

Webinar

ULI Ireland: Promoting Affordable Housing

Date: July 02, 2020

00:01:18 --> 00:01:21:

00:01:21 --> 00:01:24:

00:00:03 --> 00:00:07: How everyone and welcome. It's now 12:30, 00:00:07 --> 00:00:11: so we will begin. Hello and welcome to today's webinar 00:00:11 --> 00:00:16: by the Urban Land Institute on Promoting Housing Affordability and 00:00:16 --> 00:00:21: recognizing the recent release of the ULI Report on Best 00:00:21 --> 00:00:25: Practices to deliver intermediate housing at scale. 00:00:25 --> 00:00:26: My name is Tom Faulkner. 00:00:26 --> 00:00:28: I'm a development director with Hines, 00:00:28 --> 00:00:31: Ireland and a member of the ULI Young Leaders Committee. 00:00:31 --> 00:00:34: I'll be moderating today's webinar. 00:00:34 --> 00:00:37: Firstly, I'd like to thank the ULI Island for arranging 00:00:37 --> 00:00:42: and hosting today's webinar and especially Andy Kessler national coordinator 00:00:42 --> 00:00:45: for your Lie Island for organizing it. 00:00:45 --> 00:00:46: I'd also like to thank Tom, 00:00:46 --> 00:00:49: done the chair of LLR Qli Ireland and I'll be 00:00:49 --> 00:00:53: handing over to Tom for his closing remarks at the 00:00:53 --> 00:00:54: end of today's discussion. We will endeavour to stick to the hour and to 00:00:54 --> 00:00:57: 00:00:57 --> 00:00:58: wrap up by 1:30 PM, 00:00:58 --> 00:01:01: but we do have a few minutes provided to go 00:01:01 --> 00:01:03: a little bit over there. 00:01:03 --> 00:01:05: I have the honor of being joined today by a 00:01:05 --> 00:01:07: very distinguished panel, 00:01:07 --> 00:01:09: and I'll introduce them shortly, followed by some brief opening comments. 00:01:09 --> 00:01:12: 00:01:12 --> 00:01:15: The panel will engage in a discussion in response to 00:01:15 --> 00:01:18: those opening comments and field questions from you,

the audience, and that is really the purpose of today.

This is for you, the UI island members and hopefully

00:01:25> 00:01:28:	providing an opportunity to really engage in this discussion.
00:01:28> 00:01:32:	We very much encourage your questions and please do submit
00:01:32> 00:01:35:	them via the Q&A function on the Zoom toolbar.
00:01:35> 00:01:37:	We will do our best to get through as many
00:01:37> 00:01:39:	questions as we can within the hour,
00:01:39> 00:01:43:	and this webinar is being recorded and will be made
00:01:43> 00:01:44:	available.
00:01:44> 00:01:46:	If you haven't seen the report,
00:01:46> 00:01:49:	we would strongly encourage you to have a look.
00:01:49> 00:01:52:	I notice that the UI island guys emailed that out
00:01:52> 00:01:54:	to all registered attendees this morning,
00:01:54> 00:01:57:	and if you didn't see that it is available via
00:01:57> 00:02:01:	the UI Knowledge Finder along with the European webcast
	for
00:02:01> 00:02:01:	its release,
00:02:01> 00:02:06:	and you can Alternatively email Ireland at uli.org for a
00:02:06> 00:02:07:	copy of the report.
00:02:07> 00:02:10:	I understand that there are on today we have many
00:02:11> 00:02:17:	registered attendees which include representatives from many stakeholders across Ireland
00:02:17> 00:02:21:	and organisations with responsibility for the provision of homes,
00:02:21> 00:02:26:	including public and private sectors and elected representatives.
00:02:26> 00:02:29:	Welcome everyone now to introduce the panel.
00:02:29> 00:02:35:	The panel today consists of distinguished experts who may.
00:02:35> 00:02:38:	Who may be familiar to you as leaders in European,
00:02:38> 00:02:40:	an Irish real estate, namely,
00:02:40> 00:02:41:	we have joining us today.
00:02:41> 00:02:45:	Have your younger the Managing director of Catela residential investment
00:02:45> 00:02:49:	management of Year was in the steering group responsible for
00:02:49> 00:02:53:	the promoting affordable housing Report and Javier joins us today
00:02:53> 00:02:56:	from Berlin I believe. Welcome here.
00:02:56> 00:02:58:	We have Doctor Mark Assilah back,
00:02:58> 00:03:00:	the chief economist for Patricia AG.
00:03:00> 00:03:04:	Marcus is another leading voice in European real estate and
00:03:04> 00:03:08:	also in the steering group for the promoting affordable housing
00:03:08> 00:03:08:	report.
00:03:08> 00:03:12:	Welcome markers. And we have Doctor Bill Nolan,

00:03:12> 00:03:15:	former director of Focus Island founder of Hibernia REIT and
00:03:16> 00:03:19:	managing partner of Oracle Real Estate Strategies.
00:03:19> 00:03:22:	Bill is both passionate and expert in the topic for
00:03:22> 00:03:25:	discussion today with a PhD in social housing finance from
00:03:26> 00:03:27:	the University of Ulster.
00:03:27> 00:03:31:	Welcome Bill and welcome to the panel.
00:03:31> 00:03:34:	To begin some opening remarks and we had the benefit
00:03:34> 00:03:37:	of a really interesting brief discussion yesterday.
00:03:37> 00:03:42:	Identifying that there's so much excellent material and
	tangible recommendations
00:03:42> 00:03:43:	mapped out in this report.
00:03:43> 00:03:45:	It will be difficult to cover at all.
00:03:45> 00:03:47:	But when we connected briefly,
00:03:47> 00:03:51:	we identified some key themes to the application of this
00:03:51> 00:03:53:	report in an Irish context.
00:03:53> 00:03:56:	And virtually everything we see in the Ulr report is
00:03:56> 00:03:59:	based on cooperation between the private and public
	sectors.
00:03:59> 00:04:04:	As long term players in the delivery of intermediate housing.
00:04:04> 00:04:08:	This requires an environment of trust and mutual respect between
00:04:08> 00:04:09:	politicians,
00:04:09> 00:04:15:	administrators, developers, an financieres trust which is now not present
00:04:15> 00:04:15:	in Ireland.
00:04:15> 00:04:18:	The Irish system could be referred to as a basket
00:04:18> 00:04:22:	case and without serious institutional reform it runs the risk
00:04:22> 00:04:24:	of remaining that way,
00:04:24> 00:04:28:	thereby inhibiting our deliver. Our ability to deliver on the
00:04:28> 00:04:31:	excellent recommendations in the ULI report.
00:04:31> 00:04:32:	So with that in mind,
00:04:32> 00:04:35:	I might ask Marcus and Javier to assist initially in
00:04:35> 00:04:39:	framing the process that was undertaken to produce that report
00:04:39> 00:04:42:	to help us a little in defining what is intermediate
00:04:42> 00:04:46:	housing and whether you would agree with the observation that
00:04:46> 00:04:47:	intensive collaboration,
00:04:47> 00:04:52:	trust and mutual respect between public and private sectors
00.04.41	is
00:04:52> 00:04:53:	indeed crucial.
00:04:53> 00:04:58:	Javier, would you like to start us off there?
00:04:58> 00:05:00:	Yes, thank you Tom. Happy to do so.
00:05:00> 00:05:05:	So we established the European Council for Residential and
	·

actually 00:05:05 --> 00:05:08: it wouldn't take a long time to think about a 00:05:08 --> 00:05:12: theme that you know is interesting for all European countries. 00:05:12 --> 00:05:17: That theme was obviously portability in housing because for those 00:05:17 --> 00:05:19: who operate on a continental level, 00:05:19 --> 00:05:22: I think we all seem to concur that that this 00:05:23 --> 00:05:24: topic of affordability, 00:05:24 --> 00:05:28: which has social political financial dimensions. 00:05:28 --> 00:05:29: Is one that we see everywhere, 00:05:29 --> 00:05:31: so that was quite easy for us. 00:05:31 --> 00:05:34: And then we did a first step which is in 00:05:34 --> 00:05:37: an analysis where we also had academics and and people 00:05:37 --> 00:05:40: in the field kind of help us to define affordability 00:05:40 --> 00:05:41: and kind of measure it. 00:05:41 --> 00:05:44: That's a report that we didn't think of 1 1/2 00:05:44 --> 00:05:46: two years ago and the conclusion was that, 00:05:46 --> 00:05:49: well, affordability. It's not that easy to define. 00:05:49 --> 00:05:52: No, it's like love, you know we all kind of 00:05:52 --> 00:05:53: know what love is, 00:05:53 --> 00:05:55: but you know if we all define it and then 00:05:55 --> 00:05:58: probably you know the way that Marcus explains it's a 00:05:58 --> 00:06:00: little bit different. 00:06:00 --> 00:06:01: And how I would do it? 00:06:01 --> 00:06:03: But we mean the same thing. 00:06:03 --> 00:06:05: So we found out that affordability, 00:06:05 --> 00:06:08: actually, you know, we all know what it means, 00:06:08 --> 00:06:09: but if you define it, 00:06:09 --> 00:06:12: you can have a big academic debate so that we 00:06:12 --> 00:06:12: said, 00:06:12 --> 00:06:15: well, you know we can do two things. One is do the academic debate or Secondly know park 00:06:15 --> 00:06:18:

00:06:18 --> 00:06:20: that and try to look for solutions.

And that seems to be much better idea. 00:06:20 --> 00:06:23: 00:06:23 --> 00:06:26: So this report that you are referring to is actually 00:06:26 --> 00:06:29: the second report on and there we wanted to kind

00:06:29 --> 00:06:30: of.

00:06:30 --> 00:06:33: See what kind of solutions could be found to increase 00:06:33 --> 00:06:38: the provision of affordable housing and what you basically see

00:06:38 --> 00:06:41: in the report is kind of a life cycle.

Walk through all kinds of sectors or parts of the 00:06:41 --> 00:06:44:

00:06:44 --> 00:06:45: value chain. 00:06:45 --> 00:06:48: I think that's more correct way of seeing it. 00:06:48 --> 00:06:52: Where you see that actually there's no silver bullet, 00:06:52 --> 00:06:56: but there are sensible things to do in various part 00:06:56 --> 00:06:57: of this value chain. 00:06:57 --> 00:07:00: And you know if I added a little bit. 00:07:00 --> 00:07:03: Up and do some assumptions left and right. 00:07:03 --> 00:07:05: I think you're getting to 10:10, 00:07:05 --> 00:07:08: perhaps 15% more affordable housing, 00:07:08 --> 00:07:11: but that you know, revolutionizing. 00:07:11 --> 00:07:14: Either systems or open on new technology, 00:07:14 --> 00:07:18: so kind of not realistically looking what is possible. 00:07:18 --> 00:07:21: I think that range is possible and it seems to 00:07:21 --> 00:07:22: me that that's huge, 00:07:22 --> 00:07:24: so that's very positive news. Now your question on what is intermediate housing sort of 00:07:24 --> 00:07:28: 00:07:28 --> 00:07:30: falling in love question. 00:07:30 --> 00:07:33: I will still try to give you my definition of 00:07:33 --> 00:07:33: it. 00:07:33 --> 00:07:37: It's it's that part of the housing market where key 00:07:37 --> 00:07:40: workers should not spend should be able to live decently 00:07:40 --> 00:07:41: and not spend. 00:07:41 --> 00:07:46: More than 30% of their household income and housing costs. 00:07:46 --> 00:07:49: So there are people that. 00:07:49 --> 00:07:53: Sick and for longer times unemployed pensioners or students 00:07:53 --> 00:07:56: think they've fallen in generally in a different category. 00:07:56 --> 00:07:57: If you don't have income, 00:07:57 --> 00:08:00: that's for us. Probably a little bit more social, 00:08:00 --> 00:08:03: so the price point would be a little bit below 00:08:03 --> 00:08:05: and then you have people that are fully active in 00:08:05 --> 00:08:08: the in the market with higher salary levels and they 00:08:08 --> 00:08:11: are kind of open markets or intermediate is a bit 00:08:11 --> 00:08:12: what it says. 00:08:12 --> 00:08:16: It's between the. I open market prices and under and 00:08:16 --> 00:08:19: the social housing prices. 00:08:19 --> 00:08:22: Fantastic thank you and I might look to Marcus for 00:08:22 --> 00:08:23: a little bit on your views. 00:08:23 --> 00:08:27: In terms of that collaboration factor and whether that crosses 00:08:27 --> 00:08:29: international boundaries. The need for such close collaboration. 00:08:29 --> 00:08:32: I think when what we learned over the the discussion 00:08:32 --> 00:08:35: 00:08:35 --> 00:08:38: when we produce the report and we when we started

