07:24 --> 00:07:26:	Good morning and happy new year.
00:07:26 --> 00:07:28:	As Lord noted I'm cured,
00:07:28 --> 00:07:32:	Drake Rodriguez and faculty member at University of Pennsylvania in
00:07:32 --> 00:07:35:	the Department of City and Regional planning.
00:07:35 --> 00:07:38:	I am super pleased to be moderating this panel very
00:07:38 --> 00:07:39:	quickly.
00:07:39 --> 00:07:41:	I'm going to introduce our three.
00:07:41 --> 00:07:46:	Analysts before allowing them to introduce themselves more fully while
00:07:46 --> 00:07:49:	they're doing those introductions.

00:07:49 --> 00:07:52:	I think Kevin has a pole that we like to
00:07:52 --> 00:07:52:	launch.
00:07:52 --> 00:07:56:	I see so many different stakeholders here or she is
00:07:56 --> 00:08:00:	and CDC Zan developers just a quick pull of whether
00:08:00 --> 00:08:04:	or not you've been directly involved in negotiating a CBA.
00:08:04 --> 00:08:07:	And if you have, how did it resolve?
00:08:07 --> 00:08:10:	Was it successful? Negotiation resulted in agreement,
00:08:10 --> 00:08:13:	or. Did not result in agreement,
00:08:13 --> 00:08:15:	but there was a negotiation for one.
00:08:15 --> 00:08:20:	Our panelists today are Jamie Gautier who is the Philadelphia
00:08:20 --> 00:08:25:	City Council person representing the third district hiring West Philadelphia.
00:08:25 --> 00:08:28:	David Ross, who was a partner at the Argo Property
00:08:28 --> 00:08:30:	Group and Nolan Tully,
00:08:30 --> 00:08:33:	who is the board chair of the South of South
00:08:33 --> 00:08:35:	Neighbors Association SOS Na.
00:08:35 --> 00:08:37:	So I will just pass it off to you,
00:08:37 --> 00:08:43:	Jamie quite quickly you can introduce yourself more fully.
00:08:43 --> 00:08:50:	Hello good morning everybody. Councilmember Jaime Guardia represent Philadelphia's third
00:08:50 --> 00:08:55:	district that includes large parts of West in Southwest Philadelphia.
00:08:55 --> 00:08:58:	I'm excited to be a part of today's discussion.
00:08:58 --> 00:09:03:	We often help community groups and developers to to come
00:09:03 --> 00:09:07:	to agreements or to develop CBS that will help everyone
00:09:07 --> 00:09:10:	to kind of be good neighbors an exist together.
00:09:10 --> 00:09:13:	So thank you.
00:09:13 --> 00:09:13:	David.
00:09:16 --> 00:09:21:	Hey, good morning everybody. David Ross with Argo Property Group
00:09:21 --> 00:09:26:	were mid-size developer been focusing in Brewerytown East Falls area
00:09:26 --> 00:09:28:	for about five or six years now?
00:09:28 --> 00:09:32:	Excited to be here and we've done a handful of
00:09:32 --> 00:09:37:	Community benefits agreement so just excited about how this discussion
00:09:37 --> 00:09:39:	can move that process forward,
00:09:39 --> 00:09:39:	thanks.
00:09:42 --> 00:09:44:	Nelly
00:09:44 --> 00:09:46:	hi everybody, my name is Nolan Tully.
00:09:46 --> 00:09:50:	I'm the chair of the South of South Neighborhood Association.
00:09:50 --> 00:09:54:	That neighborhood is bounded by South Street on the North

00:09:54 --> 00:09:57:	Washington Ave on the South and then Broad Street on
00:09:57 --> 00:10:00:	the East and the Schuylkill River on the West.
00:10:00 --> 00:10:04:	We've done over the course of the last two years
00:10:04 --> 00:10:05:	or so.
00:10:05 --> 00:10:08:	Two CBA is for larger developments along Washington Ave,
00:10:08 --> 00:10:12:	which is one of the principle kind of commercial corridors.
00:10:12 --> 00:10:15:	And actually, you know, uh?
00:10:15 --> 00:10:18:	An area that Ave that has changed quite a bit
00:10:18 --> 00:10:21:	as it's gone from an industrial use to more of
00:10:21 --> 00:10:23:	a residential mixed use.
00:10:23 --> 00:10:26:	Sector, so we've had some experience in CBS.
00:10:26 --> 00:10:31:	There an that says some successes and and some things
00:10:31 --> 00:10:33:	that we've learned from.
00:10:33 --> 00:10:36:	Protect.
00:10:36 --> 00:10:38:	Kate and so it looks like not a lot of
00:10:38 --> 00:10:42:	us have been involved in negotiation negotiating cvas,
00:10:42 --> 00:10:44:	but for the few for about 1/4 of us you
00:10:45 --> 00:10:45:	have been.
00:10:45 --> 00:10:48:	It looks like it did result in agreement,
00:10:48 --> 00:10:51:	so that's that's good and promising news.
00:10:51 --> 00:10:53:	So let's maybe just kick it off.
00:10:53 --> 00:10:56:	It seems like while there are opportunities there,
00:10:56 --> 00:11:00:	maybe we can talk also a bit about the challenges
00:11:00 --> 00:11:01:	that can arise,
00:11:01 --> 00:11:05:	but also, again, talk about those opportunities that come out
00:11:05 --> 00:11:06:	of implementing.
00:11:06 --> 00:11:10:	CBS and also thinking about what are the different stakeholders
00:11:10 --> 00:11:13:	such as CDC's developers and residents,
00:11:13 --> 00:11:16:	can sort of do to mediate these challenges or or
00:11:16 --> 00:11:21:	leverage these opportunities further so you can maybe talk from
00:11:21 --> 00:11:22:	personal experience or.
00:11:25 --> 00:11:28:	A cure. I think there was a question in the
00:11:28 --> 00:11:30:	chat about describing what a CBA is,
00:11:30 --> 00:11:32:	which it occurs to me,
00:11:32 --> 00:11:34:	might be worthwhile to start with.
00:11:34 --> 00:11:37:	Yeah, no one. Do you want to coming from someone
00:11:37 --> 00:11:39:	who is sort of done successfully?
00:11:39 --> 00:11:43:	Maybe talk about how you all came into the process
00:11:43 --> 00:11:45:	of thinking about CBS?
00:11:45 --> 00:11:48:	Sure, so. You know, I do think that at its

00:11:49 --> 00:11:50:	very most basic level,
00:11:50 --> 00:11:54:	a Community benefits agreement is.
00:11:54 --> 00:11:58:	A legally binding contract between a developer or property owner
00:11:58 --> 00:12:03:	and the community and the community could be represented by
00:12:03 --> 00:12:07:	any number of different entities an it could actually be
00:12:07 --> 00:12:11:	a number of different fees on behalf of the community,
00:12:11 --> 00:12:15:	whether those are CEOs or CDC's or whatever it might
00:12:15 --> 00:12:15:	be.
00:12:15 --> 00:12:19:	Um and usually that will provide kind of an exchange
00:12:19 --> 00:12:21:	for a development.
00:12:21 --> 00:12:25:	Certain benefits that would accrue to the community.
00:12:25 --> 00:12:30:	So in our neighborhood, and I think these benefits.
00:12:30 --> 00:12:34:	Differ pretty widely depending on what the neighborhood looks like,
00:12:34 --> 00:12:35:	an I think whatever your area,
00:12:35 --> 00:12:39:	you know what might be suitable for your area or
00:12:39 --> 00:12:39:	things.
00:12:39 --> 00:12:41:	You want to focus on,
00:12:41 --> 00:12:43:	but for us, the items that we looked at were
00:12:44 --> 00:12:49:	affordable housing opening greenspaces accessible to community safety and livability
00:12:49 --> 00:12:50:	infrastructure.
00:12:50 --> 00:12:54:	Example of that would be like expanding sidewalks so that
00:12:54 --> 00:12:58:	their wider and provide more space between the car Lane
00:12:58 --> 00:13:00:	and the commercial space.
00:13:00 --> 00:13:02:	Use of minority and women owned women.
00:13:02 --> 00:13:07:	Contractors in the building. Preference for minority and women owned
00:13:07 --> 00:13:10:	businesses in the commercial spaces.
00:13:10 --> 00:13:13:	Uh, an agreement to work with us to connect our
00:13:13 --> 00:13:17:	Neighborhood Association to the tenants in the commercial space is
00:13:17 --> 00:13:21:	so that we can prioritize local hiring from a certain.
00:13:21 --> 00:13:24:	A subset of ZIP codes that are in the near
00:13:24 --> 00:13:28:	community and then some things that I think are just
00:13:28 --> 00:13:30:	kind of aesthetic but important.
00:13:30 --> 00:13:36:	So things like street trees where trash cans or other
00:13:36 --> 00:13:39:	trash disposal items would be.
00:13:39 --> 00:13:41:	Would be placed and then some things that are probably
00:13:41 --> 00:13:42:	independently legally required,
00:13:42 --> 00:13:43:	but are important to us,

00:13:43 --> 00:13:45:	such as like 80 accessible infrastructure.
00:13:45 --> 00:13:47:	So those are the things we looked at our CBS
00:13:47 --> 00:13:49:	don't aren't uniform like some of them will include some,
00:13:49 --> 00:13:50:	but not all of those,
00:13:50 --> 00:13:53:	but those are the items that we negotiate around.
00:13:53 --> 00:13:57:	Listen and Councilmember, could you maybe talk about what this
00:13:57 --> 00:14:00:	looks like from the city's perspective?
00:14:00 --> 00:14:03:	We did get a question about whether or not they
00:14:03 --> 00:14:04:	are required,
00:14:04 --> 00:14:08:	but also just thinking, how does the city sorry its
00:14:08 --> 00:14:13:	role in CBS that are largely between nonprofits and developers?
00:14:13 --> 00:14:16:	Know that there's an overall city perspective.
00:14:16 --> 00:14:20:	I think you know Cvas tend to be at this
00:14:20 --> 00:14:20:	point,
00:14:20 --> 00:14:24:	project specific and neighborhood specific.
00:14:24 --> 00:14:28:	You know there was legislation on the table last session
00:14:28 --> 00:14:32:	around requiring cvas for projects of a certain size,
00:14:32 --> 00:14:35:	but it didn't move forward,
00:14:35 --> 00:14:38:	you know, and I don't think it's a bad piece
00:14:38 --> 00:14:39:	of legislation.
00:14:39 --> 00:14:43:	I just think that it's going to need to be.
00:14:43 --> 00:14:47:	Hammered out right because we have to make sure that
00:14:47 --> 00:14:49:	everyone's needs an an.
00:14:49 --> 00:14:53:	You know what? What communities across the city need?
00:14:53 --> 00:14:55:	From my part, you know,
00:14:55 --> 00:14:59:	we often act as a facilitator between community members an
00:14:59 --> 00:15:00:	and developers.
00:15:00 --> 00:15:06:	Whether it's we're developing a formal CBA or not.
00:15:06 --> 00:15:08:	And many times and it could be,
00:15:08 --> 00:15:10:	you know, sometimes before a project.
00:15:10 --> 00:15:14:	That's probably the best time to be having these discussions
00:15:14 --> 00:15:16:	around negotiations,
00:15:16 --> 00:15:18:	but sometimes it's during construction.
00:15:18 --> 00:15:22:	We have several projects that are under construction and you
00:15:22 --> 00:15:26:	know the the neighbors feel like they're being infringed upon,
00:15:26 --> 00:15:30:	so we've had to step into those situations to to
00:15:30 --> 00:15:35:	help create better agreements and understandings between developers and residents.
00:15:35 --> 00:15:37:	And I think the opportunity.
00:15:37 --> 00:15:41:	That CBA's present is for is the opportunity to create

00:15:41 --> 00:15:46:	good relationships between developers that want to work in a
00:15:46 --> 00:15:49:	community and the residents who live there.
00:15:49 --> 00:15:53:	But I also think it's the opportunity to really derive
00:15:53 --> 00:15:54:	benefit for,
00:15:54 --> 00:15:59:	you know, longstanding neighborhood residents from you know,
00:15:59 --> 00:16:02:	development that's happening in the Community.
00:16:02 --> 00:16:06:	I think the challenge is making sure that there are
00:16:06 --> 00:16:10:	real discussions between both parties.
00:16:10 --> 00:16:15:	And that both parties are thinking really creatively about what
00:16:15 --> 00:16:17:	that benefit could look like.
00:16:17 --> 00:16:20:	One of the best CBA's in the city,
00:16:20 --> 00:16:23:	I think, relates to a project in my district,
00:16:23 --> 00:16:29:	so Brandywine is creating a major development called Schoolyards about
00:16:29 --> 00:16:32:	a 3 billion dollar development.
00:16:32 --> 00:16:35:	But you know, in moving that project forward,
00:16:35 --> 00:16:40:	they created a coalition of for community groups in West
00:16:40 --> 00:16:41:	Philadelphia.
00:16:41 --> 00:16:44:	They call themselves the Mantua Palton Alliance,
00:16:44 --> 00:16:49:	and that joint Coalition is administering about a $10,000,000 fund
00:16:49 --> 00:16:54:	over a 15 year period to support affordable housing development,
00:16:54 --> 00:16:58:	community capacity, building, economic opportunity,
00:16:58 --> 00:17:01:	and a range of other activities.
00:17:01 --> 00:17:05:	So the opportunity to create real benefit definitely exist here.
00:17:05 --> 00:17:10:	The challenges that sometimes folks aren't really listening to to
00:17:10 --> 00:17:11:	each other.
00:17:11 --> 00:17:16:	And it's hard to get to that that true benefit.
00:17:16 --> 00:17:19:	Thank you and David. Maybe you could talk a little
00:17:19 --> 00:17:22:	bit about how users come into communities,
00:17:22 --> 00:17:25:	knowing that CBS or at least in that in the
00:17:25 --> 00:17:26:	air,
00:17:26 --> 00:17:30:	right? You've had some experience where you've been going into
00:17:30 --> 00:17:34:	neighborhoods to develop an an people are kind of ready
00:17:34 --> 00:17:35:	with some CBA.
00:17:35 --> 00:17:38:	Yeah, I think it's a CBA is a way of
00:17:38 --> 00:17:42:	formalizing a lot of the promises that they made.
00:17:42 --> 00:17:45:	Over that, you know when you're when you're developer and
00:17:45 --> 00:17:49:	you're proposing something that's generally a variance or or not

