

# Webinar

## ULI Philadelphia: Benefits and Burdens: Case Studies in Transportation Equity in the Philadelphia Region

Date: June 02, 2021

**00:00:05 --> 00:00:09:** Good morning everyone and welcome to this morning's program.

**00:00:09 --> 00:00:14:** Focus on equity in infrastructure investments presented by ULI Philadelphia.

**00:00:14 --> 00:00:19:** I'm Alan bracek. I in the UI Philadelphia District Council chair and a principle at our spruce here in Philadelphia.

**00:00:19 --> 00:00:23:**

**00:00:23 --> 00:00:26:** A little housekeeping stuff before we get started,

**00:00:26 --> 00:00:29:** please leave your videos on were fairly small group.

**00:00:29 --> 00:00:30:** So finally your videos on.

**00:00:30 --> 00:00:34:** But we do ask you to keep yourself muted.

**00:00:34 --> 00:00:37:** In deference to the number of speakers that we have

**00:00:37 --> 00:00:38:** here today,

**00:00:38 --> 00:00:41:** feel free to use your chat button to introduce yourselves

**00:00:41 --> 00:00:45:** with your name and organization so everyone knows who's here

**00:00:45 --> 00:00:49:** and you're welcome to have chat conversations when presentation is

**00:00:49 --> 00:00:52:** going on. You can also enter any questions that you

**00:00:52 --> 00:00:55:** might have in the chat in our moderators will do

**00:00:55 --> 00:00:58:** their best to get to as many as possible in

**00:00:58 --> 00:01:01:** the presentation. When remind everybody,

**00:01:01 --> 00:01:05:** this is being recorded so people can get to it

**00:01:05 --> 00:01:05:** later.

**00:01:05 --> 00:01:08:** And with that I want to thank our sponsors for

**00:01:08 --> 00:01:10:** their support for this presentation.

**00:01:10 --> 00:01:14:** And. That includes our annual sponsors,

**00:01:14 --> 00:01:19:** urban visionaries. Diamond leadership circle and platinum sponsors,

**00:01:19 --> 00:01:21:** as well as her gold,

00:01:21 --> 00:01:23: silver and friends sponsors.  
00:01:25 --> 00:01:28: Without the support of those sponsors,  
00:01:28 --> 00:01:30: none of this, including this presentation,  
00:01:30 --> 00:01:34: would be possible. So we say thank you to them.  
00:01:34 --> 00:01:37: But if you're not familiar with the Urban Land Institute,  
00:01:37 --> 00:01:39: let me just say a few words about it or  
00:01:39 --> 00:01:42: mission is to shape the future of the built environment  
00:01:42 --> 00:01:45: for transformative impact in communities worldwide.  
00:01:45 --> 00:01:48: And we do that by connecting just as we're doing  
00:01:48 --> 00:01:49: here today.  
00:01:49 --> 00:01:52: By leading.  
00:01:52 --> 00:01:53: Bye.  
00:01:53 --> 00:01:58: Inspiring the best land use practices.  
00:01:58 --> 00:02:01: We've got 45,000 practitioners worldwide.  
00:02:01 --> 00:02:03: Of those about 900 or in Philadelphia,  
00:02:03 --> 00:02:07: and they range from not just the Philadelphia metro area  
00:02:07 --> 00:02:10: but also the state of Delaware or Southern New Jersey.  
00:02:10 --> 00:02:12: Beleaguered valley in central Pennsylvania.  
00:02:14 --> 00:02:17: Our Members make everything happen here.  
00:02:17 --> 00:02:21: Everything we do here is driven by Members who volunteer  
00:02:21 --> 00:02:25: both their time and their expertise to lead and to  
00:02:25 --> 00:02:26: contribute content.  
00:02:26 --> 00:02:29: We have 20 different councils and committees,  
00:02:29 --> 00:02:33: all of whom share educational experiences to advance the  
land,  
00:02:33 --> 00:02:38: use dialogue and have a positive impact in their communities  
00:02:38 --> 00:02:39: in our industry.  
00:02:39 --> 00:02:42: I want to take just a few minutes to highlight  
00:02:42 --> 00:02:44: some of the things that we've been doing over the  
00:02:44 --> 00:02:45: past year.  
00:02:45 --> 00:02:48: We do a lot of support for public policy work.  
00:02:48 --> 00:02:51: We have partnered with the City of Philadelphia on issues  
00:02:51 --> 00:02:53: such as the future of work on Life sciences,  
00:02:53 --> 00:02:56: on housing, affordability and sustainability.  
00:02:56 --> 00:02:58: You may have noted if you remember,  
00:02:58 --> 00:03:00: or if you're on our mailing list that we just  
00:03:01 --> 00:03:04: issued a report on naturally occurring affordable housing that  
we've  
00:03:04 --> 00:03:07: been working on with the City of Philadelphia for the  
00:03:07 --> 00:03:09: past year and a half.  
00:03:09 --> 00:03:12: We also have an advisory services program that allows  
members  
00:03:12 --> 00:03:16: to volunteer their expertise in support of public sector land

00:03:16 --> 00:03:17: use questions.

00:03:17 --> 00:03:20: We're also expanding and moving forward with a variety of

00:03:20 --> 00:03:21: programming,

00:03:21 --> 00:03:24: such as today's conversation and initiatives around our diversity,

00:03:24 --> 00:03:28: equity and inclusion work, including continuing to build our urban

00:03:28 --> 00:03:29: plan program,

00:03:29 --> 00:03:31: which we launched last year.

00:03:31 --> 00:03:34: This is a real estate training program that we've launched

00:03:34 --> 00:03:35: in high schools,

00:03:35 --> 00:03:38: colleges, community groups and for public officials.

00:03:38 --> 00:03:41: We also offer training to Arceo leaders and other community

00:03:41 --> 00:03:42: leaders.

00:03:42 --> 00:03:43: A couple of months ago,

00:03:43 --> 00:03:47: and there's more coming. This is a great volunteer opportunity.

00:03:47 --> 00:03:50: For our Members to get out into the community and

00:03:50 --> 00:03:52: offer support for land use issues.

00:03:52 --> 00:03:55: This and other programs that we're doing our part of

00:03:55 --> 00:03:58: our ongoing commitment to advancing diversity,

00:03:58 --> 00:04:01: equity and inclusion in our industry in an organization you

00:04:01 --> 00:04:06: are welcome to go to **[email protected]** to see Rdy framework

00:04:06 --> 00:04:09: and also to measure the progress that we're making against

00:04:09 --> 00:04:12: the commitments that we've made there.

00:04:12 --> 00:04:15: All of this just scratches the surface of what we

00:04:15 --> 00:04:15: do,

00:04:15 --> 00:04:18: so if you're not a member or if you are

00:04:18 --> 00:04:20: a member and not involved,

00:04:20 --> 00:04:22: we invite you to join us organization.

00:04:22 --> 00:04:25: As I said earlier, is fueled completely by our Members.

00:04:27 --> 00:04:29: If you haven't gotten involved yet,

00:04:29 --> 00:04:31: we hope you'll join us,

00:04:31 --> 00:04:33: especially in these changing and uncertain times.

00:04:33 --> 00:04:37: It's our mission to serve as a resource for connection

00:04:37 --> 00:04:41: and best practices to support our region in recovering and

00:04:41 --> 00:04:42: moving forward.

00:04:42 --> 00:04:45: So finally, before I pass things off to very see

00:04:45 --> 00:04:48: more of DVR PC to provide some background on the

00:04:48 --> 00:04:51: research will hear about I want to thank our seven

00:04:51 --> 00:04:55: ULI advisors who volunteer their time earlier this semester to

00:04:55 --> 00:04:59: check in with students under approach and under work

today.

**00:04:59 --> 00:05:02:** It's been a privilege to support the students throughout this

**00:05:02 --> 00:05:03:** semester.

**00:05:03 --> 00:05:06:** So now to hear more about the scope of this

**00:05:06 --> 00:05:06:** project,

**00:05:06 --> 00:05:10:** I'd like to welcome very Seymour Executive director of the

**00:05:10 --> 00:05:13:** Delaware Valley Regional Planning Commission.

**00:05:13 --> 00:05:15:** Thanks Alan and any good morning everybody.

**00:05:15 --> 00:05:18:** Glad to be here with you and you a lion

**00:05:18 --> 00:05:19:** and the student teams.

**00:05:19 --> 00:05:22:** I should note I'm a proud member of You ally

**00:05:22 --> 00:05:26:** and a member of the Executive Committee so always appreciated

**00:05:26 --> 00:05:29:** you allies role in in the region and glad we

**00:05:29 --> 00:05:33:** can partner on this. So the dollar value Regional Planning

**00:05:33 --> 00:05:38:** Commission is coordinates a series of events throughout the region.

**00:05:38 --> 00:05:43:** Particularly, we have a core role around transportation planning under

**00:05:43 --> 00:05:44:** federal law.

**00:05:44 --> 00:05:47:** We are required to prepare a long range plan.

**00:05:47 --> 00:05:52:** We prepare the capital program for transportation investments across 9

**00:05:52 --> 00:05:57:** county region in southern New Jersey and Southeastern Pennsylvania.

**00:05:57 --> 00:06:00:** Sometimes were engaged in project planning,

**00:06:00 --> 00:06:04:** sometimes were engaged in preliminary design.

**00:06:04 --> 00:06:08:** We work with our partners on outreach,

**00:06:08 --> 00:06:10:** but we don't.

**00:06:10 --> 00:06:13:** Own any facilities? We don't build any facilities.

**00:06:13 --> 00:06:15:** We don't maintain any facilities.

**00:06:15 --> 00:06:19:** We were where the planners who work on the early

**00:06:19 --> 00:06:21:** stage and I think like most planners,

**00:06:21 --> 00:06:25:** we tend to think of ourselves as.

**00:06:25 --> 00:06:29:** As the good guys we work on it with communities

**00:06:29 --> 00:06:34:** for planning in in their local local communities,

**00:06:34 --> 00:06:40:** neighborhoods. We are active in terms of outreach and input.

**00:06:40 --> 00:06:44:** We listen, we try to listen.

**00:06:44 --> 00:06:48:** Equity is is really baked into to so much of

**00:06:48 --> 00:06:51:** what we do and has been for a very,

**00:06:51 --> 00:06:53:** very long time. You know,

**00:06:53 --> 00:06:55:** in fact, the idea of,

**00:06:55 --> 00:07:00:** well, the idea of environmental justice goes back back many

00:07:00 --> 00:07:00: decades.

00:07:00 --> 00:07:05: But the specific federal rules that require a focus on

00:07:05 --> 00:07:10: environmental justice really dates from the mid 90s and

00:07:10 --> 00:07:13: the Clinton administration over 25 years ago,

00:07:13 --> 00:07:18: which put out an executive order which still stands to

00:07:18 --> 00:07:19: this day,

00:07:19 --> 00:07:24: which effectively says that any federally funded activity.

00:07:24 --> 00:07:28: Should not unduly burden any communities and the spending

00:07:28 --> 00:07:34: of federal funds should equitably share the benefits across

00:07:34 --> 00:07:36: communities.

00:07:34 --> 00:07:36: And I think that's simple.

00:07:36 --> 00:07:38: Idea has guided our work to this day.

00:07:38 --> 00:07:42: It's been over 20 years since we've put together a

00:07:42 --> 00:07:47: strategy for the fair treatment and meaningful involvement of

00:07:47 --> 00:07:48: all

00:07:47 --> 00:07:48: people.

00:07:48 --> 00:07:52: We developed our own methodology to look at indicators of

00:07:52 --> 00:07:56: potential disadvantage at a neighborhood level.

00:07:56 --> 00:07:59: And we use that to assess conditions as as we

00:07:59 --> 00:08:04: work across the region and an within individual communities

00:08:04 --> 00:08:08: to understand the specific dynamics within a community.

00:08:08 --> 00:08:11: So it's very much baked into our DNA.

00:08:11 --> 00:08:15: But having said that, there's also of course the legacy

00:08:15 --> 00:08:16: of planning,

00:08:16 --> 00:08:20: which is not always been great.

00:08:20 --> 00:08:23: And we need to acknowledge that there's been a legacy

00:08:23 --> 00:08:27: both of in housing and an in land development and

00:08:27 --> 00:08:30: an in transportation that that has had negative impacts on

00:08:30 --> 00:08:35: communities. So last year following the I think really following

00:08:35 --> 00:08:36: the Black Lives Matter,

00:08:36 --> 00:08:39: protests and the killing of George Floyd,

00:08:39 --> 00:08:41: we did a bit of a kind of a self

00:08:41 --> 00:08:45: examination to understand what our history is been and what

00:08:45 --> 00:08:48: our impact has been and run to take a number

00:08:48 --> 00:08:50: of projects this year around.