00:08:39 --> 00:08:43: I think it's a general challenge for all European cities. 00:08:43 --> 00:08:47: I think providing housing for these key workers is something 00:08:47 --> 00:08:49: that is really challenging for all cities, 00:08:49 --> 00:08:53: and it's also something that the cities need to have 00:08:53 --> 00:08:54: a solution for. 00:08:54 --> 00:08:56: Becausw we have a division of Labor. 00:08:56 --> 00:08:58: We have different salary levels, 00:08:58 --> 00:09:02: different qualifications levels and all these people have to. 00:09:02 --> 00:09:04: Be able to live within a city, 00:09:04 --> 00:09:06: otherwise the city will not function, 00:09:06 --> 00:09:09: so it is a challenge for the city to provide 00:09:09 --> 00:09:09: 00:09:09 --> 00:09:11: But we also learned one thing that at the end 00:09:11 --> 00:09:15: there are a lot of players within the housing market. 00:09:15 --> 00:09:16: Whatever you define it in detail, 00:09:16 --> 00:09:20: it's a little bit like everybody knows what the housing 00:09:20 --> 00:09:20: market is. 00:09:20 --> 00:09:23: but there is not a a very detailed definition about 00:09:23 --> 00:09:24: 00:09:24 --> 00:09:26: but all the players in the market, 00:09:26 --> 00:09:28: from developers, investors, the government, 00:09:28 --> 00:09:31: maybe also tenant unions and all the other places they 00:09:31 --> 00:09:33: need to find commonly a solution. 00:09:33 --> 00:09:35: Or maybe the biggest challenge? 00:09:35 --> 00:09:40: The new Europe. European cities currently have because no single 00:09:40 --> 00:09:45: actor will be big enough or or knowledgeable enough to 00:09:45 --> 00:09:47: really be able to come up with a. 00:09:47 --> 00:09:49: Pop that I wouldn't say optimal, 00:09:49 --> 00:09:52: but a very good or the best solution for for 00:09:52 --> 00:09:53: for each city, 00:09:53 --> 00:09:55: because each city is different, 00:09:55 --> 00:09:58: so each city they have to learn from each other 00:09:58 --> 00:10:02: but also the different market participants have to learn from 00:10:02 --> 00:10:03: each other. 00:10:03 --> 00:10:04: How can we do things? 00:10:04 --> 00:10:07: What type of framework do we need? 00:10:07 --> 00:10:10: What type of collaboration do we need to really come 00:10:10 --> 00:10:11: up with a solution? 00:10:11 --> 00:10:15: Because otherwise we will possibly fail on their end and 00:10:15 --> 00:10:18: we need to be sure that whatever we do.

00:08:38 --> 00:08:39:

the study,

00:10:18> 00:10:20:	It's not a horizon of 1224 months,
00:10:20> 00:10:23:	it has to be a mid to long-term horizon,
00:10:23> 00:10:29:	creating stability and predictability for all the players.
00:10:29> 00:10:30:	That makes a lot of sense.
00:10:30> 00:10:34:	Thank you Marcus and I know you've identified before that
00:10:34> 00:10:37:	the prominence of Dublin in the European context as an
00:10:37> 00:10:40:	attractive city and there are mega trends pushing on that
00:10:40> 00:10:43:	that demand here, among other cities across Europe.
00:10:43> 00:10:47:	So value those comments in terms of applying that context.
00:10:47> 00:10:50:	Then Bill, I would be very interested in your views
00:10:50> 00:10:54:	on heavier than Max's introduction there and how that might
00:10:55> 00:10:56:	apply in an Irish context.
00:10:56> 00:10:58:	Tom, nice to be here,
00:10:58> 00:11:01:	Tom. You referred in your introduction to Ireland being a
00:11:01> 00:11:04:	basket case in terms of housing and I have to
00:11:04> 00:11:06:	I have to endorse that.
00:11:06> 00:11:09:	And the reason for that is that the housing system
00:11:09> 00:11:12:	that we have was effectively invented well over 100 years
00:11:12> 00:11:15:	ago to solve a rural housing problem.
00:11:15> 00:11:17:	And it did that very effectively.
00:11:17> 00:11:21:	It basically house but 50,000 farm laborers and people
	working
00:11:21> 00:11:23:	in the country that was at a time that nearly
00:11:23> 00:11:24:	80%
00:11:24> 00:11:27:	of the Irish population lived in the country.
00:11:27> 00:11:31:	But the problem we have is that that system has
00:11:31> 00:11:36:	been has been imported into the urban urban situation affectively
00:11:36> 00:11:40:	with only sticking plaster changes and we have to go
00:11:40> 00:11:45:	back and and in invent or create a consensus housing
00:11:45> 00:11:45:	system.
00:11:45> 00:11:50:	We're going forward there. There is huge amount of friction
00:11:50> 00:11:54:	between the different players in Ireland.
00:11:54> 00:11:57:	Between them, social housing providers and.
00:11:57> 00:11:59:	And on the market, I mean,
00:11:59> 00:12:02:	there's a. There's a huge them and us.
00:12:02> 00:12:06:	Element in it in that the social housing providers regard
00:12:06> 00:12:08:	that as their territory in the market,
00:12:08> 00:12:11:	people are told don't don't come into it.
00:12:11> 00:12:14:	On the other hand, we have a situation where because
00:12:14> 00:12:17:	of the failure to provide social housing,
00:12:17> 00:12:20:	the the government have to reach into the market and
00:12:20> 00:12:23:	now rent about 1/3 of the PRS units in the

00:12:23 --> 00:12:24: in the market, 00:12:24 --> 00:12:26: and then sublet those out at nominal, 00:12:26 --> 00:12:29: effectively. Nominal rents to social tenants. 00:12:29 --> 00:12:32: So there there is a there is a partnership there, 00:12:32 --> 00:12:37: but it is not. A smooth partnership now. 00:12:37 --> 00:12:40: I have been arguing for some time with others, 00:12:40 --> 00:12:43: including Tom, done that we need to sit down, 00:12:43 --> 00:12:46: sit the politicians down and to get them around a 00:12:46 --> 00:12:48: table and kill some of the sacred cows. 00:12:48 --> 00:12:51: A lot of the problems in the housing situation in 00:12:51 --> 00:12:53: the housing market in Ireland, 00:12:53 --> 00:12:57: the housing, the housing environment is that there are there 00:12:57 --> 00:13:00: are commitments which are argued for by bullet, 00:13:00 --> 00:13:03: particular political interests, for for example, 00:13:03 --> 00:13:06: our rents in Ireland are for social housing are average 00:13:06 --> 00:13:07: about 200. 00:13:07 --> 00:13:11: Euros a month. Where is the same equivalent for a 00:13:11 --> 00:13:13: social house in Europe? 00:13:13 --> 00:13:15: Would probably be 807 hundred, 00:13:15 --> 00:13:17: maybe 900 euros a month. 00:13:17 --> 00:13:21: Now one of the problems is that they knock on. 00:13:21 --> 00:13:24: Effect of that is that the cost that the rent 00:13:24 --> 00:13:28: that is collected doesn't actually pay for the cost of 00:13:28 --> 00:13:31: management and the knock on effect of that is that 00:13:31 --> 00:13:35: the housing stock is actually rundown so but that's a 00:13:35 --> 00:13:40: sacred cow and would require political consensus to actually. 00:13:40 --> 00:13:42: To actually deal with it, 00:13:42 --> 00:13:47: another sacred cow instead of tenant purchase we we built 00:13:47 --> 00:13:52: over the years 400,000 houses for social tenants and we have sold 3/4 of those into to the tenants. 00:13:52 --> 00:13:56: 00:13:56 --> 00:13:58: Reality is when you look at us, 00:13:58 --> 00:13:59: those houses that were sold, 00:13:59 --> 00:14:03: they actually end up very often back in the housing 00:14:03 --> 00:14:06: stuff because they were bought back on the rented back 00:14:06 --> 00:14:07: to to the government. 00:14:07 --> 00:14:11: So we have huge numbers of these kind of dysfunctionality's. 00:14:11 --> 00:14:14: So my starting point is that we need to get 00:14:14 --> 00:14:17: all the parties as you said administrators, 00:14:17 --> 00:14:21: politicians, financials around the table. 00:14:21 --> 00:14:24: We need to get a rent system that actually pays 00:14:24 --> 00:14:25: for the accommodation, 00:14:25 --> 00:14:29: directly or indirectly.

00:14:29> 00:14:31: 00:14:31> 00:14:33:	Is that in itself? Would you want to make a move on cost base rents in if you want me
00:14:33> 00:14:34:	to?
00:14:34> 00:14:36:	I think that's perfect. I think we might come back
00:14:37> 00:14:40:	to cost based rates because there is so important in
00:14:40> 00:14:40:	this discussion,
00:14:40> 00:14:42:	but I think I see first of all,
00:14:42> 00:14:45:	I'd just like to remind our audience to to get
00:14:45> 00:14:47:	involved and use the Q&A function there.
00:14:47> 00:14:50:	We have had our first question coming in from John
00:14:50> 00:14:51:	O'Connor.
00:14:51> 00:14:54:	Thank you John and the question for the panel is
00:14:54> 00:14:57:	what is the view of the panel members between affordable
00:14:57> 00:14:59:	housing for purchase and affordable housing?
00:14:59> 00:15:02:	For rent
00:15:02> 00:15:04:	maybe I just pick, pick that up.
00:15:04> 00:15:08:	I think the interesting point is if you look at
00:15:08> 00:15:11:	today's discussion that is taking place across Europe,
00:15:11> 00:15:16:	it's heavily focused. I would say on affordability to rent.
00:15:16> 00:15:20:	I think it is the provision of housing for key
00:15:20> 00:15:21:	workers to rent.
00:15:21> 00:15:25:	If you look at the affordability definition and the concept
00:15:25> 00:15:28:	at how it is and how it is thought of
00:15:28> 00:15:30:	and how it has to be developed,
00:15:30> 00:15:34:	it has the two 2 dimensions of affordability to rent
00:15:34> 00:15:36:	an affordability to own.
00:15:36> 00:15:40:	But I think from the political side currently it's only
00:15:40> 00:15:44:	the affordability to rent that is really taking into into
00:15:44> 00:15:45:	the focus.
00:15:45> 00:15:49:	But ultimately, if you really deal with a Ford ability
00:15:49> 00:15:49:	of housing,
00:15:49> 00:15:52:	it should have both dimensions,
00:15:52> 00:15:55:	because that's what the concept is about.
00:15:55> 00:16:00:	Nevertheless, I'm realistic enough to know that the challenge
	for
00:16:00> 00:16:02:	the cities is to house people.
00:16:02> 00:16:06:	And therefore the for rent might be the more pressing
00:16:06> 00:16:06:	one.
00:16:06> 00:16:10:	Nevertheless, you should not forget the phone to own and
00:16:10> 00:16:13:	in the medium to long term as this is part
00:16:13> 00:16:16:	of the the overall housing spectrum and it gives households
00:16:16> 00:16:20:	the choice the opportunity to go for one or the