00:17:49 --> 00:17:49:	by right.
00:17:49 --> 00:17:51:	You have to have these.
00:17:51 --> 00:17:55:	Real conversations offline with neighbors and community members to say
00:17:55 --> 00:17:57:	like here's what we want to do.
00:17:57 --> 00:17:59:	You know, is this realistic and?
00:17:59 --> 00:18:02:	Um? You know the CBA.
00:18:02 --> 00:18:05:	It allows to formalize and hold accountable.
00:18:05 --> 00:18:09:	You know what a developer promises.
00:18:09 --> 00:18:13:	And it allows for some type of framework of.
00:18:13 --> 00:18:15:	Normalcy to go back against,
00:18:15 --> 00:18:17:	which is nice when. Yeah,
00:18:17 --> 00:18:20:	as a developer you're trying to plug these numbers in
00:18:20 --> 00:18:23:	your trying to explain to your investors in your lenders
00:18:23 --> 00:18:25:	like what like what are our goals and what we're.
00:18:25 --> 00:18:28:	In what we're doing for the project you can.
00:18:28 --> 00:18:31:	Account for everything and all the variables so.
00:18:31 --> 00:18:35:	MA CVI doesn't need to be a scary mysterious thing.
00:18:35 --> 00:18:37:	I think it can be.
00:18:37 --> 00:18:43:	It definitely varies from community community somewhere concerned about affordability
00:18:43 --> 00:18:43:	and parking.
00:18:43 --> 00:18:47:	Some are concerned about aesthetics.
00:18:47 --> 00:18:49:	We have done about a half dozen of 'em I'm
00:18:49 --> 00:18:52:	I'm in no means like the most experienced person,
00:18:52 --> 00:18:55:	but we've we've fumble through a couple and it's been
00:18:55 --> 00:18:59:	interesting to see how different neighborhoods approach them.
00:18:59 --> 00:19:05:	Some neighborhoods, it's it's a lot of anxiety about affordability
00:19:05 --> 00:19:06:	and gentrification,
00:19:06 --> 00:19:10:	so those cvas very much look like giving preference to
00:19:10 --> 00:19:13:	local minority contractors.
00:19:13 --> 00:19:19:	Giving first look in preference to tenants and commercial tenants.
00:19:19 --> 00:19:22:	And contributing towards neighborhood activities.
00:19:22 --> 00:19:25:	So that's where you are.
00:19:25 --> 00:19:29:	I'm in speaking about sort of the differences between communities.
00:19:29 --> 00:19:32:	I think that's a really good point of thinking about
00:19:32 --> 00:19:35:	our CEO's and capacity and maybe even lends itself to
00:19:36 --> 00:19:39:	some of the questions we're seeing in the chat about
00:19:39 --> 00:19:42:	enforcement after implementation and monitoring and

	accountability.
00:19:42 --> 00:19:46:	So thinking about an councilmember really like your point about
00:19:46 --> 00:19:50:	the Brandywine CBA and building community capacity outside of just
00:19:50 --> 00:19:51:	you know,
00:19:51 --> 00:19:53:	affordable housing bricks and sticks stuff.
00:19:53 --> 00:19:55:	So maybe thinking about and David,
00:19:55 --> 00:19:58:	you can. You can speak about your own relationship in
00:19:58 --> 00:20:03:	different communities of thinking about how does Community capacity broadly
00:20:03 --> 00:20:04:	outside of RC is?
00:20:04 --> 00:20:05:	You know it's more than RC's,
00:20:05 --> 00:20:08:	right? There are people who come to meetings were not
00:20:08 --> 00:20:10:	affiliated with RC's.
00:20:10 --> 00:20:13:	But thinking about how that community capacity and interest can
00:20:13 --> 00:20:16:	affect the CBA negotiation process were going bad.
00:20:16 --> 00:20:19:	So I know just from my own research how many
00:20:19 --> 00:20:22:	people have a large fear gentrification when it's not necessarily
00:20:22 --> 00:20:25:	knocking at the door but you still have to deal
00:20:25 --> 00:20:28:	with that fear even if it's not actually happening.
00:20:28 --> 00:20:30:	And so how do you will?
00:20:30 --> 00:20:32:	Kind of see that emerging,
00:20:32 --> 00:20:36:	either helping or hindering CBS in the city.
00:20:36 --> 00:20:38:	Um, I'll copy it to you.
00:20:38 --> 00:20:42:	Oh Councilmember, you gonna get it.
00:20:42 --> 00:20:45:	I will say that I think are seals are very
00:20:45 --> 00:20:46:	important.
00:20:46 --> 00:20:50:	I think every neighborhood should have a vehicle by which
00:20:51 --> 00:20:55:	residents can provide input and and make sure that you
00:20:55 --> 00:20:59:	know they have a say in development in the future
00:20:59 --> 00:21:02:	of what happens in their neighborhood.
00:21:02 --> 00:21:06:	And I often feel that our seals are very challenged.
00:21:06 --> 00:21:08:	They have a hard job,
00:21:08 --> 00:21:12:	most of them are volunteer organizations.
00:21:12 --> 00:21:16:	It's a lot of them kind of have active participation
00:21:16 --> 00:21:18:	from older retired folks,
00:21:18 --> 00:21:22:	but but many neighborhoods you know have younger folks who
00:21:22 --> 00:21:26:	want to participate with their working right,
00:21:26 --> 00:21:29:	and so the demands on people who run our CEO's

00:21:29 --> 00:21:31:	are are a lot right.
00:21:31 --> 00:21:33:	But their job is important.
00:21:33 --> 00:21:38:	And then you're there in discussions with developers who have
00:21:38 --> 00:21:40:	lawyers and designers,
00:21:40 --> 00:21:42:	right? And who have paid?
00:21:42 --> 00:21:45:	Expertise so from the start I think there's a power
00:21:45 --> 00:21:48:	imbalance and what I really like to see is for
00:21:48 --> 00:21:52:	us to provide to provide more tools to our CEO
00:21:52 --> 00:21:56:	so that they can participate in these conversations from a
00:21:56 --> 00:21:57:	position of power.
00:21:57 --> 00:22:01:	Sometimes when I look at Community benefit agreements,
00:22:01 --> 00:22:05:	I come away thinking that the Community could have gotten
00:22:05 --> 00:22:05:	more,
00:22:05 --> 00:22:08:	especially when we're talking about real estate.
00:22:08 --> 00:22:10:	We're talking about, you know,
00:22:10 --> 00:22:13:	developments that are going to be around.
00:22:13 --> 00:22:15:	Or maybe 100 years right,
00:22:15 --> 00:22:19:	depending on how how well is built an those developments
00:22:19 --> 00:22:22:	are going to define who can live in a neighborhood
00:22:22 --> 00:22:23:	and who can't.
00:22:23 --> 00:22:26:	And so I see my role very much as pushing
00:22:26 --> 00:22:29:	for our CEO's and using the resources of my my
00:22:29 --> 00:22:32:	office to help build their capacity.
00:22:32 --> 00:22:36:	I have a director of Equitable development position in my
00:22:36 --> 00:22:36:	office.
00:22:36 --> 00:22:39:	That person is an urban planner.
00:22:39 --> 00:22:42:	He spends a lot of time with our our CEO's
00:22:42 --> 00:22:44:	trying to listening to them.
00:22:44 --> 00:22:46:	And getting best practices from them,
00:22:46 --> 00:22:49:	but also trying to share best practices with them with
00:22:49 --> 00:22:50:	them too.
00:22:50 --> 00:22:52:	And so I see that as a key part of
00:22:52 --> 00:22:52:	my role.
00:22:56 --> 00:22:59:	David Gunn
00:22:59 --> 00:23:03:	um let's see it. There was a couple of questions
00:23:03 --> 00:23:03:	there.
00:23:03 --> 00:23:08:	I do think the CBA can can.
00:23:08 --> 00:23:10:	If it's the first thing that comes up,
00:23:10 --> 00:23:12:	I think it's. I generally like it.
00:23:12 --> 00:23:15:	Looked at as like animosity.
00:23:15 --> 00:23:17:	But the way we've been doing this is if you

00:23:17 --> 00:23:21:	want to have a long relationship with where you're building.
00:23:21 --> 00:23:23:	To know who the community members are,
00:23:23 --> 00:23:26:	know who's in charge the Councilman,
00:23:26 --> 00:23:28:	the community leaders, and you say,
00:23:28 --> 00:23:30:	hey, here's a piece of land.
00:23:30 --> 00:23:31:	Here's what we plan to do.
00:23:31 --> 00:23:36:	An have some preliminary meetings around that we've changed almost
00:23:36 --> 00:23:39:	all of our projects based on feedback to try and
00:23:39 --> 00:23:41:	push things as much.
00:23:41 --> 00:23:44:	Thoards residential and parking as possible.
00:23:44 --> 00:23:47:	Um? And then by the time we get to a
00:23:47 --> 00:23:47:	CBA,
00:23:47 --> 00:23:51:	we've already been around and had conversations that we're just
00:23:51 --> 00:23:52:	formalizing a lot of.
00:23:52 --> 00:23:56:	Concerns and. Um? I just I just think it's important
00:23:56 --> 00:23:59:	to say it doesn't need to be this.
00:23:59 --> 00:24:02:	This point of friction the CBA can be a good
00:24:02 --> 00:24:02:	thing.
00:24:02 --> 00:24:05:	That's just locking in. Things have been discussed.
00:24:07 --> 00:24:10:	Of course, at Nolan, did you want to jump in
00:24:10 --> 00:24:10:	as well?
00:24:10 --> 00:24:14:	Talk a little bit about from your perspective?
00:24:14 --> 00:24:16:	Sure, so there were, as David mentioned,
00:24:16 --> 00:24:19:	a couple of items that came up in that conversation,
00:24:19 --> 00:24:22:	which I think were interesting and again.
00:24:22 --> 00:24:25:	My role on the panel is kind of 1 arceo's
00:24:25 --> 00:24:25:	viewpoint,
00:24:25 --> 00:24:28:	right? So I want to reiterate that what's good for
00:24:28 --> 00:24:31:	sosna is not necessarily good for everybody,
00:24:31 --> 00:24:34:	and I think what the Council member pointed to in
00:24:34 --> 00:24:37:	Mount Mantua Powelton area is what was good for that
00:24:37 --> 00:24:38:	community.
00:24:38 --> 00:24:40:	But in terms of capacity.
00:24:40 --> 00:24:42:	Our our CEO was lucky in some sense.
00:24:42 --> 00:24:44:	I'm a partner at a law firm here in the
00:24:44 --> 00:24:48:	city Feighery Drinker Biddle and Reath of colleague of mine.
00:24:48 --> 00:24:50:	On the board was a partner at Duane Morris.
00:24:50 --> 00:24:53:	There are two big law firms and we were able
00:24:53 --> 00:24:55:	to get assistance from our law firms on a pro
00:24:55 --> 00:24:58:	bono basis to help negotiate these CBA's not every arceo

00:24:58 --> 00:25:01:	is going to have the ability to do that right
00:25:01 --> 00:25:04:	and I think that's an important part of looking at
00:25:04 --> 00:25:05:	what we've been able to do.
00:25:05 --> 00:25:07:	You know, I think it successfully,
00:25:07 --> 00:25:09:	but that is not necessarily replicable.
00:25:09 --> 00:25:11:	I'd love to have those types of legal.
00:25:11 --> 00:25:14:	Support.
00:25:14 --> 00:25:18:	You know available to other arceo's that don't have the
00:25:18 --> 00:25:20:	capacity to do it on their board.
00:25:20 --> 00:25:25:	The power imbalance that the Council member talked about.
00:25:25 --> 00:25:27:	Any arceo that enters into these negotiations?
00:25:27 --> 00:25:29:	If the negotiations go South,
00:25:29 --> 00:25:32:	basically, one risk of a lawsuit.
00:25:32 --> 00:25:35:	Chills the entire conversation because the Arceo can't risk a
00:25:35 --> 00:25:38:	lawsuit that exceeds any sort of insurance capacity that they
00:25:38 --> 00:25:38:	have.
00:25:38 --> 00:25:41:	Otherwise they go out of existence and and in some
00:25:41 --> 00:25:44:	instances I think wrote remote instances but potentially risk personal
00:25:44 --> 00:25:46:	liability for the members of that board,
00:25:46 --> 00:25:48:	which is completely, you know,
00:25:48 --> 00:25:51:	that is a power card that most developers don't play,
00:25:51 --> 00:25:52:	but if it comes down to it,
00:25:52 --> 00:25:55:	it's happened. I mean, there are examples across the city
00:25:55 --> 00:25:56:	of it happening,
00:25:56 --> 00:25:58:	and I think one thing that we could do,
00:25:58 --> 00:26:01:	either at the Commonwealth level or potentially the state level
00:26:01 --> 00:26:02:	is talk about some sort of.
00:26:02 --> 00:26:05:	Of liability shield there for the Arceo is when their
00:26:05 --> 00:26:06:	negotiating in good faith.
00:26:06 --> 00:26:08:	If folks are negotiating in bad faith or doing something
00:26:08 --> 00:26:09:	otherwise inappropriate,
00:26:09 --> 00:26:13:	that separate. Anne. Somewhere in the chat,
00:26:13 --> 00:26:17:	Sandy, I think mentioned that Cpas only come up when
00:26:17 --> 00:26:19:	developers run into a zoning block.
00:26:19 --> 00:26:21:	Generally speaking, in my experience,
00:26:21 --> 00:26:24:	I think that's true, but not universal,
00:26:24 --> 00:26:27:	right? So certainly one of the items that the the
00:26:27 --> 00:26:30:	community can negotiate around is you need zoning relief.
00:26:30 --> 00:26:34:	We would like you know these things for the community.
00:26:34 --> 00:26:36:	That's very simple and I think you're right,
00:26:36 --> 00:26:40:	that's what the typical circumstance would would entail.

00:26:40 --> 00:26:42:	However, you know it's not a CPA.
00:26:42 --> 00:26:46:	But we just recently in our neighborhood had had a
00:26:46 --> 00:26:47:	building.
00:26:47 --> 00:26:52:	It actually got some publicity from Inga Saffron in The
00:26:52 --> 00:26:59:	Enquirer around tearing down of historically aesthetically looking rowhome doctors
00:26:59 --> 00:26:59:	row.
00:26:59 --> 00:27:03:	And we contacted the developer through Councilman Johnson's office an.
00:27:03 --> 00:27:06:	They've come back and revise the plants so I would,
00:27:06 --> 00:27:09:	even if there's a buy right project that would encourage
00:27:09 --> 00:27:11:	our CEOs to contact the developer utilizing.
00:27:11 --> 00:27:13:	I hope it's OK for me to say this Council
00:27:13 --> 00:27:14:	member,
00:27:14 --> 00:27:17:	but utilized your Council members offices to facilitate that.
00:27:17 --> 00:27:20:	'cause I think that there are developers out there.
00:27:20 --> 00:27:23:	In fact, in my experience the majority of developers that
00:27:23 --> 00:27:26:	will sit down and listen and they really do want
00:27:26 --> 00:27:29:	to do something that the Community wants within reason.
00:27:29 --> 00:27:32:	And so I think you can go down this path
00:27:32 --> 00:27:35:	even if you don't have a zoning block and then
00:27:35 --> 00:27:36:	enforce ability.
00:27:36 --> 00:27:38:	Someone raised that you know,
00:27:38 --> 00:27:43:	legally speaking, I think enforceability is something that remains to
00:27:43 --> 00:27:43:	be seen,
00:27:43 --> 00:27:47:	and hopefully we don't see litigation over these at a
00:27:47 --> 00:27:48:	very high level,
00:27:48 --> 00:27:52:	which is where you would really get a significant court
00:27:52 --> 00:27:53:	decision.
00:27:53 --> 00:27:55:	Detailing that parameters of enforceability,
00:27:55 --> 00:27:57:	I hope we don't get there and I think you
00:27:57 --> 00:28:00:	know to David's point a moment ago developers don't enter
00:28:00 --> 00:28:02:	into these agreements looking to breach them.
00:28:02 --> 00:28:04:	I don't believe I think they enter into these agreements
00:28:05 --> 00:28:07:	trying to expedite their projects in a way that's going
00:28:07 --> 00:28:07:	to.
00:28:07 --> 00:28:09:	If we're being honest, you know,
00:28:09 --> 00:28:12:	make them money and get something up for the community
00:28:12 --> 00:28:14:	and the community is entering these agreements.
00:28:14 --> 00:28:17:	Obviously 'cause they want to get benefits that are laid
00:28:17 --> 00:28:18:	out in the agreement.