00:08:50 --> 00:08:53: Looking at minority mobility and looking at.

00:08:53 --> 00:08:57: Fair equity, but we also talked about what has been

00:08:57 --> 00:08:59: the legacy of project development,

00:08:59 --> 00:09:01: some of which we've been involved with,

00:09:01 --> 00:09:03: some of which perhaps not,

00:09:03 --> 00:09:07: and around that time I was contacted by John McLaughlin

00:09:07 --> 00:09:08: from Temple University,  
00:09:08 --> 00:09:11: who said, hey, I have a group of students in  
00:09:11 --> 00:09:15: a studio that's looking for a project you have anything  
00:09:15 --> 00:09:15: for us,  
00:09:15 --> 00:09:18: and we said we got a project for you,  
00:09:18 --> 00:09:20: so one thing led to another,  
00:09:20 --> 00:09:22: and Joanne, his colleague Jeffrey Dasha,  
00:09:22 --> 00:09:26: and. Came together actually two classes,  
00:09:26 --> 00:09:29: one in Master City and regional planning,  
00:09:29 --> 00:09:32: one in the public policy program and Joe and Jeff  
00:09:32 --> 00:09:36: put together a great group of students who really undertook  
00:09:36 --> 00:09:38: a pretty amazing research project.  
00:09:38 --> 00:09:41: So really glad that we were able to partner with  
00:09:41 --> 00:09:41: them.  
00:09:41 --> 00:09:45: Just tremendously impressed by the work that they were able  
00:09:45 --> 00:09:48: to do in a very short period of time.  
00:09:48 --> 00:09:51: And that's what you're going to hear about today.  
00:09:51 --> 00:09:54: So with that I am very happy and proud to  
00:09:54 --> 00:09:56: turn it over to the student team.  
00:09:56 --> 00:09:58: Looking into it and not sure who's who's speaking first,  
00:09:58 --> 00:10:01: but I'll let yetley you each introduce yourselves.  
00:10:06 --> 00:10:09: Good morning everyone. I'm I'm going to be the one  
00:10:09 --> 00:10:12: sharing my slides or sharing screens today so my name  
00:10:12 --> 00:10:13: is Kareem Brooms.  
00:10:13 --> 00:10:16: I was the principle writer for the market Franklin line  
00:10:17 --> 00:10:20: reconstruction case and I'm a part of the national public  
00:10:20 --> 00:10:21: policy team.  
00:10:21 --> 00:10:23: Thank you for attending and.  
00:10:25 --> 00:10:27: Here to you know, review our findings.  
00:10:39 --> 00:10:42: Hi, I'm Lucas. I'm a member of the Master public  
00:10:42 --> 00:10:45: policy team and I helped on all of the case  
00:10:45 --> 00:10:45: studies.  
00:10:51 --> 00:10:54: Alright, thanks for sharing cream and Lucas and thank you  
00:10:54 --> 00:10:58: very for that very kind introduction and for also providing  
00:10:58 --> 00:11:01: us with the opportunity to receive your PC this semester.  
00:11:01 --> 00:11:04: You are also helpful and generous with your time and  
00:11:04 --> 00:11:07: admit are many questions and requests and so we really  
00:11:07 --> 00:11:08: appreciate it.  
00:11:08 --> 00:11:10: But hello everyone, my name is Andrew Hall.  
00:11:10 --> 00:11:13: I'm part of the masters in city and Regional planning  
00:11:13 --> 00:11:16: team and together with my colleagues autumn,  
00:11:16 --> 00:11:19: Shawn's Korean grooms, Brandon Liberty and Lucas

Oschman will be presenting as we've said the transportation equity. Analysis framework that we proposed your PC to apply to current and future projects as well as the recommendations that we produced as part of our Joint Capstone project. I'd like to note that all graphics that are in the presentation or taken from the full report which is hosted on Temple's website and I believe a copy will be shared with the attendees today. Next time, please. So while give, your PC has historically been a leader in equity among IPOs following the murder of George Floyd and resulting internal conversations among DVR PC staff. The Commission wanted a framework to evaluate the impacts the past projects had on equity working concert between the public policy and city, regional planning programs, or 13 person team created a framework based on best practices, practices among both NPO's and academic literature. The two teams analyze the project seen here on screen, selected from a list of your PC provided us. Our goal was to cover urban, suburban, rural portions of the region. In addition to covering a mix of transportation modes used throughout the region. Our process to create an equity framework and a value wait. These projects was an extensive one. It consisted of many conversations with DVR, PC, staff and project stakeholders, and lots of research from public records, white papers, research reports, academic literature, newspapers, environmental impact statements and materials found through the Temple, Urban Archives and Library. Together, the research allowed us to paint a fine green picture of the history of equity in regional transportation projects. In completing the report we wanted, especially to ensure that we presented the findings and

recommendations  
00:12:57 --> 00:12:59: to policy experts such as yourselves.  
00:12:59 --> 00:13:02: As well as the final publication being available to all,  
00:13:02 --> 00:13:04: we don't want this information to sit on the shelf  
00:13:04 --> 00:13:07: and we really wanted to do our best to ensure  
00:13:07 --> 00:13:10: that the conclusions were accessible to all those interested in  
00:13:10 --> 00:13:12: applying them and also before I move on.  
00:13:12 --> 00:13:14: We did want to give a special thanks to the  
00:13:14 --> 00:13:15: UI advisory panel some,  
00:13:15 --> 00:13:17: and I see in the audience today you all were  
00:13:17 --> 00:13:20: so generous with your time and expertise in a review  
00:13:20 --> 00:13:23: of our initial findings and we really appreciate that it  
00:13:23 --> 00:13:25: was a really important meeting and you'll see Nuggets of  
00:13:26 --> 00:13:28: insight that you all provided spread throughout the report.  
00:13:34 --> 00:13:37: So the grounding root of our equity framework was Title  
00:13:37 --> 00:13:38: 6 in the ejs ecutive order.  
00:13:38 --> 00:13:42: Anyone who's working with federal dollars that fund  
transportation must  
00:13:42 --> 00:13:44: abide by these two federal mandates,  
00:13:44 --> 00:13:48: which layout populations that are explicitly protected from  
discrimination.  
00:13:48 --> 00:13:52: Different interpretations of the wording protecting these  
populations from discrimination  
00:13:52 --> 00:13:55: have led to different interpretations of equity,  
00:13:55 --> 00:13:57: all of which can be supported by the legal framework.  
00:14:04 --> 00:14:07: So seen here is our chart that's based on transportation  
00:14:07 --> 00:14:08: equity experts,  
00:14:08 --> 00:14:12: Barnes and Golems, 2018. Analysis of equity standards of  
the  
00:14:12 --> 00:14:15: at the largest NPO's in the United States.  
00:14:15 --> 00:14:19: We identified six. We can find 5 different levels of  
00:14:19 --> 00:14:20: equity impact.  
00:14:20 --> 00:14:23: All these levels of equity impact have basis under the  
00:14:23 --> 00:14:27: current regulatory environment and range from a strict  
reading of  
00:14:27 --> 00:14:29: an absence of discrimination which is level 0.  
00:14:29 --> 00:14:34: Non discrimination to reading that emphasizes greater  
benefits going to  
00:14:34 --> 00:14:38: historically disadvantaged groups or to address past wrongs  
which is  
00:14:38 --> 00:14:39: level 4 vertical equity.  
00:14:39 --> 00:14:42: A more detailed discussion of these levels of impact can  
00:14:42 --> 00:14:43: be found on our full report.



00:14:47 --> 00:14:51: Additionally, taking guidance from the Victoria Transport Policy Institute,

00:14:51 --> 00:14:55: we also identified six teams of equity which address differing

00:14:55 --> 00:14:57: types of impacted project they have.

00:14:57 --> 00:15:00: These six teams, which as you can see your process

00:15:00 --> 00:15:01: protected classes,

00:15:01 --> 00:15:04: access environment, economics and funding cover a broad range of

00:15:05 --> 00:15:07: the types of impact the project might have on equity

00:15:07 --> 00:15:10: for residents nearby as well as the region as a

00:15:10 --> 00:15:13: whole. Again, a detailed discussion of these things can be

00:15:13 --> 00:15:14: found in our full report.

00:15:19 --> 00:15:21: So see here are our final valuations for the 8

00:15:21 --> 00:15:23: case studies that the team researched.

00:15:23 --> 00:15:27: You'll note that projects may be listed as a relatively

00:15:27 --> 00:15:29: high level equity on one axis below on others,

00:15:29 --> 00:15:33: depending on how they impacted communities.

00:15:33 --> 00:15:35: The whole street. The major differences between projects.

00:15:35 --> 00:15:37: Electric your attention to the two projects on the far

00:15:38 --> 00:15:39: right side of the screen,

00:15:39 --> 00:15:42: which orenji 29 in this Google River Trail.

00:15:42 --> 00:15:44: ND 29 has a poor equity score across all dimensions,

00:15:44 --> 00:15:48: but especially in the protected classes and access themes.

00:15:48 --> 00:15:51: The low score is due to severe and disproportionate impacts

00:15:51 --> 00:15:55: that NT 29 had all of these populations without improving

00:15:55 --> 00:15:56: access to jobs and services.

00:15:56 --> 00:16:00: Contrast Ng 29 slow score with this Google River Trail

00:16:00 --> 00:16:03: in which the Axis is a four instead of a

00:16:03 --> 00:16:03: 0.

00:16:03 --> 00:16:06: With the access, another higher scores for the scriptural indicator

00:16:07 --> 00:16:09: that the trail really did improve equity in the region,

00:16:09 --> 00:16:11: while NJ 29 did not.

00:16:11 --> 00:16:14: In addition, since we'll be hearing more about this project

00:16:14 --> 00:16:16: from Johnson later in the presentation,

00:16:16 --> 00:16:18: I want to point out the I 676 --

00:16:18 --> 00:16:20: 3 X ray chart, which is located on the top

00:16:20 --> 00:16:21: row,

00:16:21 --> 00:16:23: second from the left side.

00:16:23 --> 00:16:27: It's clear that why I 676 did not have major.

00:16:27 --> 00:16:31: Majorly inequitable impacts from an access perspective rated fairly poorly

00:16:31 --> 00:16:32: in process and protected classes.

00:16:32 --> 00:16:36: Themes which will be discussed in further detail later in  
00:16:36 --> 00:16:37: our presentation.  
00:16:37 --> 00:16:38: Next slide.  
00:16:40 --> 00:16:43: Some of our findings that the research found involved some  
00:16:43 --> 00:16:46: overarching conclusions about transportation in your PC  
region.  
00:16:46 --> 00:16:50: Historically, the region prioritized white suburban residence  
just as much  
00:16:50 --> 00:16:51: as the rest of the country did,  
00:16:51 --> 00:16:56: leaving residents and communities of color and members of  
other  
00:16:56 --> 00:16:58: protected classes at a disadvantage.  
00:16:58 --> 00:17:02: Well, more people process more equitable processes have  
been in  
00:17:02 --> 00:17:02: place recently,  
00:17:02 --> 00:17:06: though few projects have been implemented that directly  
addressed this  
00:17:06 --> 00:17:09: past focus and the long lasting nature of transportation  
projects  
00:17:09 --> 00:17:12: means that the repercussions of positions still live with us  
00:17:12 --> 00:17:12: today.  
00:17:15 --> 00:17:19: However, equity is down or nothing game what works  
economically  
00:17:19 --> 00:17:21: may not work environmentally.  
00:17:21 --> 00:17:23: But our framework allows for new ones,  
00:17:23 --> 00:17:25: view of projects. Looking at both the good and the  
00:17:25 --> 00:17:25: bad aspects.  
00:17:28 --> 00:17:31: Following these conclusions, we developed some broad  
recommendations for DVR  
00:17:31 --> 00:17:33: PC about transportation equity,  
00:17:33 --> 00:17:35: which my colleague Adam Sean Smell described.  
00:17:42 --> 00:17:44: Thank you Andrew. My name is Adam Schantz and I  
00:17:44 --> 00:17:48: will be reviewing 6 high level planning recommendations that  
came  
00:17:48 --> 00:17:51: out of our report and in the chat I've shared  
00:17:51 --> 00:17:53: where our report is housed.  
00:17:53 --> 00:17:56: If you want to take a look at it at  
00:17:56 --> 00:17:57: a later time.  
00:17:57 --> 00:18:00: So DPR PC as an organization is best positioned to  
00:18:00 --> 00:18:03: seek equity from start to finish in projects.  
00:18:03 --> 00:18:06: As such DVR PC should take ownership of the necessity  
00:18:06 --> 00:18:09: to further equity at all stages of projects from initial  
00:18:09 --> 00:18:14: feasibility assessments to final completion by leveraging its  
employees high

00:18:14 --> 00:18:18: quality data and relationships throughout the region to create tools

00:18:18 --> 00:18:22: and procedures to ensure projects consider all aspects of equity.