00:16:20> 00:16:20:	other,
00:16:20> 00:16:23:	and choice is always something people like to have.
00:16:26> 00:16:29:	Great question. I'd love to hear Bill's view on that.
00:16:29> 00:16:32:	In terms of that Irish context in terms of build
00:16:32> 00:16:35:	for rent versus build for sale and you were about
00:16:35> 00:16:38:	to allude to the role of cost rental there as
00:16:38> 00:16:40:	well.
00:16:40> 00:16:42:	Anne.
00:16:42> 00:16:46:	The political environment in Ireland is very much trying to
00:16:46> 00:16:50:	trying to have owner occupation that has been a tradition
00:16:50> 00:16:54:	in the in in Ireland and basically the political structure
00:16:54> 00:16:57:	going back. Many decades is to try and support owner
00:16:57> 00:17:02:	occupation and I think our new government have actually written
00:17:02> 00:17:06:	that into their program for government that they actually want
00:17:06> 00:17:10:	to get owner, owner occupation as promotions much as possible.
00:17:10> 00:17:13:	On the other hand, the market is the market is
00:17:13> 00:17:17:	is is going the opposite direction the market is moving
00:17:17> 00:17:18:	towards a 30%
00:17:18> 00:17:22:	rental situation rather than an owner occupation and that comes
00:17:22> 00:17:26:	down to the desire of of tenants to have flexibility.
00:17:26> 00:17:30:	The inability to. October to raise money and the and
00:17:30> 00:17:34:	the needs that the level of deposits that they have
00:17:34> 00:17:36:	to get to actually borrow.
00:17:36> 00:17:39:	So there there is, there is a dynamic going on
00:17:39> 00:17:40:	there.
00:17:40> 00:17:42:	I think that probably at the 30%
00:17:42> 00:17:45:	mix level is where we will stabilize.
00:17:45> 00:17:49:	I think there will be the war and I think
00:17:50> 00:17:51:	there will be.
00:17:51> 00:17:55:	Financial benefits for our encouragement for people to own under
00:17:55> 00:17:57:	the present under the new administration.
00:17:57> 00:18:00:	But I think that the market will actually still be
00:18:00> 00:18:01:	there for rental.
00:18:01> 00:18:03:	And I think if we get if we get to
00:18:03> 00:18:05:	the level of cost rental,
00:18:05> 00:18:08:	I think that and you have security of tenure and
00:18:08> 00:18:08:	cost rental.
00:18:08> 00:18:11:	I think that will move more people into the rental
00:18:11> 00:18:14:	situation rather than owner occupation.
	·

00:18:14> 00:18:16:	One of the problems is we haven't had.
00:18:16> 00:18:19:	We haven't had security of tenure in this country and
00:18:19> 00:18:22:	it comes back to the Anglo Saxon approach to housing.
00:18:22> 00:18:27:	Rather than the European approach to housing which we
00.10.22> 00.10.27.	might
00:18:27> 00:18:28:	touch on later,
00:18:28> 00:18:32:	but security of tenure predictability of rent,
00:18:32> 00:18:36:	they will all come with a cost benefit system and
00:18:36> 00:18:39:	the benefits of owner occupation.
00:18:39> 00:18:46:	May not be as as strong in that situation.
00:18:46> 00:18:49:	Thanks Bill, and I think there's a few questions that
00:18:49> 00:18:52:	came in before the web and R and I see
00:18:52> 00:18:55:	ones come in now from Brian Moran in relation to
00:18:55> 00:18:58:	the public sector actors and with such a big onus
00:18:58> 00:19:01:	on them in that program for government you mentioned at
00:19:01> 00:19:05:	the question is how do we educate the public sector
00:19:05> 00:19:09:	actors, but political actors and state employees on real costs
00:19:09> 00:19:13:	for delivery and to work with the private sector?
00:19:13> 00:19:15:	That collaboration is obviously key.
00:19:17> 00:19:20:	Have you, would you have you or yeah,
00:19:20> 00:19:23:	I think education sounds a bit better nihilistic,
00:19:23> 00:19:27:	but I I think what the question means is that
00:19:27> 00:19:31:	perhaps there's been a leakage of know how within the
00:19:31> 00:19:32:	public sector,
00:19:32> 00:19:34:	to perhaps fully analyze, measure,
00:19:34> 00:19:39:	and then manage the housing challenges that the country
	has,
00:19:39> 00:19:42:	and that then together with other stakeholders.
00:19:42> 00:19:45:	So this is a bit my my reading of of
00:19:45> 00:19:46:	the question.
00:19:46> 00:19:50:	And and you sense already at your answer is it's
00:19:50> 00:19:51:	not a quick fix,
00:19:51> 00:19:55:	if that's if that's the underlying problem that we want
00:19:55> 00:19:56:	to address,
00:19:56> 00:19:58:	because I think we need law,
00:19:58> 00:20:03:	we need perhaps to pay people in the public sector
00:20:03> 00:20:05:	a little bit more.
00:20:05> 00:20:08:	It's much more movement between public and private
00.00.00 > 00.00.44	sectors,
00:20:08> 00:20:11:	and I also think that.
00:20:11> 00:20:15:	We need to think about institutions that parapublic where they
00:20:15> 00:20:18:	are not dependent of the political cycle,
JJ. 20. 10 UU. 20. 10.	are not dependent of the political cycle,

00:20:18> 00:20:23:	which is much shorter than the cycle of most institutional
00:20:23> 00:20:24:	investors.
00:20:24> 00:20:26:	By the way, so so that you can kind of
00:20:26> 00:20:30:	create also an institution that can really in cap can
00:20:30> 00:20:33:	learn and encapsulate knowledge.
00:20:33> 00:20:36:	That's not an easy fix that needs time,
00:20:36> 00:20:39:	and I'm not sure whether time is now really what
00:20:39> 00:20:42:	you want to go for necessarily,
00:20:42> 00:20:45:	because. A crisis and we are in the post Corona
00:20:45> 00:20:46:	time,
00:20:46> 00:20:48:	I mean.
00:20:48> 00:20:51:	Ability question will be much more important than it was
00:20:51> 00:20:54:	before because we will have much more at higher levels
00:20:55> 00:20:57:	of unemployment in the European countries.
00:20:57> 00:21:01:	So the question will come back again and historically if
00:21:01> 00:21:04:	you see also for kind of what you were referring
00:21:04> 00:21:07:	to them and have rain and the Rhine central for
00:21:07> 00:21:10:	European countries, not other side of the channel.
00:21:10> 00:21:15:	Their housing fundamentals were actually established mostly out of crisis
00:21:15> 00:21:18:	and mostly out of wars or other crisis now.
00:21:18> 00:21:20:	But also financial crisis France,
00:21:20> 00:21:24:	the Netherlands had a huge reform in 211 to 12
00:21:24> 00:21:24:	or 12.
00:21:24> 00:21:29:	Something like that, and that will form of the housing
00:21:29> 00:21:31:	market both.
00:21:31> 00:21:35:	Ownership and social housing and affordable housing challenges so I
00:21:35> 00:21:35:	can access 2.
00:21:35> 00:21:38:	Three legs are quite a clever reform was the only
00:21:38> 00:21:40:	reform since the Second World War.
00:21:40> 00:21:43:	So we had a consensus after the Second World War
00:21:43> 00:21:47:	and it actually was accepted by a different political parties.
00:21:47> 00:21:49:	Everything was challenged a little bit,
00:21:49> 00:21:52:	of course, and there was some minor modifications.
00:21:52> 00:21:55:	Every now and again, but the reset button,
00:21:55> 00:21:59:	kind of that was pushed following the financial crisis because
00:21:59> 00:22:01:	some unintended consequences have gone too big.
00:22:01> 00:22:04:	And a crisis is the moment where you can.
00:22:04> 00:22:07:	Also, you know if you have the matter of courage
00:22:08> 00:22:09:	and of personality.
00:22:09> 00:22:12:	Also next to know how courage is very important that

00:22:12> 00:22:15:	you just take the bull by the horns.
00:22:15> 00:22:18:	Get some friends on the other side of your political
00:22:18> 00:22:22:	or personal convictions and say let's do this together right?
00:22:22> 00:22:26:	Because because that's that's what we want to do and
00:22:26> 00:22:29:	I guess so time is the timing is interesting for
00:22:29> 00:22:30:	Ireland.
00:22:30> 00:22:32:	Because yeah, perhaps Ireland has.
00:22:32> 00:22:36:	An opportunity to kind of engage in a little bit
00:22:36> 00:22:40:	of of of a similar ish kind of trajectory.
00:22:40> 00:22:43:	Really interesting, thank you. Have you ran with the new
00:22:43> 00:22:46:	government in place for what less than a week?
00:22:46> 00:22:48:	It couldn't be more critical time.
00:22:48> 00:22:50:	I think that points there about a long term vision
00:22:50> 00:22:54:	that managing that transition period and making sure we don't
00:22:54> 00:22:57:	turn the tap off is that incredibly important.
00:22:57> 00:22:59:	We have another really interesting question here,
00:22:59> 00:23:02:	which I'd like to go around the houses on,
00:23:02> 00:23:05:	given I believe the European context came up in in
00:23:05> 00:23:08:	the report released Webinar previously and that is a question
00:23:08> 00:23:09:	from Sean Golden,
00:23:09> 00:23:12:	which is that. What is the view of the panel
00:23:12> 00:23:15:	members on the use of balanced regional development to quell
00:23:15> 00:23:19:	the immense pressure on the market in Dublin and other
00:23:19> 00:23:23:	urban centres? For example using mechanisms to make it easier
00:23:23> 00:23:26:	for workers to work outside of Dublin or other areas
00:23:26> 00:23:29:	with drastic affordability issues.
00:23:29> 00:23:32:	I think it's it's. It's quite a an interesting one
00:23:32> 00:23:36:	because I think it's something that is discussed all across
00:23:36> 00:23:36:	Europe.
00:23:36> 00:23:41:	Nevertheless, because we have seen urbanization as the main driver
00:23:41> 00:23:44:	of the last decade or two decades or whatever that
00:23:44> 00:23:46:	created that challenge.
00:23:46> 00:23:49:	But why are people moving to the cities?
00:23:49> 00:23:52:	It simply be cause cities offer opportunities,
00:23:52> 00:23:57:	offers choice. Via jobs opportunities to get employment or whatever
00:23:57> 00:24:01:	and also it's about collaboration with colleagues,
00:24:01> 00:24:03:	friends and people and other immunities.
00:24:03> 00:24:06:	So I think the big challenge is how can you

