Webinar

ULI Philadelphia: Benefits and Burdens: Case Studies in Transportation Equity in the Philadelphia Region

Date: June 02, 2021

00:00:05 --> 00:00:09: Good morning everyone and welcome to this morning's program.

00:00:09 --> 00:00:14: Focus on equity in infrastructure investments presented by UI Philadelphia.

00:00:14 --> 00:00:19: I'm Alan bracek. I in the UI Philadelphia District Council

00:00:19 --> 00:00:23: chair and a principle at our spruce here in Philadelphia.

00:00:23 --> 00:00:26: A little housekeeping stuff before we get started,

00:00:26 --> 00:00:29: please leave your videos on were fairly small group.

00:00:29 --> 00:00:30: So finally your videos on.

00:00:30 --> 00:00:34: But we do ask you to keep yourself muted.

00:00:34 --> 00:00:37: In deference to the number of speakers that we have

00:00:37 --> 00:00:38: here today,

00:00:38 --> 00:00:41: feel free to use your chat button to introduce yourselves

00:00:41 --> 00:00:45: with your name and organization so everyone knows who's here

00:00:45 --> 00:00:49: and you're welcome to have chat conversations when presentation is

00:00:49 --> 00:00:52: going on. You can also enter any questions that you

00:00:52 --> 00:00:55: might have in the chat in our moderators will do

00:00:55 --> 00:00:58: their best to get to as many as possible in

00:00:58 --> 00:01:01: the presentation. When remind everybody,

00:01:01 --> 00:01:05: this is being recorded so people can get to it

00:01:05 --> 00:01:05: later.

00:01:05 --> 00:01:08: And with that I want to thank our sponsors for

00:01:08 --> 00:01:10: their support for this presentation.

00:01:10 --> 00:01:14: And. That includes our annual sponsors,

00:01:14 --> 00:01:19: urban visionaries. Diamond leadership circle and platinum sponsors,

00:01:19 --> 00:01:21: as well as her gold,

00:01:21 --> 00:01:23: silver and friends sponsors.
00:01:25 --> 00:01:28: Without the support of those sponsors,
00:01:28 --> 00:01:30: none of this, including this presentation,
00:01:30 --> 00:01:34: would be possible. So we say thank you to them.
00:01:34 --> 00:01:37: But if you're not familiar with the Urban Land Institute,
00:01:37 --> 00:01:39: let me just say a few words about it or
00:01:39 --> 00:01:42: mission is to shape the future of the built environment
00:01:42 --> 00:01:45: for transformative impact in communities worldwide.
00:01:45 --> 00:01:48: And we do that by connecting just as we're doing
00:01:48 --> 00:01:49: here today.
00:01:49 --> 00:01:52: By leading.
00:01:52 --> 00:01:53: Bye.
00:01:53 --> 00:01:58: Inspiring the best land use practices.
00:01:58 --> 00:02:01: We've got 45,000 practitioners worldwide.
00:02:01 --> 00:02:03: Of those about 900 or in Philadelphia,
00:02:03 --> 00:02:07: and they range from not just the Philadelphia metro area
00:02:07 --> 00:02:10: but also the state of Delaware or Southern New Jersey.
00:02:10 --> 00:02:12: Beleaguered valley in central Pennsylvania.
00:02:14 --> 00:02:17: Our Members make everything happen here.
00:02:17 --> 00:02:21: Everything we do here is driven by Members who volunteer
00:02:21 --> 00:02:25: both their time and their expertise to lead and to
00:02:25 --> 00:02:26: contribute content.
00:02:26 --> 00:02:29: We have 20 different councils and committees,
00:02:29 --> 00:02:33: all of whom share educational experiences to advance the land,
00:02:33 --> 00:02:38: use dialogue and have a positive impact in their communities
00:02:38 --> 00:02:39: in our industry.
00:02:39 --> 00:02:42: I want to take just a few minutes to highlight
00:02:42 --> 00:02:44: some of the things that we've been doing over the
00:02:44 --> 00:02:45: past year.
00:02:45 --> 00:02:48: We do a lot of support for public policy work.
00:02:48 --> 00:02:51: We have partnered with the City of Philadelphia on issues
00:02:51 --> 00:02:53: such as the future of work on Life sciences,
00:02:53 --> 00:02:56: on housing, affordability and sustainability.
00:02:56 --> 00:02:58: You may have noted if you remember,
00:02:58 --> 00:03:00: or if you're on our mailing list that we just
00:03:01 --> 00:03:04: issued a report on naturally occurring affordable housing that we've
00:03:04 --> 00:03:07: been working on with the City of Philadelphia for the
00:03:07 --> 00:03:09: past year and a half.
00:03:09 --> 00:03:12: We also have an advisory services program that allows members
00:03:12 --> 00:03:16: to volunteer their expertise in support of public sector land

00:03:16 --> 00:03:17: use questions.
00:03:17 --> 00:03:20: We're also expanding and moving forward with a variety of
00:03:20 --> 00:03:21: programming,
00:03:21 --> 00:03:24: such as today's conversation and initiatives around our diversity,
00:03:24 --> 00:03:28: equity and inclusion work, including continuing to build our urban
00:03:28 --> 00:03:29: plan program,
00:03:29 --> 00:03:31: which we launched last year.
00:03:31 --> 00:03:34: This is a real estate training program that we've launched
00:03:34 --> 00:03:35: in high schools,
00:03:35 --> 00:03:38: colleges, community groups and for public officials.
00:03:38 --> 00:03:41: We also offer training to Arceo leaders and other community
00:03:41 --> 00:03:42: leaders.
00:03:42 --> 00:03:43: A couple of months ago,
00:03:43 --> 00:03:47: and there's more coming. This is a great volunteer opportunity.
00:03:47 --> 00:03:50: For our Members to get out into the community and
00:03:50 --> 00:03:52: offer support for land use issues.
00:03:52 --> 00:03:55: This and other programs that we're doing our part of
00:03:55 --> 00:03:58: our ongoing commitment to advancing diversity,
00:03:58 --> 00:04:01: equity and inclusion in our industry in an organization you
00:04:01 --> 00:04:06: are welcome to go to **** to see Rdy framework
00:04:06 --> 00:04:09: and also to measure the progress that we're making against
00:04:09 --> 00:04:12: the commitments that we've made there.
00:04:12 --> 00:04:15: All of this just scratches the surface of what we
00:04:15 --> 00:04:15: do,
00:04:15 --> 00:04:18: so if you're not a member or if you are
00:04:18 --> 00:04:20: a member and not involved,
00:04:20 --> 00:04:22: we invite you to join us organization.
00:04:22 --> 00:04:25: As I said earlier, is fueled completely by our Members.
00:04:27 --> 00:04:29: If you haven't gotten involved yet,
00:04:29 --> 00:04:31: we hope you'll join us,
00:04:31 --> 00:04:33: especially in these changing and uncertain times.
00:04:33 --> 00:04:37: It's our mission to serve as a resource for connection
00:04:37 --> 00:04:41: and best practices to support our region in recovering and
00:04:41 --> 00:04:42: moving forward.
00:04:42 --> 00:04:45: So finally, before I pass things off to very see
00:04:45 --> 00:04:48: more of DVR PC to provide some background on the
00:04:48 --> 00:04:51: research will hear about I want to thank our seven
00:04:51 --> 00:04:55: ULI advisors who volunteer their time earlier this semester to
00:04:55 --> 00:04:59: check in with students under approach and under work

today.
00:04:59 --> 00:05:02: It's been a privilege to support the students throughout this
00:05:02 --> 00:05:03: semester.
00:05:03 --> 00:05:06: So now to hear more about the scope of this
00:05:06 --> 00:05:06: project,
00:05:06 --> 00:05:10: I'd like to welcome very Seymour Executive director of the
00:05:10 --> 00:05:13: Delaware Valley Regional Planning Commission.
00:05:13 --> 00:05:15: Thanks Alan and any good morning everybody.
00:05:15 --> 00:05:18: Glad to be here with you and you a lion
00:05:18 --> 00:05:19: and the student teams.
00:05:19 --> 00:05:22: I should note I'm a proud member of You ally
00:05:22 --> 00:05:26: and a member of the Executive Committee so always appreciated
00:05:26 --> 00:05:29: you allies role in in the region and glad we
00:05:29 --> 00:05:33: can partner on this. So the dollar value Regional Planning
00:05:33 --> 00:05:38: Commission is coordinates a series of events throughout the region.
00:05:38 --> 00:05:43: Particularly, we have a core role around transportation planning under
00:05:43 --> 00:05:44: federal law.
00:05:44 --> 00:05:47: We are required to prepare a long range plan.
00:05:47 --> 00:05:52: We prepare the capital program for transportation investments across 9
00:05:52 --> 00:05:57: county region in southern New Jersey and Southeastern Pennsylvania.
00:05:57 --> 00:06:00: Sometimes were engaged in project planning,
00:06:00 --> 00:06:04: sometimes were engaged in preliminary design.
00:06:04 --> 00:06:08: We work with our partners on outreach,
00:06:08 --> 00:06:10: but we don't.
00:06:10 --> 00:06:13: Own any facilities? We don't build any facilities.
00:06:13 --> 00:06:15: We don't maintain any facilities.
00:06:15 --> 00:06:19: We were where the planners who work on the early
00:06:19 --> 00:06:21: stage and I think like most planners,
00:06:21 --> 00:06:25: we tend to think of ourselves as.
00:06:25 --> 00:06:29: As the good guys we work on it with communities
00:06:29 --> 00:06:34: for planning in in their local local communities,
00:06:34 --> 00:06:40: neighborhoods. We are active in terms of outreach and input.
00:06:40 --> 00:06:44: We listen, we try to listen.
00:06:44 --> 00:06:48: Equity is is really baked into to so much of
00:06:48 --> 00:06:51: what we do and has been for a very,
00:06:51 --> 00:06:53: very long time. You know,
00:06:53 --> 00:06:55: in fact, the idea of,
00:06:55 --> 00:07:00: well, the idea of environmental justice goes back back many