00:28:18 --> 00:28:20:	So I'm hopeful that we don't have to test enforceability.
00:28:20 --> 00:28:23:	'cause I do think in my experience both parties enter
00:28:23 --> 00:28:25:	into the agreements in good faith.
00:28:25 --> 00:28:28:	An, but I will concede that it is something that
00:28:28 --> 00:28:28:	is,
00:28:28 --> 00:28:32:	I think, relatively untested, at least in terms of what
00:28:32 --> 00:28:33:	I've looked at.
00:28:33 --> 00:28:36:	David, were you going to say something and then I'll
00:28:36 --> 00:28:38:	just ask one more question before Q&A,
00:28:38 --> 00:28:40:	go ahead.
00:28:40 --> 00:28:43:	I figure was going to say yeah,
00:28:43 --> 00:28:46:	it's the enforce ability is.
00:28:46 --> 00:28:48:	Um, it has been tested,
00:28:48 --> 00:28:50:	you know, but I think it's.
00:28:50 --> 00:28:54:	Reputationally we you know I think we enter into these
00:28:54 --> 00:28:55:	because.
00:28:55 --> 00:28:58:	I think most developers I can't speak for everybody,
00:28:58 --> 00:29:01:	but the goal is to have a long career in
00:29:01 --> 00:29:02:	a long relationship so.
00:29:02 --> 00:29:05:	The the idea of doing a CBA and going back
00:29:05 --> 00:29:08:	on that is what would ruin your career long term.
00:29:08 --> 00:29:10:	So I'm sure there's been examples of that,
00:29:10 --> 00:29:14:	but that's that's not I would say.
00:29:14 --> 00:29:15:	The intent going into most of these.
00:29:17 --> 00:29:21:	Against a final sort of way to sort of wrap
00:29:21 --> 00:29:25:	this up is to give our audience on a couple
00:29:25 --> 00:29:26:	of things.
00:29:26 --> 00:29:30:	Nolan, you mentioned a couple of things about CBS,
00:29:30 --> 00:29:34:	such as affordable housing and greenspace,
00:29:34 --> 00:29:38:	ascetics, women and minority contractors,
00:29:38 --> 00:29:42:	and an occupants in the commercial real estate.
00:29:42 --> 00:29:47:	What are some things that you know organizations can?
00:29:47 --> 00:29:50:	Lead into with developers in these conversations,
00:29:50 --> 00:29:51:	that sort of being an easy one,
00:29:51 --> 00:29:53:	as the Council members said,
00:29:53 --> 00:29:55:	they could have gotten a little bit more.
00:29:55 --> 00:29:57:	And what are the ones where it's like OK,
00:29:57 --> 00:29:59:	that's not going to happen so that people can,
00:29:59 --> 00:30:02:	I guess, sort of temper their expectations when sort of
00:30:02 --> 00:30:03:	entering into these agreements.
00:30:10 --> 00:30:13:	So here I went through the things that we had
00:30:13 --> 00:30:14:	in our agreements.

00:30:14 --> 00:30:18:	I did leave one thing out which David mentioned,
00:30:18 --> 00:30:21:	which is parking. We haven't really insisted on parking that
00:30:22 --> 00:30:25:	significantly exceeds the Washington Avenue I RMX standard.
00:30:25 --> 00:30:28:	But you know, we we do have parking in there.
00:30:28 --> 00:30:31:	The one thing that we.
00:30:31 --> 00:30:34:	You know, I honestly can't say we push for it
00:30:34 --> 00:30:35:	necessarily,
00:30:35 --> 00:30:37:	but the one thing that was kind of off the
00:30:37 --> 00:30:40:	table based on the amount of money that it costs
00:30:40 --> 00:30:43:	to buy land in the city was was affordable housing
00:30:43 --> 00:30:47:	that fell below a certain threshold of area median income.
00:30:47 --> 00:30:51:	What I would call true affordable housing.
00:30:51 --> 00:30:52:	We weren't able to, you know,
00:30:52 --> 00:30:55:	even kind of the first step towards that.
00:30:55 --> 00:30:58:	The affordable housing were able to negotiate around is,
00:30:58 --> 00:31:02:	I think what is typically referred to as workforce rate
00:31:02 --> 00:31:02:	housing.
00:31:02 --> 00:31:05:	It's about 60% of am I with the subsidy available
00:31:05 --> 00:31:06:	for utilities,
00:31:06 --> 00:31:09:	which was negotiated by a sister Arceo that we have
00:31:09 --> 00:31:11:	in our in our neighborhood,
00:31:11 --> 00:31:13:	the North Washington Ave coalition.
00:31:13 --> 00:31:15:	So that would be one thing I would say we
00:31:15 --> 00:31:17:	have not been able to get an and I do
00:31:17 --> 00:31:20:	understand the developers position here.
00:31:20 --> 00:31:23:	When you're paying the amount of money.
00:31:23 --> 00:31:25:	That you're paying for land in the city.
00:31:25 --> 00:31:28:	Plus you're paying the amount of money it costs to
00:31:28 --> 00:31:31:	build these large multi unit buildings.
00:31:31 --> 00:31:33:	I do think it becomes hard to provide,
00:31:33 --> 00:31:37:	you know, true low income housing even though our neighborhood
00:31:37 --> 00:31:39:	certainly needs it.
00:31:41 --> 00:31:45:	So affordable housing in high value areas essentially is going
00:31:45 --> 00:31:47:	to be the most difficult part.
00:31:47 --> 00:31:51:	Councilmember, I would say that's the most difficult part and
00:31:51 --> 00:31:52:	an you know.
00:31:52 --> 00:31:55:	Maybe the developers on the call won't like this,
00:31:55 --> 00:31:59:	but I think. I think if communities can often push
00:31:59 --> 00:32:03:	harder on that and stick to their guns an get
00:32:03 --> 00:32:05:	that I've been in,
00:32:05 --> 00:32:08:	you know so so not only do we help facilitate

00:32:08 --> 00:32:09:	cvas.
00:32:09 --> 00:32:14:	Oftentimes as a council member in discussions directly with developers
00:32:14 --> 00:32:15:	about,
00:32:15 --> 00:32:18:	you know what they you know would like to get
00:32:18 --> 00:32:22:	our buying for it or what they need our approval
00:32:22 --> 00:32:23:	for.
00:32:23 --> 00:32:26:	And I'm often pushing against affordability.
00:32:26 --> 00:32:28:	I find that in. You know,
00:32:28 --> 00:32:31:	particularly in the gentrifying areas of the third district,
00:32:31 --> 00:32:35:	the developers you know they don't want to include affordability
00:32:35 --> 00:32:35:	on site.
00:32:35 --> 00:32:38:	They rather pay and they rather like use the mixed
00:32:38 --> 00:32:40:	income housing bonus.
00:32:40 --> 00:32:43:	For example, when paying to the Housing Trust fund for
00:32:43 --> 00:32:43:	me,
00:32:43 --> 00:32:46:	we need the units were losing affordable housing,
00:32:46 --> 00:32:48:	so it's not good enough to have you know money
00:32:48 --> 00:32:52:	going to the Housing Trust fund that can support affordable
00:32:52 --> 00:32:55:	housing anywhere we need units in the neighborhood.
00:32:55 --> 00:32:57:	And I found when we stick to our guns and
00:32:57 --> 00:32:58:	when we say.
00:32:58 --> 00:33:00:	Well, you know it's a no go if you can't
00:33:00 --> 00:33:01:	do this,
00:33:01 --> 00:33:05:	we can often get further than what people originally come
00:33:05 --> 00:33:08:	to the table saying that they can do,
00:33:08 --> 00:33:11:	and so I encourage communities to push on that point
00:33:11 --> 00:33:15:	and to get at least a reasonable amount of affordable
00:33:15 --> 00:33:16:	housing.
00:33:16 --> 00:33:20:	True affordable housing that people in the in the community
00:33:20 --> 00:33:21:	can afford.
00:33:21 --> 00:33:25:	I also think that sometimes these discussions folks aren't thinking
00:33:25 --> 00:33:28:	creatively enough in these discussions,
00:33:28 --> 00:33:31:	so. As an example, we help negotiate a CBA for
00:33:31 --> 00:33:35:	our large project that was under construction already,
00:33:35 --> 00:33:39:	right? So they didn't really need anything from the community,
00:33:39 --> 00:33:43:	but the community was very unhappy with with the developers
00:33:43 --> 00:33:45:	and with the construction team.
00:33:45 --> 00:33:48:	And we went and they also had concerns about the

00:33:48 --> 00:33:49:	development,
00:33:49 --> 00:33:53:	like speeding on the road where the development was happening
00:33:53 --> 00:33:56:	and feeling like the development was going to bring more
00:33:56 --> 00:33:57:	traffic.
00:33:57 --> 00:34:00:	Well, we got the developers agreed to pay for safety.
00:34:00 --> 00:34:04:	For speed bumps, write an other sort of safety improvement,
00:34:04 --> 00:34:08:	and so if you really kind of have real discussions
00:34:08 --> 00:34:09:	and listen to each other,
00:34:09 --> 00:34:13:	you can sometimes come up with some creative solutions that
00:34:13 --> 00:34:14:	may not even be.
00:34:14 --> 00:34:18:	You know, a big deal for the developer to provide
00:34:18 --> 00:34:21:	that makes the community happy.
00:34:21 --> 00:34:24:	David, did you want to comment on things that are
00:34:24 --> 00:34:25:	on and off the table?
00:34:27 --> 00:34:30:	Um, you know, I, I don't want to stand in
00:34:30 --> 00:34:32:	for every developer in the city here.
00:34:32 --> 00:34:34:	No sure, no. No one does.
00:34:34 --> 00:34:36:	No one does.
00:34:36 --> 00:34:40:	But I think the affordability thing is is very challenging.
00:34:40 --> 00:34:42:	You know we're penciling out these projects.
00:34:42 --> 00:34:45:	What makes affordable housing possible?
00:34:45 --> 00:34:47:	Is density. More units, more numbers,
00:34:47 --> 00:34:51:	and most of our discussions with the community have been
00:34:51 --> 00:34:52:	about.
00:34:52 --> 00:34:54:	Getting families and homeowners in.
00:34:54 --> 00:34:57:	So we've shifted a lot of our developments from multifamily
00:34:57 --> 00:34:59:	to townhouses with parking,
00:34:59 --> 00:35:01:	and when you do that.
00:35:01 --> 00:35:04:	You kind of take the affordable housing part out of
00:35:04 --> 00:35:07:	it because you're slicing things as thin as you can
00:35:07 --> 00:35:09:	to to bring the unit count down.
00:35:09 --> 00:35:13:	Um? And the other thing that we battle in some
00:35:13 --> 00:35:17:	of these more fringe neighborhoods is there is this identity
00:35:17 --> 00:35:21:	of like home ownership and affordability and the idea of
00:35:21 --> 00:35:23:	apartments are really looked down upon.
00:35:23 --> 00:35:28:	There's definitely this people that participate in the Community meetings
00:35:29 --> 00:35:31:	are generally homeowners and.
00:35:31 --> 00:35:34:	Tenants and renters get vilified because they're not there and
00:35:34 --> 00:35:37:	they often don't have a chance to speak for themselves,
00:35:37 --> 00:35:39:	so I think it's tough to say like I want

00:35:39 --> 00:35:41:	to do in apartment building.
00:35:41 --> 00:35:45:	Because there's people that are that will rent this because
00:35:45 --> 00:35:49:	the people that are representing the Community groups for the
00:35:49 --> 00:35:51:	most part are homeowners.
00:35:51 --> 00:35:53:	So we listen to that and we've changed.
00:35:53 --> 00:35:58:	But it's definitely it's hard to do affordable housing.
00:35:58 --> 00:36:00:	Townhomes without any incentive structure.
00:36:00 --> 00:36:02:	We're still buying land at market rate.
00:36:02 --> 00:36:05:	We're still doing construction on Mercury.
00:36:05 --> 00:36:06:	It's hard to pencil in.
00:36:08 --> 00:36:11:	I agree on that point about renters.
00:36:11 --> 00:36:13:	There is sometimes, you know,
00:36:13 --> 00:36:17:	within neighborhoods a strong bias towards renters and the type
00:36:17 --> 00:36:21:	of neighborhood neighbors they'll be and how involved there they'll
00:36:21 --> 00:36:21:	be.
00:36:21 --> 00:36:24:	I'm a renter like I often have to say that
00:36:24 --> 00:36:27:	to people in community meetings to kind of dispel the
00:36:27 --> 00:36:31:	notion that renters are people who you know don't care
00:36:31 --> 00:36:33:	about the community at the same time,
00:36:33 --> 00:36:36:	though, I think a piece of that sentiment comes,
00:36:36 --> 00:36:38:	you know when in certain neighborhoods.
00:36:38 --> 00:36:42:	Rental is all that's being developed.
00:36:42 --> 00:36:45:	So in neighborhoods like Mantua.
00:36:45 --> 00:36:49:	Parts of of East Parkside you have vacant land and
00:36:49 --> 00:36:53:	you have developers only or coming in wanting to do
00:36:53 --> 00:36:57:	rental and people have a different vision for their community
00:36:57 --> 00:37:01:	that may include many types of housing and I think
00:37:01 --> 00:37:03:	that that sentiment is valid.
00:37:06 --> 00:37:10:	Um, I wanted to. We have so many questions in
00:37:10 --> 00:37:10:	the chat.
00:37:10 --> 00:37:14:	I wanted to get to some of those in the
00:37:14 --> 00:37:17:	time that we have we have about.
00:37:17 --> 00:37:20:	8 minutes to go through some of these questions all
00:37:20 --> 00:37:22:	kind of bundle them up.
00:37:22 --> 00:37:25:	Some of them are like logistical questions and so Council
00:37:25 --> 00:37:29:	member you mentioned someone in your office who does equitable
00:37:29 --> 00:37:31:	development 'cause she just restate.
00:37:31 --> 00:37:35:	Their name? Sure, Andrew Goodman in our office.
00:37:35 --> 00:37:38:	He's our director of Equitable Development,

00:37:38 --> 00:37:43:	and that's very purposeful. Equitable development is like my main
00:37:43 --> 00:37:44:	agenda,
00:37:44 --> 00:37:48:	and I want everyone in our communities to benefit from
00:37:48 --> 00:37:52:	all of the assets in all the development that's happening.
00:37:52 --> 00:37:56:	And so his main job is to.
00:37:56 --> 00:37:59:	To make sure that we have a place based strategy
00:37:59 --> 00:38:01:	that's designed for equity,
00:38:01 --> 00:38:05:	he spends a lot of time in these discussions with
00:38:05 --> 00:38:10:	developers and with community members making sure that our residents
00:38:10 --> 00:38:11:	are are represented.
00:38:11 --> 00:38:16:	Most folks and in Council with most District Council members
00:38:16 --> 00:38:18:	do have people who work on zoning,
00:38:18 --> 00:38:22:	but I thought it was very important to have an
00:38:22 --> 00:38:26:	urban planner in the role just with with everything with
00:38:26 --> 00:38:26:	the.
00:38:26 --> 00:38:28:	Amount in in the piece of development that we have
00:38:28 --> 00:38:29:	in the district.
00:38:31 --> 00:38:36:	In jail and there are a couple of other council
00:38:37 --> 00:38:38:	offices that have.
00:38:38 --> 00:38:42:	Planners in them that are focused on engaging with our
00:38:42 --> 00:38:45:	CEO's and so that sort of differs for every Council
00:38:45 --> 00:38:45:	office.
00:38:45 --> 00:38:47:	There's not like a standard,
00:38:47 --> 00:38:51:	certainly not equitable development person in every Council office,
00:38:51 --> 00:38:54:	but there are usually someone who deals with land use
00:38:54 --> 00:38:55:	issues.
00:38:55 --> 00:38:59:	Anne and you can check the Council Members website for
00:38:59 --> 00:39:03:	that information with her staff email list.
00:39:03 --> 00:39:09:	Talking a little bit. Many of the questions also concern
00:39:09 --> 00:39:15:	issues of legal language enforcement oversight and accountability.
00:39:15 --> 00:39:18:	And Nolan, I'll just sort of pop this over to
00:39:18 --> 00:39:18:	you.
00:39:18 --> 00:39:22:	Did you all just sort of Google like CBA agreements
00:39:22 --> 00:39:24:	and find like some boilerplate language?
00:39:24 --> 00:39:27:	Or how did you get some of that resources from?
00:39:27 --> 00:39:30:	Yeah, that's a good question akyra.
00:39:30 --> 00:39:32:	It would take a lot of work honestly.
00:39:32 --> 00:39:35:	So there were a number of folks on our board
00:39:35 --> 00:39:38:	who were intimately involved in this.