00:24:06> 00:24:08:	make people move outside.
00:24:08> 00:24:12:	'cause if you would have the job opportunity outside for
00:24:12> 00:24:13:	the employer,
00:24:13> 00:24:14:	who then moves out there,
00:24:14> 00:24:17:	he might have the advantage being the only one.
00:24:17> 00:24:21:	So he gets his employees for from the local community.
00:24:21> 00:24:25:	Nevertheless, the talent pool is much more limited so.
00:24:25> 00:24:29:	Did the economically speaking external economies of scale that you
00:24:29> 00:24:32:	have within the city like the good example,
00:24:32> 00:24:35:	is the financial Center of London that I mean the
00:24:35> 00:24:37:	high qualified intelligent people.
00:24:37> 00:24:40:	They they all want to will be attracted to London
00:24:40> 00:24:45:	despite what's currently happening because it simply offers a
	unique
00:24:45> 00:24:49:	environment to learn to collaborate in to exchange ideas.
00:24:49> 00:24:52:	And therefore I think the challenge getting people to the
00:24:52> 00:24:54:	regions is it sounds easy.
00:24:54> 00:24:57:	And maybe the crisis can be a catalyst for some
00:24:57> 00:24:57:	of.
00:24:57> 00:25:01:	Home working being a possible solution to or work and
00:25:01> 00:25:06:	facilitate Home Office as as a part time solution for
00:25:06> 00:25:06:	that.
00:25:06> 00:25:11:	But ultimately I think urbanization will not be reversed and
00:25:11> 00:25:14:	therefore the challenge will speak to cities.
00:25:14> 00:25:16:	It's maybe not not the answer.
00:25:16> 00:25:20:	A lot of people would like to say to have,
00:25:20> 00:25:24:	but the problem is how can you create incentives for
00:25:24> 00:25:26:	companies to move out too often?
00:25:26> 00:25:28:	Jobs in regional or more.
00:25:28> 00:25:31:	Or less attractive in currently less attractive areas,
00:25:31> 00:25:36:	becausw whoever moves first has the disadvantage that he might
00:25:36> 00:25:37:	fail and which got within.
00:25:37> 00:25:39:	How do you support this?
00:25:39> 00:25:42:	And I think that's it comes back to the knowledge
00:25:42> 00:25:45:	question which other cities at the end you can find
00:25:46> 00:25:49:	a solution via better public transport that people can easier
00:25:49> 00:25:53:	commute. Maybe it's not only car related,
00:25:53> 00:25:55:	it's it's train related or whatever,
00:25:55> 00:25:57:	so that can be a solution,
00:25:57> 00:26:00:	But the question also here is that is something very
00:26:00> 00:26:01:	long term,

```
00:26:01 --> 00:26:04:
                          ten 1520 years it brings us back to where we
00:26:04 --> 00:26:05:
                          started.
00:26:05 --> 00:26:07:
                          Possibly we need a vision for the next two 1
00:26:08 --> 00:26:10:
                          two decades and not a vision for the next two
00:26:11 --> 00:26:14:
                          years and maybe 2 to add something to some years
00:26:14 --> 00:26:16:
                          words. Education has a lot to do,
00:26:16 --> 00:26:20:
                          possibly also with transparency, because I think there's a lot
00:26:20 --> 00:26:23:
                          of misconception about what costs and returns are.
00:26:23 --> 00:26:26:
                          In the public sector and what we really return in
00:26:26 --> 00:26:29:
                          the private sector is always mentioned.
00:26:29 --> 00:26:32:
                          You have to double digit returns when you when you
00:26:32 --> 00:26:34:
                          do the investments in real estate.
00:26:34 --> 00:26:37:
                          And I think if you do the classical multifamily housing,
00:26:37 --> 00:26:40:
                          I want to see where you get these double digit
00:26:40 --> 00:26:43:
                          returns with a institutional investment class.
00:26:43 --> 00:26:46:
                          I think transparency is also something that will help less
00:26:46 --> 00:26:49:
                          in addition to increased collaboration.
00:26:51 --> 00:26:55:
                          Fantastic. Thank you, bill. Do you have any views on
00:26:55 --> 00:26:59:
                          that in terms of the regional question?
00:26:59 --> 00:27:01:
                          I would actually agree with Marcus.
00:27:01 --> 00:27:05:
                          I think cities are just going to grow and I
00:27:05 --> 00:27:08:
                          think politicians don't particularly like it.
00:27:08 --> 00:27:11:
                          It doesn't suit their their voter base,
00:27:11 --> 00:27:15:
                          but the economies of scale going cities and the attraction
00:27:15 --> 00:27:18:
                          for young people to be in cities.
00:27:18 --> 00:27:20:
                          I mean I have got my children,
00:27:20 --> 00:27:24:
                          my children. I live. I live 30 miles outside Dublin
00:27:24 --> 00:27:28:
                          but all my children departed the nest more than 20
00:27:28 --> 00:27:30:
                          years ago and insist on living.
00:27:30 --> 00:27:33:
                          And in town why? Because their jobs are down the
00:27:33 --> 00:27:33:
                          road.
                          This Tennis Club is down the road.
00:27:33 --> 00:27:36:
00:27:36 --> 00:27:37:
                          The friends are down the road.
00:27:37 --> 00:27:41:
                          They go to the restaurants and they meet their friends
00:27:41 --> 00:27:43:
                          there and in many ways urban living is.
00:27:43 --> 00:27:46:
                          It is a social activity.
00:27:46 --> 00:27:49:
                          They they have an integrated life,
00:27:49 --> 00:27:52:
                          which is far more complicated than miners are.
00:27:52 --> 00:27:56:
                          My never was it's and they could not have that
00:27:56 --> 00:28:02:
                          kind of sophisticated relationship driven life in a rural location.
00:28:02 --> 00:28:05:
                          And you know the the Tennis Club is 10 minutes
00:28:05 --> 00:28:06:
                          away.
```

00:28:06> 00:28:09:	The swimming pool is 15 minutes away and my I
00:28:09> 00:28:13:	don't see my grandchildren very often because they want to
00:28:13> 00:28:16:	be in town too because their friends are in town.
00:28:16> 00:28:18:	So I think we are in a in a trend
00:28:18> 00:28:20:	which is unlikely to change.
00:28:20> 00:28:23:	But you know I've seen so many things that I
00:28:23> 00:28:25:	thought might change my life.
00:28:25> 00:28:29:	I it's possible that that technology will actually move this
00:28:29> 00:28:32:	move this around in a different way,
00:28:32> 00:28:34:	but you know. I, my grandchildren,
00:28:34> 00:28:36:	will not will want to live in in towns and
00:28:37> 00:28:38:	we want to live in large towns.
00:28:38> 00:28:41:	They want to get to the country they want to
00:28:41> 00:28:43:	get to the country in the at the weekends.
00:28:43> 00:28:46:	Of course, I mean, I call it the Paris effect.
00:28:46> 00:28:49:	People want to be in the city during the week,
00:28:49> 00:28:52:	but they want to go to the Britney over their
00:28:52> 00:28:54:	country houses at the weekend or Holidays.
00:28:54> 00:28:58:	I think that's going to be the pattern.
00:28:58> 00:29:02:	Interesting, sounds like there's a real need for infrastructure investment
00:29:02> 00:29:05:	as well to open up more locations for this kind
00:29:05> 00:29:06:	of growth overtime,
00:29:06> 00:29:09:	and it sounds like that might fall into something we
00:29:09> 00:29:12:	spoke about earlier in terms of a robust long-term plan.
00:29:12> 00:29:16:	Some of the questions coming in talk a little bit
00:29:16> 00:29:18:	about the the cost of delivery.
00:29:18> 00:29:21:	And it's really interesting because we have a different
00.23.10> 00.23.21.	narratives.
00:29:21> 00:29:24:	I think in the Irish context around what it actually
00:29:24> 00:29:25:	costs to deliver units.
00:29:25> 00:29:28:	I would be very interested in Bill to continue with
00:29:28> 00:29:29:	you there,
00:29:29> 00:29:32:	just in terms of the cost to deliver units.
00:29:32> 00:29:35:	We get some media suggesting that it's in the two
00:29:35> 00:29:38:	hundreds and yet we on the development side see a
00:29:38> 00:29:42:	very real number that's significantly greater than that.
00:29:42> 00:29:44:	Where do you see that?
00:29:44> 00:29:47:	I think it goes back to the to the to
00:29:47> 00:29:52:	the level of debate that is taking place both in
00:29:52> 00:29:56:	the media and in and very off technically is that.
00:29:56> 00:30:01:	That the. When I moved out of commercial property
	effectively

00:30:01> 00:30:02:	into residential,
00:30:02> 00:30:05:	I had no idea of the complexity of the residential
00:30:05> 00:30:08:	sector as opposed to the commercial sector.
00:30:08> 00:30:10:	The commercial sector works with tenants,
00:30:10> 00:30:12:	works with landlords, work with builders.
00:30:12> 00:30:14:	When you get into the residential sector,
00:30:14> 00:30:18:	you've got a totally different environment because you're dealing with
00:30:18> 00:30:21:	a more complicated form of real estate.
00:30:21> 00:30:23:	But you're also dealing with the media.
00:30:23> 00:30:27:	You're dealing with politicians, etc etc so.
00:30:27> 00:30:31:	The debate that take that are taking place on provision
00:30:31> 00:30:34:	of housing are are what I would call pub level
00:30:34> 00:30:38:	rather than at A&A long way from academic or informed
00:30:38> 00:30:42:	level. Ann and I think that's one of the changes
00:30:42> 00:30:45:	we have to try and achieve as as as a
00:30:45> 00:30:48:	ULI can change is trying to get people get the
00:30:48> 00:30:53:	level of debate so that people understand that delivering a
00:30:53> 00:30:57:	house you can deliver US 3 bedroom semi D today
00:30:57> 00:31:00:	in suburban Dublin cost about 350 to 400,000.
00:31:00> 00:31:03:	And less than half that is the concrete.
00:31:03> 00:31:06:	The rest of it is infrastructure around certain services,
00:31:06> 00:31:09:	etc. And taxation. There's a big chunk of taxation and
00:31:09> 00:31:13:	I'd be interested in Xavier and Marcus's views on taxation.
00:31:13> 00:31:14:	We charge we charge 13%
00:31:14> 00:31:17:	on the cost of a of building a house here,
00:31:17> 00:31:20:	and that goes straight through into the bottom line and
00:31:20> 00:31:22:	enter into rental levels.
00:31:22> 00:31:25:	And I suspect that that doesn't apply another in other
00:31:25> 00:31:26:	countries,
00:31:26> 00:31:29:	but I'd be interested to hear what their comment is
00:31:29> 00:31:30:	if I may pose a question,
00:31:30> 00:31:34:	but the. Costs are higher here.
00:31:34> 00:31:37:	It then they are in other countries.
00:31:37> 00:31:40:	Why? An? Because? Because we are an island country and
00:31:40> 00:31:43:	a lot of our materials have to be brought from
00:31:43> 00:31:44:	abroad.
00:31:44> 00:31:47:	So where are you importing steel and glass and all
00:31:47> 00:31:49:	those materials from abroad?
00:31:49> 00:31:52:	And there's an add-on cost there.
00:31:52> 00:31:56:	And the second thing is the different differential between
	houses

00:31:56> 00:31:57:	and apartments.
00:31:57> 00:32:03:	We have been traditionally very efficient at building the semi
00:32:03> 00:32:04:	detached house.
00:32:04> 00:32:08:	Most of our builders builder developers were originally
	tradesmen,
00:32:08> 00:32:11:	carpenters or block layers and so on,
00:32:11> 00:32:14:	and they know exactly how to achieve economies of scale
00:32:14> 00:32:17:	from building large numbers of semi detached houses.
00:32:17> 00:32:21:	We have not had a tradition of building apartments and
00:32:21> 00:32:23:	we do not have the economies of scale and the
00:32:24> 00:32:28:	experience that that exists in countries like Germany in building
00:32:28> 00:32:31:	apartments are cost of apartments are high because we don't
00:32:31> 00:32:33:	build many of them are.
00:32:33> 00:32:36:	Cost of housing is. Is relatively efficient,
00:32:36> 00:32:39:	so coming back to my house or 350,000 that is
00:32:39> 00:32:43:	50,000 of that nearly \$50,000 made over taxation.
00:32:43> 00:32:46:	So when you take that off your down to 300,000,
00:32:46> 00:32:50:	I'd be interested to hear what a semi detached 3
00:32:50> 00:32:54:	bedroom house cost to build in in Germany or in
00:32:54> 00:32:54:	Holland.
00:32:54> 00:32:58:	Yeah, very interesting go thank you and I think it's
00:32:58> 00:33:01:	interesting to look at the proportion of apartment living in
00:33:01> 00:33:04:	Ireland versus mainland Europe as well.
00:33:04> 00:33:07:	In terms of that level of acceptance demonstrated there and
00:33:07> 00:33:10:	we have a long way to go measured against our
00:33:10> 00:33:13:	earlier discussion there around the houses we want to live
00:33:13> 00:33:16:	in the cities we want to build and the need
00:33:16> 00:33:17:	for that infrastructure.
00:33:17> 00:33:21:	That long term vision to deliver those cities and more
00:33:21> 00:33:25:	apartments coinciding with that culture around apartment building.
00:33:25> 00:33:28:	I'm I guess one of the questions coming in further
00:33:28> 00:33:29:	to that point.
00:33:29> 00:33:32:	Actually, before I do, I would like to grab one
00:33:32> 00:33:35:	of Wills quest bills questions in there,
00:33:35> 00:33:38:	around around taxation and on the the cost stack for
00:33:38> 00:33:40:	any individual unit.
00:33:40> 00:33:43:	We see that as a very significant component as you
00:33:43> 00:33:45:	outlined there that can be 13 1/2%
00:33:45> 00:33:49:	on residential units and for us that's taking a big
00:33:49> 00:33:50:	part of the pie.
00:33:50> 00:33:53:	I'd like to pose a question to to Javier and