00:18:22 --> 00:18:25: We recommend that DVR PC use our framework of six

00:18:25 --> 00:18:29: categories and five ratings to add nuance to its existing

00:18:29 --> 00:18:30: equity analysis process.

00:18:30 --> 00:18:35: Early incorporation of this framework would have highlighted resource allocation

00:18:35 --> 00:18:39: and lack of transit consideration in direct connection.

00:18:39 --> 00:18:40: As one can see in the pie chart,

00:18:40 --> 00:18:44: the cost of direct connection relative to DVR PC's.

00:18:44 --> 00:18:48: New Jersey tip funding between 2012 and today was 1/4

00:18:48 --> 00:18:49: of the total amount.

00:18:49 --> 00:18:53: Our analysis also would have illustrated the environmental impact of

00:18:53 --> 00:18:56: NJ 29 on the City of Trenton and his communities

00:18:56 --> 00:18:57: of color,

00:18:57 --> 00:19:00: which were entirely cut off from the Delaware River to

00:19:00 --> 00:19:03: make way for this roadway providing access to suburban and

00:19:04 --> 00:19:05: wider residents.

00:19:05 --> 00:19:08: We recognize that it's not politically or logistically easy to

00:19:08 --> 00:19:10: be a front runner championing equity,

00:19:10 --> 00:19:13: but it will allow DVR PC to correct negative effects

00:19:14 --> 00:19:17: that people have been living with for generations.

00:19:17 --> 00:19:18: Next slide, please.

00:19:20 --> 00:19:24: DVR PC is gone beyond the legal minimums for participation,

00:19:24 --> 00:19:28: but continued improvements would foster more equity in the region.

00:19:28 --> 00:19:31: DVR PC offers opportunities for public feedback,

00:19:31 --> 00:19:34: but that feedback is not required to be integrated into

00:19:34 --> 00:19:38: decisions and many of the least equitable decisions made in

00:19:38 --> 00:19:41: recent years have occurred when that feedback was gathered but

00:19:41 --> 00:19:45: ignored. The community was heard but ignored in the case

00:19:45 --> 00:19:48: of NJ 29 when the Citizen Advisory Committee was calling

00:19:48 --> 00:19:50: for a less auto oriented tip.

00:19:50 --> 00:19:53: At the same time that planning phases for the Lambertton

00:19:53 --> 00:19:54: tunnel were in action.

00:19:54 --> 00:19:58: Current outreach proceedings have tended to emphasize those who are

00:19:58 --> 00:19:59: already in power,

00:19:59 --> 00:20:02: such as the participation process for US 422,

00:20:02 --> 00:20:07: which prioritize the feedback of business and political leaders over

00:20:07 --> 00:20:08: that of those of residents.

00:20:08 --> 00:20:11: Living in the vicinity of the roadway.

00:20:11 --> 00:20:14: We recommend that DVR PC continue to be creative in

00:20:14 --> 00:20:18: seeking public participation itself and require public participation of its

00:20:18 --> 00:20:19: project partners,

00:20:19 --> 00:20:23: ensuring that responses from those with less influence are just

00:20:23 --> 00:20:26: as powerful as those who have historically held power.

00:20:26 --> 00:20:29: Next slide, please.

00:20:29 --> 00:20:32: Construction will have an impact on nearby residents,

00:20:32 --> 00:20:36: but current procedures allow some projects to skip mitigation studies

00:20:36 --> 00:20:39: or rely on mitigation studies that are decades out of

00:20:39 --> 00:20:39: date.

00:20:39 --> 00:20:43: Current procedures during the construction of direct connection have left

00:20:43 --> 00:20:46: Workingclass Belmar residents to deal with noise and visual impacts,

00:20:46 --> 00:20:48: many of which are ongoing.

00:20:48 --> 00:20:52: The grandfathering in of the Route 29 project under the

00:20:52 --> 00:20:55: ice T allowed an 18 year old environmental impact study

00:20:55 --> 00:20:59: on an industrial area to govern mitigation on a residential

00:20:59 --> 00:21:03: neighborhood leading to residents dealing with costly home repairs,

00:21:03 --> 00:21:08: noise and dust pollution. Construction impacts had disproportionate impacts on

00:21:08 --> 00:21:11: business owners in low income communities,

00:21:11 --> 00:21:14: which often lack the financial records and other paperwork to

00:21:14 --> 00:21:17: access grants and relief funding already available.

00:21:17 --> 00:21:21: We recommend that DVR PC identify dedicated funding streams for

00:21:21 --> 00:21:25: studying and mitigating construction impacts in project facilities to position

00:21:25 --> 00:21:30: construction mitigation at the foreground of the planning process rather

00:21:30 --> 00:21:33: than as an afterthought. We also recommend the DVR PC

00:21:33 --> 00:21:36: include diverse partnerships to mediate challenges,

00:21:36 --> 00:21:39: particularly in low income communities.

00:21:39 --> 00:21:40: Next slide, please.

00:21:44 --> 00:21:46: We recommend that DVR PC.

00:21:46 --> 00:21:50: Prioritize increasing transparency in the funding sources and

final cost

00:21:50 --> 00:21:54: for projects both internally and externally while DVR PC does

00:21:54 --> 00:21:56: a great job of clearly showing tip out allocations,

00:21:56 --> 00:22:00: the responsibility for the actual payments for projects,

00:22:00 --> 00:22:04: lies and state lies with state DOTs and public transportation

00:22:04 --> 00:22:04: agencies.

00:22:04 --> 00:22:08: Information on final project costs are not always easily

00:22:08 --> 00:22:11: accessible

00:22:08 --> 00:22:11: as we found when conducting our own research on the

00:22:11 --> 00:22:12: funding of NJ 29,

00:22:12 --> 00:22:15: we were able to determine tip allocations across three

00:22:15 --> 00:22:18: periods

00:22:15 --> 00:22:18: of time during which the project was built,

00:22:18 --> 00:22:21: but we were unable to obtain the obligated amounts and

00:22:21 --> 00:22:22: construction costs,

00:22:22 --> 00:22:25: in part due to COVID-19 restrictions.

00:22:25 --> 00:22:28: As a result, our recommendation would be for DVR PC

00:22:28 --> 00:22:32: to work with its agency partners to routinely compile this

00:22:32 --> 00:22:35: information into one of its popular online toolkits.

00:22:35 --> 00:22:38: Then both DVR PC and the public would be able

00:22:38 --> 00:22:41: to see how much money is being spent Ware and

00:22:41 --> 00:22:44: could call attention to any inequitable distributions.

00:22:44 --> 00:22:48: This compiled information would also highlight the

00:22:48 --> 00:22:52: opportunities and constraints

00:22:48 --> 00:22:52: of the current funding system and may even provide

00:22:52 --> 00:22:55: reasoning

00:22:52 --> 00:22:55: to increase the amount of local funding for transportation

00:22:55 --> 00:22:59: which

00:22:55 --> 00:22:59: could then be used to provide accessibility and economic

00:22:59 --> 00:23:01: growth

00:22:59 --> 00:23:01: to disadvantaged populations.

00:23:01 --> 00:23:02: Next slide, please.

00:23:04 --> 00:23:07: DVR PC's long range plans called for making land use

00:23:07 --> 00:23:10: decisions that would complement transportation projects.

00:23:10 --> 00:23:12: However, in the case of PATCO,

00:23:12 --> 00:23:16: the land use around most stations have have resulted in

00:23:16 --> 00:23:19: massive parking lots equal to 109 football fields.

00:23:19 --> 00:23:23: In total there by primarily benefiting households with cars.

00:23:23 --> 00:23:28: With US422 DVR PC recommended creating transportation

00:23:28 --> 00:23:30: centers to minimize

00:23:28 --> 00:23:30: suburbanization and reduce car travel,

00:23:30 --> 00:23:35: but was largely ignored by local municipalities in Montgomery

00:23:35 --> 00:23:40: County.

00:23:35 --> 00:23:40: In these transportation projects, disadvantage populations

such as carless households,  
00:23:40 --> 00:23:44: communities of color and reverse commuters receive fewer benefits.  
00:23:44 --> 00:23:47: We see many opportunities for DVR PC to improve the  
00:23:47 --> 00:23:51: implementation of its long range plans for integrating land use  
00:23:51 --> 00:23:54: planning with transportation projects.  
00:23:54 --> 00:23:57: First, we recommend that the RPC strengthen its advocacy by  
00:23:57 --> 00:24:02: bolstering regional partnerships and working with elected officials and government  
00:24:02 --> 00:24:05: agencies to integrate complementary land use,  
00:24:05 --> 00:24:09: planning into transportation planning, decision-making and funding.  
00:24:09 --> 00:24:13: With respect to PATCO, this could involve working with towns  
00:24:13 --> 00:24:17: containing stations to apply for New Jersey's transit village destination,  
00:24:17 --> 00:24:20: where they would receive funding for smart growth projects within  
00:24:20 --> 00:24:21: walking distance to stations.  
00:24:21 --> 00:24:26: Collingswood successful lumberyard mixed use Project is a good example  
00:24:26 --> 00:24:26: of this.  
00:24:26 --> 00:24:29: Next, we recommend the DVR PC call for policy changes  
00:24:29 --> 00:24:33: that would make it easier to ensure appropriate zoning around  
00:24:33 --> 00:24:34: transportation projects.  
00:24:34 --> 00:24:38: DVR PC can work with public transit agencies that own  
00:24:38 --> 00:24:42: land to partner with developers and create transit oriented development.  
00:24:42 --> 00:24:43: Next slide, please.  
00:24:47 --> 00:24:50: DVR PC should also prioritize access to over congestion reduction  
00:24:50 --> 00:24:55: with alternatives such as public transit and infrastructure for walking  
00:24:55 --> 00:24:55: and bicycling.  
00:24:55 --> 00:24:58: Since the advent of the automobile,  
00:24:58 --> 00:25:02: reducing traffic congestion has been a major concern for transportation  
00:25:02 --> 00:25:04: transportation leaders across the country.  
00:25:04 --> 00:25:08: Decades of research on congestion have shown that increasing highway  
00:25:08 --> 00:25:12: capacity does not lead to the long-term elimination of congestion,  
00:25:12 --> 00:25:15: but in fact creates more of it.