00:39:38 --> 00:39:42:	We talked to Councilmember Johnson's office and got some guidance
00:39:42 --> 00:39:43:	from them.
00:39:43 --> 00:39:44:	We talked to council members,
00:39:44 --> 00:39:48:	Will's office and got some guidance from them.
00:39:48 --> 00:39:51:	Actually saw someone at the beginning.
00:39:51 --> 00:39:55:	You had logged in from the Philadelphia Chinatown CDC.
00:39:55 --> 00:39:59:	We gotta example from them of a community that had
00:39:59 --> 00:40:03:	said that agreement that they had used in Chinatown.
00:40:03 --> 00:40:06:	I talked to folks from CHOP and I talked to
00:40:06 --> 00:40:08:	folks who had negotiated.
00:40:08 --> 00:40:11:	I think it was NKCDC
00:40:11 --> 00:40:13:	I could be wrong about that.
00:40:13 --> 00:40:15:	Well, I definitely thought down CCDC,
00:40:15 --> 00:40:18:	but then I also talked to some of the folks
00:40:18 --> 00:40:23:	who negotiated the Sugarhouse Casino Community Benefits Agreement an that
00:40:23 --> 00:40:24:	was all great.
00:40:24 --> 00:40:27:	Out of the stuff wasn't like as I mentioned at
00:40:27 --> 00:40:27:	the top,
00:40:27 --> 00:40:30:	it wasn't particularly useful for our,
00:40:30 --> 00:40:32:	you know, very. Small ish,
00:40:32 --> 00:40:34:	you know. Compared to those projects,
00:40:34 --> 00:40:36:	developments. At the same token,
00:40:36 --> 00:40:40:	both of the CBS CBS we've negotiated are for projects
00:40:40 --> 00:40:43:	bigger than the projects that David has described.
00:40:43 --> 00:40:47:	He's negotiated CBS for, so there's a wide range of
00:40:47 --> 00:40:49:	things here that.
00:40:49 --> 00:40:51:	That would work. There's also a lot of resources online,
00:40:51 --> 00:40:53:	accurate to your point about Googling.
00:40:53 --> 00:40:55:	I don't want to minimize that an.
00:40:55 --> 00:40:58:	Ann and I think.
00:40:58 --> 00:41:00:	You know someone just wrote in the chat.
00:41:00 --> 00:41:02:	How can someone get examples of CBS?
00:41:02 --> 00:41:03:	I would reach out it.
00:41:03 --> 00:41:05:	I think it's pretty. It was pretty easy for us
00:41:05 --> 00:41:07:	to identify the RC's that have done these before.
00:41:07 --> 00:41:10:	And if anyone wants to reach out to.
00:41:10 --> 00:41:14:	To me I'm happy with my copies of the ones
00:41:14 --> 00:41:19:	we've done it sasna an my email is **** I'm
00:41:19 --> 00:41:21:	happy to share those.
00:41:21 --> 00:41:23:	And I think there's also a bunch available,

00:41:23 --> 00:41:26:	but you just reach out to various CCS or ICO
00:41:26 --> 00:41:28:	throughout the city that have done that and we were
00:41:28 --> 00:41:30:	able to get a kind of a bunch of 'em
00:41:30 --> 00:41:32:	that we were able to use examples,
00:41:32 --> 00:41:34:	but it did take a lot of work an and
00:41:34 --> 00:41:37:	again I think that goes to the capacity point that
00:41:37 --> 00:41:40:	the Council member made earlier in the in the panel.
00:41:44 --> 00:41:47:	Think, yeah, um, another sort of major question,
00:41:47 --> 00:41:50:	of course, is about enforcement and the role of the
00:41:50 --> 00:41:54:	city and sort of managing both the expectations of the
00:41:54 --> 00:41:54:	Community.
00:41:54 --> 00:41:58:	We had a really good question about the scale and
00:41:58 --> 00:41:58:	scope of CBS,
00:41:58 --> 00:42:02:	how the Brandywine is obviously going to be different than
00:42:02 --> 00:42:04:	the ones that David engages in.
00:42:04 --> 00:42:08:	It's different than the ones that's awesome engages in,
00:42:08 --> 00:42:10:	but thinking also.
00:42:10 --> 00:42:13:	You know how can we manage the expectations of the
00:42:13 --> 00:42:18:	community of developers and then talking about enforcement,
00:42:18 --> 00:42:22:	our developers entering into these things to get good press
00:42:22 --> 00:42:26:	and move through the process or communities.
00:42:26 --> 00:42:29:	Being too aggressive is the city being too passive or
00:42:29 --> 00:42:30:	too aggressive,
00:42:30 --> 00:42:33:	so those are all sort of.
00:42:33 --> 00:42:36:	Things that we have to balance in these discussions have
00:42:36 --> 00:42:40:	both encouraging development in the city while also making sure
00:42:40 --> 00:42:41:	we don't displace,
00:42:41 --> 00:42:43:	and that's for the last 15 years,
00:42:43 --> 00:42:46:	20 years. At least. That's been a major issue in
00:42:46 --> 00:42:48:	the City of development without displacement,
00:42:48 --> 00:42:51:	but I also do think David brings a good point
00:42:51 --> 00:42:54:	about like what sort of development like yes there and
00:42:54 --> 00:42:58:	there was someone in the chat that mentioned about East
00:42:58 --> 00:43:01:	Parkside being 70% rental housing and how there's a ton
00:43:01 --> 00:43:03:	of rental housing there and we are.
00:43:03 --> 00:43:05:	We used to be. City of homeowners.
00:43:05 --> 00:43:08:	But that is changing. So how do you kind of
00:43:08 --> 00:43:12:	navigate the types of development that people want in their
00:43:12 --> 00:43:14:	community and those tensions?
00:43:14 --> 00:43:17:	I don't expect an answer to that question which would
00:43:17 --> 00:43:18:	solve 90%

00:43:18 --> 00:43:20:	of my problems in planning,
00:43:20 --> 00:43:21:	but someone has some ideas.
00:43:24 --> 00:43:26:	So Akira, from my perspective.
00:43:26 --> 00:43:29:	I mean, I think most folks are aware that they
00:43:29 --> 00:43:33:	are the Graduate Hospital South South neighborhood,
00:43:33 --> 00:43:37:	gentrified very, very rapidly over the last 20 years.
00:43:37 --> 00:43:39:	And so we've.
00:43:39 --> 00:43:40:	We've had to deal with that,
00:43:40 --> 00:43:43:	and you know, I don't know how good of a
00:43:43 --> 00:43:46:	job we've done as a neighborhood dealing with it to
00:43:46 --> 00:43:46:	be honest,
00:43:46 --> 00:43:49:	but I do think that one of the things we
00:43:49 --> 00:43:50:	learned in this process,
00:43:50 --> 00:43:53:	especially from our first effort at a CBA which didn't
00:43:53 --> 00:43:55:	result in a successful CBA,
00:43:55 --> 00:43:57:	is that you you really do have to get out
00:43:57 --> 00:44:00:	and do the kind of the shoe leather work of
00:44:00 --> 00:44:01:	community engagement you have to.
00:44:01 --> 00:44:05:	You have to work to get the community to understand
00:44:05 --> 00:44:06:	what you're trying to do.
00:44:06 --> 00:44:08:	And how it's going to impact them,
00:44:08 --> 00:44:11:	if at all? And why you think that the items
00:44:11 --> 00:44:14:	that you're pushing for in the CBA are going to
00:44:14 --> 00:44:15:	be helpful to them?
00:44:15 --> 00:44:18:	You know, one of the items that I think I
00:44:18 --> 00:44:19:	even overlook,
00:44:19 --> 00:44:22:	but I think maybe even the most important item that
00:44:22 --> 00:44:24:	we've negotiated in the CBA's,
00:44:24 --> 00:44:27:	and I think it's often one that the developer is
00:44:27 --> 00:44:28:	happy to do.
00:44:28 --> 00:44:32:	Is an agreement a commitment to connect the Arceo to
00:44:32 --> 00:44:36:	the commercial tenants that are going to come into a
00:44:36 --> 00:44:40:	development that has commercial space in it and work to
00:44:40 --> 00:44:46:	get folks in the Community jobs at those commercial spaces?
00:44:46 --> 00:44:50:	I think jobs an availability opportunity is so important,
00:44:50 --> 00:44:52:	especially in neighborhoods that are,
00:44:52 --> 00:44:57:	you know, going through those types of demographic changes.
00:44:57 --> 00:44:59:	An you know I'm pretty proud of some of the
00:44:59 --> 00:45:02:	places that we've gotten commitments you know to work with,
00:45:02 --> 00:45:05:	uh, you know our neighborhood groups to connect.

00:45:05 --> 00:45:08:	Folks looking for work for good jobs in our neighborhood
00:45:08 --> 00:45:09:	based on development.
00:45:09 --> 00:45:13:	And I think that can be a real win win.
00:45:13 --> 00:45:15:	And I think it offsets some of the things that
00:45:16 --> 00:45:18:	I think the Council member rightly pointed to about.
00:45:18 --> 00:45:21:	True affordable housing Ann and I don't want to be
00:45:21 --> 00:45:22:	here to say that.
00:45:22 --> 00:45:24:	You know, community shouldn't push for that.
00:45:24 --> 00:45:27:	They should, especially if that's what the community wants.
00:45:27 --> 00:45:30:	But I do think there are real hurdles,
00:45:30 --> 00:45:34:	real challenges to developers being able to provide that.
00:45:34 --> 00:45:39:	Um? I think that I think that the community,
00:45:39 --> 00:45:44:	the developers in the city play a role in making
00:45:44 --> 00:45:51:	sure that the Community benefits agreement is actually implemented.
00:45:51 --> 00:45:54:	I'm I'm in my I just crossed my first year
00:45:54 --> 00:45:57:	in office so some of the things that we did
00:45:57 --> 00:45:57:	are,
00:45:57 --> 00:46:00:	you know I'm going to be seeing them come to
00:46:00 --> 00:46:01:	fruition,
00:46:01 --> 00:46:04:	but I plan to play an active role in making
00:46:04 --> 00:46:07:	sure that the agreements are are implemented.
00:46:07 --> 00:46:10:	And also you know when trying to come up with
00:46:10 --> 00:46:11:	CBA agreements,
00:46:11 --> 00:46:15:	we've been thoughtful or try to be thoughtful about who
00:46:15 --> 00:46:19:	would administer those agreements from the community.
00:46:19 --> 00:46:24:	Anan in the hopes that that organization has the capacity.
00:46:24 --> 00:46:27:	I think that a lot of these discussions are going
00:46:27 --> 00:46:30:	to continue to be tailored to neighborhoods.
00:46:30 --> 00:46:32:	The affordability piece of it.
00:46:32 --> 00:46:36:	I'm hoping to see more public policy that that focus
00:46:36 --> 00:46:38:	on that focuses on that part.
00:46:38 --> 00:46:41:	I personally with the pace of development that we have
00:46:41 --> 00:46:42:	in the district,
00:46:42 --> 00:46:46:	I personally find it exhausting to be in a million
00:46:46 --> 00:46:50:	different conversations and trying to force the issue of affordable
00:46:50 --> 00:46:51:	housing.
00:46:51 --> 00:46:53:	I would like to see us have.
00:46:53 --> 00:46:58:	Mandatory inclusionary zoning that says that there there has to
00:46:58 --> 00:47:01:	be a level of affordability in development on sites.
00:47:01 --> 00:47:05:	I would like to see us use publicly owned vacant

00:47:05 --> 00:47:09:	land more effectively towards you know housing that will be
00:47:09 --> 00:47:11:	affordable truly for the community.
00:47:11 --> 00:47:13:	So some of these things.
00:47:13 --> 00:47:17:	I'm hoping I think government has a responsibility to really
00:47:17 --> 00:47:20:	push on so that we're not having all of these
00:47:20 --> 00:47:24:	individual conversations that May or may not pan out.
00:47:27 --> 00:47:28:	Thank you David. Go ahead,
00:47:28 --> 00:47:31:	no, I was just saying I think I think a
00:47:31 --> 00:47:33:	lot of developers would get behind,
00:47:33 --> 00:47:37:	you know, some type of mandatory CBA for projects over.
00:47:37 --> 00:47:40:	You know, modest size because it's it's a known factor
00:47:40 --> 00:47:42:	that we're dealing with.
00:47:42 --> 00:47:43:	You know it is challenging.
00:47:43 --> 00:47:47:	We go into this and you don't know where the
00:47:47 --> 00:47:50:	requests are going to go and it can go.
00:47:50 --> 00:47:54:	From a healthy discussion towards you know.
00:47:54 --> 00:47:56:	To two wins battling, but I think if you can
00:47:57 --> 00:47:59:	go into a project and a piece of land you
00:47:59 --> 00:48:00:	know your costs.
00:48:00 --> 00:48:03:	What you don't know is where the CBA is going
00:48:03 --> 00:48:03:	to end up.
00:48:03 --> 00:48:05:	So if there were something set at,
00:48:05 --> 00:48:07:	you know at the citywide level.
00:48:07 --> 00:48:10:	It's it allows us to know what we're getting into,
00:48:10 --> 00:48:13:	and I think that would help a lot of people,
00:48:13 --> 00:48:16:	and it would save a lot of stress for councilpersons
00:48:16 --> 00:48:17:	community groups.
00:48:17 --> 00:48:19:	And you know, for us.
00:48:19 --> 00:48:21:	But it would also streamline.
00:48:21 --> 00:48:23:	You know this for everybody,
00:48:23 --> 00:48:29:	so I don't see that being something that developers oppose.
00:48:29 --> 00:48:32:	Thank you David, that was as close to an agreement
00:48:32 --> 00:48:35:	across all stakeholders that we're going to get.
00:48:35 --> 00:48:36:	So let's end on a high note.
00:48:36 --> 00:48:40:	I apologize that we didn't get to everyones questions in
00:48:40 --> 00:48:41:	the chat,
00:48:41 --> 00:48:44:	let I encourage you to join and support your CEOs
00:48:44 --> 00:48:47:	an engage with your Council members on these topics so
00:48:47 --> 00:48:51:	that we can move forward into more sustainable and enforceable.
00:48:51 --> 00:48:53:	CBS and I will turn it back to Laura.
00:48:53 --> 00:48:56:	Thank you. Wonderful thank you so much to all of