00:07:00 --> 00:07:00: decades.
00:07:00 --> 00:07:05: But the specific federal rules that require a focus on
00:07:05 --> 00:07:10: environmental justice really dates from the mid 90s an and
00:07:10 --> 00:07:13: the Clinton administration over 25 years ago,
00:07:13 --> 00:07:18: which put out an executive order which still stands to
00:07:18 --> 00:07:19: this day,
00:07:19 --> 00:07:24: which effectively says that any federally funded activity.
00:07:24 --> 00:07:28: Should not unduly burden any communities and the spending of
00:07:28 --> 00:07:34: federal funds should equitably share the benefits across communities.
00:07:34 --> 00:07:36: And I think that's simple.
00:07:36 --> 00:07:38: Idea has guided our work to this day.
00:07:38 --> 00:07:42: It's been over 20 years since we've put together a
00:07:42 --> 00:07:47: strategy for the fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all
00:07:47 --> 00:07:48: people.
00:07:48 --> 00:07:52: We developed our own methodology to look at indicators of
00:07:52 --> 00:07:56: potential disadvantage at a neighborhood level.
00:07:56 --> 00:07:59: And we use that to assess conditions as as we
00:07:59 --> 00:08:04: work across the region and an within individual communities to
00:08:04 --> 00:08:08: to understand the specific dynamics within a community.
00:08:08 --> 00:08:11: So it's very much baked into our DNA.
00:08:11 --> 00:08:15: But having said that, there's also of course the legacy
00:08:15 --> 00:08:16: of planning,
00:08:16 --> 00:08:20: which is not always been great.
00:08:20 --> 00:08:23: And we need to acknowledge that there's been a legacy
00:08:23 --> 00:08:27: both of in housing and an in land development and
00:08:27 --> 00:08:30: an in transportation that that has had negative impacts on
00:08:30 --> 00:08:35: communities. So last year following the I think really following
00:08:35 --> 00:08:36: the Black Lives Matter,
00:08:36 --> 00:08:39: protests and the killing of George Floyd,
00:08:39 --> 00:08:41: we did a bit of a kind of a self
00:08:41 --> 00:08:45: examination to understand what our history is been and what
00:08:45 --> 00:08:48: our impact has been and run to take a number
00:08:48 --> 00:08:50: of projects this year around.
00:08:50 --> 00:08:53: Looking at minority mobility and looking at.
00:08:53 --> 00:08:57: Fair equity, but we also talked about what has been
00:08:57 --> 00:08:59: the legacy of project development,
00:08:59 --> 00:09:01: some of which we've been involved with,
00:09:01 --> 00:09:03: some of which perhaps not,
00:09:03 --> 00:09:07: and around that time I was contacted by John McLaughlin

00:09:07 --> 00:09:08: from Temple University,
00:09:08 --> 00:09:11: who said, hey, I have a group of students in
00:09:11 --> 00:09:15: a studio that's looking for a project you have anything
00:09:15 --> 00:09:15: for us,
00:09:15 --> 00:09:18: and we said we got a project for you,
00:09:18 --> 00:09:20: so one thing led to another,
00:09:20 --> 00:09:22: and Joanne, his colleague Jeffrey Dasha,
00:09:22 --> 00:09:26: and. Came together actually two classes,
00:09:26 --> 00:09:29: one in Master City and regional planning,
00:09:29 --> 00:09:32: one in the public policy program and Joe and Jeff
00:09:32 --> 00:09:36: put together a great group of students who really undertook
00:09:36 --> 00:09:38: a pretty amazing research project.
00:09:38 --> 00:09:41: So really glad that we were able to partner with
00:09:41 --> 00:09:41: them.
00:09:41 --> 00:09:45: Just tremendously impressed by the work that they were able
00:09:45 --> 00:09:48: to do in a very short period of time.
00:09:48 --> 00:09:51: And that's what you're going to hear about today.
00:09:51 --> 00:09:54: So with that I am very happy and proud to
00:09:54 --> 00:09:56: turn it over to the student team.
00:09:56 --> 00:09:58: Looking into it and not sure who's who's speaking first,
00:09:58 --> 00:10:01: but I'll let yetley you each introduce yourselves.
00:10:06 --> 00:10:09: Good morning everyone. I'm I'm going to be the one
00:10:09 --> 00:10:12: sharing my slides or sharing screens today so my name
00:10:12 --> 00:10:13: is Kareem Brooms.
00:10:13 --> 00:10:16: I was the principle writer for the market Franklin line
00:10:17 --> 00:10:20: reconstruction case and I'm a part of the national public
00:10:20 --> 00:10:21: policy team.
00:10:21 --> 00:10:23: Thank you for attending and.
00:10:25 --> 00:10:27: Here to you know, review our findings.
00:10:39 --> 00:10:42: Hi, I'm Lucas. I'm a member of the Master public
00:10:42 --> 00:10:45: policy team and I helped on all of the case
00:10:45 --> 00:10:45: studies.
00:10:51 --> 00:10:54: Alright, thanks for sharing cream and Lucas and thank you
00:10:54 --> 00:10:58: very for that very kind introduction and for also providing
00:10:58 --> 00:11:01: us with the opportunity to receive your PC this semester.
00:11:01 --> 00:11:04: You are also helpful and generous with your time and
00:11:04 --> 00:11:07: admit are many questions and requests and so we really
00:11:07 --> 00:11:08: appreciate it.
00:11:08 --> 00:11:10: But hello everyone, my name is Andrew Hall.
00:11:10 --> 00:11:13: I'm part of the masters in city and Regional planning
00:11:13 --> 00:11:16: team and together with my colleagues autumn,
00:11:16 --> 00:11:19: Shawn's Korean grooms, Brandon Liberty and Lucas

Oschman will be
00:11:19 --> 00:11:22: presenting as we've said the transportation equity.
00:11:22 --> 00:11:25: Analysis framework that we proposed your PC to apply to
00:11:25 --> 00:11:28: current and future projects as well as the recommendations that
00:11:28 --> 00:11:30: we produced as part of our Joint Capstone project.
00:11:30 --> 00:11:32: I'd like to note that all graphics that are in
00:11:32 --> 00:11:35: the presentation or taken from the full report which is
00:11:35 --> 00:11:37: hosted on Temple's website and I believe a copy will
00:11:37 --> 00:11:40: be shared with the attendees today.
00:11:40 --> 00:11:41: Next time, please.
00:11:44 --> 00:11:46: So while give, your PC has historically been a leader
00:11:47 --> 00:11:50: in equity among IPOs following the murder of George Floyd
00:11:50 --> 00:11:53: and resulting internal conversations among DVR PC staff.
00:11:53 --> 00:11:56: The Commission wanted a framework to evaluate the impacts the
00:11:56 --> 00:12:00: past projects had on equity working concert between the public
00:12:00 --> 00:12:01: policy and city,
00:12:01 --> 00:12:04: regional planning programs, or 13 person team created a framework
00:12:04 --> 00:12:05: based on best practices,
00:12:05 --> 00:12:08: practices among both NPO's and academic literature.
00:12:08 --> 00:12:11: The two teams analyze the project seen here on screen,
00:12:11 --> 00:12:14: selected from a list of your PC provided us.
00:12:14 --> 00:12:16: Our goal was to cover urban,
00:12:16 --> 00:12:18: suburban, rural portions of the region.
00:12:18 --> 00:12:22: In addition to covering a mix of transportation modes used
00:12:22 --> 00:12:24: throughout the region.
00:12:24 --> 00:12:27: Our process to create an equity framework and a value
00:12:27 --> 00:12:27: wait.
00:12:27 --> 00:12:29: These projects was an extensive one.
00:12:29 --> 00:12:31: It consisted of many conversations with DVR,
00:12:31 --> 00:12:33: PC, staff and project stakeholders,
00:12:33 --> 00:12:35: and lots of research from public records,
00:12:35 --> 00:12:38: white papers, research reports, academic literature,
00:12:38 --> 00:12:42: newspapers, environmental impact statements and materials found through the Temple,
00:12:42 --> 00:12:45: Urban Archives and Library. Together,
00:12:45 --> 00:12:48: the research allowed us to paint a fine green picture
00:12:48 --> 00:12:51: of the history of equity in regional transportation projects.
00:12:51 --> 00:12:53: In completing the report we wanted,
00:12:53 --> 00:12:57: especially to ensure that we presented the findings and

recommendations
00:12:57 --> 00:12:59: to policy experts such as yourselves.
00:12:59 --> 00:13:02: As well as the final publication being available to all,
00:13:02 --> 00:13:04: we don't want this information to sit on the shelf
00:13:04 --> 00:13:07: and we really wanted to do our best to ensure
00:13:07 --> 00:13:10: that the conclusions were accessible to all those interested in
00:13:10 --> 00:13:12: applying them and also before I move on.
00:13:12 --> 00:13:14: We did want to give a special thanks to the
00:13:14 --> 00:13:15: UI advisory panel some,
00:13:15 --> 00:13:17: and I see in the audience today you all were
00:13:17 --> 00:13:20: so generous with your time and expertise in a review
00:13:20 --> 00:13:23: of our initial findings and we really appreciate that it
00:13:23 --> 00:13:25: was a really important meeting and you'll see Nuggets of
00:13:26 --> 00:13:28: insight that you all provided spread throughout the report.
00:13:34 --> 00:13:37: So the grounding root of our equity framework was Title
00:13:37 --> 00:13:38: 6 in the ejs ecutive order.
00:13:38 --> 00:13:42: Anyone who's working with federal dollars that fund transportation must
00:13:42 --> 00:13:44: abide by these two federal mandates,
00:13:44 --> 00:13:48: which layout populations that are explicitly protected from discrimination.
00:13:48 --> 00:13:52: Different interpretations of the wording protecting these populations from discrimination
00:13:52 --> 00:13:55: have led to different interpretations of equity,
00:13:55 --> 00:13:57: all of which can be supported by the legal framework.
00:14:04 --> 00:14:07: So seen here is our chart that's based on transportation
00:14:07 --> 00:14:08: equity experts,
00:14:08 --> 00:14:12: Barnes and Golems, 2018. Analysis of equity standards of the
00:14:12 --> 00:14:15: at the largest NPO's in the United States.
00:14:15 --> 00:14:19: We identified six. We can find 5 different levels of
00:14:19 --> 00:14:20: equity impact.
00:14:20 --> 00:14:23: All these levels of equity impact have basis under the
00:14:23 --> 00:14:27: current regulatory environment and range from a strict reading of
00:14:27 --> 00:14:29: an absence of discrimination which is level 0.
00:14:29 --> 00:14:34: Non discrimination to reading that emphasizes greater benefits going to
00:14:34 --> 00:14:38: historically disadvantaged groups or to address past wrongs which is
00:14:38 --> 00:14:39: level 4 vertical equity.
00:14:39 --> 00:14:42: A more detailed discussion of these levels of impact can
00:14:42 --> 00:14:43: be found on our full report.

00:14:47 --> 00:14:51: Additionally, taking guidance from the Victoria Transport Policy Institute,

00:14:51 --> 00:14:55: we also identified six teams of equity which address differing

00:14:55 --> 00:14:57: types of impacted project they have.