00:25:15 --> 00:25:18: While congestion mitigation should continue to play a role in  
00:25:18 --> 00:25:19: decision making,  
00:25:19 --> 00:25:22: it should do so only in the context of improving  
00:25:22 --> 00:25:26: equitable access rather than the narrowly defined goal of  
reducing  
00:25:26 --> 00:25:27: highway travel times.  
00:25:27 --> 00:25:31: For instance, Virginia D. OTS Smart Scale program uses  
data  
00:25:31 --> 00:25:34: driven processes to quantify the increase in access for  
proposed  
00:25:34 --> 00:25:38: transportation projects with this type of equity cost benefit  
analysis  
00:25:38 --> 00:25:42: projects such as direct connection would be more heavily  
scrutinized.  
00:25:42 --> 00:25:45: While the potential equitable project.  
00:25:45 --> 00:25:49: Of the Glassboro Camden Line would have more public  
backing.  
00:25:49 --> 00:25:52: And now I pass it off to my colleague Karim.  
00:25:59 --> 00:26:02: Hello good morning everyone. My name is Corrine Lucas  
Ashman,  
00:26:02 --> 00:26:06: Brandon Lambertian. I will be relaying some of our policy  
00:26:06 --> 00:26:10: findings and recommendations so that planning agencies like  
DVR PC  
00:26:10 --> 00:26:14: can implement policies and plans that meet higher equity out.  
00:26:14 --> 00:26:16: And so just to get us started,  
00:26:16 --> 00:26:19: one of our initial findings is that during the planning  
00:26:20 --> 00:26:20: phases,  
00:26:20 --> 00:26:25: planners, engineers and agencies of agency officials did not  
include  
00:26:25 --> 00:26:28: or implement explicit metrics of equity.  
00:26:28 --> 00:26:31: So I just want to winter attention to the graphic  
00:26:31 --> 00:26:34: on the right and it illustrates the decrease mean income  
00:26:34 --> 00:26:38: in the project area despite the increased development  
projects you  
00:26:38 --> 00:26:42: know supported by the reconstructed make market Frankfort  
line in  
00:26:43 --> 00:26:44: the newly constructed stations,  
00:26:44 --> 00:26:47: especially stations like 69th St,  
00:26:47 --> 00:26:51: which post you know a lot of economic development around  
00:26:51 --> 00:26:52: it.  
00:26:52 --> 00:26:56: And while those projects did bring a positive bring positive  
00:26:56 --> 00:26:57: outcomes to the area,  
00:26:57 --> 00:27:01: it did not actually ameliorate the socioeconomic standing of  
the  
00:27:01 --> 00:27:05: people in the area who are predominantly people of color

00:27:05 --> 00:27:07: in a low income area and in between cases,  
00:27:07 --> 00:27:11: we actually found that the current metrics of equity to  
00:27:11 --> 00:27:14: be a fairly new standard across best practices.  
00:27:14 --> 00:27:16: Across standard I mean across sectors.  
00:27:16 --> 00:27:21: So while some agencies did implement practices of equitable  
00:27:21 --> 00:27:25: planning,  
00:27:25 --> 00:27:29: like environmental impact standards. Or community outreach  
00:27:29 --> 00:27:34: campaigns.  
00:27:34 --> 00:27:35: They did not have explicit standards or count accountability  
00:27:35 --> 00:27:40: measures  
00:27:40 --> 00:27:45: to address trends of historic negative impacts against black  
00:27:45 --> 00:27:47: indigenous  
00:27:47 --> 00:27:51: other people of color.  
00:27:51 --> 00:27:54: Low income communities and other historically  
00:27:54 --> 00:27:57: disadvantaged groups are.  
00:27:57 --> 00:28:00: Recommendations include choosing sites that do not  
00:28:00 --> 00:28:01: negatively impact historically  
00:28:01 --> 00:28:04: disadvantaged groups and communities,  
00:28:04 --> 00:28:07: beginning with community consultation to and to understand  
00:28:07 --> 00:28:08: their needs  
00:28:08 --> 00:28:12: and the potential unforeseen's impacts.  
00:28:12 --> 00:28:13: And finally, to consult with elected officials in the area  
00:28:13 --> 00:28:16: to gain their support and also to expand the scope  
00:28:16 --> 00:28:19: of the project.  
00:28:19 --> 00:28:24: Another one of our findings is that burden in Britains  
00:28:24 --> 00:28:27: and negative impacts from transportation projects are often  
00:28:27 --> 00:28:29: disproportionately placed  
00:28:29 --> 00:28:32: on black indigenous people of color and other in low  
00:28:32 --> 00:28:34: income communities across cases we did find informal  
00:28:34 --> 00:28:39: examples of  
00:28:39 --> 00:28:42: equity considerations like environmental impact standards  
00:28:42 --> 00:28:45: and town hall meetings.  
00:28:45 --> 00:28:49: For those efforts did not involve Community input at the  
00:28:49 --> 00:28:53: decision-making level,  
00:28:53 --> 00:28:56: engage in practices that prioritize the needs and perspectives  
00:28:56 --> 00:28:59: of  
00:28:59 --> 00:29:02: minority communities.  
00:29:02 --> 00:29:05: Low income communities and other historically demand  
00:29:05 --> 00:29:08: disadvantaged groups and  
00:29:08 --> 00:29:11: usually address out equity outcomes in hindsight.  
00:29:11 --> 00:29:14: The graphic below from governing data uses Census Bureau  
00:29:14 --> 00:29:17: data  
00:29:17 --> 00:29:20: to depict groups and demographic most dependent on public  
00:29:20 --> 00:29:23: transit  
00:29:23 --> 00:29:26: in Philadelphia and emphasizes how their needs have



historically not  
00:28:53 --> 00:28:58: matched with the project. Prioritization of impios and  
municipal transit  
00:28:58 --> 00:28:59: agencies.  
00:28:59 --> 00:29:03: This point is especially important when considering  
Community resilience and  
00:29:03 --> 00:29:07: ability for community to recuperate after the shock of  
transportation  
00:29:07 --> 00:29:10: projects and other acute economic shocks.  
00:29:10 --> 00:29:13: Black indigenous people of color and low income  
communities often  
00:29:13 --> 00:29:17: lack the political bargaining power and formal resources like  
business  
00:29:17 --> 00:29:19: and housing records to partake in the middle.  
00:29:19 --> 00:29:24: Mitigation in relief funding strategies already in place were  
developed  
00:29:24 --> 00:29:27: to protect vulnerable communities doing these projects.  
00:29:27 --> 00:29:29: In order to address these inequities,  
00:29:29 --> 00:29:32: we recommend prioritizing.  
00:29:32 --> 00:29:36: Excuse me, prioritizing more convenient transit access to  
minority communities,  
00:29:36 --> 00:29:41: low income communities, and other historic historically  
disadvantaged groups.  
00:29:41 --> 00:29:45: And finding creative ways to accelerate construction to  
minimize highway  
00:29:45 --> 00:29:49: and rail shutdowns and the other negative impacts of  
transportation  
00:29:49 --> 00:29:51: and construction projects.  
00:29:51 --> 00:29:53: And I'll be handing it off to my colleagues.  
00:29:55 --> 00:29:59: Morning everybody, whatever most important findings was  
that single purpose  
00:29:59 --> 00:30:00: agencies,  
00:30:00 --> 00:30:03: such as transportation agencies like Penn daughter SEPTA,  
00:30:03 --> 00:30:06: may not possess the range of resources or expertise to  
00:30:06 --> 00:30:09: address inequities in their transportation projects.  
00:30:09 --> 00:30:12: Transportation projects should be led by transportation  
agencies,  
00:30:12 --> 00:30:15: but we recommend assembling multi agency teams to help  
design  
00:30:15 --> 00:30:19: and implement mitigation efforts under the direction of a  
public  
00:30:19 --> 00:30:19: executive,  
00:30:19 --> 00:30:22: these agencies are great at doing their jobs related to  
00:30:22 --> 00:30:23: transit,  
00:30:23 --> 00:30:26: but these agencies need the active support of bureaucracies

agencies.

**00:30:26 --> 00:30:30:** And governments with experience in dealing with adverse social and

**00:30:30 --> 00:30:31:** economic impacts.

**00:30:31 --> 00:30:34:** Another recommendation of ours is to consider tolling of highways

**00:30:34 --> 00:30:37:** to pay for transit infrastructure projects.

**00:30:37 --> 00:30:39:** In the case of I-476 known as the Blue Route

**00:30:39 --> 00:30:42:** Transit integration with the project was ignored from the start,

**00:30:42 --> 00:30:45:** even though it was considered by outside experts and has

**00:30:45 --> 00:30:47:** been studied by DVR PC since the completion of the

**00:30:47 --> 00:30:51:** route tolling these highways could help improve equity outcomes by

**00:30:51 --> 00:30:56:** creating the transit infrastructure used by low income minority communities.

**00:30:56 --> 00:30:56:** Next slide, please.

**00:30:59 --> 00:31:01:** Another finding of ours is the tempos.

**00:31:01 --> 00:31:05:** An agency boards often like the perspectives of inner city,

**00:31:05 --> 00:31:07:** low income or minority voices on their boards,

**00:31:07 --> 00:31:09:** which perpetuate inequities in disproportion.

**00:31:09 --> 00:31:12:** Negative impacts across those communities.

**00:31:12 --> 00:31:15:** We recommend the DVR PC should explore changing or expanding

**00:31:15 --> 00:31:18:** how representation is allocated on the Executive Board,

**00:31:18 --> 00:31:21:** so it's just researching how areas like Atlanta have added

**00:31:21 --> 00:31:25:** proportional representation of citizen representatives to their MPO board.

**00:31:25 --> 00:31:28:** However, we acknowledge it that there are major challenges to

**00:31:28 --> 00:31:30:** changing the structure of DVR PC.

**00:31:30 --> 00:31:33:** Needing the ascent of the legislatures of both Pennsylvania and

**00:31:33 --> 00:31:34:** New Jersey and DVR,

**00:31:34 --> 00:31:38:** PC does have representation for minority and low income communities

**00:31:38 --> 00:31:39:** on the board presently,

**00:31:39 --> 00:31:42:** such as dedicated representation for cities such as Camden,

**00:31:42 --> 00:31:46:** Chester and Trend. We recommend enhancing economic development opportunities for

**00:31:46 --> 00:31:50:** communities affected by transportation projects such as creating parks or

**00:31:50 --> 00:31:51:** doing zoning changes,

**00:31:51 --> 00:31:54:** though we also recommend being mindful of gentrification.

**00:31:54 --> 00:31:57:** Concerns in these projects we recommend monitoring and addressing non

00:31:58 --> 00:32:00: economic impacts such as the loss of social capital due  
 00:32:00 --> 00:32:02: to dividing neighborhoods.  
 00:32:02 --> 00:32:04: And threats to a community's cultural,  
 00:32:04 --> 00:32:07: religious, and recreational assets such as we saw with the  
 00:32:07 --> 00:32:08: Holy Redeemer Church in school,  
 00:32:08 --> 00:32:11: in Chinatown, with the Vine Street Expressway.  
 00:32:11 --> 00:32:14: We also recommend using future infrastructure funds to  
 rectify existing  
 00:32:14 --> 00:32:16: impacts of past transportation projects,  
 00:32:16 --> 00:32:19: which leads us to our next section or my colleague  
 00:32:19 --> 00:32:21: Brandon will be taking us more in depth on the  
 00:32:21 --> 00:32:24: case study of the Vine Street Expressway in the Philadelphia  
 00:32:24 --> 00:32:25: Chinatown community.  
 00:32:28 --> 00:32:30: Wonderful thank you, Lucas and Cream,  
 00:32:30 --> 00:32:32: as well as everyone for having us today.  
 00:32:32 --> 00:32:34: I'm gonna be along with John Chin,  
 00:32:34 --> 00:32:36: the executive director of the CDC,  
 00:32:36 --> 00:32:40: going through our Vine Street Expressway case study just to  
 00:32:40 --> 00:32:42: give you a little more insight into what one of  
 00:32:42 --> 00:32:44: these case studies looked like.  
 00:32:44 --> 00:32:46: Kind of from start to end.  
 00:32:46 --> 00:32:49: Going to the next slide.  
 00:32:49 --> 00:32:51: So I'm gonna give you 2 parts.  
 00:32:51 --> 00:32:53: 1st will look at the case study process.  
 00:32:53 --> 00:32:57: Look at some of the design considerations made for this  
 00:32:57 --> 00:33:00: policy analysis and then from here will go to John  
 00:33:00 --> 00:33:03: Chin who will speak on the role of the Chinatown  
 00:33:03 --> 00:33:06: community and the leaders during the early stages of this  
 00:33:06 --> 00:33:09: initial process and then it will come back to me  
 00:33:09 --> 00:33:13: to talk about some of our findings and recommendations  
 specific  
 00:33:13 --> 00:33:16: to this case study and also wrap it into kind  
 00:33:16 --> 00:33:19: of the modern political context that is made.  
 00:33:19 --> 00:33:23: Special events are Expressway quite politically salient.  
 00:33:23 --> 00:33:25: In the last six months or so,  
 00:33:25 --> 00:33:28: go ahead.  
 00:33:28 --> 00:33:31: So our case study process began by identifying key pieces  
 00:33:31 --> 00:33:36: of legislation that affected the planning of an Interstate  
 highway  
 00:33:36 --> 00:33:37: through Center City,  
 00:33:37 --> 00:33:41: Philadelphia. We went all the way back to 1956 with  
 00:33:41 --> 00:33:45: the passage of the Interstate Highway system by President  
 Eisenhower