00:48:56 --> 00:49:00:	our panelists to Doctor Rodriguez and all of you for
00:49:00 --> 00:49:04:	submitting so many really important and interesting questions.
00:49:04 --> 00:49:08:	The conversation obviously is much longer than the time that
00:49:08 --> 00:49:09:	we have allocated,
00:49:09 --> 00:49:12:	so I really do hope that you will continue to
00:49:12 --> 00:49:16:	engage with us and your organ in your local organizations
00:49:16 --> 00:49:20:	around these topics that were just talking about today.
00:49:20 --> 00:49:22:	So now I would like to switch gears.
00:49:22 --> 00:49:26:	We're going to hear from 2 presenters who will give.
00:49:26 --> 00:49:29:	Very specific examples of community engagement,
00:49:29 --> 00:49:32:	one in Philadelphia and one coming to us from Atlanta,
00:49:32 --> 00:49:35:	GA. So first we will hear from Tyrone Rashal,
00:49:35 --> 00:49:38:	president of Urban Key Capital Partners and member of the
00:49:38 --> 00:49:39:	UI public,
00:49:39 --> 00:49:42:	Private Private Partnership, National Product Council.
00:49:42 --> 00:49:46:	Tyrone will share trends on the public sector's role in
00:49:46 --> 00:49:51:	encouraging inclusive development and updated principles for community engagement.
00:49:51 --> 00:49:54:	So Tyrone, I will pass things to you and a
00:49:54 --> 00:49:55:	reminder again,
00:49:55 --> 00:49:56:	will hear from 2 steak.
00:49:56 --> 00:49:59:	Those two presenters and then we will take questions again
00:49:59 --> 00:50:01:	from the chat at the end of that time,
00:50:01 --> 00:50:05:	so please feel free to continue that discussion so.
00:50:05 --> 00:50:08:	Tyrone, thanks Laura. Good morning everybody.
00:50:08 --> 00:50:11:	Hope everybody is well. Greetings from Atlanta,
00:50:11 --> 00:50:15:	GA. I realized that we're already behind in the schedule,
00:50:15 --> 00:50:18:	so I will make my thoughts quickly.
00:50:18 --> 00:50:20:	But really I am Tyrone Rochelle.
00:50:20 --> 00:50:23:	I am a private sector consultant now but at one
00:50:23 --> 00:50:27:	point in time I ran redevelopment for the City of
00:50:27 --> 00:50:32:	Atlanta through our development authority called investment Lana,
00:50:32 --> 00:50:36:	which is really the mechanism for negotiating complex public private.
00:50:36 --> 00:50:40:	Partnerships and I want to couch this in the context
00:50:40 --> 00:50:44:	of public private partnerships because typically when CBA is come up,
00:50:44 --> 00:50:44:	up,
00:50:44 --> 00:50:48:	you're really talking about an instance where a private developer
00:50:48 --> 00:50:51:	is receiving some type of incentive from the public sector

00:50:51 --> 00:50:55:	which creates the need for an agreement for how benefits
00:50:55 --> 00:50:58:	would be spread. And I think that's reasonable,
00:50:58 --> 00:51:01:	right? If you're getting something in exchange for providing a
00:51:01 --> 00:51:03:	public good and service,
00:51:03 --> 00:51:06:	there should be an agreement around how that works.
00:51:06 --> 00:51:09:	Whether or not the incentive is necessary and if it's
00:51:09 --> 00:51:11:	achieving the goals that I mean,
00:51:11 --> 00:51:15:	it's municipality would have, so I think that's appropriate company
00:51:15 --> 00:51:17:	to advance to the next slide please.
00:51:17 --> 00:51:19:	And I started this as an activist,
00:51:19 --> 00:51:21:	so I wasn't your typical government bureaucrat.
00:51:21 --> 00:51:23:	I'm gonna lawyer investment banker,
00:51:23 --> 00:51:26:	and I lived in a community in Atlanta that was
00:51:26 --> 00:51:29:	being impacted by a large public private partnership called the
00:51:29 --> 00:51:30:	Atlanta Beltline.
00:51:30 --> 00:51:33:	And I wanted to be involved in the conversation and
00:51:33 --> 00:51:36:	I was appointed to an advisory committee with 45 of
00:51:36 --> 00:51:37:	my closest friends.
00:51:37 --> 00:51:39:	First of all, never do that.
00:51:39 --> 00:51:42:	45 people to get into a room to negotiate anything
00:51:42 --> 00:51:43:	is chaos,
00:51:43 --> 00:51:45:	and these were from you know,
00:51:45 --> 00:51:48:	two dozen different neighborhoods around the city.
00:51:48 --> 00:51:52:	So, but what I would like to talk about is
00:51:52 --> 00:51:53:	how these P3.
00:51:53 --> 00:51:57:	Arrangements are evolving, and particularly where we talk about producing
00:51:57 --> 00:51:58:	public benefit.
00:51:58 --> 00:52:00:	If you could go to the next slide,
00:52:00 --> 00:52:02:	please, and the way they're involving,
00:52:02 --> 00:52:06:	we really think about the public sector and the private
00:52:06 --> 00:52:06:	sector.
00:52:06 --> 00:52:08:	Is these two homogeneous institutions,
00:52:08 --> 00:52:11:	and they're not right. So these models that have been
00:52:11 --> 00:52:14:	in an action for decades now that they're changing,
00:52:14 --> 00:52:18:	particularly when resources are constrained and the projects that are
00:52:18 --> 00:52:21:	really trying to provide public goods and services that need
00:52:22 --> 00:52:22:	resources right,
00:52:22 --> 00:52:26:	affordable housing. But like I heard one of the Palace
00:52:26 --> 00:52:29:	say it doesn't pencil out in certain communities where land

00:52:29 --> 00:52:30:	costs is hard,
00:52:30 --> 00:52:33:	right? And you're trying to drive affordability down to 3050%
00:52:33 --> 00:52:36:	am eyes. It just doesn't happen with some type of
00:52:36 --> 00:52:36:	help.
00:52:36 --> 00:52:39:	And we called that help incentive that I and the
00:52:39 --> 00:52:42:	first point that I'd like to say is an incentive
00:52:42 --> 00:52:43:	is not a giveaway.
00:52:43 --> 00:52:47:	I would encourage municipalities or think of incentives as investments
00:52:47 --> 00:52:50:	in future benefits that would not have happened otherwise,
00:52:50 --> 00:52:53:	and that could be affordable housing that could be parks
00:52:54 --> 00:52:55:	and green space that could be.
00:52:55 --> 00:52:59:	Increasing opportunities for job creation and small business growth.
00:52:59 --> 00:53:02:	All of those things come into play in Atlanta.
00:53:02 --> 00:53:05:	I'm very proud of how progressive our City has been
00:53:06 --> 00:53:06:	around this.
00:53:06 --> 00:53:10:	In fact, it's been so progressive that we just created
00:53:10 --> 00:53:12:	our first citywide economic mobility plan,
00:53:12 --> 00:53:17:	which intentionally economic mobility because it's not just talking about
00:53:17 --> 00:53:19:	one input being affordable housing,
00:53:19 --> 00:53:21:	but it's talking about how job quality,
00:53:21 --> 00:53:23:	job creation and access occurs.
00:53:23 --> 00:53:26:	Where do we spend our money right on?
00:53:26 --> 00:53:30:	Affordable housing, can it be affordable to folks that have
00:53:30 --> 00:53:33:	to travel is in their job centers very important because
00:53:33 --> 00:53:36:	if I gotta now commute 2 hours to get to
00:53:36 --> 00:53:39:	my job, I've lost some value right in time and
00:53:39 --> 00:53:41:	effort and energy,
00:53:41 --> 00:53:44:	but the biggest point that I would take here is
00:53:44 --> 00:53:45:	that.
00:53:45 --> 00:53:50:	These these agreements get difficult because they happen.
00:53:50 --> 00:53:52:	From a transactional standpoint, right?
00:53:52 --> 00:53:55:	I mean what that's going to be the toughest agreement
00:53:55 --> 00:53:57:	where I'm doing something.
00:53:57 --> 00:54:01:	You want something else. We've already made investment and their
00:54:01 --> 00:54:02:	transactions are one off.
00:54:02 --> 00:54:04:	So what we've tried to do in it here in
00:54:04 --> 00:54:07:	Atlanta is take away the focus on one off transactional
00:54:07 --> 00:54:11:	deals and look at this from a holistic perspective of
00:54:11 --> 00:54:14:	community engagement and plan these benefits out before

	there is
00:54:14 --> 00:54:15:	a project,
00:54:15 --> 00:54:19:	right? Because we all know that in these community organizations
00:54:19 --> 00:54:22:	there there are handful of people that drive the discussion
00:54:22 --> 00:54:22:	and.
00:54:22 --> 00:54:26:	Oftentimes, I question whether those five people represent the interest
00:54:26 --> 00:54:28:	of any particular community,
00:54:28 --> 00:54:30:	so we want to hear everyone's voice up front.
00:54:30 --> 00:54:33:	I'm gonna fly through this quickly so next slide,
00:54:33 --> 00:54:36:	please. This is really what I'm trying to get to.
00:54:36 --> 00:54:39:	We really been talking about in our Council at ULI.
00:54:39 --> 00:54:42:	We got 100 people nationally that look at these stories
00:54:42 --> 00:54:43:	from all across the country.
00:54:43 --> 00:54:46:	And we've always concentrated on this public sector.
00:54:46 --> 00:54:50:	Being the government, private sector being the big bad developer,
00:54:50 --> 00:54:52:	right? And it's just not true,
00:54:52 --> 00:54:54:	it's more sophisticated. In that particular,
00:54:54 --> 00:54:58:	when you're talking about investing in distressed areas that don't
00:54:58 --> 00:55:00:	normally attract traditional forms of capital,
00:55:00 --> 00:55:02:	right? So the South side of our city.
00:55:02 --> 00:55:06:	If there weren't partnerships that help create incentives to do
00:55:06 --> 00:55:07:	certain things,
00:55:07 --> 00:55:09:	you would have no development at all,
00:55:09 --> 00:55:11:	because it's just harder to do so.
00:55:11 --> 00:55:13:	We gotta add the people into this,
00:55:13 --> 00:55:16:	and it seems like a presumption that the public sector
00:55:16 --> 00:55:17:	and the people are the same.
00:55:17 --> 00:55:19:	I would posit to you today or not,
00:55:19 --> 00:55:22:	the public sector should represent the interest of all the
00:55:22 --> 00:55:23:	people,
00:55:23 --> 00:55:25:	but it's more complex. Then saying,
00:55:25 --> 00:55:29:	hey, development authority going to this backroom and do what's
00:55:29 --> 00:55:30:	best for us.
00:55:30 --> 00:55:32:	I just don't think that works for anyone,
00:55:32 --> 00:55:35:	so why not include what the people think early in
00:55:35 --> 00:55:38:	the process before you embark on any type of master
00:55:38 --> 00:55:38:	plan.
00:55:38 --> 00:55:42:	Right now we know that you can't plan everything right.

00:55:42 --> 00:55:44:	Some projects pop up that don't need any type of
00:55:44 --> 00:55:47:	rezoning or need any type of subsidy from the city,
00:55:47 --> 00:55:49:	so those are as of right there,
00:55:49 --> 00:55:52:	other mechanisms to make those go the way that you
00:55:52 --> 00:55:53:	need to.
00:55:53 --> 00:55:56:	But I would argue that that is an important factor.
00:55:56 --> 00:55:59:	In this next slide, please.
00:55:59 --> 00:56:02:	Then I'll get to the nonprofit and philanthropic sectors in
00:56:02 --> 00:56:03:	a bit.
00:56:03 --> 00:56:05:	But really, this is kind of the point.
00:56:05 --> 00:56:09:	Let's focus on equitable development and driving equity through economic
00:56:09 --> 00:56:10:	mobility.
00:56:10 --> 00:56:13:	I think those are the most sustainable ways to impact
00:56:13 --> 00:56:15:	communities and make them better.
00:56:15 --> 00:56:18:	And I'm really talking about communities that don't get a
00:56:18 --> 00:56:20:	lot of investment at all,
00:56:20 --> 00:56:24:	right? And you're gonna see this already happening because cities
00:56:24 --> 00:56:26:	are strapped with resources,
00:56:26 --> 00:56:29:	right? So to be able to balance those resources across
00:56:29 --> 00:56:31:	different projects is going to.
00:56:31 --> 00:56:32:	Get off Please.
00:56:35 --> 00:56:37:	And I'll take these two together really,
00:56:37 --> 00:56:39:	when we're talking about distressed communities,
00:56:39 --> 00:56:42:	it isn't always the big bad developer,
00:56:42 --> 00:56:45:	right? You have nonprofit stakeholders that in some of my
00:56:45 --> 00:56:46:	communities drive projects,
00:56:46 --> 00:56:50:	right? They they are mission based entities that are looking
00:56:50 --> 00:56:52:	in the example of Covenant House Georgia.
00:56:52 --> 00:56:55:	They're trying to help homeless children from 16 to 24
00:56:55 --> 00:56:56:	years old.
00:56:56 --> 00:56:58:	They just did a project that I helped him close
00:56:59 --> 00:56:59:	last year.
00:56:59 --> 00:57:02:	That has tremendous benefits, not only for that community.
00:57:02 --> 00:57:05:	Before our city. And I would argue that.
00:57:05 --> 00:57:08:	Those risk return characteristics are different with these types of
00:57:08 --> 00:57:09:	sponsors,
00:57:09 --> 00:57:11:	so we have to acknowledge them,
00:57:11 --> 00:57:12:	and on the next slide,
00:57:12 --> 00:57:16:	many of the investors in these communities come from philanthropy,

00:57:16 --> 00:57:19:	right? So when we're talking about philanthropic investors,
00:57:19 --> 00:57:23:	there's a different metric that they're using to make investments
00:57:23 --> 00:57:26:	in some of these communities and their project underwriting is
00:57:26 --> 00:57:29:	different and benefit is not always about money.
00:57:29 --> 00:57:32:	Sometimes benefit includes things that you don't think you can
00:57:33 --> 00:57:33:	measure,
00:57:33 --> 00:57:35:	but I would posit that there is a way to.
00:57:35 --> 00:57:38:	Measure benefits from increased safety.
00:57:38 --> 00:57:43:	More affordable housing, more retail in a particular community doesn't
00:57:43 --> 00:57:43:	have it.
00:57:43 --> 00:57:46:	Next slide, please. Then I hear I'm out of time
00:57:46 --> 00:57:49:	so I will go quickly through these and this is
00:57:49 --> 00:57:52:	where I spend most of my time is really on
00:57:52 --> 00:57:56:	financial tools, right? And when you're dealing with municipal programs
00:57:56 --> 00:57:58:	that are either making grants,
00:57:58 --> 00:58:01:	property tax abatements, some type of value that is being
00:58:01 --> 00:58:04:	given from the public sector to the private sector,
00:58:04 --> 00:58:07:	that transfer of value should have the expectation of some
00:58:07 --> 00:58:10:	type of framework with the Community benefits,
00:58:10 --> 00:58:13:	right? That is the reason why we are doing the
00:58:13 --> 00:58:16:	deal then why there is a need for incentive.
00:58:16 --> 00:58:19:	I'll give 2 examples really quickly 'cause I know I'm
00:58:19 --> 00:58:20:	running out of time.
00:58:20 --> 00:58:23:	Next slide we have a very big one in our
00:58:23 --> 00:58:23:	city,
00:58:23 --> 00:58:26:	the Atlanta Beltline and I think I mentioned to you
00:58:26 --> 00:58:29:	before just a very hairy project that really has changed
00:58:29 --> 00:58:32:	our city and I think in the positive way.
00:58:32 --> 00:58:35:	But there are also some lessons learned that we had
00:58:35 --> 00:58:38:	because once you create a very valuable asset in your
00:58:38 --> 00:58:39:	city,
00:58:39 --> 00:58:42:	that value is noticed by developers that want to build
00:58:42 --> 00:58:43:	around it right?
00:58:43 --> 00:58:47:	So how do you anticipate that future growth knowing that?
00:58:47 --> 00:58:50:	What's your building is automatically creating value,
00:58:50 --> 00:58:51:	so it's not an issue of.
00:58:51 --> 00:58:53:	Value creation is valued transferring,
00:58:53 --> 00:58:57:	distribution, and all of these components were in our