00:33:53> 00:33:57:	Marcus around around that and whether taxation concessions on.
00:33:57> 00:34:02:	Intermediate housing or housing generally is something you see elsewhere.
00:34:02> 00:34:03:	If I can pick that one up,
00:34:03> 00:34:06:	you know we see it definitely elsewhere,
00:34:06> 00:34:09:	and I think that's an interesting point in the premise
00:34:09> 00:34:10:	there that you know there's,
00:34:10> 00:34:12:	for instance, if I look at iPhones,
00:34:12> 00:34:14:	there's no lack in iPhones.
00:34:14> 00:34:15:	Everyone can get an iPhone,
00:34:15> 00:34:17:	and I don't eat any kind of tax subsidy to
00:34:18> 00:34:20:	buy my iPhone in housing markets across Europe.
00:34:20> 00:34:23:	the Irish situation specific, and perhaps a little bit more
00:34:23> 00:34:25:	intense and elsewhere,
00:34:25> 00:34:27:	but we have kind of broken housing markets,
00:34:27> 00:34:30:	right? So the market that kind of works for iPhones
00:34:30> 00:34:32:	kind of doesn't seem to work for.
00:34:32> 00:34:36:	For housing, so it's that's an interesting kind of starting
00:34:36> 00:34:36:	point,
00:34:36> 00:34:39:	and if you take that as a starting point that
00:34:39> 00:34:43:	you know the market doesn't seem to function,
00:34:43> 00:34:46:	the market that is currently structured so you know what
00:34:46> 00:34:49:	kind of extra work and the government taken.
00:34:49> 00:34:53:	That's a bit question, then in terms of no taxation
00:34:53> 00:34:57:	or other kinds of subsidies that the government can have
00:34:57> 00:34:59:	to kind of nudge or push prices down,
00:34:59> 00:35:03:	and behavior of people in the right direction.
00:35:03> 00:35:07:	Then of course that's isn't isn't effective instrument.
00:35:07> 00:35:10:	I think the French will have quite a lot of
00:35:10> 00:35:13:	knowledge on both the social welfare state and taxation.
00:35:13> 00:35:17:	They kind of have this logmar intermediary definition,
00:35:17> 00:35:21:	which is almost literally kind of intermediate housing,
00:35:21> 00:35:23:	right? It's the same concept,
00:35:23> 00:35:25:	and it's basically for key workers,
00:35:25> 00:35:29:	so it it's. It's actually what we're talking about.
00:35:29> 00:35:33:	And they have this kind of subsidies that are both.
00:35:33> 00:35:38:	Back to waste. Once you reduce their faith in everything
00:35:38> 00:35:39:	from 20 to 10%.
00:35:39> 00:35:42:	Considerable Ann and also you don't pay property.
00:35:42> 00:35:46:	Local property taxes for period of 20 years if you.
00:35:46> 00:35:49:	If you don't it should keep the the asset in

00:35:49> 00:35:53:	affordable housing rental brackets or there is regulation around now
00:35:54> 00:35:58:	and it has been quite effective in producing intermediate housing
00:35:58> 00:36:01:	in the Netherlands. You have drop off transfer tax.
00:36:01> 00:36:05:	It's not really Viti but it's brand protects that was
00:36:05> 00:36:06:	dropped from 6%
00:36:06> 00:36:09:	to 2% during the crisis and it's also.
00:36:09> 00:36:13:	Was also dropped. A few converted officers into raising right?
00:36:13> 00:36:16:	So that's also kind of instruments to work to work
00:36:16> 00:36:16:	with,
00:36:16> 00:36:20:	so it is an effective instrument to notch behavior.
00:36:20> 00:36:23:	But I also think that the fundamental problem at all
00:36:23> 00:36:23:	of that,
00:36:23> 00:36:27:	it's scalability. We don't have states that have a lot
00:36:27> 00:36:27:	of cash.
00:36:27> 00:36:29:	We on the end of a debt cycle,
00:36:29> 00:36:33:	don't wait. You look at the Bretton Woods styles of
00:36:33> 00:36:36:	a system that levels that we had after World War
00:36:36> 00:36:39:	were kind of restructured and now we have very high
00:36:39> 00:36:43:	levels. So I'm not sure you know how sustainable that
00:36:43> 00:36:43:	is.
00:36:43> 00:36:45:	You would want to see.
00:36:45> 00:36:47:	Also, you know what can we do in terms of
00:36:47> 00:36:51:	affordable social with a market based principles,
00:36:51> 00:36:55:	rather many impact impact investors that think that housing isn't
00:36:55> 00:36:58:	it some sensible social investment.
00:36:58> 00:37:01:	You can make a decent stable return and that doesn't
00:37:01> 00:37:03:	need to be that high.
00:37:03> 00:37:07:	And it is still competitive in this environment because interests
00:37:07> 00:37:09:	are so low if compared to,
00:37:09> 00:37:11:	for instance, state bonds so.
00:37:11> 00:37:14:	It's it's I'm not going into another direction,
00:37:14> 00:37:17:	I know, but I just want to chip it in
00:37:17> 00:37:19:	that that this point of scalability.
00:37:19> 00:37:23:	I think with all tax and subsidy questions is one
00:37:23> 00:37:26:	that you really need to think about.
00:37:26> 00:37:29:	OK, thanks earlier. I think there's a few questions coming
00:37:29> 00:37:33:	in around the content of the report and how we
00:37:33> 00:37:36:	can sort of quick snapshots as to takeaways and the
00:37:36> 00:37:40:	recommendations of the report and in advance of our

audience. 00:37:40 --> 00:37:43: Sort of getting into the detail of that report. 00:37:43 --> 00:37:45: I think it would be interesting. 00:37:45 --> 00:37:49: There's a question there from Karina works that I might 00:37:49 --> 00:37:51: ask Bill to have a look at, 00:37:51 --> 00:37:54: and in the interim I just want to look to 00:37:54 --> 00:37:56: ask Marcus if if. 00:37:56 --> 00:37:58: We could talk about John O'Connor's question here. 00:37:58 --> 00:38:01: The key messages from the UI promoting housing affordability report 00:38:01 --> 00:38:04: based on our discussion yesterday and and the great discussion 00:38:04 --> 00:38:05: we're having today. 00:38:05 --> 00:38:08: Marcus, are there some key points that you would highlight 00:38:08 --> 00:38:11: there from your experience in in the steering group for 00:38:11 --> 00:38:11: the report? 00:38:11 --> 00:38:14: We haven't touched on? 00:38:14 --> 00:38:17: I think we've we've touched on already on quite a 00:38:17 --> 00:38:19: lot of what we have experienced, 00:38:19 --> 00:38:22: but I think one of the key learning of when 00:38:22 --> 00:38:25: we set up the report and also about the project 00:38:25 --> 00:38:27: because I think for for you rely Europe. 00:38:27 --> 00:38:30: That report is not the end of the project. 00:38:30 --> 00:38:32: We want to keep that ongoing. 00:38:32 --> 00:38:35: I think what we learned is there is no one 00:38:35 --> 00:38:38: size fits all solution that you can apply across all 00:38:38 --> 00:38:42: cities across all countries or called across all regions. 00:38:42 --> 00:38:46: It's simply. The idea of the report was show examples 00:38:46 --> 00:38:49: that worked and then take your local situation. 00:38:49 --> 00:38:52: Take your local market players, 00:38:52 --> 00:38:57: your political governmental, whatever players you have and try to 00:38:57 --> 00:38:59: figure out how can it be adapted. 00:38:59 --> 00:39:02: Not saying this worked in Barcelona, 00:39:02 --> 00:39:04: so that's why we do it in Dublin. 00:39:04 --> 00:39:07: It's it's a coastal city as well, 00:39:07 --> 00:39:10: so it worked in Barcelona and should work in Dublin 00:39:10 --> 00:39:11: as well.

00:39:11 --> 00:39:15: No, no think about cleverly think about in a group

00:39:15 --> 00:39:16: with a group of.

00:39:16 --> 00:39:20: Intelligent people operating in that sector and think how can

00:39:20 --> 00:39:21: it be adapted?

00:39:21 --> 00:39:23: What do we need to change?

00:39:23> 00:39:26:	What can we take on and maybe look at other
00:39:26> 00:39:27:	examples?
00:39:27> 00:39:31:	How can we possibly integrate something that worked in that
00:39:31> 00:39:33:	that special context to that project?
00:39:33> 00:39:37:	So I think the biggest takeaway is also think about
00:39:37> 00:39:37:	it.
00:39:37> 00:39:41:	Take take a look and then discuss what can work.
00:39:41> 00:39:45:	The project of this affordability report is also to create
00:39:45> 00:39:46:	a library of.
00:39:46> 00:39:51:	Different projects across the European countries and across the cities
00:39:51> 00:39:54:	that should grow overtime so that everybody can take a
00:39:54> 00:39:55:	look at,
00:39:55> 00:39:58:	think about, and then how can it be adapted.
00:39:58> 00:40:01:	It's not to say the report tells you how to
00:40:01> 00:40:02:	do it.
00:40:02> 00:40:05:	The report should give you in ideas and ways how
00:40:05> 00:40:07:	you can tackle it,
00:40:07> 00:40:11:	and then discuss how you can implement it.
00:40:11> 00:40:15:	Fantastic collaboration and transparency. Two things that seem to be
00:40:16> 00:40:19:	coming up again and again and the calls for housing
00:40:19> 00:40:22:	Commission or Task Force seem incredibly relevant.
00:40:22> 00:40:25:	A question here from Pat Farrell that I'd like to
00:40:25> 00:40:26:	pose.
00:40:26> 00:40:29:	Or sorry I've I've skipped over the one day and
00:40:29> 00:40:29:	Bill will.
00:40:29> 00:40:33:	Carina Wilkes has asked. It has been reported that unaffordable
00:40:33> 00:40:36:	housing in England is due to four factors.
00:40:36> 00:40:39:	The shortage of land for development,
00:40:39> 00:40:42:	the lack of finance available for major infrastructure.
00:40:42> 00:40:47:	Low productivity growth in construction and insufficient market diversity or
00:40:47> 00:40:50:	a concentrated market does the panel think these apply in
00:40:50> 00:40:51:	Ireland?
00:40:51> 00:40:53:	Wonder if you have any thoughts?
00:40:53> 00:40:55:	OK, let's start on the on the I'm going to
00:40:55> 00:40:57:	ask you to repeat those questions,
00:40:57> 00:40:59:	but that start on the land one.
00:40:59> 00:41:02:	I think there is England is A is a country
00:41:02> 00:41:04:	with the population of 60,000,000 odd.
00:41:04> 00:41:07:	We have a population of just over 4 million.

```
00:41:07 --> 00:41:09:
                          We don't have a scarcity of land.
00:41:09 --> 00:41:10:
                          We are you just fly over.
00:41:10 --> 00:41:12:
                          When you're flying across Dublin,
00:41:12 --> 00:41:15:
                          you just look down and you see an awful lot
00:41:15 --> 00:41:16:
                          of green.
00:41:16 --> 00:41:20:
                          Very close to relatively close to the city center.
00:41:20 --> 00:41:23:
                          Now what we do have is a shortage of public
00:41:23 --> 00:41:26:
                          transport and particularly rail public transport.
00:41:28 --> 00:41:31:
                          Dublin is roughly the same size as in in in
00:41:31 --> 00:41:33:
                          in land area as Paris,
00:41:33 --> 00:41:35:
                          yet our population is is is 18 the size
00:41:36 --> 00:41:36:
                          of Paris.
00:41:36 --> 00:41:40:
                          But if you look at the rail service in Paris
00:41:40 --> 00:41:44:
                          you will find that they have multiple rail going out
00:41:44 --> 00:41:47:
                          of going out to the land that is available.
00:41:47 --> 00:41:50:
                          My father was a town planner and he said,
00:41:50 --> 00:41:53:
                          you say that the development followed the pipes and you
00:41:53 --> 00:41:56:
                          know that's the reality and if you look at the
00:41:56 --> 00:42:00:
                          expansion of London during the end of the beginning of
00:42:00 --> 00:42:03:
                          the last century, basically it followed the railway station,
00:42:03 --> 00:42:07:
                          railway lines. The railway lines were built very often by
00:42:07 --> 00:42:11:
                          by developers are the tube lines and kind of development
00:42:11 --> 00:42:12:
                          followed them.
00:42:12 --> 00:42:15:
                          So we we have we got caught in that development
00:42:15 --> 00:42:18:
                          followed the road so we tend to have a relatively.
00:42:18 --> 00:42:21:
                          Low density and the whole the whole emphasis here now
00:42:21 --> 00:42:24:
                          is on policy is to try and get people get
00:42:24 --> 00:42:27:
                          get density up along transport corridors.
00:42:27 --> 00:42:30:
                          The one of the one of the difficulties about that
00:42:30 --> 00:42:34:
                          here is that you can build a semi detached house.
00:42:34 --> 00:42:37:
                          I said earlier for for 350,000 out in the suburbs.
00:42:37 --> 00:42:41:
                          But when you want to build an apartment closer to
00:42:41 --> 00:42:44:
                          the city center it's going to cost you 400 or
00:42:44 --> 00:42:47:
                          450,000 for a 2 bedroom apartment.
00:42:47 --> 00:42:49:
                          But now and the problem is the market,
00:42:49 --> 00:42:53:
                          the market is not prepared to pay the price in
00:42:53 --> 00:42:56:
                          the extra price for for that for that apartment.
00:42:56 --> 00:43:00:
                          So basically we have a an anomaly here with the
00:43:00 --> 00:43:02:
                          policy of urbanization,
00:43:02 --> 00:43:05:
                          but we have a market situation which is driving sub
00:43:05 --> 00:43:06:
                          urbanization,
00:43:06 --> 00:43:10:
                          so that is an anomaly that needs to get needs
```