00:33:45 --> 00:33:49: and looked at the funds that were created and set  
00:33:49 --> 00:33:52: aside and the goals of that project that led to  
00:33:52 --> 00:33:56: this expansion effort and what that meant for large cities  
00:33:56 --> 00:33:57: like Philadelphia.  
00:33:57 --> 00:34:01: Vine Street Expressway connects. I-76 on the West with the  
00:34:01 --> 00:34:04: Ben Franklin Bridge and Camden on the east,  
00:34:04 --> 00:34:08: and it cuts right through Center City as a below  
00:34:08 --> 00:34:11: grade Expressway as we see it today.  
00:34:11 --> 00:34:14: So that was kind of the context that it offered  
00:34:14 --> 00:34:17: itself in and from there we created a list of  
00:34:17 --> 00:34:22: interviewees that would include engineers from the project,  
00:34:22 --> 00:34:25: city officials and Chinatown community leaders.  
00:34:25 --> 00:34:29: We felt that a interview driven case study was going  
00:34:29 --> 00:34:31: to be very valuable.  
00:34:31 --> 00:34:34: Because the people that lived this experience would have a  
00:34:34 --> 00:34:37: greater insight than any reporter white paper we could read,  
00:34:37 --> 00:34:41: and we could also see how their emotions and kind  
00:34:41 --> 00:34:44: of their reactions to different events and.  
00:34:44 --> 00:34:48: Key ideas relate to the kind of historical nature of  
00:34:48 --> 00:34:51: it and figure out where the real truth is and  
00:34:51 --> 00:34:52: important.  
00:34:52 --> 00:34:55: Slade in each piece.  
00:34:55 --> 00:34:58: A decision was made to take this case study chronologically.  
00:34:58 --> 00:35:01: And to tell the story of each decision as a  
00:35:02 --> 00:35:04: building block of the final outcome.  
00:35:04 --> 00:35:08: We found that by telling the story of each legislation  
00:35:08 --> 00:35:11: that was enacted or a new decision that was made  
00:35:11 --> 00:35:14: by a local or state official would kind of build  
00:35:14 --> 00:35:17: up to this ultimate finale of the opening of the  
00:35:17 --> 00:35:19: Expressway in 1991,  
00:35:19 --> 00:35:22: and that this told a greater story then taking it  
00:35:22 --> 00:35:24: in any other form.  
00:35:24 --> 00:35:27: A couple crucial components of this case study,  
00:35:27 --> 00:35:29: including an interview with Cecilia.  
00:35:29 --> 00:35:33: Yep, Cecilia. Yep, is the godmother of Chinatown.  
00:35:33 --> 00:35:36: She was one of the original activists who protested the  
00:35:36 --> 00:35:40: creation and the destruction of much of the neighborhood  
00:35:40 --> 00:35:43: along  
00:35:40 --> 00:35:43: Vine Street to Clear Way for this project.  
00:35:43 --> 00:35:47: And she still is actively involved with many efforts to  
00:35:47 --> 00:35:50: protect the Chinatown community.  
00:35:50 --> 00:35:53: I'm another was an interview with John Smith,

00:35:53 --> 00:35:57: an engineer who worked alongside both PennDOT and the Chinatown

00:35:57 --> 00:36:02: community to find alternatives that would more holistically benefit both

00:36:02 --> 00:36:06: trying to talk community and also the greater goals of

00:36:06 --> 00:36:09: the Mayor of Philadelphia and PennDOT,

00:36:09 --> 00:36:12: as well as EU. SDOT finally was our look at

00:36:12 --> 00:36:15: the environmental impact statement from 1983,

00:36:15 --> 00:36:20: which was compared against the draft statement that was put

00:36:20 --> 00:36:21: out in 1977.

00:36:21 --> 00:36:24: To figure out which changes were made and at what

00:36:24 --> 00:36:27: point new equity considerations were made to arrive at the

00:36:27 --> 00:36:28: final outcome.

00:36:28 --> 00:36:30: So from here I'll pass it to John Chin,

00:36:30 --> 00:36:33: who has a couple of slides to tell you about

00:36:33 --> 00:36:35: the role of Chinatown in this process.

00:36:39 --> 00:36:40: Thanks, Brandon.

00:36:43 --> 00:36:45: Great, thank you very much.

00:36:45 --> 00:36:47: So look at this photo.

00:36:47 --> 00:36:51: We clearly are living in a different day in process

00:36:52 --> 00:36:56: today than we did 50 years ago when Chinatown first

00:36:56 --> 00:37:02: learned about this proposal for the Vine Street Expressway.

00:37:02 --> 00:37:05: And although we're probably not at a point where we

00:37:05 --> 00:37:06: want to be yet,

00:37:06 --> 00:37:10: but we're moving in the right direction direction in terms

00:37:10 --> 00:37:13: of community engagement process in equity.

00:37:13 --> 00:37:14: Next slide.

00:37:19 --> 00:37:21: You know, so you have a map of of area

00:37:21 --> 00:37:24: around Chinatown and you have photo of kids holding up

00:37:24 --> 00:37:28: signs so device you Expressway is what we're talking about

00:37:28 --> 00:37:31: today. But that was just the beginning of many,

00:37:31 --> 00:37:35: many projects that have been proposed for Chinatown over

00:37:35 --> 00:37:38: the

00:37:35 --> 00:37:38: decades that projects that may be good for the general

00:37:38 --> 00:37:39: region,

00:37:39 --> 00:37:42: but not so good for our Chinatown community.

00:37:42 --> 00:37:43: Come.

00:37:43 --> 00:37:48: What we're faced with was a shock when this proposal

00:37:48 --> 00:37:51: was learned about in Chinatown.

00:37:51 --> 00:37:55: There was resignation with the fact that the elders of

00:37:55 --> 00:37:59: the community said that you can't fight City Hall.

00:37:59 --> 00:38:03: And advice you expressing was coming through to takedown the

00:38:03 --> 00:38:07: Chinese Catholic Church and school Ann from from a large  
00:38:07 --> 00:38:08: POV and White POV.  
00:38:08 --> 00:38:12: You know schools are available.  
00:38:12 --> 00:38:15: Throughout the region. But this was our school and church  
00:38:15 --> 00:38:16: in our community.  
00:38:16 --> 00:38:19: Only school elementary school, in our community,  
00:38:19 --> 00:38:22: and this community did not want to lose that.  
00:38:22 --> 00:38:26: So the community organized under the leadership,  
00:38:26 --> 00:38:28: is to see a more yet formed.  
00:38:28 --> 00:38:32: Its very first public meeting to address Urban Development  
and  
00:38:32 --> 00:38:34: transportation,  
00:38:34 --> 00:38:37: and that actually led to the formation of what we  
00:38:37 --> 00:38:42: know today as Philadelphia Chinatown Development  
Corporation.  
00:38:42 --> 00:38:45: And since that time, we've learned more than we ever  
00:38:46 --> 00:38:48: wanted to about urban planning,  
00:38:48 --> 00:38:52: development, and transportation. And today in 2021.  
00:38:52 --> 00:38:56: Our agency is very involved with planning not only in  
00:38:56 --> 00:38:58: our neighborhood,  
00:38:58 --> 00:39:02: but around it because the lesson learned here for any  
00:39:02 --> 00:39:05: community is that we need to be engaged,  
00:39:05 --> 00:39:09: involved if we are to ensure that the equity that  
00:39:09 --> 00:39:13: is desired in our Community is realized next slide.  
00:39:15 --> 00:39:20: So Brandon touched upon a couple of significant events over  
00:39:20 --> 00:39:21: the years,  
00:39:21 --> 00:39:23: and Barry Seymour as well,  
00:39:23 --> 00:39:26: 1970, was Environmental Protection Act,  
00:39:26 --> 00:39:28: 1973.  
00:39:28 --> 00:39:34: We were able to utilized environmental impact statement  
which was  
00:39:34 --> 00:39:39: required of any projects with federal dollars in it.  
00:39:39 --> 00:39:43: In 77 and 1983 we had two very different versions  
00:39:43 --> 00:39:45: of the environmental impact study,  
00:39:45 --> 00:39:51: with additional changes that came around the 1983 to  
address  
00:39:51 --> 00:39:53: community issues and concerns.  
00:39:53 --> 00:39:56: Most of which was really to save the whole Redeemer  
00:39:57 --> 00:39:57: Church,  
00:39:57 --> 00:40:01: but also with the highway coming through our community.  
00:40:01 --> 00:40:04: How? How is this going to impact a divided community?  
00:40:04 --> 00:40:08: And how's the community going to crossover this highway?  
00:40:08 --> 00:40:09: So you see here, 10 St Plaza.

00:40:09 --> 00:40:12: This is a little I called it a way station  
00:40:12 --> 00:40:16: where pedestrians engineers knew that the that's just could not  
00:40:16 --> 00:40:20: cross the ice rink stress way on one traffic signal.  
00:40:20 --> 00:40:23: So they developed this area where students from the whole  
00:40:23 --> 00:40:26: gamer school could stand in the middle.  
00:40:26 --> 00:40:29: Of the bridge over the highway.  
00:40:29 --> 00:40:33: Safely, while eastbound and westbound cars on the  
Expressway on  
00:40:33 --> 00:40:35: the street service Rd could go by.  
00:40:35 --> 00:40:36: Next slide.  
00:40:38 --> 00:40:41: And so you know.  
00:40:44 --> 00:40:47: You know to to the.  
00:40:47 --> 00:40:50: Integon that was presented.  
00:40:50 --> 00:40:53: You know we are now learning and we now know  
00:40:53 --> 00:40:54: that.  
00:40:54 --> 00:41:00: Transportation goals are very different from overall  
development goals.  
00:41:00 --> 00:41:05: And in our experience, engagement has to happen at the  
00:41:05 --> 00:41:06: very beginning,  
00:41:06 --> 00:41:09: as ideas and visions are created.  
00:41:09 --> 00:41:14: This is the only way you can minimize impacts.  
00:41:14 --> 00:41:17: Of these transportation plans in any community,  
00:41:17 --> 00:41:21: and if you haven't visited Chinatown here and taking one  
00:41:21 --> 00:41:22: of our tours,  
00:41:22 --> 00:41:25: we take people on tours just to show the impact  
00:41:25 --> 00:41:29: of the Expressway and all these other urban developments  
that  
00:41:29 --> 00:41:31: make make living and working.  
00:41:31 --> 00:41:34: China can very challenging. So and lastly,  
00:41:34 --> 00:41:39: culture. You know China accounts just can't be anywhere  
where  
00:41:39 --> 00:41:43: the only Chinatown here in Philadelphia and this is the  
00:41:43 --> 00:41:45: location that we found it in 1870.  
00:41:45 --> 00:41:48: This is the place where we want to be and  
00:41:48 --> 00:41:50: where we want to remain.  
00:41:50 --> 00:41:52: So things are not always transportable,  
00:41:52 --> 00:41:57: and that's why it's even more important that.  
00:41:57 --> 00:42:01: Planning agencies and government have to work with the  
communities  
00:42:02 --> 00:42:05: because one communities treasure is so important that it just  
00:42:05 --> 00:42:06: can't translate.  
00:42:06 --> 00:42:09: Translate are transported to somewhere else.

00:42:11 --> 00:42:15: So brand, I think this sets of back to you.  
00:42:15 --> 00:42:17: Perfect thank you very much,  
00:42:17 --> 00:42:20: John. So we'll go to the next slide to talk  
00:42:20 --> 00:42:23: about the American jobs plan proposal which came from the  
00:42:24 --> 00:42:28: Biden administration and their initial proposal that included  
\$20 billion  
00:42:28 --> 00:42:34: to target communities that were upended by highway  
projects.  
00:42:34 --> 00:42:38: The importance of this is that it explicitly mentions the  
00:42:38 --> 00:42:41: Vine Street Expressway as well as a couple of other  
00:42:41 --> 00:42:45: projects in the area that would be viable for these  
00:42:45 --> 00:42:48: funds to help right certain past wrongs.  
00:42:48 --> 00:42:52: And the work of this case study supports the conclusion  
00:42:52 --> 00:42:53: that a CAP or cover,  
00:42:53 --> 00:42:58: the Vine Street Expressway, would greatly benefit Chinatown  
residents would  
00:42:58 --> 00:43:02: reduce noise and air pollution and offer more outdoor  
community  
00:43:02 --> 00:43:03: space.  
00:43:03 --> 00:43:06: As John talked about the 10th St Plaza is a  
00:43:06 --> 00:43:07: quite small piece of land.  
00:43:07 --> 00:43:11: That is, you know, entirely concrete has a small pavilion  
00:43:11 --> 00:43:12: to it,  
00:43:12 --> 00:43:15: but expanding this cap for a couple of blocks but  
00:43:15 --> 00:43:18: allow the community to have outdoor space.  
00:43:18 --> 00:43:21: To really gather meet we have seen during the recent  
00:43:22 --> 00:43:25: uptick in protest that it gives more land for the  
00:43:25 --> 00:43:28: community to gather for these types of events and especially  
00:43:28 --> 00:43:31: with the pandemic moving as more things outdoors.  
00:43:31 --> 00:43:35: And as we know that outdoor events are becoming more  
00:43:35 --> 00:43:35: common.  
00:43:35 --> 00:43:38: This is another way to really give back to the  
00:43:38 --> 00:43:41: Community and create a space as well as safety for  
00:43:41 --> 00:43:42: the children.  
00:43:42 --> 00:43:46: You know, going back and forth between the school and  
00:43:46 --> 00:43:49: their homes on the other side of the Expressway.  
00:43:49 --> 00:43:52: Notably Congressman Brendan Boyle and Dwight Evans,  
00:43:52 --> 00:43:55: as well as Secretary of Transportation Pete Buddha,  
00:43:55 --> 00:43:58: judge, have voiced support for correcting the damage done  
by  
00:43:59 --> 00:43:59: the Expressway,  
00:43:59 --> 00:44:04: which are important steps in getting the funding and plans  
00:44:04 --> 00:44:06: made for this project.