00:14:57 --> 00:15:00: These six teams, which as you can see your process

00:15:00 --> 00:15:01: protected classes,

00:15:01 --> 00:15:04: access environment, economics and funding cover a broad range of

00:15:05 --> 00:15:07: the types of impact the project might have on equity

00:15:07 --> 00:15:10: for residents nearby as well as the region as a

00:15:10 --> 00:15:13: whole. Again, a detailed discussion of these things can be

00:15:13 --> 00:15:14: found in our full report.

00:15:19 --> 00:15:21: So see here are our final valuations for the 8

00:15:21 --> 00:15:23: case studies that the team researched.

00:15:23 --> 00:15:27: You'll note that projects may be listed as a relatively

00:15:27 --> 00:15:29: high level equity on one axis below on others,

00:15:29 --> 00:15:33: depending on how they impacted communities.

00:15:33 --> 00:15:35: The whole street. The major differences between projects.

00:15:35 --> 00:15:37: Electric your attention to the two projects on the far

00:15:38 --> 00:15:39: right side of the screen,

00:15:39 --> 00:15:42: which orenji 29 in this Google River Trail.

00:15:42 --> 00:15:44: ND 29 has a poor equity score across all dimensions,

00:15:44 --> 00:15:48: but especially in the protected classes and access themes.

00:15:48 --> 00:15:51: The low score is due to severe and disproportionate impacts

00:15:51 --> 00:15:55: that NT 29 had all of these populations without improving

00:15:55 --> 00:15:56: access to jobs and services.

00:15:56 --> 00:16:00: Contrast Ng 29 slow score with this Google River Trail

00:16:00 --> 00:16:03: in which the Axis is a four instead of a

00:16:03 --> 00:16:03: 0.

00:16:03 --> 00:16:06: With the access, another higher scores for the scriptural indicator

00:16:07 --> 00:16:09: that the trail really did improve equity in the region,

00:16:09 --> 00:16:11: while NJ 29 did not.

00:16:11 --> 00:16:14: In addition, since we'll be hearing more about this project

00:16:14 --> 00:16:16: from Johnson later in the presentation,

00:16:16 --> 00:16:18: I want to point out the I 676 --

00:16:18 --> 00:16:20: 3 X ray chart, which is located on the top

00:16:20 --> 00:16:21: row,

00:16:21 --> 00:16:23: second from the left side.

00:16:23 --> 00:16:27: It's clear that why I 676 did not have major.

00:16:27 --> 00:16:31: Majorly inequitable impacts from an access perspective rated fairly poorly

00:16:31 --> 00:16:32: in process and protected classes.

00:16:32 --> 00:16:36: Themes which will be discussed in further detail later in
00:16:36 --> 00:16:37: our presentation.
00:16:37 --> 00:16:38: Next slide.
00:16:40 --> 00:16:43: Some of our findings that the research found involved some
00:16:43 --> 00:16:46: overarching conclusions about transportation in your PC region.
00:16:46 --> 00:16:50: Historically, the region prioritized white suburban residence just as much
00:16:50 --> 00:16:51: as the rest of the country did,
00:16:51 --> 00:16:56: leaving residents and communities of color and members of other
00:16:56 --> 00:16:58: protected classes at a disadvantage.
00:16:58 --> 00:17:02: Well, more people process more equitable processes have been in
00:17:02 --> 00:17:02: place recently,
00:17:02 --> 00:17:06: though few projects have been implemented that directly addressed this
00:17:06 --> 00:17:09: past focus and the long lasting nature of transportation projects
00:17:09 --> 00:17:12: means that the repercussions of positions still live with us
00:17:12 --> 00:17:12: today.
00:17:15 --> 00:17:19: However, equity is down or nothing game what works economically
00:17:19 --> 00:17:21: may not work environmentally.
00:17:21 --> 00:17:23: But our framework allows for new ones,
00:17:23 --> 00:17:25: view of projects. Looking at both the good and the
00:17:25 --> 00:17:25: bad aspects.
00:17:28 --> 00:17:31: Following these conclusions, we developed some broad recommendations for DVR
00:17:31 --> 00:17:33: PC about transportation equity,
00:17:33 --> 00:17:35: which my colleague Adam Sean Smell described.
00:17:42 --> 00:17:44: Thank you Andrew. My name is Adam Schantz and I
00:17:44 --> 00:17:48: will be reviewing 6 high level planning recommendations that came
00:17:48 --> 00:17:51: out of our report and in the chat I've shared
00:17:51 --> 00:17:53: where our report is housed.
00:17:53 --> 00:17:56: If you want to take a look at it at
00:17:56 --> 00:17:57: a later time.
00:17:57 --> 00:18:00: So DPR PC as an organization is best positioned to
00:18:00 --> 00:18:03: seek equity from start to finish in projects.
00:18:03 --> 00:18:06: As such DVR PC should take ownership of the necessity
00:18:06 --> 00:18:09: to further equity at all stages of projects from initial
00:18:09 --> 00:18:14: feasibility assessments to final completion by leveraging its employees high

00:18:14 --> 00:18:18: quality data and relationships throughout the region to create tools

00:18:18 --> 00:18:22: and procedures to ensure projects consider all aspects of equity.

00:18:22 --> 00:18:25: We recommend that DVR PC use our framework of six

00:18:25 --> 00:18:29: categories and five ratings to add nuance to its existing

00:18:29 --> 00:18:30: equity analysis process.

00:18:30 --> 00:18:35: Early incorporation of this framework would have highlighted resource allocation

00:18:35 --> 00:18:39: and lack of transit consideration in direct connection.

00:18:39 --> 00:18:40: As one can see in the pie chart,

00:18:40 --> 00:18:44: the cost of direct connection relative to DVR PC's.

00:18:44 --> 00:18:48: New Jersey tip funding between 2012 and today was 1/4

00:18:48 --> 00:18:49: of the total amount.

00:18:49 --> 00:18:53: Our analysis also would have illustrated the environmental impact of

00:18:53 --> 00:18:56: NJ 29 on the City of Trenton and his communities

00:18:56 --> 00:18:57: of color,

00:18:57 --> 00:19:00: which were entirely cut off from the Delaware River to

00:19:00 --> 00:19:03: make way for this roadway providing access to suburban and

00:19:04 --> 00:19:05: wider residents.

00:19:05 --> 00:19:08: We recognize that it's not politically or logistically easy to

00:19:08 --> 00:19:10: be a front runner championing equity,

00:19:10 --> 00:19:13: but it will allow DVR PC to correct negative effects

00:19:14 --> 00:19:17: that people have been living with for generations.

00:19:17 --> 00:19:18: Next slide, please.

00:19:20 --> 00:19:24: DVR PC is gone beyond the legal minimums for participation,

00:19:24 --> 00:19:28: but continued improvements would foster more equity in the region.

00:19:28 --> 00:19:31: DVR PC offers opportunities for public feedback,

00:19:31 --> 00:19:34: but that feedback is not required to be integrated into

00:19:34 --> 00:19:38: decisions and many of the least equitable decisions made in

00:19:38 --> 00:19:41: recent years have occurred when that feedback was gathered but

00:19:41 --> 00:19:45: ignored. The community was heard but ignored in the case

00:19:45 --> 00:19:48: of NJ 29 when the Citizen Advisory Committee was calling

00:19:48 --> 00:19:50: for a less auto oriented tip.

00:19:50 --> 00:19:53: At the same time that planning phases for the Lamberton

00:19:53 --> 00:19:54: tunnel were in action.

00:19:54 --> 00:19:58: Current outreach proceedings have tended to emphasize those who are

00:19:58 --> 00:19:59: already in power,

00:19:59 --> 00:20:02: such as the participation process for US 422,

00:20:02 --> 00:20:07: which prioritize the feedback of business and political leaders over

00:20:07 --> 00:20:08: that of those of residents.

00:20:08 --> 00:20:11: Living in the vicinity of the roadway.

00:20:11 --> 00:20:14: We recommend that DVR PC continue to be creative in

00:20:14 --> 00:20:18: seeking public participation itself and require public participation of its

00:20:18 --> 00:20:19: project partners,

00:20:19 --> 00:20:23: ensuring that responses from those with less influence are just

00:20:23 --> 00:20:26: as powerful as those who have historically held power.

00:20:26 --> 00:20:29: Next slide, please.

00:20:29 --> 00:20:32: Construction will have an impact on nearby residents,

00:20:32 --> 00:20:36: but current procedures allow some projects to skip mitigation studies

00:20:36 --> 00:20:39: or rely on mitigation studies that are decades out of

00:20:39 --> 00:20:39: date.

00:20:39 --> 00:20:43: Current procedures during the construction of direct connection have left

00:20:43 --> 00:20:46: Workingclass Belmar residents to deal with noise and visual impacts,

00:20:46 --> 00:20:48: many of which are ongoing.

00:20:48 --> 00:20:52: The grandfathering in of the Route 29 project under the

00:20:52 --> 00:20:55: ice T allowed an 18 year old environmental impact study

00:20:55 --> 00:20:59: on an industrial area to govern mitigation on a residential

00:20:59 --> 00:21:03: neighborhood leading to residents dealing with costly home repairs,

00:21:03 --> 00:21:08: noise and dust pollution. Construction impacts had disproportionate impacts on

00:21:08 --> 00:21:11: business owners in low income communities,

00:21:11 --> 00:21:14: which often lack the financial records and other paperwork to

00:21:14 --> 00:21:17: access grants and relief funding already available.

00:21:17 --> 00:21:21: We recommend that DVR PC identify dedicated funding streams for

00:21:21 --> 00:21:25: studying and mitigating construction impacts in project facilities to position

00:21:25 --> 00:21:30: construction mitigation at the foreground of the planning process rather

00:21:30 --> 00:21:33: than as an afterthought. We also recommend the DVR PC

00:21:33 --> 00:21:36: include diverse partnerships to medicate challenges,

00:21:36 --> 00:21:39: particularly in low income communities.

00:21:39 --> 00:21:40: Next slide, please.

00:21:44 --> 00:21:46: We recommend that DVR PC.