	Community
00:58:57 --> 00:58:58:	benefits framework,
00:58:58 --> 00:59:00:	and I wouldn't call this a CBA.
00:59:00 --> 00:59:03:	It was a larger framework and then when future projects
00:59:03 --> 00:59:04:	come up,
00:59:04 --> 00:59:06:	there are project specific Cbas that happen.
00:59:06 --> 00:59:10:	But one example is we should bonds using tax increment
00:59:10 --> 00:59:13:	finance for this district in this district is large.
00:59:13 --> 00:59:16:	It's it's one of the largest tags tax allocation districts
00:59:16 --> 00:59:18:	we have in the city.
00:59:18 --> 00:59:20:	And the focus was affordable housing.
00:59:20 --> 00:59:22:	So 15% of all. Net Bond sees went into a
00:59:22 --> 00:59:26:	special fund that is used specifically to do mezzanine loan
00:59:26 --> 00:59:29:	product grant products to developers that are willing to do
00:59:29 --> 00:59:32:	affordable housing. So I won't go through that whole list
00:59:32 --> 00:59:36:	'cause I know I'm running longtime next slide please.
00:59:36 --> 00:59:38:	We just did this one last month and and all
00:59:38 --> 00:59:40:	of these aren't driven by the community,
00:59:40 --> 00:59:44:	right? Sometimes the lenders want to see these community benefits
00:59:45 --> 00:59:48:	qualified so particularly with the new markets tax credit.
00:59:48 --> 00:59:51:	Program where I've spent a lot of time and space.
00:59:51 --> 00:59:54:	The lender themselves and want to see these outcomes and
00:59:54 --> 00:59:57:	quantify them very specifically so that they can report to
00:59:57 --> 00:59:59:	the Department of Treasury.
00:59:59 --> 01:00:01:	Look at all the great things I did with my
01:00:01 --> 01:00:02:	allocation.
01:00:02 --> 01:00:05:	Now that I'm reapplying, I can repeat those outcomes and
01:00:05 --> 01:00:08:	there's a list of outcomes that was just in one
01:00:08 --> 01:00:12:	Community benefits agreement for a roughly 8.1 million dollar investment,
01:00:12 --> 01:00:14:	which isn't a huge investment in the city,
01:00:14 --> 01:00:16:	but I think it was a way to to to
01:00:16 --> 01:00:18:	get that going to just show that.
01:00:18 --> 01:00:21:	It isn't just the public or private sector or the
01:00:21 --> 01:00:25:	neighborhood associations that are driving this,
01:00:25 --> 01:00:28:	but this evolving set of stakeholders also have a role
01:00:28 --> 01:00:30:	in seeing these benefits realized.
01:00:30 --> 01:00:35:	With that Kevin, I will hold for comments and then
01:00:35 --> 01:00:37:	I'm next speaker get going.
01:00:37 --> 01:00:39:	Thank you so much, Tyrone.
01:00:39 --> 01:00:41:	Obviously a lot more we can learn from you.

01:00:41 --> 01:00:45:	So look forward to continuing this conversation at the end
01:00:45 --> 01:00:47:	so I will keep us moving.
01:00:47 --> 01:00:49:	Now I will turn it to Maria Sourbeer,
01:00:49 --> 01:00:53:	be our Vice President of development for Shift capital to
01:00:53 --> 01:00:57:	share a case study on the recently completed Philadelphia project.
01:00:57 --> 01:01:02:	Jason trial in Kensington and specifically how your project addressed
01:01:02 --> 01:01:05:	some of these issues around community engagement.
01:01:05 --> 01:01:06:	So go ahead and read it.
01:01:06 --> 01:01:11:	Hello, good morning. Um? So Jason trial,
01:01:11 --> 01:01:13:	you know, I was asked here,
01:01:13 --> 01:01:17:	I think because we didn't do it CVA on this
01:01:17 --> 01:01:17:	project.
01:01:17 --> 01:01:21:	But we did address a lot of community programming and
01:01:21 --> 01:01:24:	thinking through the process.
01:01:24 --> 01:01:27:	So I'm going to talk about Jason Shell,
01:01:27 --> 01:01:29:	which is a project in Kensington.
01:01:29 --> 01:01:32:	You can move to the next slide.
01:01:32 --> 01:01:36:	But first, I just wanted to introduce myself and I
01:01:36 --> 01:01:39:	am an architect by license and education.
01:01:39 --> 01:01:44:	But I came through. After architecture came through Akarere in
01:01:44 --> 01:01:48:	on the nonprofit side of real estate and so I
01:01:48 --> 01:01:49:	think.
01:01:49 --> 01:01:52:	That gives me a very different perspective,
01:01:52 --> 01:01:54:	an when shift was growing up,
01:01:54 --> 01:01:56:	I was one of the first hires,
01:01:56 --> 01:01:59:	I think because I look at things from an impact
01:01:59 --> 01:02:01:	driven community driven POV,
01:02:01 --> 01:02:04:	and maybe that's a little bit different than a typical
01:02:04 --> 01:02:05:	development,
01:02:05 --> 01:02:08:	so I'm definitely the one at the table saying,
01:02:08 --> 01:02:12:	well, you know, how's that moving the needle right?
01:02:12 --> 01:02:15:	How's that creating jobs? How's that you know,
01:02:15 --> 01:02:18:	doing the things that real estate from our perspective is
01:02:18 --> 01:02:19:	meant to do,
01:02:19 --> 01:02:23:	and so. That's sort of how it comes with these
01:02:23 --> 01:02:23:	things.
01:02:23 --> 01:02:24:	Next slide.
01:02:26 --> 01:02:30:	So just two minutes on shift where a place based,
01:02:30 --> 01:02:34:	mission driven organization. So we started doing real estate in,

01:02:34 --> 01:02:39:	specifically Northern Kensington, and so we have about 2 million
01:02:39 --> 01:02:43:	square feet of property in the Kensington neighborhood,
01:02:43 --> 01:02:46:	with the concept being if you focus all of your
01:02:46 --> 01:02:51:	energy in one neighborhood and diversifying your asset classes,
01:02:51 --> 01:02:56:	then potentially you're providing jobs in these large industrial buildings.
01:02:56 --> 01:02:59:	If you're providing jobs, ideally someone might want to live
01:03:00 --> 01:03:01:	near where they work,
01:03:01 --> 01:03:04:	and so we wanted to provide housing and the commercial
01:03:04 --> 01:03:06:	corridor is an important piece.
01:03:06 --> 01:03:08:	If you're going to live there and work there,
01:03:08 --> 01:03:10:	hopefully you want to shop there,
01:03:10 --> 01:03:13:	and those three things together sort of create.
01:03:13 --> 01:03:17:	Create a strong neighborhood and so you'll see here just
01:03:17 --> 01:03:19:	some snippets of what we've done.
01:03:19 --> 01:03:23:	So on the upper left that's making North that used
01:03:23 --> 01:03:24:	to be jomar.
01:03:24 --> 01:03:28:	Fabric San now it houses 60 about 60 small businesses
01:03:28 --> 01:03:31:	on the bottom left is where we're negotiating.
01:03:31 --> 01:03:34:	A CBA right now that's it's one one of our
01:03:34 --> 01:03:35:	projects.
01:03:35 --> 01:03:40:	Outside of Kensington, we have two projects outside Kensington and
01:03:40 --> 01:03:42:	that's on N Broad St Jumpstart.
01:03:42 --> 01:03:46:	Kensington is some program where we tried to provide education
01:03:46 --> 01:03:50:	for folks in the neighborhood that want to get into
01:03:50 --> 01:03:55:	development and learn about development and learn about real estate.
01:03:55 --> 01:03:58:	You know where the opinion that it takes a village
01:03:58 --> 01:04:01:	and that you know we want to help other people
01:04:01 --> 01:04:04:	take advantage and and and participate.
01:04:04 --> 01:04:08:	In the middle, there just quickly that was Kensington Storefront
01:04:08 --> 01:04:09:	Challenge,
01:04:09 --> 01:04:12:	which was us trying to brainstorm about how to reinvigorate
01:04:12 --> 01:04:14:	the commercial corridor.
01:04:14 --> 01:04:17:	We had a few properties that had commercial on the
01:04:17 --> 01:04:20:	ground floor and we were trying to think through how
01:04:20 --> 01:04:22:	to fill them and we had lots of ideas and
01:04:22 --> 01:04:25:	it occurred to us that we should open up that
01:04:25 --> 01:04:28:	thinking and so we ran a competition where we invited

01:04:28 --> 01:04:31:	people to think with us about what would work well
01:04:31 --> 01:04:35:	on that commercial corridor. And we offered a years free
01:04:35 --> 01:04:39:	rent and some dollars Tord tenant fit out and.
01:04:39 --> 01:04:41:	I can recall being very nervous that no one was
01:04:41 --> 01:04:42:	going to apply,
01:04:42 --> 01:04:44:	but we had about 30 applicants,
01:04:44 --> 01:04:47:	an nine awards, and it's taken a few years.
01:04:47 --> 01:04:48:	But so you know, we have,
01:04:48 --> 01:04:52:	I think seven of those businesses up and functioning now.
01:04:52 --> 01:04:53:	Next slide.
01:04:56 --> 01:04:58:	I think you can move to the next slide that
01:04:58 --> 01:04:58:	was,
01:04:58 --> 01:05:01:	you know, I was just saying we had the almost
01:05:01 --> 01:05:03:	2 million square feet of property there,
01:05:03 --> 01:05:05:	and that's sort of the statistics around it.
01:05:05 --> 01:05:08:	So Kensington, if you're not familiar with Kensington,
01:05:08 --> 01:05:10:	it is, uh, along the.
01:05:10 --> 01:05:14:	Public transit line. Jason Trelyn specific is about a block
01:05:14 --> 01:05:16:	from the Tioga station,
01:05:16 --> 01:05:19:	which is an 18 minute ride to City Hall,
01:05:19 --> 01:05:23:	half that to Fishtown, so it's very accessible and Jason
01:05:23 --> 01:05:26:	Trails a 2 minute walk from that station,
01:05:26 --> 01:05:28:	which is very important to us.
01:05:28 --> 01:05:33:	Kensington in General is a challenged neighborhood with strong bones,
01:05:33 --> 01:05:38:	right? There's a lot of dedicated people in the neighborhood
01:05:38 --> 01:05:41:	fighting and working hard to maintain.
01:05:41 --> 01:05:45:	A lifestyle that's healthy for their children and healthy for
01:05:45 --> 01:05:49:	themselves and we're working with those folks to create.
01:05:49 --> 01:05:52:	A platform of growth, you know,
01:05:52 --> 01:05:58:	an opportunity for wealth building and just thoughtfulness around.
01:05:58 --> 01:06:03:	Around investment in how we're growing in in Kensington.
01:06:03 --> 01:06:06:	Next
01:06:06 --> 01:06:06:	Netflix.
01:06:09 --> 01:06:12:	So the project itself was a furniture store.
01:06:12 --> 01:06:14:	Most recently it was diamond furniture.
01:06:14 --> 01:06:16:	It's two buildings adjacent to each other,
01:06:16 --> 01:06:19:	connected by what you'll see on the lower left is
01:06:19 --> 01:06:23:	sort of a courtyard area 155 thousand square feet with
01:06:23 --> 01:06:26:	commercial on the ground floor and residential above.
01:06:26 --> 01:06:29:	This was our first foray into multifamily sort of mixed

01:06:29 --> 01:06:29:	use.
01:06:29 --> 01:06:33:	Previous to that, we were really focused on job creation,
01:06:33 --> 01:06:36:	so the making North and making South ones that you
01:06:36 --> 01:06:39:	saw in the previous slides were all small business driven
01:06:39 --> 01:06:40:	where we said,
01:06:40 --> 01:06:43:	you know. We're not going to get this single anchor,
01:06:43 --> 01:06:45:	you know Coca Cola is not coming in to take
01:06:45 --> 01:06:46:	the whole building.
01:06:46 --> 01:06:48:	There's not going to be a single user,
01:06:48 --> 01:06:51:	and so we went in and broke it the building
01:06:51 --> 01:06:53:	up into smaller units so that we could bring in
01:06:53 --> 01:06:54:	businesses.
01:06:54 --> 01:06:58:	Thinking about who those businesses are an and finding like
01:06:58 --> 01:07:01:	minded partners to house and work out of those spaces
01:07:01 --> 01:07:04:	has been really challenging and exciting for us.
01:07:04 --> 01:07:08:	You know, seeking folks who want to hire local and
01:07:08 --> 01:07:11:	who have a similar mission is part of our ethos.
01:07:11 --> 01:07:14:	And so you know, we're very excited to say that
01:07:14 --> 01:07:18:	we have those buildings in making North at least stabilized
01:07:18 --> 01:07:21:	and we can sell lots of leases in the pipeline
01:07:21 --> 01:07:24:	despite Covid. And, um, you know,
01:07:24 --> 01:07:27:	I was saying yesterday, it's really heartening to me to
01:07:27 --> 01:07:29:	see how many new businesses are coming,
01:07:29 --> 01:07:32:	despite the fact that you know the pandemic has been
01:07:32 --> 01:07:35:	challenging for some businesses that didn't make it there.
01:07:35 --> 01:07:37:	People are creative and steadfast,
01:07:37 --> 01:07:39:	and so we're we're moving forward.
01:07:39 --> 01:07:43:	So this building we decided we did debate what the
01:07:43 --> 01:07:45:	best use was it for was for it,
01:07:45 --> 01:07:48:	and if it should be light industrial commercial.
01:07:48 --> 01:07:53:	But we landed on three stories of residential and commercial
01:07:53 --> 01:07:54:	in the ground floor.
01:07:54 --> 01:07:58:	I think mostly because it is nestled a little bit
01:07:58 --> 01:08:00:	more away from the industrial piece.
01:08:00 --> 01:08:03:	It is at the corner of Kensington Ave,
01:08:03 --> 01:08:07:	Anna largely residential area and there is not an abundance
01:08:07 --> 01:08:09:	of multifamily housing.
01:08:09 --> 01:08:10:	So it is a neighborhood.
01:08:10 --> 01:08:14:	But there's not a lot of opportunity for this kind
01:08:14 --> 01:08:16:	of this kind of project,
01:08:16 --> 01:08:18:	and so we're very excited about it.
01:08:18 --> 01:08:21:	It's not a subsidized project,

01:08:21 --> 01:08:24:	but we were successful in the large majority of the
01:08:24 --> 01:08:26:	building is at the 6070%
01:08:26 --> 01:08:30:	am I an after feedback from the neighborhood,
01:08:30 --> 01:08:32:	we could find a way to bring in a couple
01:08:33 --> 01:08:33:	units at 40%
01:08:33 --> 01:08:35:	am I we had no CVI,
01:08:35 --> 01:08:37:	but I would say.
01:08:37 --> 01:08:42:	A common goal for affordability and job creation,
01:08:42 --> 01:08:46:	and so we worked really hard in.
01:08:46 --> 01:08:50:	With the contractor on making sure that there were minority
01:08:50 --> 01:08:53:	and local local hires in the temporary construction jobs and
01:08:53 --> 01:08:55:	when we're seeking leasing for the building,
01:08:55 --> 01:08:59:	we certainly look for businesses that.
01:08:59 --> 01:09:03:	Have have an interest so we have at the corner.
01:09:03 --> 01:09:07:	Our anchor tenant is Cafe which is a Vietnamese coffee
01:09:07 --> 01:09:11:	shop that is associated with the nonprofit called 12 +
01:09:11 --> 01:09:15:	12 Plus Works with high school students to help them
01:09:15 --> 01:09:19:	understand the importance and get to higher education and so
01:09:19 --> 01:09:24:	they funnel those students from their nonprofit 12 plus to
01:09:24 --> 01:09:27:	be employed at their retail location.
01:09:27 --> 01:09:30:	That's going to open on the corner so they.
01:09:30 --> 01:09:32:	There a roaster and retail,
01:09:32 --> 01:09:34:	so they sell coffee and you can buy that now
01:09:34 --> 01:09:35:	out of the Roastery,
01:09:35 --> 01:09:38:	and soon they will be opening here to sell coffee
01:09:38 --> 01:09:39:	over the counter.
01:09:39 --> 01:09:41:	We're really excited about them.
01:09:41 --> 01:09:44:	In addition we have if lab which would be idea
01:09:44 --> 01:09:48:	Factory and they are small business incubator focused on minority
01:09:48 --> 01:09:50:	and impoverished neighborhoods,
01:09:50 --> 01:09:53:	helping people sort of bring their idea to the next
01:09:53 --> 01:09:53:	level.
01:09:53 --> 01:09:56:	So they will also be front and center sort of
01:09:56 --> 01:10:00:	right at the corner of the courtyard and J Street.
01:10:00 --> 01:10:02:	Next slide I don't know how I'm going on time
01:10:02 --> 01:10:03:	to it.
01:10:03 --> 01:10:05:	I'm OK two minute warning.
01:10:05 --> 01:10:07:	OK, so because there's not a lot of multi family
01:10:08 --> 01:10:09:	in the neighborhood,
01:10:09 --> 01:10:13:	we did a lot of brainstorming around how we can
01:10:13 --> 01:10:14:	make sure that this.