00:44:06 --> 00:44:08: So from here I'd like to pass it to Laura  
00:44:08 --> 00:44:08: Slutzky,  
00:44:08 --> 00:44:11: the executive director of ULI Philadelphia,  
00:44:11 --> 00:44:13: to help moderate a Q&A session.  
00:44:13 --> 00:44:16: And personally I would just like to thank everyone for  
00:44:16 --> 00:44:19: attending and listening to our presentation today.  
00:44:21 --> 00:44:25: Great, thank you so much everyone for the time dedicated  
00:44:25 --> 00:44:26: to this project.  
00:44:26 --> 00:44:28: I know there was a lot more than even.  
00:44:28 --> 00:44:31: We got to explore during this session so we really  
00:44:31 --> 00:44:34: appreciate it and always love working with DVR PC so  
00:44:34 --> 00:44:35: we have time for audience Q&A.  
00:44:35 --> 00:44:38: We have a small group so if folks are have  
00:44:38 --> 00:44:41: questions or comments or anything you'd like to discuss you  
00:44:41 --> 00:44:44: can just put it in the chat and I'll probably  
00:44:44 --> 00:44:46: call on you to ask yourself since we have a  
00:44:46 --> 00:44:47: smaller.  
00:44:49 --> 00:44:50: I will give it a moment.  
00:44:53 --> 00:44:57: And I can ask my question while people are getting  
00:44:57 --> 00:44:57: warmed up.  
00:45:00 --> 00:45:03: Let's see. So if you could talk to us,  
00:45:03 --> 00:45:06: your equity scale was really interesting,  
00:45:06 --> 00:45:09: and using that across a variety of projects,  
00:45:09 --> 00:45:11: I know we didn't get to dig deep today,  
00:45:11 --> 00:45:15: but did you find themes related to the specific types  
00:45:15 --> 00:45:18: of infrastructure that you analyze?  
00:45:18 --> 00:45:22: So for example, something that you found in common across  
00:45:22 --> 00:45:26: highway projects or transit projects that would be useful for  
00:45:26 --> 00:45:29: our Community to hear as we think about.  
00:45:29 --> 00:45:33: These topics so any any of the presenters or researchers  
00:45:33 --> 00:45:35: if you want to speak to that.  
00:45:37 --> 00:45:39: If there were three specific transit types,  
00:45:39 --> 00:45:41: yeah, go ahead, Andrew. Sure,  
00:45:41 --> 00:45:44: yeah, I can start that process controlling.  
00:45:44 --> 00:45:45: But yeah, I think unsurprisingly,  
00:45:45 --> 00:45:48: we found that highway projects seem to have more adverse  
00:45:48 --> 00:45:53: impacts to the surrounding communities without necessarily  
00:45:53 --> 00:45:54: providing benefits to  
00:45:54 --> 00:45:57: them like access benefits.  
00:45:54 --> 00:45:57: Porn is great, then. Like NJ 29 there or the  
00:45:57 --> 00:46:00: Vine Street Expressway and it had more.  
00:46:00 --> 00:46:02: Harmful impacts to the communities,

00:46:02 --> 00:46:06: whereas transit or trail projects like Super River Trail or  
00:46:06 --> 00:46:08: PAC El which we studied in again so they do  
00:46:08 --> 00:46:12: have more equitable impacts for communities and a lot of  
00:46:12 --> 00:46:15: other aspects. So that's too general findings that are not  
00:46:15 --> 00:46:16: super surprising,  
00:46:16 --> 00:46:21: but it's interesting to see it was usually reflected in  
00:46:21 --> 00:46:23: the spider charts that we had.  
00:46:23 --> 00:46:25: If I could jump in to build on that,  
00:46:25 --> 00:46:28: Andrew was saying one of the things though about PATCO,  
00:46:28 --> 00:46:32: which. I think we have time to get into here.  
00:46:32 --> 00:46:35: The students found that just the amount of surface parking  
00:46:36 --> 00:46:40: lots right around those commuter stations are not necessarily  
the  
00:46:40 --> 00:46:41: best land use,  
00:46:41 --> 00:46:45: right? And there's the ability for someone to walk to  
00:46:45 --> 00:46:45: employment.  
00:46:45 --> 00:46:49: We using Petco is impeded when you have very large  
00:46:49 --> 00:46:49: surface.  
00:46:49 --> 00:46:51: Lots, right? So there's a.  
00:46:51 --> 00:46:54: So it's not a. It's not a clear case,  
00:46:54 --> 00:46:57: lower where transit is is inherently better.  
00:46:57 --> 00:47:00: It's how it's transit that's done well.  
00:47:00 --> 00:47:02: Right, and I think that maybe cream you can speak  
00:47:03 --> 00:47:06: about the reconstruction of the Crankpin line is to how  
00:47:06 --> 00:47:06: transit,  
00:47:06 --> 00:47:08: but not necessarily done in the right way,  
00:47:08 --> 00:47:12: also had negative impact community.  
00:47:12 --> 00:47:15: Yeah, that's yeah so something I was actually going to  
00:47:15 --> 00:47:16: point out.  
00:47:16 --> 00:47:18: You know, if you look at this sort of the  
00:47:18 --> 00:47:19: two urban projects,  
00:47:19 --> 00:47:22: the market, Frankfort line reconstruction,  
00:47:22 --> 00:47:24: and the Vine Street Expressway,  
00:47:24 --> 00:47:27: they do, you know, score higher on the access an  
00:47:27 --> 00:47:30: equity and excuse me access in environments with scale,  
00:47:30 --> 00:47:32: and that's generally, you know,  
00:47:32 --> 00:47:36: just looking at the market Frankfort line that generally comes  
00:47:36 --> 00:47:39: with investing in public transit and just by proxy of  
00:47:39 --> 00:47:42: improving the stations with escalators and.  
00:47:45 --> 00:47:47: Elevators and things of the sort like that,  
00:47:47 --> 00:47:50: and just overall in increasing that access,  
00:47:50 --> 00:47:53: but you. But when you look at the sort of

00:47:53 --> 00:47:57: the the categories of protected classes in this sort of  
00:47:57 --> 00:47:58: process,  
00:47:58 --> 00:48:01: you don't. You sort of find the concurrent,  
00:48:01 --> 00:48:02: you know.  
00:48:02 --> 00:48:05: Exclusion of those particular communities,  
00:48:05 --> 00:48:07: and then because of that,  
00:48:07 --> 00:48:10: exclude the exclusion of those communities.  
00:48:10 --> 00:48:14: You have the adverse effects on protected classes and so  
00:48:14 --> 00:48:18: that that also comes from something that we've observed  
when  
00:48:18 --> 00:48:23: you're looking at communities of color versus when you're  
looking  
00:48:23 --> 00:48:26: at the the blue route and the political bargaining power  
00:48:27 --> 00:48:31: of low income communities and in minority communities  
versus suburban  
00:48:31 --> 00:48:33: communities who generally.  
00:48:33 --> 00:48:37: Have a more sort of collective eyes identity and and  
00:48:37 --> 00:48:41: capacity to to bargain for their own interest in an  
00:48:41 --> 00:48:41: area.  
00:48:41 --> 00:48:45: So something that I did notice is that when you're  
00:48:45 --> 00:48:50: dealing with urban construction and you're dealing with black  
and  
00:48:50 --> 00:48:55: black communities and other minority communities is that the  
effects  
00:48:55 --> 00:49:00: on protected classes in the process of developing those  
transportation  
00:49:00 --> 00:49:04: projects are generally sort of connected to each other.  
00:49:06 --> 00:49:10: Great, thank you. We do have a couple audience comments  
00:49:10 --> 00:49:13: but I just want to follow up on the surface  
00:49:13 --> 00:49:13: parking.  
00:49:13 --> 00:49:16: Point is, that's really interesting.  
00:49:16 --> 00:49:20: And are there any more specific comments or findings that  
00:49:20 --> 00:49:22: you all had related to?  
00:49:22 --> 00:49:25: I think you said you gave us a really interesting  
00:49:25 --> 00:49:30: statistic about the actual square footage of those surface  
parking  
00:49:30 --> 00:49:30: lots.  
00:49:30 --> 00:49:35: Is that something that folks should be contemplating as new  
00:49:35 --> 00:49:39: bills are passed and we look at making improvements in  
00:49:39 --> 00:49:40: the region?  
00:49:40 --> 00:49:44: Yeah, so yeah the the surfing surface parking lots were  
00:49:44 --> 00:49:49: really striking throughout throughout PATCO an really limited,  
00:49:49 --> 00:49:53: you know the ability for PATCO to service like an  
00:49:53 --> 00:49:56: economic generator because so few.

00:49:56 --> 00:49:59: Housing developments or, you know,  
00:49:59 --> 00:50:03: employment centers are around the PATCO stations outside  
of kind  
00:50:03 --> 00:50:05: of the more inner stations.  
00:50:05 --> 00:50:08: So yeah, we just found that PATCO was primarily catered  
00:50:08 --> 00:50:09: towards,  
00:50:09 --> 00:50:13: you know, suburban commuters, that we're driving to the  
stations  
00:50:14 --> 00:50:16: to get to Inner City Philadelphia jobs.  
00:50:16 --> 00:50:20: But it didn't have the same benefit in reverse for,  
00:50:20 --> 00:50:23: let's say, Philadelphia residents or Camden residents.  
00:50:23 --> 00:50:26: You know, looking for work as jobs have,  
00:50:26 --> 00:50:29: really, you know, expanded beyond the center of the city  
00:50:29 --> 00:50:32: over the past 40 years into the suburbs.  
00:50:32 --> 00:50:36: But those suburban jobs are not accessible to people without  
00:50:36 --> 00:50:36: cars,  
00:50:36 --> 00:50:39: primarily communities of color.  
00:50:39 --> 00:50:43: That's an interesting one. It will be interesting to see  
00:50:43 --> 00:50:46: if other city how other cities have handled.  
00:50:46 --> 00:50:49: Yeah, so that that's something that we were looking at  
00:50:49 --> 00:50:51: a little bit in terms of,  
00:50:51 --> 00:50:54: you know, what can be done to counteract that,  
00:50:54 --> 00:50:56: and I think I mentioned it a little bit.  
00:50:56 --> 00:50:59: But you know Collingswood, while not you,  
00:50:59 --> 00:51:01: know completely a very diverse area.  
00:51:01 --> 00:51:05: They have taken advantage of New Jersey funding to create  
00:51:05 --> 00:51:09: this like transit community for certain developments.  
00:51:09 --> 00:51:13: And that was something that we were hoping that other  
00:51:13 --> 00:51:16: towns would would look at doing to create housing as  
00:51:16 --> 00:51:19: well as jobs closer to stations,  
00:51:19 --> 00:51:20: great.  
00:51:20 --> 00:51:23: Great, let me go to some of our comments and  
00:51:23 --> 00:51:24: questions in the chat.  
00:51:24 --> 00:51:26: So Al I was going to call on you for  
00:51:27 --> 00:51:27: your comment,  
00:51:27 --> 00:51:31: but if you want to make your comment and then  
00:51:31 --> 00:51:35: go ahead and ask your question regarding the congestion on  
00:51:35 --> 00:51:36: 376.  
00:51:36 --> 00:51:38: If you are.  
00:51:38 --> 00:51:40: We can't hear you, but you look unmuted.  
00:51:45 --> 00:51:45: Try again.  
00:51:49 --> 00:51:51: Can you hear me now?