00:43:10> 00:43:13:	to get sorted out at at policy level and at
00:43:13> 00:43:15:	implementation level problems.
00:43:15> 00:43:20:	A second question. The low productivity growth in
00.40.00 > 00.40.04	construction and
00:43:20> 00:43:24:	insufficient market diversity or a concentrated market I,
00:43:24> 00:43:28:	I think our construction industry is remarkably robust.
00:43:28> 00:43:32:	Its ability to move from zero to producing 20,000 houses
00:43:32> 00:43:35:	in the space of three or four years is absolutely
00:43:35> 00:43:36:	remarkable.
00:43:36> 00:43:38:	So I think we have it.
00:43:38> 00:43:41:	We have a construction industry which is very good by
00:43:41> 00:43:43:	international levels,
00:43:43> 00:43:45:	I mean go back to the bad days of the
00:43:45> 00:43:48:	of the Celtic Tiger we were producing.
00:43:48> 00:43:50:	90,000 houses at the top.
00:43:50> 00:43:53:	Now I know we had we had problems with standards
00:43:53> 00:43:53:	and so on,
00:43:53> 00:43:57:	but still we we poured 90,000 foundations a year and
00:43:57> 00:43:58:	built the houses.
00:43:58> 00:44:02:	You know, we didn't necessarily building with the right place,
00:44:02> 00:44:05:	which was what was a policy problem rather than a
00:44:05> 00:44:06:	construction problem.
00:44:06> 00:44:10:	So I think our construction industry is actually very very
00:44:10> 00:44:13:	good and it is got better and better.
00:44:13> 00:44:17:	And I think the standards that have been imposed on
00:44:17> 00:44:18:	it recently.
00:44:18> 00:44:21:	Have actually improved it. I mean there was a time
00:44:21> 00:44:23:	when you were buying a new house.
00:44:23> 00:44:25:	You have to worry about about whether the proof was
00:44:25> 00:44:28:	properly was was was going to stay there.
00:44:28> 00:44:32:	Nowadays there are so much certification and specification
	checking I
00:44:32> 00:44:34:	think you know you could almost buy a house off
00:44:34> 00:44:37:	off the peg and know that it's going to be
00:44:37> 00:44:39:	as good as a car that you would get from
00:44:39> 00:44:40:	from Jaguar,
00:44:40> 00:44:42:	Arneson, wherever it happens to be.
00:44:42> 00:44:44:	So I don't think we have any problem with housing
00:44:45> 00:44:46:	standards here provided,
00:44:46> 00:44:50:	provided our enforcement continues. What was the 3rd
	question?
00:44:50> 00:44:53:	You've covered them all. You've done well.
00:44:53> 00:44:56:	So much Bill now I think of fantastic answer there

```
00:44:56 --> 00:44:59:
                          and I I think it's an interesting comparison to the
00:44:59 --> 00:45:02:
                          to the to the UK context in question that I'd
00:45:02 --> 00:45:05:
                          like to pose to to to have year is when
00:45:05 --> 00:45:08:
                          we look at a functioning affordable housing market like the
00:45:08 --> 00:45:09:
                          UK,
00:45:09 --> 00:45:12:
                          where there's sort of clear regulation and a lot of
00:45:12 --> 00:45:15:
                          investment appetite to participate in that market.
00:45:15 --> 00:45:18:
                          That's something that we are yet to see developed to
00:45:18 --> 00:45:21:
                          the same sort of scale in an Irish context.
00:45:21 --> 00:45:24:
                          What are the initial things of the first things?
00:45:24 --> 00:45:26:
                          That a housing Commission, for example,
00:45:26 --> 00:45:30:
                          needs to discuss in formulating the framework for a functional
00:45:30 --> 00:45:34:
                          affordable housing market to come into play in Ireland.
00:45:34 --> 00:45:37:
                          But funny that you would take the UK as an
00:45:37 --> 00:45:40:
                          example because we would not have chosen the UK as
00:45:40 --> 00:45:41:
                          an example,
00:45:41 --> 00:45:44:
                          it's a market worth which actually has a longstanding debate
00:45:44 --> 00:45:47:
                          since the 70s as well on there and how to
00:45:47 --> 00:45:50:
                          increase production of rental and affordable homes.
00:45:50 --> 00:45:52:
                          But that's part that I mean it's a it's a
00:45:52 --> 00:45:53:
                          different topic,
00:45:53 --> 00:45:56:
                          so I think with the key thing that we,
00:45:56 --> 00:46:00:
                          the key things were already a little bit sad so.
00:46:00 --> 00:46:03:
                          It's it's. It's a matter of courage and courage.
00:46:03 --> 00:46:06:
                          You need to kind of define a clear strategy.
00:46:06 --> 00:46:10:
                          So I think there is no lack such on knowledge
00:46:10 --> 00:46:10:
                          or data.
00:46:10 --> 00:46:14:
                          I think everyone knows more or less pretty well where
00:46:14 --> 00:46:15:
                          the problems are.
00:46:15 --> 00:46:18:
                          We need to find a consensus in Ireland.
00:46:18 --> 00:46:21:
                          So you need to kind of go with the people
00:46:21 --> 00:46:24:
                          that are on the opposite side of what you think
00:46:24 --> 00:46:26:
                          and kind of you know,
00:46:26 --> 00:46:30:
                          grab them lovingly in your arms and embrace them and
                          say no,
00:46:30 --> 00:46:30:
00:46:30 --> 00:46:32:
                          we're going into a room.
00:46:32 --> 00:46:35:
                          And we're not getting out until we have a common
00:46:35 --> 00:46:38:
                          strategy as to how we will agree on solving the
                          housing crisis.
00:46:38 --> 00:46:38:
00:46:38 --> 00:46:41:
                          That from my perspective and really boom.
00:46:41 --> 00:46:44:
                          Bust boom bust. So only market where we failed to
00:46:44 --> 00:46:46:
                          invest in Europe and in only Mark where we wanted
```

00:46:46> 00:46:49:	to invest and we failed to to invest because the
00:46:49> 00:46:52:	boom bust was kind of too complicated for me to
00:46:52> 00:46:52:	follow.
00:46:52> 00:46:54:	So I think that also the Irish.
00:46:54> 00:46:57:	It makes the Irish housing market and probably also lose
00:46:57> 00:47:00:	a lot of capital and energy because you suffer.
00:47:00> 00:47:03:	Mostly I think of this short boom bust cycle.
00:47:03> 00:47:06:	So you need kind of a strategic plan that is
00:47:07> 00:47:11:	long term and kind of involves the key stakeholders and
00:47:11> 00:47:15:	in that sense you know they'll be careful with examples,
00:47:15> 00:47:18:	but you know the kind of way that the Germans
00:47:18> 00:47:22:	or the French or the Dutch in all different degrees,
00:47:22> 00:47:26:	but they kind of seem to be able the Austrians
00:47:26> 00:47:29:	to take a long term view on solving the housing
00:47:29> 00:47:32:	market with various stakeholders.
00:47:32> 00:47:34:	And it's not. Perfect either,
00:47:34> 00:47:37:	but I think that seems to be missing in Ireland.
00:47:37> 00:47:40:	This long-term approach of consensus,
00:47:40> 00:47:43:	and I think that's the key point.
00:47:43> 00:47:46:	Thanks, thanks for being there was one question that I
00:47:46> 00:47:50:	accidentally dismissed around standards and the cost of
	delivery in
00:47:51> 00:47:51:	Ireland,
00:47:51> 00:47:55:	suggesting that the quality of housing standards is very high
00:47:51> 00:47:55: 00:47:55> 00:47:56:	suggesting that the quality of housing standards is very high by global comparison,
00:47:55> 00:47:56:	by global comparison,
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58:	by global comparison, which I would agree with.
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:09> 00:48:13:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:13> 00:48:13:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing,
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:17:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:17: 00:48:17> 00:48:20:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as as some. Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from our analysis that the standards are very robust and to
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:17: 00:48:17> 00:48:20: 00:48:20> 00:48:23:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as as some. Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:17: 00:48:17> 00:48:20:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as as some. Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from our analysis that the standards are very robust and to
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:17: 00:48:17> 00:48:20: 00:48:20> 00:48:23:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as as some. Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from our analysis that the standards are very robust and to keep pace with NS AB which is flagged in the question will need to keep those standards relatively high
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:17: 00:48:17> 00:48:20: 00:48:20> 00:48:23: 00:48:23> 00:48:27:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as as some. Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from our analysis that the standards are very robust and to keep pace with NS AB which is flagged in the question will need to keep those standards relatively high from
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:17: 00:48:17> 00:48:20: 00:48:20> 00:48:23: 00:48:23> 00:48:27:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as as some. Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from our analysis that the standards are very robust and to keep pace with NS AB which is flagged in the question will need to keep those standards relatively high from a constructability point,
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:09> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:17> 00:48:20: 00:48:20> 00:48:23: 00:48:23> 00:48:27:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as as some. Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from our analysis that the standards are very robust and to keep pace with NS AB which is flagged in the question will need to keep those standards relatively high from a constructability point, but I think you know there are other things other
00:47:55> 00:47:56: 00:47:56> 00:47:58: 00:47:58> 00:48:00: 00:48:00> 00:48:03: 00:48:04> 00:48:07: 00:48:07> 00:48:09: 00:48:13> 00:48:13: 00:48:13> 00:48:17: 00:48:17> 00:48:20: 00:48:20> 00:48:23: 00:48:23> 00:48:27: 00:48:27> 00:48:29: 00:48:29> 00:48:32: 00:48:32> 00:48:35:	by global comparison, which I would agree with. The current standards are very are very high, but it's interesting. I think it ties into alot of the other points we've discussed today around the cost of delivery and the standards for housing, whether they should be reduced or or even improved as as some. Political suggestions are at the moment I would suggest from our analysis that the standards are very robust and to keep pace with NS AB which is flagged in the question will need to keep those standards relatively high from a constructability point, but I think you know there are other things other opportunities we we can look at we can continue to