01:10:14 --> 01:10:17:	This building was special, like how do these people integrate
01:10:18 --> 01:10:20:	into the neighborhood an after a lot of sort of
01:10:20 --> 01:10:22:	back and forth and back and forth.
01:10:22 --> 01:10:24:	We came up with a good neighbor program and so
01:10:24 --> 01:10:27:	tenants in this building that were touting as the most
01:10:27 --> 01:10:30:	civically engaged building in the country.
01:10:30 --> 01:10:31:	Ideally when it opens at that,
01:10:31 --> 01:10:34:	is our goal. The tenants in the building are incentivized
01:10:34 --> 01:10:37:	financially to engage in the neighborhood so they can get
01:10:37 --> 01:10:40:	up to a $100 discount on their rent if they
01:10:40 --> 01:10:41:	put up to four hours every month.
01:10:41 --> 01:10:44:	So it's $25.00 an hour towards the neighborhood.
01:10:44 --> 01:10:48:	Neighborhood cleanups attend your Civic Association meeting etc.
01:10:48 --> 01:10:51:	So we have I think about 20 four partners right
01:10:51 --> 01:10:54:	now including the hospital and the local CDC's etc that
01:10:54 --> 01:10:56:	are going to help us track that.
01:10:56 --> 01:10:59:	And if people for every hour they donate to the
01:10:59 --> 01:11:03:	neighborhood every month they will get a discount on their
01:11:03 --> 01:11:03:	rent.
01:11:03 --> 01:11:06:	So the good neighbor. Hope program for us is a
01:11:06 --> 01:11:09:	big incentive so that people will volunteer not only with
01:11:09 --> 01:11:10:	the neighborhood,
01:11:10 --> 01:11:13:	but potentially between one another.
01:11:13 --> 01:11:16:	There are there's an opportunity for digital interaction as well
01:11:16 --> 01:11:19:	as a lounge an community area where people where people
01:11:19 --> 01:11:23:	can interact and with one another and in the neighborhood.
01:11:23 --> 01:11:26:	In addition, we partnered with health plus which is an
01:11:26 --> 01:11:29:	organization that provides Tele health so every tenant as a
01:11:29 --> 01:11:31:	part of their rent has access to.
01:11:36 --> 01:11:39:	I'm sorry to tell help where they can make a
01:11:39 --> 01:11:41:	phone call and meet with the Doctor as well as
01:11:41 --> 01:11:45:	a discount on any prescriptions that might come through that
01:11:45 --> 01:11:48:	and then Rhino is a an organization that eliminates the
01:11:48 --> 01:11:52:	need for security deposit so that security deposit would be
01:11:52 --> 01:11:55:	a small fee like a couple of dollars per per
01:11:55 --> 01:11:58:	month instead of a chunk needed at the beginning.
01:11:58 --> 01:12:01:	So it allows people lower barrier of entry to move
01:12:01 --> 01:12:02:	into the space.
01:12:02 --> 01:12:06:	Next slide. And got a little bit more time out.
01:12:06 --> 01:12:09:	C Pace is a part of our capital stack to
01:12:09 --> 01:12:11:	help pay for the building.

01:12:11 --> 01:12:14:	And so we were able to achieve some significant.
01:12:16 --> 01:12:20:	Utility savings for tenants in the building so they are
01:12:20 --> 01:12:25:	responsible for their electric bills and through this program we
01:12:25 --> 01:12:29:	were able to use energy efficient recovery units,
01:12:29 --> 01:12:33:	LED lighting, better windows, local plumbing etc etc.
01:12:33 --> 01:12:37:	In an effort to lower bills and lower our carbon
01:12:37 --> 01:12:38:	footprint.
01:12:38 --> 01:12:40:	Laugh like I think.
01:12:40 --> 01:12:43:	And this was just, you know.
01:12:43 --> 01:12:45:	We did a lot of outreach and tried to do
01:12:45 --> 01:12:48:	our best to listen to people in the neighborhood.
01:12:48 --> 01:12:52:	We interacted with the local Civic Association Association,
01:12:52 --> 01:12:56:	two different CBCS, the Locust local business associations we attended
01:12:56 --> 01:12:58:	all over their meetings.
01:12:58 --> 01:13:00:	We gave presentations we allowed for,
01:13:00 --> 01:13:04:	you know, open communication. They could email us or you
01:13:04 --> 01:13:04:	know,
01:13:04 --> 01:13:06:	or at anytime or call us at anytime.
01:13:06 --> 01:13:10:	We had multiple meetings with the Arceo and actually even.
01:13:12 --> 01:13:14:	Went back so we were at our formal arceo because
01:13:15 --> 01:13:15:	of our zoning.
01:13:15 --> 01:13:18:	You know that everybody talked about as part of the
01:13:18 --> 01:13:19:	process,
01:13:19 --> 01:13:21:	but at that meeting people weren't satisfied.
01:13:21 --> 01:13:23:	They still had further further,
01:13:23 --> 01:13:25:	you know they wanted us to push harder and so
01:13:25 --> 01:13:26:	we said,
01:13:26 --> 01:13:27:	well, let's not vote tonight,
01:13:27 --> 01:13:30:	you know, let's take take some time and we did
01:13:30 --> 01:13:31:	go back and we thought,
01:13:31 --> 01:13:34:	you know we got creative about providing more parking and
01:13:34 --> 01:13:36:	finding a way to increase affordability.
01:13:36 --> 01:13:39:	And so we try our best to.
01:13:39 --> 01:13:42:	Despite the fact that we didn't have a CBA.
01:13:42 --> 01:13:44:	Put our money where our mouth is like.
01:13:44 --> 01:13:47:	We have a common goal angwe the CBA.
01:13:47 --> 01:13:50:	Could have been a formalization of those things,
01:13:50 --> 01:13:52:	and I think that's what people were talking about before,
01:13:52 --> 01:13:53:	but in this case.
01:13:56 --> 01:13:59:	We did those things without a formal informal agreement and

01:14:00 --> 01:14:00:	ideally.
01:14:00 --> 01:14:01:	I'd like to you know,
01:14:01 --> 01:14:04:	I like to think that we were very successful at
01:14:04 --> 01:14:05:	it at this project.
01:14:09 --> 01:14:12:	Great. Thank you so much Maria.
01:14:12 --> 01:14:15:	Congratulations on the project and really great to hear a
01:14:15 --> 01:14:19:	different very different example than what we just discussed.
01:14:19 --> 01:14:21:	So now we have time for questions.
01:14:21 --> 01:14:24:	So Tyrone. If you could please on reentering your videos
01:14:24 --> 01:14:25:	back on,
01:14:25 --> 01:14:27:	you know we have a lot more to hear from
01:14:27 --> 01:14:30:	you both so I'll start with the first which actually
01:14:30 --> 01:14:33:	I was very excited to hear Maria that you see
01:14:33 --> 01:14:35:	pace in your capital. So yeah,
01:14:35 --> 01:14:38:	do you have a question about that?
01:14:38 --> 01:14:40:	You use that for the residential portion.
01:14:40 --> 01:14:42:	This is a priest, no,
01:14:42 --> 01:14:44:	no, it was very specific around the commercial an we
01:14:44 --> 01:14:47:	were well into the project when we realized we had
01:14:47 --> 01:14:49:	a gap and so we did have to go back
01:14:49 --> 01:14:50:	and condo as the project.
01:14:50 --> 01:14:53:	So we went back in the two commercial levels of
01:14:53 --> 01:14:57:	each of the buildings are their own separate separate condos.
01:14:57 --> 01:15:00:	Got it. Great, so I'll again remind the audience you
01:15:00 --> 01:15:04:	can go ahead and place your questions into the chat
01:15:04 --> 01:15:05:	on either project.
01:15:05 --> 01:15:08:	It's even want to mention I forgot to mention that
01:15:08 --> 01:15:10:	you know before I came to shift I worked on
01:15:10 --> 01:15:11:	the nonprofit side.
01:15:11 --> 01:15:14:	I was. I led the real estate team for North
01:15:14 --> 01:15:15:	Square and I wrote,
01:15:15 --> 01:15:18:	you know, I led the Community Benefits agreement for a
01:15:18 --> 01:15:21:	local project that's under construction there now and it was
01:15:21 --> 01:15:24:	so interesting to me to sit on both sides of
01:15:24 --> 01:15:25:	the table, right? You know,
01:15:25 --> 01:15:27:	when I came to shift I was like,
01:15:27 --> 01:15:30:	wow, you know it would be asking for this.
01:15:30 --> 01:15:32:	If I if I were sitting over there and so
01:15:32 --> 01:15:36:	I want to make sure we're providing this over here,
01:15:36 --> 01:15:38:	and so the formalization of that,
01:15:38 --> 01:15:41:	I'll be important like the end result is what what

01:15:41 --> 01:15:44:	we what we tried to try to do right,
01:15:44 --> 01:15:47:	and so I hopefully hopefully have taken us there.
01:15:47 --> 01:15:50:	Absolutely, that's a great point and I have to take
01:15:51 --> 01:15:53:	this 2 seconds to make a plug for urban plan
01:15:54 --> 01:15:54:	program,
01:15:54 --> 01:15:59:	which is exactly providing participants opportunity to get into different
01:15:59 --> 01:16:01:	roles on a fake project.
01:16:01 --> 01:16:04:	And as I said mentioned this at the beginning but
01:16:04 --> 01:16:07:	will be doing this with a group of RC Ozanne
01:16:07 --> 01:16:10:	community leaders in Philadelphia in a couple of weeks,
01:16:10 --> 01:16:13:	so hopefully I know we have a lot of participants
01:16:13 --> 01:16:15:	on this call in that program.
01:16:15 --> 01:16:19:	So that's that's exciting and something we're looking forward to.
01:16:19 --> 01:16:22:	So Tyrone, you talk, you touched on a lot of
01:16:22 --> 01:16:26:	really interesting mechanisms that you're looking at in Atlanta.
01:16:26 --> 01:16:30:	I wonder if you could share if you coming into
01:16:30 --> 01:16:31:	a different municipality.
01:16:31 --> 01:16:35:	And hearing a little bit about what's happening in Philadelphia,
01:16:35 --> 01:16:39:	we have a big group today of practitioners from around
01:16:39 --> 01:16:40:	the industry.
01:16:40 --> 01:16:42:	Kind of. Do you have advice or something?
01:16:42 --> 01:16:45:	A couple of specific things that you would want to
01:16:46 --> 01:16:48:	share with our group in Philadelphia?
01:16:48 --> 01:16:50:	Oh man, I could. I could bore you,
01:16:50 --> 01:16:54:	but the one takeaway in this and I see questions
01:16:54 --> 01:16:55:	popping up of.
01:16:55 --> 01:16:58:	How can you do? CBA is if development is as
01:16:58 --> 01:17:02:	of right and there's nothing needed from the municipality.
01:17:02 --> 01:17:03:	I mean, I I would.
01:17:03 --> 01:17:06:	I would try and take it away from the one
01:17:06 --> 01:17:09:	off transactional nature of negotiating agreements,
01:17:09 --> 01:17:12:	right? I mean that if you have the framework right
01:17:12 --> 01:17:17:	and the development community understands what you're trying to do
01:17:17 --> 01:17:18:	around the beltline,
01:17:18 --> 01:17:22:	for an example, these aren't surprised conversations when they come
01:17:22 --> 01:17:23:	up right,
01:17:23 --> 01:17:27:	particularly if they're trying to induce some type of benefit.

01:17:27 --> 01:17:31:	They wouldn't otherwise be able to be induced right?
01:17:31 --> 01:17:35:	We hear about in I'm talking true public private partnerships
01:17:35 --> 01:17:39:	right where there's capital going into capital stats for private
01:17:39 --> 01:17:43:	developers where it should not be a surprise that this
01:17:43 --> 01:17:45:	is not just moderating down right there.
01:17:45 --> 01:17:49:	This is an investment by the public sector and trying
01:17:49 --> 01:17:51:	to achieve certain outcomes.
01:17:51 --> 01:17:53:	So the one thing I would do is it if
01:17:54 --> 01:17:57:	you could keep these less transactional and one off.
01:17:57 --> 01:18:01:	And create frameworks that help codifies the types of things
01:18:01 --> 01:18:03:	that your community wants.
01:18:03 --> 01:18:05:	That's gonna work better for you,
01:18:05 --> 01:18:08:	right? I mean that the worst time to ask somebody
01:18:08 --> 01:18:11:	for something is when you want it when you need
01:18:11 --> 01:18:12:	it,
01:18:12 --> 01:18:13:	right?
01:18:13 --> 01:18:16:	Down the road and you find out that you need
01:18:16 --> 01:18:19:	something that train has left the building.
01:18:19 --> 01:18:21:	That's going to be a very hard negotiation,
01:18:21 --> 01:18:25:	so I would encourage everyone to think about larger frameworks.
01:18:25 --> 01:18:27:	In the case of Atlanta,
01:18:27 --> 01:18:30:	we put together an economic mobility plan where we included
01:18:30 --> 01:18:33:	a broad section of the entire cities community to ask
01:18:33 --> 01:18:37:	them whether the types of things that would help enhance
01:18:37 --> 01:18:40:	our entire community and we approach it holistically,
01:18:40 --> 01:18:43:	not to mean that there won't be separate agreements.
01:18:43 --> 01:18:45:	On a project by project basis,
01:18:45 --> 01:18:49:	but I think it really did require some upfront thought
01:18:49 --> 01:18:52:	and we could at least say there was broad participation
01:18:52 --> 01:18:55:	and not just the five largest people in the room
01:18:55 --> 01:18:58:	trying to drive through what's important to them.
01:18:58 --> 01:19:00:	So I think it's more holistic that way.
01:19:03 --> 01:19:05:	That's great, thank you so much.
01:19:05 --> 01:19:09:	Like we have a couple of comments and thanks to
01:19:10 --> 01:19:11:	Maria on the project.
01:19:11 --> 01:19:15:	Could you let see Maria speak to any of the
01:19:15 --> 01:19:17:	challenges that you face?
01:19:17 --> 01:19:21:	Or maybe in the project where you discuss that you're
01:19:21 --> 01:19:23:	looking at a CBA right now?
01:19:23 --> 01:19:28:	Maybe some specific examples around that negotiation that you could