00:51:51 --> 00:51:52: Yes, OK. No. It's very,  
00:51:52 --> 00:51:56: very interesting and I had a chance to kind of  
00:51:56 --> 00:51:59: flip through the report as you were talking.  
00:51:59 --> 00:52:03: I I'm the. There seemed to be a general emphasis  
00:52:03 --> 00:52:08: in your recommendations to focus on public transit and  
incorporating.  
00:52:08 --> 00:52:13: I would say redevelopment or better development impact.  
00:52:13 --> 00:52:16: Mitigation. As part of the projects,  
00:52:16 --> 00:52:20: and I think separating that out is definitely has a  
00:52:20 --> 00:52:20: good idea,  
00:52:20 --> 00:52:26: because as you mentioned, the single focus agencies tend to  
00:52:26 --> 00:52:27: get tunnel vision.  
00:52:27 --> 00:52:30: But I would just as a question.  
00:52:30 --> 00:52:33: You made several statements early on about,  
00:52:33 --> 00:52:37: you know induced demand, how more lanes.  
00:52:37 --> 00:52:40: Results in more traffic. But then you talk about how  
00:52:40 --> 00:52:44: you have the southern section of the Blue route.  
00:52:44 --> 00:52:47: That even though the lanes are narrowed.  
00:52:47 --> 00:52:53: Some people still attempt to go through there.  
00:52:53 --> 00:52:55: Just had you have any thoughts on that?  
00:53:02 --> 00:53:03: I'll jump in so Casey trap,  
00:53:03 --> 00:53:06: one of the other members of our project who's not  
00:53:06 --> 00:53:09: here today with the kind of focus on the blue  
00:53:09 --> 00:53:09: route.  
00:53:09 --> 00:53:12: But we all partook. One thing I'll first say about  
00:53:12 --> 00:53:16: the kind of public transit focus and the redevelopment is  
00:53:16 --> 00:53:18: that we kind of know that there's not going to  
00:53:18 --> 00:53:22: be a lot more massive Interstate projects that are put  
00:53:22 --> 00:53:23: in in the future,  
00:53:23 --> 00:53:25: so the focus really goes to you,  
00:53:25 --> 00:53:29: know, small community development to redevelopment in  
these kind of.  
00:53:29 --> 00:53:32: Restorative actions and so that was our focus.  
00:53:32 --> 00:53:36: Obviously there will be no new highways here and there,  
00:53:36 --> 00:53:39: but we felt that that was a strong place to  
00:53:39 --> 00:53:39: focus on.  
00:53:39 --> 00:53:42: But in terms of the congestion,  
00:53:42 --> 00:53:43: I think a lot of focus was,  
00:53:43 --> 00:53:48: you know, pollution and finding ways to keep traffic flowing.  
00:53:48 --> 00:53:51: And there's been a lot of work done and talks  
00:53:51 --> 00:53:54: happening between the role of like 4 lanes or six  
00:53:54 --> 00:53:58: lanes and Lucas at some point can jump into that

00:53:58 --> 00:54:04: kind of the. The connection between I-95 and 476 at  
00:54:04 --> 00:54:07: Chester with those changes.  
00:54:07 --> 00:54:09: There is a lot that went into it and a  
00:54:09 --> 00:54:12: lot of time and effort and research that went into  
00:54:12 --> 00:54:13: it that.  
00:54:13 --> 00:54:17: Was not, I think, a clear answer at any point  
00:54:17 --> 00:54:17: so.  
00:54:17 --> 00:54:18: Yeah, I think that was.  
00:54:18 --> 00:54:22: It was never super clear which decision was the better  
00:54:22 --> 00:54:23: at the time,  
00:54:23 --> 00:54:26: and that's just kind of what they landed on.  
00:54:26 --> 00:54:27: Lucas, if you have more.  
00:54:27 --> 00:54:30: Yeah, so this is it's a complicated question 'cause I  
00:54:30 --> 00:54:33: think like it's hard to quantify how much the lane  
00:54:33 --> 00:54:33: reduction does.  
00:54:33 --> 00:54:37: Like 'cause we talk about Swarthmore College and because  
that's  
00:54:37 --> 00:54:39: like the busiest part of the section is going towards  
00:54:39 --> 00:54:40: that interchange 95.  
00:54:40 --> 00:54:42: But like the research is pretty clear.  
00:54:42 --> 00:54:44: If you like expanded the southern part,  
00:54:44 --> 00:54:47: you would not. You would run out of benefit like  
00:54:47 --> 00:54:49: the benefits of increased lanes in a few years,  
00:54:49 --> 00:54:51: but it's hard to tell like how much effect the  
00:54:51 --> 00:54:54: fact that it does reducing lanes there has.  
00:54:54 --> 00:54:56: But that's where we kind of get the like.  
00:54:56 --> 00:54:57: A lot of our focus in that.  
00:54:57 --> 00:55:00: Case study is how, like at the time people to  
00:55:00 --> 00:55:02: wanted public transit integration.  
00:55:02 --> 00:55:04: With this with the Blue Route Highway,  
00:55:04 --> 00:55:06: whether it was buses or rail or and then none  
00:55:06 --> 00:55:08: of that came to fruition and how the only real  
00:55:09 --> 00:55:11: way to reduce congestion on that road would be to  
00:55:11 --> 00:55:14: get people out of those cars by giving them alternative  
00:55:14 --> 00:55:15: means of travel.  
00:55:17 --> 00:55:22: Great. Thanks everyone, so we're actually running tight on  
time.  
00:55:22 --> 00:55:24: I want to end with Sean's question because it's a  
00:55:24 --> 00:55:27: good sort of closing thing if people have a few  
00:55:27 --> 00:55:28: extra moments,  
00:55:28 --> 00:55:32: but Jim if you are available to ask your question  
00:55:32 --> 00:55:34: about transportation costs.  
00:55:34 --> 00:55:38: Sure, thank you Laura. Great presentation everybody.

00:55:38 --> 00:55:44: I'm just curious if any private transportation companies have popped up getting contracts with the companies to actually get residents to those opportunities.

00:55:44 --> 00:55:49: I don't have a specific answer for that, but I do have one tidbit that we got from our interviews in the report.

00:55:49 --> 00:55:51: Was learning that in the context of blue route and public transportation, the Delaware County did used to pay for a shuttle service to get workers to the County nursing home in media from Chester.

00:55:57 --> 00:55:59: So nothing specific on that.

00:55:59 --> 00:56:02: But just like something like that, it does appear in the report that the lack of this infrastructure has caused governments have to go out of their way to figure out how to how to solve these transportation. Problems.

00:56:02 --> 00:56:03: Great, anyone else? I just wanted the restated jury status question again just just so I can attempt to answer it.

00:56:03 --> 00:56:06: I I thought I had an answer but I just want to make sure I'm answering your correct question or Kareem.

00:56:06 --> 00:56:07: My question basically is if there is a challenge with getting.

00:56:07 --> 00:56:10: Residence two companies that have been built in the suburbs and we don't in the public.

00:56:10 --> 00:56:13: Transportation was not set up to fit in that.

00:56:13 --> 00:56:14: Are there private companies that may be setting up so you can't get SEPTA, but there's a private company that's been set up to make do a contract with the company to tiring to get employees back and forth on a regular basis.

00:56:14 --> 00:56:16: They might be coming from a particular community like Chester in that example.

00:56:16 --> 00:56:18: Yes, so I I based based on at least three.

00:56:18 --> 00:56:20: Public like public policy cases.

00:56:20 --> 00:56:24: I didn't see any sort of like partnerships that were sort of like private partnerships that,

00:56:24 --> 00:56:26:

00:56:26 --> 00:56:28:

00:56:28 --> 00:56:36:

00:56:36 --> 00:56:39:

00:56:39 --> 00:56:40:

00:56:40 --> 00:56:42:

00:56:42 --> 00:56:45:

00:56:45 --> 00:56:46:

00:56:46 --> 00:56:49:

00:56:49 --> 00:56:50:

00:56:50 --> 00:56:54:

00:56:54 --> 00:56:56:

00:56:56 --> 00:56:59:

00:56:59 --> 00:57:03:

00:57:03 --> 00:57:04:

00:57:04 --> 00:57:08:

00:57:08 --> 00:57:12:

00:57:12 --> 00:57:16:

00:57:16 --> 00:57:20:

00:57:20 --> 00:57:22:

00:57:22 --> 00:57:27:

00:57:27 --> 00:57:29:

00:57:29 --> 00:57:32:

00:57:32 --> 00:57:35:

00:57:35 --> 00:57:37: in terms of like specific transportation,  
00:57:37 --> 00:57:41: Brandon, do you have something that in that area?  
00:57:41 --> 00:57:43: Yeah, so when we talked to John Grady,  
00:57:43 --> 00:57:46: who is the former executive director of PIDC and he  
00:57:46 --> 00:57:49: spent a lot of this time working on the Navy  
00:57:49 --> 00:57:51: Yard kind of redevelopment and expansion?  
00:57:51 --> 00:57:54: And they put a lot of time and money into  
00:57:54 --> 00:57:58: figuring out which you know which residents in which towns  
00:57:58 --> 00:58:00: in the suburbs that they could.  
00:58:00 --> 00:58:02: Find new job sectors from an.  
00:58:02 --> 00:58:05: They were running buses between the end of the Broad  
00:58:05 --> 00:58:09: Street line in South Philadelphia about it's about 2 miles  
00:58:09 --> 00:58:12: from there to the Navy Yard and so they're working  
00:58:12 --> 00:58:16: on like private shuttle systems to get people from the  
00:58:16 --> 00:58:19: Broad Street line to the Navy Yard and offering some  
00:58:19 --> 00:58:23: of those incentives and running bus systems even up through  
00:58:23 --> 00:58:27: like the blue route into some of those suburban areas  
00:58:27 --> 00:58:30: to bring people in jobs down there and also to  
00:58:30 --> 00:58:31: incentivize companies to.  
00:58:31 --> 00:58:35: Moving to the Navy Yard by showing that they had  
00:58:35 --> 00:58:37: the ability to bus in new workers,  
00:58:37 --> 00:58:40: so I think that's one of the more clear examples  
00:58:40 --> 00:58:42: of kind of a private company.  
00:58:42 --> 00:58:46: Or I mean it's really a public private partnership,  
00:58:46 --> 00:58:51: but working to bus people in directly from available transit  
00:58:51 --> 00:58:52: to new areas.  
00:58:52 --> 00:58:55: Great and I think Greg and the DVR PC folks  
00:58:55 --> 00:58:56: want to weigh in on this one.  
00:58:56 --> 00:58:59: Go ahead, yeah I was just going to say really,  
00:58:59 --> 00:59:02: really quickly. It's it's a geometry problem,  
00:59:02 --> 00:59:04: so whether it's public or private,  
00:59:04 --> 00:59:07: you know to to serve these trips.  
00:59:07 --> 00:59:08: It usually costs \$20 a ride,  
00:59:08 --> 00:59:12: \$30 a ride to get people to those dispersed employment  
00:59:12 --> 00:59:16: locations from connecting transit service or from from the  
00:59:16 --> 00:59:19: city.  
00:59:16 --> 00:59:19: And so it's it's it's it's in the long run.  
00:59:19 --> 00:59:22: It's always going to be a losing proposition to try  
00:59:22 --> 00:59:22: to chase.  
00:59:22 --> 00:59:26: Job development with Tran dispersed job development with  
00:59:26 --> 00:59:29: transit.  
00:59:26 --> 00:59:29: Just can't provide cost efficient service.  
00:59:29 --> 00:59:31: So even when the service is private,



00:59:31 --> 00:59:35: it's at heavy public subsidy and sustainability is pretty questionable

00:59:35 --> 00:59:37: and I'm sorry if you hear background noise.

00:59:37 --> 00:59:40: I have a toddler that seems to have escaped containment.

00:59:43 --> 00:59:45: No problem, well, this is really fascinating.

00:59:45 --> 00:59:47: I think we could go on for a long time,

00:59:47 --> 00:59:49: but I want to keep us on track.

00:59:49 --> 00:59:50: We're a few minutes over,

00:59:50 --> 00:59:53: but if everyones OK, still hanging out for just a

00:59:53 --> 00:59:54: moment.

00:59:54 --> 00:59:57: I love Shawna to ask her question to the group

00:59:57 --> 00:59:58: as we close so go ahead.