00:21:46 --> 00:21:50: Prioritize increasing transparency in the funding sources and

final cost
00:21:50 --> 00:21:54: for projects both internally and externally while DVR PC does
00:21:54 --> 00:21:56: a great job of clearly showing tip out allocations,
00:21:56 --> 00:22:00: the responsibility for the actual payments for projects,
00:22:00 --> 00:22:04: lies and state lies with state DOTS and public transportation
00:22:04 --> 00:22:04: agencies.
00:22:04 --> 00:22:08: Information on final project costs are not always easily accessible
00:22:08 --> 00:22:11: as we found when conducting our own research on the
00:22:11 --> 00:22:12: funding of NJ 29,
00:22:12 --> 00:22:15: we were able to determine tip allocations across three periods
00:22:15 --> 00:22:18: of time during which the project was built,
00:22:18 --> 00:22:21: but we were unable to obtain the obligated amounts and
00:22:21 --> 00:22:22: construction costs,
00:22:22 --> 00:22:25: in part due to COVID-19 restrictions.
00:22:25 --> 00:22:28: As a result, our recommendation would be for DVR PC
00:22:28 --> 00:22:32: to work with its agency partners to routinely compile this
00:22:32 --> 00:22:35: information into one of its popular online toolkits.
00:22:35 --> 00:22:38: Then both DVR PC and the public would be able
00:22:38 --> 00:22:41: to see how much money is being spent Ware and
00:22:41 --> 00:22:44: could call attention to any inequitable distributions.
00:22:44 --> 00:22:48: This compiled information would also highlight the opportunities and constraints
00:22:48 --> 00:22:52: of the current funding system and may even provide reasoning
00:22:52 --> 00:22:55: to increase the amount of local funding for transportation which
00:22:55 --> 00:22:59: could then be used to provide accessibility and economic growth
00:22:59 --> 00:23:01: to disadvantaged populations.
00:23:01 --> 00:23:02: Next slide, please.
00:23:04 --> 00:23:07: DVR PC's long range plans called for making land use
00:23:07 --> 00:23:10: decisions that would complement transportation projects.
00:23:10 --> 00:23:12: However, in the case of PATCO,
00:23:12 --> 00:23:16: the land use around most stations have have resulted in
00:23:16 --> 00:23:19: massive parking lots equal to 109 football fields.
00:23:19 --> 00:23:23: In total there by primarily benefiting households with cars.
00:23:23 --> 00:23:28: With US422 DVR PC recommended creating transportation centers to minimize
00:23:28 --> 00:23:30: suburbanization and reduce car travel,
00:23:30 --> 00:23:35: but was largely ignored by local municipalities in Montgomery County.
00:23:35 --> 00:23:40: In these transportation projects, disadvantage populations

such as carless households,

00:23:40 --> 00:23:44: communities of color and reverse commuters receive fewer benefits.

00:23:44 --> 00:23:47: We see many opportunities for DVR PC to improve the

00:23:47 --> 00:23:51: implementation of its long range plans for integrating land use

00:23:51 --> 00:23:54: planning with transportation projects.

00:23:54 --> 00:23:57: First, we recommend that the RPC strengthen its advocacy by

00:23:57 --> 00:24:02: bolstering regional partnerships and working with elected officials and government

00:24:02 --> 00:24:05: agencies to integrate complementary land use,

00:24:05 --> 00:24:09: planning into transportation planning, decision-making and funding.

00:24:09 --> 00:24:13: With respect to PATCO, this could involve working with towns

00:24:13 --> 00:24:17: containing stations to apply for New Jersey's transit village destination,

00:24:17 --> 00:24:20: where they would receive funding for smart growth projects within

00:24:20 --> 00:24:21: walking distance to stations.

00:24:21 --> 00:24:26: Collingswood successful lumberyard mixed use Project is a good example

00:24:26 --> 00:24:26: of this.

00:24:26 --> 00:24:29: Next, we recommend the DVR PC call for policy changes

00:24:29 --> 00:24:33: that would make it easier to ensure appropriate zoning around

00:24:33 --> 00:24:34: transportation projects.

00:24:34 --> 00:24:38: DVR PC can work with public transit agencies that own

00:24:38 --> 00:24:42: land to partner with developers and create transit oriented development.

00:24:42 --> 00:24:43: Next slide, please.

00:24:47 --> 00:24:50: DVR PC should also prioritize access to over congestion reduction

00:24:50 --> 00:24:55: with alternatives such as public transit and infrastructure for walking

00:24:55 --> 00:24:55: and bicycling.

00:24:55 --> 00:24:58: Since the advent of the automobile,

00:24:58 --> 00:25:02: reducing traffic congestion has been a major concern for transportation

00:25:02 --> 00:25:04: transportation leaders across the country.

00:25:04 --> 00:25:08: Decades of research on congestion have shown that increasing highway

00:25:08 --> 00:25:12: capacity does not lead to the long-term elimination of congestion,

00:25:12 --> 00:25:15: but in fact creates more of it.

00:25:15 --> 00:25:18: While congestion mitigation should continue to play a role in
00:25:18 --> 00:25:19: decision making,
00:25:19 --> 00:25:22: it should do so only in the context of improving
00:25:22 --> 00:25:26: equitable access rather than the narrowly defined goal of reducing
00:25:26 --> 00:25:27: highway travel times.
00:25:27 --> 00:25:31: For instance, Virginia D. OTS Smart Scale program uses data
00:25:31 --> 00:25:34: driven processes to quantify the increase in access for proposed
00:25:34 --> 00:25:38: transportation projects with this type of equity cost benefit analysis
00:25:38 --> 00:25:42: projects such as direct connection would be more heavily scrutinized.
00:25:42 --> 00:25:45: While the potential equitable project.
00:25:45 --> 00:25:49: Of the Glassboro Camden Line would have more public backing.
00:25:49 --> 00:25:52: And now I pass it off to my colleague Karim.
00:25:59 --> 00:26:02: Hello good morning everyone. My name is Corrine Lucas Ashman,
00:26:02 --> 00:26:06: Brandon Lambertian. I will be relaying some of our policy
00:26:06 --> 00:26:10: findings and recommendations so that planning agencies like DVR PC
00:26:10 --> 00:26:14: can implement policies and plans that meet higher equity out.
00:26:14 --> 00:26:16: And so just to get us started,
00:26:16 --> 00:26:19: one of our initial findings is that during the planning
00:26:20 --> 00:26:20: phases,
00:26:20 --> 00:26:25: planners, engineers and agencies of agency officials did not include
00:26:25 --> 00:26:28: or implement explicit metrics of equity.
00:26:28 --> 00:26:31: So I just want to winter attention to the graphic
00:26:31 --> 00:26:34: on the right and it illustrates the decrease mean income
00:26:34 --> 00:26:38: in the project area despite the increased development projects you
00:26:38 --> 00:26:42: know supported by the reconstructed make market Frankfort line in
00:26:43 --> 00:26:44: the newly constructed stations,
00:26:44 --> 00:26:47: especially stations like 69th St,
00:26:47 --> 00:26:51: which post you know a lot of economic development around
00:26:51 --> 00:26:52: it.
00:26:52 --> 00:26:56: And while those projects did bring a positive bring positive
00:26:56 --> 00:26:57: outcomes to the area,
00:26:57 --> 00:27:01: it did not actually ameliorate the socioeconomic standing of the
00:27:01 --> 00:27:05: people in the area who are predominantly people of color

00:27:05 --> 00:27:07: in a low income area and in between cases,

00:27:07 --> 00:27:11: we actually found that the current metrics of equity to

00:27:11 --> 00:27:14: be a fairly new standard across best practices.

00:27:14 --> 00:27:16: Across standard I mean across sectors.

00:27:16 --> 00:27:21: So while some agencies did implement practices of equitable planning,

00:27:21 --> 00:27:25: like environmental impact standards. Or community outreach campaigns.

00:27:25 --> 00:27:29: They did not have explicit standards or count accountability measures

00:27:30 --> 00:27:34: to address trends of historic negative impacts against black indigenous

00:27:34 --> 00:27:35: other people of color.

00:27:35 --> 00:27:40: Low income communities and other historically disadvantaged groups are.

00:27:40 --> 00:27:45: Recommendations include choosing sites that do not negatively impact historically

00:27:45 --> 00:27:47: disadvantaged groups and communities,

00:27:47 --> 00:27:51: beginning with community consultation to and to understand their needs

00:27:51 --> 00:27:54: and the potential unforeseen's impacts.

00:27:54 --> 00:27:57: And finally, to consult with elected officials in the area

00:27:57 --> 00:28:00: to gain their support and also to expand the scope

00:28:00 --> 00:28:01: of the project.

00:28:04 --> 00:28:07: Another one of our findings is that burden in Britains

00:28:08 --> 00:28:12: and negative impacts from transportation projects are often disproportionately placed

00:28:13 --> 00:28:16: on black indigenous people of color and other in low

00:28:16 --> 00:28:19: income communities across cases we did find informal examples of

00:28:19 --> 00:28:24: equity considerations like environmental impact standards and town hall meetings.

00:28:24 --> 00:28:27: For those efforts did not involve Community input at the

00:28:27 --> 00:28:29: decision-making level,

00:28:29 --> 00:28:32: engage in practices that prioritize the needs and perspectives of

00:28:32 --> 00:28:34: minority communities.

00:28:34 --> 00:28:39: Low income communities and other historically demand disadvantaged groups and

00:28:39 --> 00:28:42: usually address out equity outcomes in hindsight.

00:28:42 --> 00:28:45: The graphic below from governing data uses Census Bureau data

00:28:45 --> 00:28:49: to depict groups and demographic most dependent on public transit

00:28:49 --> 00:28:53: in Philadelphia and emphasizes how their needs have

historically not

00:28:53 --> 00:28:58: matched with the project. Prioritization of impios and municipal transit

00:28:58 --> 00:28:59: agencies.

00:28:59 --> 00:29:03: This point is especially important when considering Community resilience and

00:29:03 --> 00:29:07: ability for community to recuperate after the shock of transportation

00:29:07 --> 00:29:10: projects and other acute economic shocks.

00:29:10 --> 00:29:13: Black indigenous people of color and low income communities often

00:29:13 --> 00:29:17: lack the political bargaining power and formal resources like business

00:29:17 --> 00:29:19: and housing records to partake in the middle.

00:29:19 --> 00:29:24: Mitigation in relief funding strategies already in place were developed

00:29:24 --> 00:29:27: to protect vulnerable communities doing these projects.

00:29:27 --> 00:29:29: In order to address these inequities,

00:29:29 --> 00:29:32: we recommend prioritizing.

00:29:32 --> 00:29:36: Excuse me, prioritizing more convenient transit access to minority communities,

00:29:36 --> 00:29:41: low income communities, and other historic historically disadvantaged groups.

00:29:41 --> 00:29:45: And finding creative ways to accelerate construction to minimize highway

00:29:45 --> 00:29:49: and rail shutdowns and the other negative impacts of transportation

00:29:49 --> 00:29:51: and construction projects.

00:29:51 --> 00:29:53: And I'll be handing it off to my colleagues.

00:29:55 --> 00:29:59: Morning everybody, whatever most important findings was that single purpose

00:29:59 --> 00:30:00: agencies,

00:30:00 --> 00:30:03: such as transportation agencies like Penn daughter SEPTA,

00:30:03 --> 00:30:06: may not possess the range of resources or expertise to

00:30:06 --> 00:30:09: address inequities in their transportation projects.