00:48:44> 00:48:45:	to be very.
00:48:45> 00:48:49:	Very intensively looked at by a very informed Council,
00:48:49> 00:48:52:	and I think the Housing Commission has a role to
00:48:52> 00:48:56:	do to oversee the development of those standards without allowing
00:48:56> 00:48:59:	any wins to influence massive shifts in those standards.
00:48:59> 00:49:03:	If we are also to achieve their sustainability goals that
00:49:03> 00:49:05:	ends up prescribed for the EU,
00:49:05> 00:49:08:	I might move on to this question from Pat Farrell
00:49:08> 00:49:09:	an important question.
00:49:09> 00:49:12:	For for targeted for Bill and that is your thoughts
00:49:12> 00:49:15:	on how we close the affordability or viability gap.
00:49:15> 00:49:18:	To assist more people to own their own homes.
00:49:23> 00:49:26:	Who is that question for Tom?
00:49:26> 00:49:31:	For me, sorry. I mean you answer is the answer
00:49:31> 00:49:33:	is it's you know.
00:49:33> 00:49:36:	We were caught it were caught in a in a
00:49:36> 00:49:37:	three legged stool.
00:49:37> 00:49:42:	Situation is affordability, cost, cost of delivery and finance.
00:49:42> 00:49:45:	I mean, those three have to to have to make
00:49:45> 00:49:47:	to make housing viable.
00:49:47> 00:49:49:	All of those have to have to be have to
00:49:49> 00:49:53:	stand together an and the the weaknesses,
00:49:53> 00:49:55:	the affordability side of it.
00:49:55> 00:50:00:	So basically who? How do you subsidize the difference between
00:50:00> 00:50:04:	what it costs about somebody can afford?
00:50:04> 00:50:06:	And I don't know the answer to that.
00:50:06> 00:50:09:	I mean there you have a concrete block and a
00:50:09> 00:50:13:	yard of gaana meter of concrete cost the same regardless
00:50:14> 00:50:16:	of who's occupying the man.
00:50:16> 00:50:18:	Water, water, salary level is.
00:50:18> 00:50:22:	So I mean, various proposals have come forward.
00:50:22> 00:50:25:	You've got the shared equity scheme in the UK where
00:50:25> 00:50:27:	the government owned 20%
00:50:27> 00:50:31:	and put up and could give you alone for that
00:50:32> 00:50:32:	amount.
00:50:32> 00:50:35:	Yes, that could work, but you know,
00:50:35> 00:50:38:	is it just simply going to put up the price
00:50:38> 00:50:42:	of houses by my increasing competition for the available
	stock?
00:50:42> 00:50:46:	I don't know. That's the state owned equity part of
00:50:46> 00:50:48:	your house is an issue.

00:50:48> 00:50:50:	I have no expertise in at all and my my
00:50:50> 00:50:54:	expertise is in the rental side and on the investment
00:50:54> 00:50:55:	side.
00:50:55> 00:50:57:	So how you do a shared equity?
00:50:57> 00:51:00:	I don't know. So then in terms of the cost
00:51:00> 00:51:01:	rental piece,
00:51:01> 00:51:04:	it was something we were intending to come back to
00:51:04> 00:51:05:	Bill.
00:51:05> 00:51:08:	But your I guess suggestions there about how we could
00:51:08> 00:51:12:	implement an effective cost rental model I think would be
00:51:13> 00:51:16:	a really interesting place to dig in a little deeper.
00:51:16> 00:51:19:	OK, some of you may have seen the paper.
00:51:19> 00:51:22:	The article I wrote in the Sunday business post last
00:51:22> 00:51:23:	10 days ago,
00:51:23> 00:51:26:	basically advocating a cost based rental model,
00:51:26> 00:51:29:	which was what was with the core of my of
00:51:29> 00:51:30:	my PhD thesis.
00:51:30> 00:51:34:	And it's very clear to me that the only way
00:51:34> 00:51:38:	to do that is through through financing and cheap financing.
00:51:38> 00:51:41:	I mean, we the example I put forward in that
00:51:41> 00:51:46:	was that you could have it with with government guarantee
00:51:46> 00:51:49:	to enable cheap financing that you would be able to
00:51:49> 00:51:53:	have a rental of about ???1000 a month or ???250
00:51:53> 00:51:53:	a week.
00:51:53> 00:51:57:	I think that's affordable in the Irish for the average
00:51:57> 00:51:59:	Irish tradesman,
00:51:59> 00:52:04:	Middle Lincoln professional. Anne. I present market rent for
00.50.04 > 00.50.00.	that
00:52:04> 00:52:09:	for that house in Dublin is probably 2000 a month
00:52:09> 00:52:12:	or more and probably moves up to 4050%
00:52:12> 00:52:15:	of the of income.
00:52:15> 00:52:18:	As mark aside early, you have to be in the
00:52:19> 00:52:22:	in the range where you're the rent paid by a tenant is is is 30%
00:52:22> 00:52:24: 00:52:24> 00:52:27:	
00:52:24> 00:52:27:	or less of their income now at at ???1000 a
	month that would fit the middle link of the average
00:52:31> 00:52:33: 00:52:35> 00:52:37:	middle income. Tenant.
00:52:37> 00:52:37:	
00:52:41> 00:52:43:	So my argument is that you can provide through an
00:52:43> 00:52:43:	appropriate vehicle,
UU.32.43/ UU.32.401	probably through the housing associations are with impact investor or
	2 - 1-2-1 - 2-1

00:52:48> 00:52:50:	impact Investor Company.
00:52:50> 00:52:55:	You can provide high volumes of affordable rental at about
00:52:55> 00:52:56:	1000 euros per month.
00:52:59> 00:53:02:	Provided you will get the support from from the state
00:53:02> 00:53:04:	and that state my proposal.
00:53:04> 00:53:08:	My specific proposal was that that was actually done through
00:53:08> 00:53:12:	the local authorities who would give known as a step
00:53:12> 00:53:15:	in agreement so they would effectively in the event of
00:53:15> 00:53:18:	the promoter of the housing going bust,
00:53:18> 00:53:21:	that the government would step in and make good.
00:53:21> 00:53:24:	The borrower with that structure in place.
00:53:24> 00:53:26:	Then the.
00:53:26> 00:53:30:	Possible to get money long term money on the market
00:53:30> 00:53:31:	at 2,
00:53:31> 00:53:34:	two and a half 3%.
00:53:34> 00:53:36:	Nearby finance cost based housing.
00:53:36> 00:53:37:	Now there was an echo.
00:53:37> 00:53:40:	There needs to be an equity element in it and
00:53:40> 00:53:42:	that can come either from.
00:53:42> 00:53:45:	Housing associations are from impact investors.
00:53:45> 00:53:49:	I have experience of working with impact investors and
	probably
00:53:49> 00:53:53:	the biggest impact investor in Ireland is the state through
00:53:54> 00:53:55:	it through its.
00:53:55> 00:53:59:	Through its investment vehicle.
00:53:59> 00:54:04:	And they are. They are interested in supporting this type
00:54:05> 00:54:08:	of of cost based rental housing.
00:54:08> 00:54:10:	So am I believe that it is doable,
00:54:10> 00:54:14:	but up to now, the Department of Finance in Ireland
00:54:14> 00:54:18:	have been absolutely resolute against any kind of guarantee system
00:54:18> 00:54:20:	in respect of borrowing.
00:54:20> 00:54:24:	Now all those kind of guarantees systems do exist in
00:54:24> 00:54:27:	virtually every other European country.
00:54:27> 00:54:29:	the Dutch have a system which is,
00:54:29> 00:54:32:	which is not quite a guarantee the government end up
00:54:33> 00:54:35:	as a long term as a long term long stop,
00:54:35> 00:54:39:	but there's there are insurance.
00:54:39> 00:54:42:	Provisions in the middle. So the guarantee is given by
00:54:42> 00:54:45:	an insurance fund with a long stop from the government.
00:54:45> 00:54:48:	But the the long and the short of it is
00:54:48> 00:54:51:	that the finance year the provider of bond financing is
00:54:51> 00:54:53:	sure that he's going to get his interest,

00:54:53> 00:54:57:	and he's going to get his money back.
00:54:57> 00:55:00:	And I don't think we are going to get cost
00:55:00> 00:55:05:	based housing unless the government changes the Department finance in
00:55:05> 00:55:10:	particular changes their approach to giving or arranging guarantees structures
00:55:10> 00:55:14:	for for long term debt.
00:55:14> 00:55:16:	That's sorry, bit long winded,
00:55:16> 00:55:18:	but that's that's it. If you want to read the
00:55:18> 00:55:22:	whole article and read the Sunday business Post 10 days
00:55:22> 00:55:22:	ago,
00:55:22> 00:55:25:	critically important bill and so important for right now.
00:55:25> 00:55:28:	So thank you so much for that outline.
00:55:28> 00:55:31:	It's interesting as as we've been working through today I've
00:55:31> 00:55:35:	had the the nine recommendations of the report to the
00:55:35> 00:55:35:	side here,
00:55:35> 00:55:38:	and it feels like we've covered a lot of ground,
00:55:38> 00:55:41:	so that's fantastic. I guess before I hand over to
00:55:41> 00:55:41:	Tom,
00:55:41> 00:55:44:	done from the ULI, the Cheruvu Island 2.
00:55:44> 00:55:46:	To provide some closing remarks,
00:55:46> 00:55:48:	I would love to go round the panel swiftly and
00:55:48> 00:55:50:	just capture any final comments.
00:55:50> 00:55:53:	Sort of an elevator wrap up from each of you
00:55:53> 00:55:56:	as to anything you think we may not have covered
00:55:56> 00:55:59:	or you think is critically important to the Irish context
00:55:59> 00:56:02:	for applying the recommendations of the urali.
00:56:02> 00:56:07:	Promoting affordable housing report today and I'd like to start
00:56:07> 00:56:08:	with Marcus.
00:56:08> 00:56:11:	If I mention it quite a several.
00:56:14> 00:56:18:	I all the things of social distancing and code.
00:56:18> 00:56:21:	Look big, look for a big round table and everybody
00:56:21> 00:56:22:	on that.
00:56:22> 00:56:25:	We exchange ideas and and discuss what your long term
00:56:25> 00:56:26:	goals are.
00:56:26> 00:56:29:	Because I think the long term goals is what you
00:56:29> 00:56:30:	easily can agree on.
00:56:30> 00:56:33:	And if you have this then work on achieving these
00:56:33> 00:56:36:	goals and therefore I think you need a big round
00:56:36> 00:56:38:	table in the current situation.
00:56:40> 00:56:42:	Really pertinent, thank you. Have yeah,
00:56:42> 00:56:43:	well you know I was.