00:59:58 --> 01:00:01: Yeah, thanks so I put in the chat that you

01:00:01 --> 01:00:05: guys did a fantastic job at proposing things for us.

01:00:05 --> 01:00:08: But I also think a lot of the things that

01:00:08 --> 01:00:12: you proposed could be used by planners in general and

01:00:12 --> 01:00:16: also particularly this group were in such an important time

01:00:16 --> 01:00:19: for restorative justice to be more of the focus.

01:00:19 --> 01:00:24: Advocates and grassroots have been asking for this for decades

01:00:24 --> 01:00:28: so I would love for the professional class to take

01:00:28 --> 01:00:30: advantage of this moment.

01:00:30 --> 01:00:33: So do you students have anything that you would really

01:00:33 --> 01:00:35: want to pass on to this group right now to

01:00:35 --> 01:00:37: take up as their mantle?

01:00:41 --> 01:00:42: One piece and I'll just go quick.

01:00:42 --> 01:00:45: One piece that we mentioned with the Vine Street is

01:00:45 --> 01:00:49: just reaching out to these community groups at the very

01:00:49 --> 01:00:52: beginning before you even create the the first set of

01:00:52 --> 01:00:55: plans. 'cause otherwise you're putting people on their heels and

01:00:55 --> 01:00:57: making them very defensive.

01:00:57 --> 01:00:59: So if you approach him and say hey look where

01:00:59 --> 01:01:02: you know we're hoping to do this new project,

01:01:02 --> 01:01:06: that's going to involve your community or cut their community.

01:01:06 --> 01:01:08: Can we identify key locations that you may?

01:01:08 --> 01:01:11: That should be protective and you know areas for.

01:01:11 --> 01:01:15: Possible expansion or new growth and having that conversation before

01:01:16 --> 01:01:16: you say hey,

01:01:16 --> 01:01:20: there's a highway coming through and you're we're going to

01:01:20 --> 01:01:22: take your church in school.

01:01:22 --> 01:01:26: So having those conversations before the plans and blueprints are

01:01:26 --> 01:01:29: made would be one thing that I think everyone in

01:01:29 --> 01:01:32: this land use and planning world can really look at

01:01:32 --> 01:01:35: going forward.

01:01:35 --> 01:01:36: That was the exact point I was going to make,

01:01:36 --> 01:01:38: so.

01:01:38 --> 01:01:41: Yeah, something something that I always try to that I've

01:01:41 --> 01:01:42: been thinking about.

01:01:42 --> 01:01:46: Actually, as I've been reading more about equity and planning

01:01:46 --> 01:01:48: is just project prioritization.

01:01:48 --> 01:01:50: And that's sort of the one place where we can

01:01:50 --> 01:01:53: start in sort of overcome the constraints and what we

01:01:53 --> 01:01:56: choose to end like is just by choosing and what

01:01:56 --> 01:01:59: we choose to do an in the projects that we

01:01:59 --> 01:02:00: actually choose to engage in.

01:02:00 --> 01:02:03: So I think that's a good place to start and

01:02:03 --> 01:02:07: really understanding our constraints and what's feasible and what's not,

01:02:07 --> 01:02:09: and what we prioritize this.

01:02:09 --> 01:02:12: Cleaners and then the other thing I think is really

01:02:12 --> 01:02:17: important is basing our plans around actionable goals and actionable

01:02:17 --> 01:02:20: outcomes so that we can see the we can actually

01:02:20 --> 01:02:23: put our metrics of equity to to the actions and

01:02:23 --> 01:02:27: outcomes that we're creating and see you know the shortcomings

01:02:27 --> 01:02:31: of what we have achieved and we haven't achieved.

01:02:31 --> 01:02:34: And I think by sort of prioritizing the most equitable

01:02:34 --> 01:02:38: goal of what is feasible for us and then having

01:02:38 --> 01:02:41: sort of actionable outcomes to observe those.

01:02:41 --> 01:02:44: To observe those projects, I think is a good platform

01:02:44 --> 01:02:48: to really understand our limitations in the feasibility of our

01:02:48 --> 01:02:51: projects in ways that we can improve and ameliorate them

01:02:51 --> 01:02:54: in future circumstances well. Or if I if I can

01:02:54 --> 01:02:54: just.

01:02:54 --> 01:02:56: I mean I think to to creams point,

01:02:56 --> 01:03:00: you know, picking the right project at the right location

01:03:00 --> 01:03:03: is absolutely the first first step to trying to get

01:03:03 --> 01:03:03: things right,

01:03:03 --> 01:03:06: but I think a lot of these lessons also showed

01:03:06 --> 01:03:09: that it's more expensive to try to fix things later

01:03:09 --> 01:03:11: than than to design them,  
01:03:11 --> 01:03:15: right? Front, but also have to acknowledge that sometimes really  
01:03:15 --> 01:03:18: doing things right up front is a lot more expensive,  
01:03:18 --> 01:03:21: unfortunately, so at this time is we're also looking for  
01:03:21 --> 01:03:25: funding for transportation at the federal level at the state  
01:03:25 --> 01:03:25: level,  
01:03:25 --> 01:03:29: it's an opportunity really to invest and and do those  
01:03:29 --> 01:03:31: right projects in the right way at the right.  
01:03:31 --> 01:03:35: The right location. So hope everybody can continue to support  
01:03:35 --> 01:03:39: opportunities for investment because I think they can really be.  
01:03:39 --> 01:03:42: We have a time now when some of those investments.  
01:03:42 --> 01:03:45: Really be transformative. And we're all anxious to see those  
01:03:45 --> 01:03:46: happen.  
01:03:46 --> 01:03:47: So thank thanks to the student team.  
01:03:47 --> 01:03:51: They they really appreciate their insights.  
01:03:51 --> 01:03:53: Wonderful thank you so much.  
01:03:53 --> 01:03:55: I will wrap us just because it's 1035,  
01:03:55 --> 01:03:57: but absolutely is very sad.  
01:03:57 --> 01:04:00: This is such an important time for so many reasons  
01:04:00 --> 01:04:04: for this work and this information and hopefully we'll see  
01:04:04 --> 01:04:07: investments in our region and a CAP on the Vine  
01:04:07 --> 01:04:11: Street Expressway and a lot of the recommendations here implemented.  
01:04:11 --> 01:04:14: So thank you all so much for listening to DVR,  
01:04:14 --> 01:04:17: PC and the students for your amazing work.  
01:04:17 --> 01:04:19: And I also need to thank.  
01:04:19 --> 01:04:21: They're not here but you allies.  
01:04:21 --> 01:04:25: National Curtis Infrastructure Grant supported a part of this work  
01:04:25 --> 01:04:27: and some of the aspects where we pulled in some  
01:04:28 --> 01:04:29: of the you have a lie advisors,  
01:04:29 --> 01:04:31: so hopefully that was valuable.  
01:04:31 --> 01:04:34: Will also be featured. A summary of this in some  
01:04:34 --> 01:04:36: of the content that you will I put out when  
01:04:36 --> 01:04:40: all of these various projects in nine different cities are  
01:04:40 --> 01:04:42: completed so will please keep an eye out for that  
01:04:42 --> 01:04:45: and hopefully we can continue to push some of these  
01:04:45 --> 01:04:49: concepts that are broadly nationally applicable and also talk about  
01:04:49 --> 01:04:52: the work that we're doing in Philadelphia.  
01:04:52 --> 01:04:54: On the national stage, so thank you again.

01:04:54 --> 01:04:57: Hope to see you soon want to highlight a couple  
01:04:57 --> 01:04:59: of upcoming ULI events.  
01:04:59 --> 01:05:01: The June 10th one kind of relevant here.  
01:05:01 --> 01:05:05: This is actually you'll I normally that's in North Carolina.  
01:05:05 --> 01:05:09: I think it's triangle is putting together this gridlock by  
01:05:09 --> 01:05:11: connecting development and transportation.  
01:05:11 --> 01:05:14: Sorry about my phone demand management,  
01:05:14 --> 01:05:17: that's virtual, so open to all folks and here on  
01:05:17 --> 01:05:19: June 16th is are you alive?  
01:05:19 --> 01:05:21: Philadelphia Virtual Awards for excellence.  
01:05:21 --> 01:05:24: Encourage folks to join we have.  
01:05:24 --> 01:05:26: An interesting I think I saw Ken on this call  
01:05:26 --> 01:05:28: from SEPTA Hollywood speaker,  
01:05:28 --> 01:05:31: the creator of the Wework series does is going to  
01:05:31 --> 01:05:34: do a fireside chat with Ken Starr from our team  
01:05:34 --> 01:05:35: here,  
01:05:35 --> 01:05:38: which is really interesting. Hearing his story is like a  
01:05:38 --> 01:05:42: total non real estate person learning about that that work  
01:05:42 --> 01:05:44: in those founders there and then.  
01:05:44 --> 01:05:47: Of course we'll announce our winners of the UI for  
01:05:47 --> 01:05:49: Excellence program,  
01:05:49 --> 01:05:51: so I want to take just a minute also to  
01:05:51 --> 01:05:52: talk about.  
01:05:52 --> 01:05:55: I think we have folks that are new and of  
01:05:55 --> 01:05:55: course.  
01:05:55 --> 01:05:59: Amazing students who we hope you stay in Philadelphia in  
01:05:59 --> 01:05:59: the field.  
01:05:59 --> 01:06:02: We are wrapping up our UI engagement campaign.  
01:06:02 --> 01:06:05: This is the opportunity to learn about a lot of  
01:06:05 --> 01:06:06: the work that Alan mentioned.  
01:06:06 --> 01:06:10: An R20 almost 20 volunteer opportunities within our  
01:06:10 --> 01:06:13: organization.  
01:06:13 --> 01:06:16: So please if you're interested in getting more involved,  
01:06:16 --> 01:06:18: go to our website. You can reach out to any  
01:06:18 --> 01:06:21: of our team here on this call or myself or  
01:06:21 --> 01:06:24: many of the DVR PC folks who are actively involved.  
01:06:24 --> 01:06:26: It's we over the summer we always sort of regroup  
01:06:26 --> 01:06:29: and as Alan mentioned at the beginning.  
01:06:29 --> 01:06:32: Everything that we do is driven by our Members.  
01:06:32 --> 01:06:33: This idea came from a kind of casual conversation that  
01:06:33 --> 01:06:33: we had with crag from DVR,  
01:06:33 --> 01:06:34: PC at one of our meetings.

01:06:34 --> 01:06:37: So really our Members drive the content and and we  
01:06:37 --> 01:06:39: hope to continue work like this going forward.  
01:06:39 --> 01:06:42: So please check it out and then finally we would  
01:06:42 --> 01:06:43: love your feedback.  
01:06:43 --> 01:06:45: Kevin is going to send a link to a survey  
01:06:45 --> 01:06:48: we really value hearing from people and this was a  
01:06:48 --> 01:06:49: really different format.  
01:06:49 --> 01:06:51: So if you could take a few minutes to fill  
01:06:51 --> 01:06:53: that out and let us know what you think of  
01:06:53 --> 01:06:56: our programming and then I will make a final plug  
01:06:56 --> 01:06:57: that I don't usually say.  
01:06:57 --> 01:07:00: But to this group. We actually have an open job  
01:07:00 --> 01:07:04: at ULI Philadelphia on our team for an associate position,  
01:07:04 --> 01:07:06: which is an entry level role with the tons of  
01:07:07 --> 01:07:09: opportunity for growth were really small team.  
01:07:09 --> 01:07:13: We are not requiring real estate are planning experience so  
01:07:13 --> 01:07:17: feel free to spread the word about that opportunity and  
01:07:17 --> 01:07:20: I'm happy to answer any questions but it's all on  
01:07:20 --> 01:07:23: our website as well. So with that I'll just thank  
01:07:23 --> 01:07:26: everyone from again for the work for being here.  
01:07:26 --> 01:07:29: Keep an eye out. We'll share all of the summarize  
01:07:29 --> 01:07:30: findings as we.  
01:07:30 --> 01:07:33: Make them public and I have a feeling we'll be  
01:07:33 --> 01:07:36: continuing a lot of these conversations going into next year.  
01:07:36 --> 01:07:39: So thank you again. Everyone please stay safe.  
01:07:39 --> 01:07:42: Take care.  
01:07:42 --> 01:07:44: Hope to see you in person soon.

---

*This video transcript has been machine-generated, so it may not be accurate. It is for personal use only. Reproduction or use without written permission is prohibited. If you have a correction or for permission inquiries, please contact [\[email protected\]](#).*