00:30:09 --> 00:30:12: Transportation projects should be led by transportation agencies,

00:30:12 --> 00:30:15: but we recommend assembling multi agency teams to help design

00:30:15 --> 00:30:19: and implement mitigation efforts under the direction of a public

00:30:19 --> 00:30:19: executive,

00:30:19 --> 00:30:22: these agencies are great at doing their jobs related to

00:30:22 --> 00:30:23: transit,

00:30:23 --> 00:30:26: but these agencies need the active support of bureaucracies

agencies.

00:30:26 --> 00:30:30: And governments with experience in dealing with adverse social and

00:30:30 --> 00:30:31: economic impacts.

00:30:31 --> 00:30:34: Another recommendation of ours is to consider tolling of highways

00:30:34 --> 00:30:37: to pay for transit infrastructure projects.

00:30:37 --> 00:30:39: In the case of I-476 known as the Blue Route

00:30:39 --> 00:30:42: Transit integration with the project was ignored from the start,

00:30:42 --> 00:30:45: even though it was considered by outside experts and has

00:30:45 --> 00:30:47: been studied by DVR PC since the completion of the

00:30:47 --> 00:30:51: route tolling these highways could help improve equity outcomes by

00:30:51 --> 00:30:56: creating the transit infrastructure used by low income minority communities.

00:30:56 --> 00:30:56: Next slide, please.

00:30:59 --> 00:31:01: Another finding of ours is the tempos.

00:31:01 --> 00:31:05: An agency boards often like the perspectives of inner city,

00:31:05 --> 00:31:07: low income or minority voices on their boards,

00:31:07 --> 00:31:09: which perpetuate inequities in disproportion.

00:31:09 --> 00:31:12: Negative impacts across those communities.

00:31:12 --> 00:31:15: We recommend the DVR PC should explore changing or expanding

00:31:15 --> 00:31:18: how representation is allocated on the Executive Board,

00:31:18 --> 00:31:21: so it's just researching how areas like Atlanta have added

00:31:21 --> 00:31:25: proportional representation of citizen representatives to their MPO board.

00:31:25 --> 00:31:28: However, we acknowledge it that there are major challenges to

00:31:28 --> 00:31:30: changing the structure of DVR PC.

00:31:30 --> 00:31:33: Needing the ascent of the legislatures of both Pennsylvania and

00:31:33 --> 00:31:34: New Jersey and DVR,

00:31:34 --> 00:31:38: PC does have representation for minority and low income communities

00:31:38 --> 00:31:39: on the board presently,

00:31:39 --> 00:31:42: such as dedicated representation for cities such as Camden,

00:31:42 --> 00:31:46: Chester and Trend. We recommend enhancing economic development opportunities for

00:31:46 --> 00:31:50: communities affected by transportation projects such as creating parks or

00:31:50 --> 00:31:51: doing zoning changes,

00:31:51 --> 00:31:54: though we also recommend being mindful of gentrification.

00:31:54 --> 00:31:57: Concerns in these projects we recommend monitoring and addressing non

00:31:58 --> 00:32:00: economic impacts such as the loss of social capital due
00:32:00 --> 00:32:02: to dividing neighborhoods.
00:32:02 --> 00:32:04: And threats to a community's cultural,
00:32:04 --> 00:32:07: religious, and recreational assets such as we saw with the
00:32:07 --> 00:32:08: Holy Redeemer Church in school,
00:32:08 --> 00:32:11: in Chinatown, with the Vine Street Expressway.
00:32:11 --> 00:32:14: We also recommend using future infrastructure funds to rectify existing
00:32:14 --> 00:32:16: impacts of past transportation projects,
00:32:16 --> 00:32:19: which leads us to our next section or my colleague
00:32:19 --> 00:32:21: Brandon will be taking us more in depth on the
00:32:21 --> 00:32:24: case study of the Vine Street Expressway in the Philadelphia
00:32:24 --> 00:32:25: Chinatown community.
00:32:28 --> 00:32:30: Wonderful thank you, Lucas and Cream,
00:32:30 --> 00:32:32: as well as everyone for having us today.
00:32:32 --> 00:32:34: I'm gonna be along with John Chin,
00:32:34 --> 00:32:36: the executive director of the CDC,
00:32:36 --> 00:32:40: going through our Vine Street Expressway case study just to
00:32:40 --> 00:32:42: give you a little more insight into what one of
00:32:42 --> 00:32:44: these case studies looked like.
00:32:44 --> 00:32:46: Kind of from start to end.
00:32:46 --> 00:32:49: Going to the next slide.
00:32:49 --> 00:32:51: So I'm gonna give you 2 parts.
00:32:51 --> 00:32:53: 1st will look at the case study process.
00:32:53 --> 00:32:57: Look at some of the design considerations made for this
00:32:57 --> 00:33:00: policy analysis and then from here will go to John
00:33:00 --> 00:33:03: Chin who will speak on the role of the Chinatown
00:33:03 --> 00:33:06: community and the leaders during the early stages of this
00:33:06 --> 00:33:09: initial process and then it will come back to me
00:33:09 --> 00:33:13: to talk about some of our findings and recommendations specific
00:33:13 --> 00:33:16: to this case study and also wrap it into kind
00:33:16 --> 00:33:19: of the modern political context that is made.
00:33:19 --> 00:33:23: Special events are Expressway quite politically salient.
00:33:23 --> 00:33:25: In the last six months or so,
00:33:25 --> 00:33:28: go ahead.
00:33:28 --> 00:33:31: So our case study process began by identifying key pieces
00:33:31 --> 00:33:36: of legislation that affected the planning of an Interstate highway
00:33:36 --> 00:33:37: through Center City,
00:33:37 --> 00:33:41: Philadelphia. We went all the way back to 1956 with
00:33:41 --> 00:33:45: the passage of the Interstate Highway system by President Eisenhower

00:33:45 --> 00:33:49: and looked at the funds that were created and set
00:33:49 --> 00:33:52: aside and the goals of that project that led to
00:33:52 --> 00:33:56: this expansion effort and what that meant for large cities
00:33:56 --> 00:33:57: like Philadelphia.
00:33:57 --> 00:34:01: Vine Street Expressway connects. I-76 on the West with the
00:34:01 --> 00:34:04: Ben Franklin Bridge and Camden on the east,
00:34:04 --> 00:34:08: and it cuts right through Center City as a below
00:34:08 --> 00:34:11: grade Expressway as we see it today.
00:34:11 --> 00:34:14: So that was kind of the context that it offered
00:34:14 --> 00:34:17: itself in and from there we created a list of
00:34:17 --> 00:34:22: interviewees that would include engineers from the project,
00:34:22 --> 00:34:25: city officials and Chinatown community leaders.
00:34:25 --> 00:34:29: We felt that a interview driven case study was going
00:34:29 --> 00:34:31: to be very valuable.
00:34:31 --> 00:34:34: Because the people that lived this experience would have a
00:34:34 --> 00:34:37: greater insight than any reporter white paper we could read,
00:34:37 --> 00:34:41: and we could also see how their emotions and kind
00:34:41 --> 00:34:44: of their reactions to different events and.
00:34:44 --> 00:34:48: Key ideas relate to the kind of historical nature of
00:34:48 --> 00:34:51: it and figure out where the real truth is and
00:34:51 --> 00:34:52: important.
00:34:52 --> 00:34:55: Slade in each piece.
00:34:55 --> 00:34:58: A decision was made to take this case study chronologically.
00:34:58 --> 00:35:01: And to tell the story of each decision as a
00:35:02 --> 00:35:04: building block of the final outcome.
00:35:04 --> 00:35:08: We found that by telling the story of each legislation
00:35:08 --> 00:35:11: that was enacted or a new decision that was made
00:35:11 --> 00:35:14: by a local or state official would kind of build
00:35:14 --> 00:35:17: up to this ultimate finale of the opening of the
00:35:17 --> 00:35:19: Expressway in 1991,
00:35:19 --> 00:35:22: and that this told a greater story then taking it
00:35:22 --> 00:35:24: in any other form.
00:35:24 --> 00:35:27: A couple crucial components of this case study,
00:35:27 --> 00:35:29: including an interview with Cecilia.
00:35:29 --> 00:35:33: Yep, Cecilia. Yep, is the godmother of Chinatown.
00:35:33 --> 00:35:36: She was one of the original activists who protested the
00:35:36 --> 00:35:40: creation and the destruction of much of the neighborhood along
00:35:40 --> 00:35:43: Vine Street to Clear Way for this project.
00:35:43 --> 00:35:47: And she still is actively involved with many efforts to
00:35:47 --> 00:35:50: protect the Chinatown community.
00:35:50 --> 00:35:53: I'm another was an interview with John Smith,

00:35:53 --> 00:35:57: an engineer who worked alongside both PennDOT and the Chinatown
00:35:57 --> 00:36:02: community to find alternatives that would more holistically benefit both
00:36:02 --> 00:36:06: trying to talk community and also the greater goals of
00:36:06 --> 00:36:09: the Mayor of Philadelphia and PennDOT,
00:36:09 --> 00:36:12: as well as EU. SDOT finally was our look at
00:36:12 --> 00:36:15: the environmental impact statement from 1983,
00:36:15 --> 00:36:20: which was compared against the draft statement that was put
00:36:20 --> 00:36:21: out in 1977.
00:36:21 --> 00:36:24: To figure out which changes were made and at what
00:36:24 --> 00:36:27: point new equity considerations were made to arrive at the
00:36:27 --> 00:36:28: final outcome.
00:36:28 --> 00:36:30: So from here I'll pass it to John Chin,
00:36:30 --> 00:36:33: who has a couple of slides to tell you about
00:36:33 --> 00:36:35: the role of Chinatown in this process.
00:36:39 --> 00:36:40: Thanks, Brandon.
00:36:43 --> 00:36:45: Great, thank you very much.
00:36:45 --> 00:36:47: So look at this photo.
00:36:47 --> 00:36:51: We clearly are living in a different day in process
00:36:52 --> 00:36:56: today than we did 50 years ago when Chinatown first
00:36:56 --> 00:37:02: learned about this proposal for the Vine Street Expressway.
00:37:02 --> 00:37:05: And although we're probably not at a point where we
00:37:05 --> 00:37:06: want to be yet,
00:37:06 --> 00:37:10: but we're moving in the right direction direction in terms
00:37:10 --> 00:37:13: of community engagement process in equity.
00:37:13 --> 00:37:14: Next slide.
00:37:19 --> 00:37:21: You know, so you have a map of of area
00:37:21 --> 00:37:24: around Chinatown and you have photo of kids holding up
00:37:24 --> 00:37:28: signs so device you Expressway is what we're talking about
00:37:28 --> 00:37:31: today. But that was just the beginning of many,
00:37:31 --> 00:37:35: many projects that have been proposed for Chinatown over the
00:37:35 --> 00:37:38: decades that projects that may be good for the general
00:37:38 --> 00:37:39: region,
00:37:39 --> 00:37:42: but not so good for our Chinatown community.
00:37:42 --> 00:37:43: Come.
00:37:43 --> 00:37:48: What we're faced with was a shock when this proposal
00:37:48 --> 00:37:51: was learned about in Chinatown.
00:37:51 --> 00:37:55: There was resignation with the fact that the elders of
00:37:55 --> 00:37:59: the community said that you can't fight City Hall.
00:37:59 --> 00:38:03: And advice you expressing was coming through to takedown the