01:19:29 --> 01:19:30:	share with the group.
01:19:30 --> 01:19:33:	Sure, you know it is 1 where it was.
01:19:33 --> 01:19:36:	By right, I saw somebody asking you know,
01:19:36 --> 01:19:39:	how do you do it when it's by right?
01:19:39 --> 01:19:41:	And in this case I did,
01:19:41 --> 01:19:43:	we had to go through.
01:19:43 --> 01:19:47:	The Civic design review. But other than that it was
01:19:47 --> 01:19:48:	a buy write project.
01:19:48 --> 01:19:52:	I think we got to a CBA because we had
01:19:52 --> 01:19:56:	been talking so long with the community like we had.
01:19:56 --> 01:19:59:	Informally, we had common goals already,
01:19:59 --> 01:20:01:	and so when they proposed a CBA,
01:20:01 --> 01:20:04:	I think we were just open to it because we'd
01:20:04 --> 01:20:07:	already think we were all clear on what the goals
01:20:07 --> 01:20:10:	were and the fact that it would make them more
01:20:10 --> 01:20:13:	comfortable and us more accountable to have it.
01:20:13 --> 01:20:17:	We were already there like it had been years in
01:20:17 --> 01:20:18:	the making.
01:20:18 --> 01:20:21:	It's a challenging project, I think because shift doesn't necessarily
01:20:21 --> 01:20:23:	do a lot of public subsidy,
01:20:23 --> 01:20:26:	and so the project budgets are really tight.
01:20:26 --> 01:20:27:	We're not a Brandywine, right?
01:20:27 --> 01:20:29:	We're not a big big developer,
01:20:29 --> 01:20:31:	and so our budgets tend to be really tight,
01:20:31 --> 01:20:34:	and if there's not public subsidy involved,
01:20:34 --> 01:20:35:	you know we're out there.
01:20:35 --> 01:20:39:	Writing grants and getting scrappy about our capital stack.
01:20:39 --> 01:20:41:	But there's not a lot of fluff to say.
01:20:41 --> 01:20:43:	Well, we're going to provide this extra,
01:20:43 --> 01:20:44:	and so I think that.
01:20:47 --> 01:20:50:	Educating on sort of the strata of what is a
01:20:50 --> 01:20:54:	developer has been has been an important part because I
01:20:54 --> 01:20:57:	think you used the word developer and everybody thinks.
01:20:57 --> 01:20:59:	We're rolling in dough right?
01:20:59 --> 01:21:01:	And and that isn't always the case until I think
01:21:02 --> 01:21:04:	you need to be realistic and an an open about
01:21:04 --> 01:21:08:	communication and what's possible and where the flexibility points are
01:21:08 --> 01:21:11:	like. Well, yeah, somethings totally doable like we can you
01:21:11 --> 01:21:11:	know jobs.
01:21:11 --> 01:21:13:	I think jobs on the short term,

01:21:13 --> 01:21:16:	the construction jobs we're absolutely committed to that and we
01:21:17 --> 01:21:19:	want to sort of beat with the city standard is
01:21:19 --> 01:21:22:	and do better there because you don't want to bring
01:21:22 --> 01:21:24:	a big project to a neighborhood and not benefit the
01:21:25 --> 01:21:26:	people that live right there.
01:21:26 --> 01:21:29:	And that's really important to us.
01:21:29 --> 01:21:32:	At the same time, I don't know who the end
01:21:32 --> 01:21:33:	users are going to be.
01:21:33 --> 01:21:36:	I'm committed to finding.
01:21:36 --> 01:21:40:	Like minded leaseholders who want to hire local and want
01:21:40 --> 01:21:41:	to but.
01:21:41 --> 01:21:44:	But when I haven't identified them yet and the project
01:21:44 --> 01:21:46:	won't sing or work without a lease in place,
01:21:46 --> 01:21:49:	I'm very much hamstrung to say I'm going to commit
01:21:49 --> 01:21:52:	for someone I haven't even met yet and so that
01:21:52 --> 01:21:54:	has been really an interesting part.
01:21:54 --> 01:21:55:	Where yes, we want to do that,
01:21:55 --> 01:21:58:	but I can't promise something that you know you can't
01:21:59 --> 01:22:00:	promise what you can't promise,
01:22:00 --> 01:22:04:	so that's been very sticky and kind of like.
01:22:04 --> 01:22:06:	Figuring out a creative way to get where we want
01:22:06 --> 01:22:09:	to go without committing to something that I just can't
01:22:09 --> 01:22:10:	promise.
01:22:10 --> 01:22:11:	But but you want to promise,
01:22:11 --> 01:22:14:	right? Like that's something that's important to the deal,
01:22:14 --> 01:22:14:	but.
01:22:17 --> 01:22:19:	But you have to find that partner.
01:22:19 --> 01:22:21:	Thank you, I don't know Tyrone.
01:22:21 --> 01:22:24:	If you want to fall into that with any.
01:22:24 --> 01:22:27:	Thoughts on an example? Building about Maria just said no,
01:22:27 --> 01:22:29:	no, not not, not necessarily,
01:22:29 --> 01:22:32:	but I see some things that are coming up in
01:22:32 --> 01:22:36:	the chat which you know to help you move it
01:22:36 --> 01:22:36:	along it.
01:22:36 --> 01:22:40:	Equal to build the equitable development is really what I'm
01:22:40 --> 01:22:40:	saying.
01:22:40 --> 01:22:44:	Major cities start to concentrate on right because each community
01:22:44 --> 01:22:45:	is different.
01:22:45 --> 01:22:48:	But I would argue that many of these communities have
01:22:48 --> 01:22:51:	similar things and not just in your city and across
01:22:51 --> 01:22:52:	the country,

01:22:52 --> 01:22:54:	right? And and if that's the case I could argue
01:22:54 --> 01:22:58:	that if you put five different people in that Neighborhood
01:22:58 --> 01:22:59:	Association room,
01:22:59 --> 01:23:03:	you probably have different thoughts on what's important also right?
01:23:03 --> 01:23:06:	So I'm not trying to concentrate on what's dissimilar,
01:23:06 --> 01:23:09:	what's different, but there are things that.
01:23:09 --> 01:23:13:	Are needed in particularly distressed communities that I think if
01:23:13 --> 01:23:16:	we spend our effort and time and resources on those
01:23:16 --> 01:23:17:	things,
01:23:17 --> 01:23:20:	we get better outcomes. One in our city we have
01:23:20 --> 01:23:21:	an oversized,
01:23:21 --> 01:23:25:	I think, minority small business community that isn't looking for
01:23:25 --> 01:23:26:	necessarily.
01:23:26 --> 01:23:28:	Jaw retail jobs in our community.
01:23:28 --> 01:23:31:	They could care less if a $10 job opened up
01:23:31 --> 01:23:32:	in their community,
01:23:32 --> 01:23:35:	but want to figure out how they can take their
01:23:35 --> 01:23:40:	businesses and take advantage of changing communities without being displaced
01:23:40 --> 01:23:40:	right?
01:23:40 --> 01:23:45:	With growing market share an if you can help those
01:23:45 --> 01:23:46:	small business.
01:23:46 --> 01:23:49:	Owners, they are the people that are driving hiring down
01:23:49 --> 01:23:52:	the road that look like people in these communities,
01:23:52 --> 01:23:54:	right? I would argue that my company,
01:23:54 --> 01:23:55:	which is a small NB,
01:23:55 --> 01:23:58:	is more likely to hire someone that couldn't get some
01:23:58 --> 01:24:00:	of these other jobs right.
01:24:00 --> 01:24:02:	So if you help those people,
01:24:02 --> 01:24:04:	I think you build organically from the ground up in
01:24:05 --> 01:24:05:	small business,
01:24:05 --> 01:24:08:	lending in programs that that isn't.
01:24:08 --> 01:24:11:	That isn't unique to a particular neighborhood,
01:24:11 --> 01:24:14:	right? I mean, that is something where you can build
01:24:14 --> 01:24:14:	a program,
01:24:14 --> 01:24:17:	figure out what resources are requirement,
01:24:17 --> 01:24:19:	have the full faith of the city behind you,
01:24:19 --> 01:24:22:	and helping to roll this out in a broader way
01:24:22 --> 01:24:23:	where you have more impact.
01:24:23 --> 01:24:27:	You know, instead of negotiating 1000 separate agreements

	with developers
01:24:27 --> 01:24:31:	to try and get small business programs within those agreements,
01:24:31 --> 01:24:33:	why not? Why not think big about this?
01:24:33 --> 01:24:36:	Yeah, I think that speaks to David's point where he
01:24:36 --> 01:24:37:	was saying,
01:24:37 --> 01:24:38:	you know, as a developer.
01:24:38 --> 01:24:41:	We would know we were stepping into if there were
01:24:41 --> 01:24:41:	some broad,
01:24:41 --> 01:24:44:	broad strokes that defined what the parameters were.
01:24:46 --> 01:24:49:	Oh, that's a good one in your chatroom.
01:24:49 --> 01:24:52:	My access to health and educational opportunities.
01:24:52 --> 01:24:55:	It's a peeve of mine because I don't.
01:24:55 --> 01:24:58:	I believe the one thing that does equalize people the
01:24:59 --> 01:25:02:	most is access to educational opportunities.
01:25:02 --> 01:25:05:	So they're definitely way that's a good example of talking
01:25:06 --> 01:25:07:	about on a citywide basis.
01:25:07 --> 01:25:10:	How are we going to increase that access?
01:25:10 --> 01:25:14:	What it looks like codifying put it into city legislation
01:25:14 --> 01:25:16:	and then as projects come up?
01:25:16 --> 01:25:21:	Either whether it's through zoning overlay around a high growth
01:25:21 --> 01:25:23:	area in your part of town,
01:25:23 --> 01:25:27:	or whether or not a specific incentives designed for educational
01:25:27 --> 01:25:28:	assets,
01:25:28 --> 01:25:31:	or developers of them. There's a way to tackle these
01:25:31 --> 01:25:33:	more efficiently,
01:25:33 --> 01:25:37:	faster and with more benefit than going one off CBA
01:25:37 --> 01:25:37:	with.
01:25:37 --> 01:25:42:	But in Atlanta, no Neighborhood Association thinks about the same
01:25:42 --> 01:25:42:	thing,
01:25:42 --> 01:25:45:	even when I mean that you would really chase your
01:25:45 --> 01:25:47:	tail forever doing that.
01:25:47 --> 01:25:51:	So in the 70s we qualified something called neighborhood planning
01:25:51 --> 01:25:51:	units,
01:25:51 --> 01:25:55:	where those community organizations roll up into an MPU and
01:25:55 --> 01:25:58:	they have a true voice and work with the city
01:25:58 --> 01:26:01:	on prospects of rezoning and a lot of these issues.
01:26:01 --> 01:26:03:	So it's like that in many cities.
01:26:03 --> 01:26:06:	But I tell you to have to talk with.

01:26:06 --> 01:26:09:	Each party that isn't in the best position to negotiate
01:26:09 --> 01:26:11:	a CBA really think about it right?
01:26:11 --> 01:26:14:	I mean that that is a that is a relationship
01:26:14 --> 01:26:19:	where you have asymmetrical information between a developer that negotiates
01:26:19 --> 01:26:22:	agreements everyday and fire people in this room.
01:26:22 --> 01:26:26:	So why not give it the support and importance that
01:26:26 --> 01:26:27:	it needs citywide?
01:26:27 --> 01:26:30:	Yeah, these great points. Thank you so much and and
01:26:30 --> 01:26:31:	thinking about this,
01:26:31 --> 01:26:35:	you know, holistically, equitably an across multiple projects is,
01:26:35 --> 01:26:37:	I think, a great lesson from today.
01:26:37 --> 01:26:39:	And I see we did have some questions for the
01:26:39 --> 01:26:40:	Councilwoman.
01:26:40 --> 01:26:42:	Feel free to answer in the chat.
01:26:42 --> 01:26:44:	We are coming on time and I want to be
01:26:44 --> 01:26:45:	respectful for everyone.
01:26:45 --> 01:26:47:	But you can go ahead.
01:26:47 --> 01:26:50:	And I will say, the Pennsylvania Philadelphia Association of CDC's
01:26:50 --> 01:26:52:	may have some information.
01:26:52 --> 01:26:55:	Obviously, feel free to reach out to your council person
01:26:55 --> 01:26:58:	and the Councilwoman if you want to drop some information
01:26:58 --> 01:26:59:	in there.
01:26:59 --> 01:27:02:	Please do obviously will continue to try to convene these
01:27:02 --> 01:27:03:	discussions.
01:27:03 --> 01:27:05:	There's so much more to talk about,
01:27:05 --> 01:27:07:	not just around this particular area,
01:27:07 --> 01:27:11:	but I love that the group our Council really thought
01:27:11 --> 01:27:13:	about not just a Community benefits agreement,
01:27:13 --> 01:27:17:	but other broader ways of engaging a community and thinking
01:27:17 --> 01:27:19:	about equity as we look at projects.
01:27:19 --> 01:27:22:	So I will end here by just thanking everybody for
01:27:22 --> 01:27:23:	participating.
01:27:23 --> 01:27:26:	This is such an important conversation.
01:27:26 --> 01:27:29:	Thank you to our presenters are sponsors in the community
01:27:29 --> 01:27:29:	and.
01:27:29 --> 01:27:33:	Economic Development Council for putting the event together.
01:27:33 --> 01:27:35:	Thank you all for being here.
01:27:35 --> 01:27:38:	We really appreciate your participation and your time.

01:27:38 --> 01:27:40:	As I mentioned at the beginning,
01:27:40 --> 01:27:42:	you lie is here for you.
01:27:42 --> 01:27:44:	We would love to meet folks who are here for
01:27:44 --> 01:27:45:	the first time.
01:27:45 --> 01:27:48:	We would love for you to get involved by joining
01:27:48 --> 01:27:50:	by joining one of our counsels.
01:27:50 --> 01:27:53:	Or you can sit in on anything before you make
01:27:53 --> 01:27:54:	that leap.
01:27:54 --> 01:27:57:	Here are some additional upcoming programs that you can see
01:27:57 --> 01:28:00:	here this week on post Pandemic retail.
01:28:00 --> 01:28:02:	January 26th we have a member breakfast.
01:28:02 --> 01:28:06:	That's informal. We'll hear about real estate development and other
01:28:06 --> 01:28:08:	social equity project in Philadelphia.
01:28:08 --> 01:28:11:	And then on February 2nd we have a virtual open
01:28:11 --> 01:28:13:	house that's again an informal,
01:28:13 --> 01:28:16:	casual way for people to talk to one another and
01:28:16 --> 01:28:18:	hear more about how to get engaged.
01:28:18 --> 01:28:20:	And there's a lot more where that came from.
01:28:20 --> 01:28:22:	So then you'll also see in the chat,
01:28:22 --> 01:28:26:	Kevin dropped a survey. Your feedback is so important.
01:28:26 --> 01:28:27:	It really we really do value it.
01:28:27 --> 01:28:30:	It helps us shape things and how we move things.
01:28:30 --> 01:28:33:	Or hear you lie so if you could please take
01:28:33 --> 01:28:36:	a few minutes to just click on that probably one
01:28:36 --> 01:28:39:	minute tell us what you thought about today and we
01:28:39 --> 01:28:40:	hope to see you all again soon.
01:28:40 --> 01:28:43:	Thank you so much for an important conversation.
01:28:43 --> 01:28:46:	Everybody stay well nice to see you take care.
01:28:46 --> 01:28:47:	Thank you.