00:57:58> 00:58:00:this kind of a complex and it seems to be00:58:00> 00:58:04:kind of pillar structure argumentation that you have an island00:58:04> 00:58:06:where you kind of cannot seem to be able to00:58:06> 00:58:09:kind of get out of the cocoon and you need00:58:09> 00:58:11:to be able to get out of the computers.00:58:11> 00:58:14:Think about those two legs and if you can exchange00:58:14> 00:58:17:very important parts for each of the protagonist and and00:58:17> 00:58:20:at least you know get together showing them that you00:58:20> 00:58:25:have the intention. Find a solution with that.00:58:30> 00:58:30:And bill. I think that my wish would be that00:58:30> 00:58:32:the level of the base.00:58:32> 00:58:36:It goes up from pub level to being an informed	00:56:43 -> 00:56:46:I was listening to Bill's last comments and I were00:56:47 -> 00:56:49:I was listening to Bill's last comments and I were00:56:49 -> 00:56:52:Cynical, but but it didn't sound optimistic to me and00:56:55 -> 00:56:55:I know Bill very optimistic and solution and creative thinkers.00:56:58 -> 00:56:58 -> 00:57:01:So you know if if if you have an idea00:57:01 -> 00:57:04 -> 00:57:04:It's very important, cannot kind of get to the level00:57:04 -> 00:57:09:know what does the other side need and what do00:57:09 -> 00:57:11:you need to give the other side.00:57:11 -> 00:57:16:be the finance Department to get them on the table.00:57:12 -> 00:57:20:And you know the housing market has kind of two00:57:20 -> 00:57:20:legs.00:57:22 -> 00:57:23:And those are interconnected and one is the rental lack00:57:29 -> 00:57:29:And those are interconnected and one is the rental lack00:57:29 -> 00:57:29:Department.00:57:29 -> 00:57:30:Department.00:57:30 -> 00:57:31:Generally is more interested in the owner occupier,00:57:32 -> 00:57:32:Generally is more interested in the owner oscupier,00:57:34 -> 00:57:41:So if you thinking about that,00:57:44 -> 00:57:44So if you thinking about that,00:57:44 -> 00:57:48 -> 00:57:51:Duiton.00:57:51 -> 00:57:51:Compromise is that you know you have to be able
---	--

00:58:37> 00:58:38:	discussion.
00:58:38> 00:58:42:	How to achieve that is is challenging?
00:58:42> 00:58:46:	They the if you I have found that if you
00:58:46> 00:58:50:	start trying to explain how the housing system works.
00:58:50> 00:58:54:	People have two interests. One is you're finishing up quickly
00:58:54> 00:58:57:	and the 2nd is what's the price of what my
00:58:57> 00:59:00:	house going to be worth in 10 years time that
00:59:00> 00:59:03:	the that it is hugely complicated and you you have
00:59:03> 00:59:07:	to lift the bonnet of the car to actually understand
00:59:07> 00:59:10:	how the engine works and so few people,
00:59:10> 00:59:13:	particularly politicians are prepared to do that.
00:59:13> 00:59:17:	Very few politicians actually understand the procurement
	process,
00:59:17> 00:59:21:	the finance process, the actual construction process.
00:59:21> 00:59:23:	And if you understand housing,
00:59:23> 00:59:27:	you have to, you have to understand the makeup and
00:59:27> 00:59:28:	and the working.
00:59:28> 00:59:32:	The motivation of the constituent parts.
00:59:32> 00:59:35:	And you know you take management,
00:59:35> 00:59:39:	the management of social housing and rental housing is is
00:59:39> 00:59:41:	complicated and it is sophisticated.
00:59:41> 00:59:45:	But again, the only person is really worried about the
00:59:45> 00:59:48:	management is it is the guy who's got a leak.
00:59:48> 00:59:52:	He's got his dishwasher leaking either his own one or
00:59:52> 00:59:54:	the one on the roof above him.
00:59:54> 00:59:56:	And that's what management is to him.
00:59:56> 00:59:58:	But you know the management,
00:59:58> 01:00:03:	the delivery, the design, they are all interconnecting parts.
01:00:03> 01:00:08:	Which which are not really understood and people and don't
01:00:08> 01:00:09:	get discussed.
01:00:09> 01:00:12:	The pub in the in the pub discussion and we
01:00:12> 01:00:16:	have so many pub discussions on television and it's wonderful
01:00:16> 01:00:16:	there.
01:00:16> 01:00:19:	Media love it because basically you get three people in
01:00:19> 01:00:22:	and a lot of different views on design that have
01:00:22> 01:00:26:	different views on financing and off you go for an
01:00:26> 01:00:30:	hours entertainment with with with for the actual media
	sponsor.
01:00:30> 01:00:32:	So get the level of debate up and I think
01:00:32> 01:00:33:	that our housing,
01:00:33> 01:00:37:	age, Housing, Housing Commission backed up by a housing research

01:00:37 --> 01:00:38: unit, 01:00:38 --> 01:00:41: we don't have a housing research unit we did have. 01:00:41 --> 01:00:43: About 30 years ago in the forest, 01:00:43 --> 01:00:45: for better. But we really need an in depth housing 01:00:45 --> 01:00:49: research unit which is respected by all the players and 01:00:49 --> 01:00:52: which can which can pronounce authoritatively on issues as they 01:00:52 --> 01:00:54: come up. 01:00:54 --> 01:00:57: Interesting thanks bill. And with that I might hand over 01:00:57 --> 01:01:00: to Tom Dunn and thank you from myself to all 01:01:00 --> 01:01:01: of the panelists. 01:01:01 --> 01:01:04: Super interesting Tom and thanks very much Marcus. 01:01:04 --> 01:01:07: That was really interesting conversation discussion. 01:01:07 --> 01:01:11: I thought the quality of the debate taking Bill's point 01:01:11 --> 01:01:14: about the level of debate that point the bill made, 01:01:14 --> 01:01:17: certainly would not apply to the conversation. 01:01:17 --> 01:01:18: I think we've had here today. 01:01:18 --> 01:01:21: I think it's been really in depth and it was 01:01:21 --> 01:01:24: of course founded on that very good report that the ULI. 01:01:25 --> 01:01:25: 01:01:25 --> 01:01:27: Has produced and that is one of the strengths and 01:01:28 --> 01:01:30: one of the great benefits that the UI provides in 01:01:30 --> 01:01:31: a country like Ireland. 01:01:31 --> 01:01:34: Whereas Bill says the level of debate needs to be 01:01:34 --> 01:01:37: opted and the UI is making a serious contribution to 01:01:37 --> 01:01:37: that, 01:01:37 --> 01:01:40: I think through producing reports like this. 01:01:40 --> 01:01:42: Can I just make a couple of observations? 01:01:42 --> 01:01:45: First of all, I think Marcus made the point that 01:01:45 --> 01:01:46: often. 01:01:46 --> 01:01:49: Solutions to crisis come solutions to problems, 01:01:49 --> 01:01:52: crisis. I was struck by the point you made that 01:01:52 --> 01:01:56: you know the long term settle settled approach to housing 01:01:56 --> 01:02:00: was only upset by the financial crisis and presumably will 01:02:00 --> 01:02:01: be upset by this crisis too, 01:02:01 --> 01:02:05: and that this crisis is an opportunity to do something 01:02:05 --> 01:02:08: about on about the long term way we've been doing 01:02:08 --> 01:02:09: things, 01:02:09 --> 01:02:13: particularly in Ireland. And I think this crisis does provide 01:02:13 --> 01:02:14: an opportunity, and I think what Bill was saying. 01:02:14 --> 01:02:16: 01:02:16 --> 01:02:19: Is right that we need some sort of long?

01:02:19> 01:02:24:	Term well constructed discussion about housing in Ireland fitting all
01:02:24> 01:02:27:	the great the actors together and making sure that they
01:02:27> 01:02:31:	all interact and understand the way each other comes at
01:02:31> 01:02:34:	the problem. I I just would make one observation on
01:02:34> 01:02:38:	that which I don't think came up in this conversation,
01:02:38> 01:02:41:	but I think it's kind of important and that is
01:02:41> 01:02:44:	that there's an ideological issue in housing.
01:02:44> 01:02:47:	If I look across the solutions that are put forward
01:02:47> 01:02:50:	in Ireland you can see deep ideological.
01:02:50> 01:02:53:	Foundations for a lot of these which come from views
01:02:53> 01:02:55:	about how big a state we should have.
01:02:55> 01:02:58:	For example, you know in in one world view if
01:02:58> 01:03:01:	the state gets involved and captures a lot of the
01:03:01> 01:03:02:	resource is well,
01:03:02> 01:03:04:	then it will have a lot of resource is to
01:03:04> 01:03:08:	provide housing for a greater proportion of the population than,
01:03:08> 01:03:10:	for instance is done in Ireland.
01:03:10> 01:03:14:	So the ideology about housing is something that maybe you
01:03:14> 01:03:14:	will.
01:03:14> 01:03:17:	I should start thinking about a little bit.
01:03:17> 01:03:18:	So with those few remarks,
01:03:18> 01:03:20:	can I just thank yourself?
01:03:20> 01:03:23:	Comfort doing a great job of moderating a weapon are
01:03:23> 01:03:26:	which is that skill to be watched in the future,
01:03:26> 01:03:29:	because probably we're going to have more of these.
01:03:29> 01:03:32:	If this is the way the world is going to
01:03:32> 01:03:32:	go.
01:03:32> 01:03:35:	And I think thank Marcus and Xavierre for coming in
01:03:35> 01:03:37:	and giving us the benefit of that.
01:03:37> 01:03:40:	I would make the observation that I think somebody in
01:03:40> 01:03:43:	the course of their conversation made the point that asked
01:03:44> 01:03:45:	about the situation.
01:03:45> 01:03:47:	In the UK. One of the problems in Ireland we
01:03:47> 01:03:50:	have been bedevilled with trying to solve problems.
01:03:50> 01:03:53:	Has been that is the first port of call because
01:03:53> 01:03:54:	we speak English,
01:03:54> 01:03:57:	they speak English. If we've got a problem often the
01:03:57> 01:03:59:	first thing we do is find out what has been
01:03:59> 01:04:02:	done in the UK and that overly influences us.
01:04:02> 01:04:04:	I think one of the benefits for island of the

01:04:04 --> 01:04:07: UK leaving the European Union is we might stop ourselves 01:04:07 --> 01:04:10: doing that because I think a lot of the problems 01:04:10 --> 01:04:12: that we have are not going to be solved by 01:04:12 --> 01:04:14: looking to what has been done in the UK and 01:04:14 --> 01:04:17: I think that's been the case for for about half 01:04:17 --> 01:04:19: a century for more than half century for hundred. 01:04:19 --> 01:04:21: Since you so can I thank Marcus. 01:04:21 --> 01:04:24: Xavier for coming in and giving us the benefit of 01:04:24 --> 01:04:25: their worldview. 01:04:25 --> 01:04:27: I think this is probably important. 01:04:27 --> 01:04:31: Can I thank Andy for organizing this and putting together? 01:04:31 --> 01:04:33: And of course, the UI staff are doing all this. 01:04:33 --> 01:04:36: These things don't come together that easily. 01:04:36 --> 01:04:38: They take a bit of technology and take a bit 01:04:38 --> 01:04:40: of effort to put together. 01:04:40 --> 01:04:42: So can I just say thanks very much? 01:04:42 --> 01:04:45: I actually don't know how you clap on webinars. 01:04:45 --> 01:04:46: Tom, do you know? 01:04:50 --> 01:04:52: Usually at the end of these sessions, 01:04:52 --> 01:04:54: there's a big round of applause, 01:04:54 --> 01:04:56: so I don't know if zoom has constructed at a 01:04:56 --> 01:04:58: button that I should press, 01:04:58 --> 01:05:01: or you should fast to simulate that round of applause, 01:05:01 --> 01:05:03: but maybe we will do this waving her hands as 01:05:04 --> 01:05:06: they do in the in the in the death circles 01:05:06 --> 01:05:07: you know. 01:05:07 --> 01:05:09: So thank you very much for coming along, 01:05:09 --> 01:05:12: and may I also thank the audience and the people 01:05:12 --> 01:05:14: who participated in this seminar, 01:05:14 --> 01:05:16: because I think this is very important. 01:05:16 --> 01:05:19: Still made the point. To have a discussion and to 01:05:19 --> 01:05:21: raise the level of debate in Ireland so can I 01:05:21 --> 01:05:24: ask each of you to go away with those words. 01:05:24 --> 01:05:26: That Bill said that we've got to elevate the level 01:05:26 --> 01:05:29: of conversation about housing in Ireland from the level of 01:05:29 --> 01:05:30: the pub, 01:05:30 --> 01:05:32: and we've done a good work on that today. 01:05:32 --> 01:05:35: So thank you all very much. 01:05:35 --> 01:05:37: Thank you, thank you there. 01:05:40 --> 01:05:42: Now who presses what button?

This video transcript has been machine-generated, so it may not be accurate. It is for personal use only. Reproduction or use without written permission is prohibited. If you have a correction or for permission inquiries, please contact .