00:38:03 --> 00:38:07: Chinese Catholic Church and school Ann from from a large
00:38:07 --> 00:38:08: POV and White POV.
00:38:08 --> 00:38:12: You know schools are available.
00:38:12 --> 00:38:15: Throughout the region. But this was our school and church
00:38:15 --> 00:38:16: in our community.
00:38:16 --> 00:38:19: Only school elementary school, in our community,
00:38:19 --> 00:38:22: and this community did not want to lose that.
00:38:22 --> 00:38:26: So the community organized under the leadership,
00:38:26 --> 00:38:28: is to see a more yet formed.
00:38:28 --> 00:38:32: Its very first public meeting to address Urban Development and
00:38:32 --> 00:38:34: transportation,
00:38:34 --> 00:38:37: and that actually led to the formation of what we
00:38:37 --> 00:38:42: know today as Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation.
00:38:42 --> 00:38:45: And since that time, we've learned more than we ever
00:38:46 --> 00:38:48: wanted to about urban planning,
00:38:48 --> 00:38:52: development, and transportation. And today in 2021.
00:38:52 --> 00:38:56: Our agency is very involved with planning not only in
00:38:56 --> 00:38:58: our neighborhood,
00:38:58 --> 00:39:02: but around it because the lesson learned here for any
00:39:02 --> 00:39:05: community is that we need to be engaged,
00:39:05 --> 00:39:09: involved if we are to ensure that the equity that
00:39:09 --> 00:39:13: is desired in our Community is realized next slide.
00:39:15 --> 00:39:20: So Brandon touched upon a couple of significant events over
00:39:20 --> 00:39:21: the years,
00:39:21 --> 00:39:23: and Barry Seymour as well,
00:39:23 --> 00:39:26: 1970, was Environmental Protection Act,
00:39:26 --> 00:39:28: 1973.
00:39:28 --> 00:39:34: We were able to utilized environmental impact statement which was
00:39:34 --> 00:39:39: required of any projects with federal dollars in it.
00:39:39 --> 00:39:43: In 77 and 1983 we had two very different versions
00:39:43 --> 00:39:45: of the environmental impact study,
00:39:45 --> 00:39:51: with additional changes that came around the 1983 to address
00:39:51 --> 00:39:53: community issues and concerns.
00:39:53 --> 00:39:56: Most of which was really to save the whole Redeemer
00:39:57 --> 00:39:57: Church,
00:39:57 --> 00:40:01: but also with the highway coming through our community.
00:40:01 --> 00:40:04: How? How is this going to impact a divided community?
00:40:04 --> 00:40:08: And how's the community going to crossover this highway?
00:40:08 --> 00:40:09: So you see here, 10 St Plaza.

00:40:09 --> 00:40:12: This is a little I called it a way station
00:40:12 --> 00:40:16: where pedestrians engineers knew that the that's just could not
00:40:16 --> 00:40:20: cross the ice rink stress way on one traffic signal.
00:40:20 --> 00:40:23: So they developed this area where students from the whole
00:40:23 --> 00:40:26: gamer school could stand in the middle.
00:40:26 --> 00:40:29: Of the bridge over the highway.
00:40:29 --> 00:40:33: Safely, while eastbound and westbound cars on the Expressway on
00:40:33 --> 00:40:35: the street service Rd could go by.
00:40:35 --> 00:40:36: Next slide.
00:40:38 --> 00:40:41: And so you know.
00:40:44 --> 00:40:47: You know to to the.
00:40:47 --> 00:40:50: Integon that was presented.
00:40:50 --> 00:40:53: You know we are now learning and we now know
00:40:53 --> 00:40:54: that.
00:40:54 --> 00:41:00: Transportation goals are very different from overall development goals.
00:41:00 --> 00:41:05: And in our experience, engagement has to happen at the
00:41:05 --> 00:41:06: very beginning,
00:41:06 --> 00:41:09: as ideas and visions are created.
00:41:09 --> 00:41:14: This is the only way you can minimize impacts.
00:41:14 --> 00:41:17: Of these transportation plans in any community,
00:41:17 --> 00:41:21: and if you haven't visited Chinatown here and taking one
00:41:21 --> 00:41:22: of our tours,
00:41:22 --> 00:41:25: we take people on tours just to show the impact
00:41:25 --> 00:41:29: of the Expressway and all these other urban developments that
00:41:29 --> 00:41:31: make make living and working.
00:41:31 --> 00:41:34: China can very challenging. So and lastly,
00:41:34 --> 00:41:39: culture. You know China accounts just can't be anywhere where
00:41:39 --> 00:41:43: the only Chinatown here in Philadelphia and this is the
00:41:43 --> 00:41:45: location that we found it in 1870.
00:41:45 --> 00:41:48: This is the place where we want to be and
00:41:48 --> 00:41:50: where we want to remain.
00:41:50 --> 00:41:52: So things are not always transportable,
00:41:52 --> 00:41:57: and that's why it's even more important that.
00:41:57 --> 00:42:01: Planning agencies and government have to work with the communities
00:42:02 --> 00:42:05: because one communities treasure is so important that it just
00:42:05 --> 00:42:06: can't translate.
00:42:06 --> 00:42:09: Translate are transported to somewhere else.

00:42:11 --> 00:42:15: So brand, I think this sets of back to you.
00:42:15 --> 00:42:17: Perfect thank you very much,
00:42:17 --> 00:42:20: John. So we'll go to the next slide to talk
00:42:20 --> 00:42:23: about the American jobs plan proposal which came from the
00:42:24 --> 00:42:28: Biden administration and their initial proposal that included $20 billion
00:42:28 --> 00:42:34: to target communities that were upended by highway projects.
00:42:34 --> 00:42:38: The importance of this is that it explicitly mentions the
00:42:38 --> 00:42:41: Vine Street Expressway as well as a couple of other
00:42:41 --> 00:42:45: projects in the area that would be viable for these
00:42:45 --> 00:42:48: funds to help right certain past wrongs.
00:42:48 --> 00:42:52: And the work of this case study supports the conclusion
00:42:52 --> 00:42:53: that a CAP or cover,
00:42:53 --> 00:42:58: the Vine Street Expressway, would greatly benefit Chinatown residents would
00:42:58 --> 00:43:02: reduce noise and air pollution and offer more outdoor community
00:43:02 --> 00:43:03: space.
00:43:03 --> 00:43:06: As John talked about the 10th St Plaza is a
00:43:06 --> 00:43:07: quite small piece of land.
00:43:07 --> 00:43:11: That is, you know, entirely concrete has a small pavilion
00:43:11 --> 00:43:12: to it,
00:43:12 --> 00:43:15: but expanding this cap for a couple of blocks but
00:43:15 --> 00:43:18: allow the community to have outdoor space.
00:43:18 --> 00:43:21: To really gather meet we have seen during the recent
00:43:22 --> 00:43:25: uptick in protest that it gives more land for the
00:43:25 --> 00:43:28: community to gather for these types of events and especially
00:43:28 --> 00:43:31: with the pandemic moving as more things outdoors.
00:43:31 --> 00:43:35: And as we know that outdoor events are becoming more
00:43:35 --> 00:43:35: common.
00:43:35 --> 00:43:38: This is another way to really give back to the
00:43:38 --> 00:43:41: Community and create a space as well as safety for
00:43:41 --> 00:43:42: the children.
00:43:42 --> 00:43:46: You know, going back and forth between the school and
00:43:46 --> 00:43:49: their homes on the other side of the Expressway.
00:43:49 --> 00:43:52: Notably Congressman Brendan Boyle and Dwight Evans,
00:43:52 --> 00:43:55: as well as Secretary of Transportation Pete Buddha,
00:43:55 --> 00:43:58: judge, have voiced support for correcting the damage done by
00:43:59 --> 00:43:59: the Expressway,
00:43:59 --> 00:44:04: which are important steps in getting the funding and plans
00:44:04 --> 00:44:06: made for this project.

00:44:06 --> 00:44:08: So from here I'd like to pass it to Laura
00:44:08 --> 00:44:08: Slutzky,
00:44:08 --> 00:44:11: the executive director of ULI Philadelphia,
00:44:11 --> 00:44:13: to help moderate a Q&A session.
00:44:13 --> 00:44:16: And personally I would just like to thank everyone for
00:44:16 --> 00:44:19: attending and listening to our presentation today.
00:44:21 --> 00:44:25: Great, thank you so much everyone for the time dedicated
00:44:25 --> 00:44:26: to this project.
00:44:26 --> 00:44:28: I know there was a lot more than even.
00:44:28 --> 00:44:31: We got to explore during this session so we really
00:44:31 --> 00:44:34: appreciate it and always love working with DVR PC so
00:44:34 --> 00:44:35: we have time for audience Q&A.
00:44:35 --> 00:44:38: We have a small group so if folks are have
00:44:38 --> 00:44:41: questions or comments or anything you'd like to discuss you
00:44:41 --> 00:44:44: can just put it in the chat and I'll probably
00:44:44 --> 00:44:46: call on you to ask yourself since we have a
00:44:46 --> 00:44:47: smaller.
00:44:49 --> 00:44:50: I will give it a moment.
00:44:53 --> 00:44:57: And I can ask my question while people are getting
00:44:57 --> 00:44:57: warmed up.
00:45:00 --> 00:45:03: Let's see. So if you could talk to us,
00:45:03 --> 00:45:06: your equity scale was really interesting,
00:45:06 --> 00:45:09: and using that across a variety of projects,
00:45:09 --> 00:45:11: I know we didn't get to dig deep today,
00:45:11 --> 00:45:15: but did you find themes related to the specific types
00:45:15 --> 00:45:18: of infrastructure that you analyze?
00:45:18 --> 00:45:22: So for example, something that you found in common across
00:45:22 --> 00:45:26: highway projects or transit projects that would be useful for
00:45:26 --> 00:45:29: our Community to hear as we think about.
00:45:29 --> 00:45:33: These topics so any any of the presenters or researchers
00:45:33 --> 00:45:35: if you want to speak to that.
00:45:37 --> 00:45:39: If there were three specific transit types,
00:45:39 --> 00:45:41: yeah, go ahead, Andrew. Sure,
00:45:41 --> 00:45:44: yeah, I can start that process controlling.
00:45:44 --> 00:45:45: But yeah, I think unsurprisingly,
00:45:45 --> 00:45:48: we found that highway projects seem to have more adverse
00:45:48 --> 00:45:53: impacts to the surrounding communities without necessarily providing benefits to
00:45:53 --> 00:45:54: them like access benefits.
00:45:54 --> 00:45:57: Porn is great, then. Like NJ 29 there or the
00:45:57 --> 00:46:00: Vine Street Expressway and it had more.
00:46:00 --> 00:46:02: Harmful impacts to the communities,

00:46:02 --> 00:46:06: whereas transit or trail projects like Super River Trail or
00:46:06 --> 00:46:08: PAC El which we studied in again so they do
00:46:08 --> 00:46:12: have more equitable impacts for communities and a lot of
00:46:12 --> 00:46:15: other aspects. So that's too general findings that are not
00:46:15 --> 00:46:16: super surprising,
00:46:16 --> 00:46:21: but it's interesting to see it was usually reflected in
00:46:21 --> 00:46:23: the spider charts that we had.
00:46:23 --> 00:46:25: If I could jump in to build on that,
00:46:25 --> 00:46:28: Andrew was saying one of the things though about PATCO,
00:46:28 --> 00:46:32: which. I think we have time to get into here.
00:46:32 --> 00:46:35: The students found that just the amount of surface parking
00:46:36 --> 00:46:40: lots right around those commuter stations are not necessarily the
00:46:40 --> 00:46:41: best land use,
00:46:41 --> 00:46:45: right? And there's the ability for someone to walk to
00:46:45 --> 00:46:45: employment.
00:46:45 --> 00:46:49: We using Petco is impeded when you have very large
00:46:49 --> 00:46:49: surface.
00:46:49 --> 00:46:51: Lots, right? So there's a.
00:46:51 --> 00:46:54: So it's not a. It's not a clear case,
00:46:54 --> 00:46:57: lower where transit is is inherently better.
00:46:57 --> 00:47:00: It's how it's transit that's done well.
00:47:00 --> 00:47:02: Right, and I think that maybe cream you can speak
00:47:03 --> 00:47:06: about the reconstruction of the Crankpin line is to how
00:47:06 --> 00:47:06: transit,
00:47:06 --> 00:47:08: but not necessarily done in the right way,
00:47:08 --> 00:47:12: also had negative impact community.
00:47:12 --> 00:47:15: Yeah, that's yeah so something I was actually going to
00:47:15 --> 00:47:16: point out.
00:47:16 --> 00:47:18: You know, if you look at this sort of the
00:47:18 --> 00:47:19: two urban projects,
00:47:19 --> 00:47:22: the market, Frankfort line reconstruction,
00:47:22 --> 00:47:24: and the Vine Street Expressway,
00:47:24 --> 00:47:27: they do, you know, score higher on the access an
00:47:27 --> 00:47:30: equity and excuse me access in environments with scale,
00:47:30 --> 00:47:32: and that's generally, you know,
00:47:32 --> 00:47:36: just looking at the market Frankford line that generally comes
00:47:36 --> 00:47:39: with investing in public transit and just by proxy of
00:47:39 --> 00:47:42: improving the stations with escalators and.
00:47:45 --> 00:47:47: Elevators and things of the sort like that,
00:47:47 --> 00:47:50: and just overall in increasing that access,
00:47:50 --> 00:47:53: but you. But when you look at the sort of

00:47:53 --> 00:47:57: the the categories of protected classes in this sort of
00:47:57 --> 00:47:58: process,
00:47:58 --> 00:48:01: you don't. You sort of find the concurrent,
00:48:01 --> 00:48:02: you know.
00:48:02 --> 00:48:05: Exclusion of those particular communities,
00:48:05 --> 00:48:07: and then because of that,
00:48:07 --> 00:48:10: exclude the exclusion of those communities.
00:48:10 --> 00:48:14: You have the adverse effects on protected classes and so
00:48:14 --> 00:48:18: that that also comes from something that we've observed when
00:48:18 --> 00:48:23: you're looking at communities of color versus when you're looking
00:48:23 --> 00:48:26: at the the blue route and the political bargaining power
00:48:27 --> 00:48:31: of low income communities and in minority communities versus suburban
00:48:31 --> 00:48:33: communities who generally.
00:48:33 --> 00:48:37: Have a more sort of collective eyes identity and and
00:48:37 --> 00:48:41: capacity to to bargain for their own interest in an
00:48:41 --> 00:48:41: area.
00:48:41 --> 00:48:45: So something that I did notice is that when you're
00:48:45 --> 00:48:50: dealing with urban construction and you're dealing with black and
00:48:50 --> 00:48:55: black communities and other minority communities is that the effects
00:48:55 --> 00:49:00: on protected classes in the process of developing those transportation
00:49:00 --> 00:49:04: projects are generally sort of connected to each other.
00:49:06 --> 00:49:10: Great, thank you. We do have a couple audience comments
00:49:10 --> 00:49:13: but I just want to follow up on the surface
00:49:13 --> 00:49:13: parking.
00:49:13 --> 00:49:16: Point is, that's really interesting.
00:49:16 --> 00:49:20: And are there any more specific comments or findings that
00:49:20 --> 00:49:22: you all had related to?
00:49:22 --> 00:49:25: I think you said you gave us a really interesting
00:49:25 --> 00:49:30: statistic about the actual square footage of those surface parking
00:49:30 --> 00:49:30: lots.
00:49:30 --> 00:49:35: Is that something that folks should be contemplating as new
00:49:35 --> 00:49:39: bills are passed and we look at making improvements in
00:49:39 --> 00:49:40: the region?
00:49:40 --> 00:49:44: Yeah, so yeah the the surfing surface parking lots were
00:49:44 --> 00:49:49: really striking throughout throughout PATCO an really limited,
00:49:49 --> 00:49:53: you know the ability for PATCO to service like an
00:49:53 --> 00:49:56: economic generator because so few.

00:49:56 --> 00:49:59: Housing developments or, you know,
00:49:59 --> 00:50:03: employment centers are around the PATCO stations outside of kind
00:50:03 --> 00:50:05: of the more inner stations.
00:50:05 --> 00:50:08: So yeah, we just found that PATCO was primarily catered
00:50:08 --> 00:50:09: towards,
00:50:09 --> 00:50:13: you know, suburban commuters, that we're driving to the stations
00:50:14 --> 00:50:16: to get to Inner City Philadelphia jobs.
00:50:16 --> 00:50:20: But it didn't have the same benefit in reverse for,
00:50:20 --> 00:50:23: let's say, Philadelphia residents or Camden residents.
00:50:23 --> 00:50:26: You know, looking for work as jobs have,
00:50:26 --> 00:50:29: really, you know, expanded beyond the center of the city
00:50:29 --> 00:50:32: over the past 40 years into the suburbs.
00:50:32 --> 00:50:36: But those suburban jobs are not accessible to people without
00:50:36 --> 00:50:36: cars,
00:50:36 --> 00:50:39: primarily communities of color.
00:50:39 --> 00:50:43: That's an interesting one. It will be interesting to see
00:50:43 --> 00:50:46: if other city how other cities have handled.
00:50:46 --> 00:50:49: Yeah, so that that's something that we were looking at
00:50:49 --> 00:50:51: a little bit in terms of,
00:50:51 --> 00:50:54: you know, what can be done to counteract that,
00:50:54 --> 00:50:56: and I think I mentioned it a little bit.
00:50:56 --> 00:50:59: But you know Collingswood, while not you,
00:50:59 --> 00:51:01: know completely a very diverse area.
00:51:01 --> 00:51:05: They have taken advantage of New Jersey funding to create
00:51:05 --> 00:51:09: this like transit community for certain developments.
00:51:09 --> 00:51:13: And that was something that we were hoping that other
00:51:13 --> 00:51:16: towns would would look at doing to create housing as
00:51:16 --> 00:51:19: well as jobs closer to stations,
00:51:19 --> 00:51:20: great.
00:51:20 --> 00:51:23: Great, let me go to some of our comments and
00:51:23 --> 00:51:24: questions in the chat.
00:51:24 --> 00:51:26: So Al I was going to call on you for
00:51:27 --> 00:51:27: your comment,
00:51:27 --> 00:51:31: but if you want to make your comment and then
00:51:31 --> 00:51:35: go ahead and ask your question regarding the congestion on
00:51:35 --> 00:51:36: 376.
00:51:36 --> 00:51:38: If you are.
00:51:38 --> 00:51:40: We can't hear you, but you look unmuted.
00:51:45 --> 00:51:45: Try again.
00:51:49 --> 00:51:51: Can you hear me now?

00:51:51 --> 00:51:52: Yes, OK. No. It's very,
00:51:52 --> 00:51:56: very interesting and I had a chance to kind of
00:51:56 --> 00:51:59: flip through the report as you were talking.
00:51:59 --> 00:52:03: I I'm the. There seemed to be a general emphasis
00:52:03 --> 00:52:08: in your recommendations to focus on public transit and incorporating.
00:52:08 --> 00:52:13: I would say redevelopment or better development impact.
00:52:13 --> 00:52:16: Mitigation. As part of the projects,
00:52:16 --> 00:52:20: and I think separating that out is definitely has a
00:52:20 --> 00:52:20: good idea,
00:52:20 --> 00:52:26: because as you mentioned, the single focus agencies tend to
00:52:26 --> 00:52:27: get tunnel vision.
00:52:27 --> 00:52:30: But I would just as a question.
00:52:30 --> 00:52:33: You made several statements early on about,
00:52:33 --> 00:52:37: you know induced demand, how more lanes.
00:52:37 --> 00:52:40: Results in more traffic. But then you talk about how
00:52:40 --> 00:52:44: you have the southern section of the Blue route.
00:52:44 --> 00:52:47: That even though the lanes are narrowed.
00:52:47 --> 00:52:53: Some people still attempt to go through there.
00:52:53 --> 00:52:55: Just had you have any thoughts on that?
00:53:02 --> 00:53:03: I'll jump in so Casey trap,
00:53:03 --> 00:53:06: one of the other members of our project who's not
00:53:06 --> 00:53:09: here today with the kind of focus on the blue
00:53:09 --> 00:53:09: route.
00:53:09 --> 00:53:12: But we all partook. One thing I'll first say about
00:53:12 --> 00:53:16: the kind of public transit focus and the redevelopment is
00:53:16 --> 00:53:18: that we kind of know that there's not going to
00:53:18 --> 00:53:22: be a lot more massive Interstate projects that are put
00:53:22 --> 00:53:23: in in the future,
00:53:23 --> 00:53:25: so the focus really goes to you,
00:53:25 --> 00:53:29: know, small community development to redevelopment in these kind of.
00:53:29 --> 00:53:32: Restorative actions and so that was our focus.
00:53:32 --> 00:53:36: Obviously there will be no new highways here and there,
00:53:36 --> 00:53:39: but we felt that that was a strong place to
00:53:39 --> 00:53:39: focus on.
00:53:39 --> 00:53:42: But in terms of the congestion,
00:53:42 --> 00:53:43: I think a lot of focus was,
00:53:43 --> 00:53:48: you know, pollution and finding ways to keep traffic flowing.
00:53:48 --> 00:53:51: And there's been a lot of work done and talks
00:53:51 --> 00:53:54: happening between the role of like 4 lanes or six
00:53:54 --> 00:53:58: lanes and Lucas at some point can jump into that

00:53:58 --> 00:54:04: kind of the. The connection between I-95 and 476 at
00:54:04 --> 00:54:07: Chester with those changes.
00:54:07 --> 00:54:09: There is a lot that went into it and a
00:54:09 --> 00:54:12: lot of time and effort and research that went into
00:54:12 --> 00:54:13: it that.
00:54:13 --> 00:54:17: Was not, I think, a clear answer at any point
00:54:17 --> 00:54:17: so.
00:54:17 --> 00:54:18: Yeah, I think that was.
00:54:18 --> 00:54:22: It was never super clear which decision was the better
00:54:22 --> 00:54:23: at the time,
00:54:23 --> 00:54:26: and that's just kind of what they landed on.
00:54:26 --> 00:54:27: Lucas, if you have more.
00:54:27 --> 00:54:30: Yeah, so this is it's a complicated question 'cause I
00:54:30 --> 00:54:33: think like it's hard to quantify how much the lane
00:54:33 --> 00:54:33: reduction does.
00:54:33 --> 00:54:37: Like 'cause we talk about Swarthmore College and because that's
00:54:37 --> 00:54:39: like the busiest part of the section is going towards
00:54:39 --> 00:54:40: that interchange 95.
00:54:40 --> 00:54:42: But like the research is pretty clear.
00:54:42 --> 00:54:44: If you like expanded the southern part,
00:54:44 --> 00:54:47: you would not. You would run out of benefit like
00:54:47 --> 00:54:49: the benefits of increased lanes in a few years,
00:54:49 --> 00:54:51: but it's hard to tell like how much effect the
00:54:51 --> 00:54:54: fact that it does reducing lanes there has.
00:54:54 --> 00:54:56: But that's where we kind of get the like.
00:54:56 --> 00:54:57: A lot of our focus in that.
00:54:57 --> 00:55:00: Case study is how, like at the time people to
00:55:00 --> 00:55:02: wanted public transit integration.
00:55:02 --> 00:55:04: With this with the Blue Route Highway,
00:55:04 --> 00:55:06: whether it was buses or rail or and then none
00:55:06 --> 00:55:08: of that came to fruition and how the only real
00:55:09 --> 00:55:11: way to reduce congestion on that road would be to
00:55:11 --> 00:55:14: get people out of those cars by giving them alternative
00:55:14 --> 00:55:15: means of travel.
00:55:17 --> 00:55:22: Great. Thanks everyone, so we're actually running tight on time.
00:55:22 --> 00:55:24: I want to end with Sean's question because it's a
00:55:24 --> 00:55:27: good sort of closing thing if people have a few
00:55:27 --> 00:55:28: extra moments,
00:55:28 --> 00:55:32: but Jim if you are available to ask your question
00:55:32 --> 00:55:34: about transportation costs.
00:55:34 --> 00:55:38: Sure, thank you Laura. Great presentation everybody.

00:55:38 --> 00:55:44: I'm just curious if any private transportation companies have popped
00:55:44 --> 00:55:49: up getting contracts with the companies to actually get residents
00:55:49 --> 00:55:51: to those opportunities.
00:55:57 --> 00:55:59: I don't have a specific answer for that,
00:55:59 --> 00:56:02: but I do have one tidbit that we got from
00:56:02 --> 00:56:03: our interviews in the report.
00:56:03 --> 00:56:06: Was learning that in the context of blue route and
00:56:06 --> 00:56:07: public transportation,
00:56:07 --> 00:56:10: the Delaware County did used to pay for a shuttle
00:56:10 --> 00:56:13: service to get workers to the County nursing home in
00:56:13 --> 00:56:14: media from Chester.
00:56:14 --> 00:56:16: So nothing specific on that.
00:56:16 --> 00:56:18: But just like something like that,
00:56:18 --> 00:56:20: it does appear in the report that the lack of
00:56:20 --> 00:56:24: this infrastructure has caused governments have to go out of
00:56:24 --> 00:56:26: their way to figure out how to how to solve
00:56:26 --> 00:56:28: these transportation. Problems.
00:56:33 --> 00:56:36: Great, anyone else? I just wanted the restated jury status
00:56:36 --> 00:56:39: question again just just so I can attempt to answer
00:56:39 --> 00:56:40: it.
00:56:40 --> 00:56:42: I I thought I had an answer but I just
00:56:42 --> 00:56:45: want to make sure I'm answering your correct question or
00:56:45 --> 00:56:46: Kareem.
00:56:46 --> 00:56:49: My question basically is if there is a challenge with
00:56:49 --> 00:56:50: getting.
00:56:50 --> 00:56:54: Residence two companies that have been built in the suburbs
00:56:54 --> 00:56:56: and we don't in the public.
00:56:56 --> 00:56:59: Transportation was not set up to fit in that.
00:56:59 --> 00:57:03: Are there private companies that may be setting up so
00:57:03 --> 00:57:04: you can't get SEPTA,
00:57:04 --> 00:57:08: but there's a private company that's been set up to
00:57:08 --> 00:57:12: make do a contract with the company to tiring to
00:57:12 --> 00:57:16: get employees back and forth on a regular basis.
00:57:16 --> 00:57:20: They might be coming from a particular community like Chester
00:57:20 --> 00:57:22: in that example.
00:57:22 --> 00:57:27: Yes, so I I based based on at least three.
00:57:27 --> 00:57:29: Public like public policy cases.
00:57:29 --> 00:57:32: I didn't see any sort of like partnerships that were
00:57:32 --> 00:57:35: sort of like private partnerships that,

00:57:35 --> 00:57:37: in terms of like specific transportation,
00:57:37 --> 00:57:41: Brandon, do you have something that in that area?
00:57:41 --> 00:57:43: Yeah, so when we talked to John Grady,
00:57:43 --> 00:57:46: who is the former executive director of PIDC and he
00:57:46 --> 00:57:49: spent a lot of this time working on the Navy
00:57:49 --> 00:57:51: Yard kind of redevelopment and expansion?
00:57:51 --> 00:57:54: And they put a lot of time and money into
00:57:54 --> 00:57:58: figuring out which you know which residents in which towns
00:57:58 --> 00:58:00: in the suburbs that they could.
00:58:00 --> 00:58:02: Find new job sectors from an.
00:58:02 --> 00:58:05: They were running buses between the end of the Broad
00:58:05 --> 00:58:09: Street line in South Philadelphia about it's about 2 miles
00:58:09 --> 00:58:12: from there to the Navy Yard and so they're working
00:58:12 --> 00:58:16: on like private shuttle systems to get people from the
00:58:16 --> 00:58:19: Broad Street line to the Navy Yard and offering some
00:58:19 --> 00:58:23: of those incentives and running bus systems even up through
00:58:23 --> 00:58:27: like the blue route into some of those suburban areas
00:58:27 --> 00:58:30: to bring people in jobs down there and also to
00:58:30 --> 00:58:31: incentivize companies to.
00:58:31 --> 00:58:35: Moving to the Navy Yard by showing that they had
00:58:35 --> 00:58:37: the ability to bus in new workers,
00:58:37 --> 00:58:40: so I think that's one of the more clear examples
00:58:40 --> 00:58:42: of kind of a private company.
00:58:42 --> 00:58:46: Or I mean it's really a public private partnership,
00:58:46 --> 00:58:51: but working to bus people in directly from available transit
00:58:51 --> 00:58:52: to new areas.
00:58:52 --> 00:58:55: Great and I think Greg and the DVR PC folks
00:58:55 --> 00:58:56: want to weigh in on this one.
00:58:56 --> 00:58:59: Go ahead, yeah I was just going to say really,
00:58:59 --> 00:59:02: really quickly. It's it's a geometry problem,
00:59:02 --> 00:59:04: so whether it's public or private,
00:59:04 --> 00:59:07: you know to to serve these trips.
00:59:07 --> 00:59:08: It usually costs $20 a ride,
00:59:08 --> 00:59:12: $30 a ride to get people to those dispersed employment
00:59:12 --> 00:59:16: locations from connecting transit service or from from the city.
00:59:16 --> 00:59:19: And so it's it's it's it's in the long run.
00:59:19 --> 00:59:22: It's always going to be a losing proposition to try
00:59:22 --> 00:59:22: to chase.
00:59:22 --> 00:59:26: Job development with Tran dispersed job development with transit.
00:59:26 --> 00:59:29: Just can't provide cost efficient service.
00:59:29 --> 00:59:31: So even when the service is private,

00:59:31 --> 00:59:35: it's at heavy public subsidy and sustainability is pretty questionable
00:59:35 --> 00:59:37: and I'm sorry if you hear background noise.
00:59:37 --> 00:59:40: I have a toddler that seems to have escaped containment.
00:59:43 --> 00:59:45: No problem, well, this is really fascinating.
00:59:45 --> 00:59:47: I think we could go on for a long time,
00:59:47 --> 00:59:49: but I want to keep us on track.
00:59:49 --> 00:59:50: We're a few minutes over,
00:59:50 --> 00:59:53: but if everyones OK, still hanging out for just a
00:59:53 --> 00:59:54: moment.
00:59:54 --> 00:59:57: I love Shawna to ask her question to the group
00:59:57 --> 00:59:58: as we close so go ahead.
00:59:58 --> 01:00:01: Yeah, thanks so I put in the chat that you
01:00:01 --> 01:00:05: guys did a fantastic job at proposing things for us.
01:00:05 --> 01:00:08: But I also think a lot of the things that
01:00:08 --> 01:00:12: you proposed could be used by planners in general and
01:00:12 --> 01:00:16: also particularly this group were in such an important time
01:00:16 --> 01:00:19: for restorative justice to be more of the focus.
01:00:19 --> 01:00:24: Advocates and grassroots have been asking for this for decades
01:00:24 --> 01:00:28: so I would love for the professional class to take
01:00:28 --> 01:00:30: advantage of this moment.
01:00:30 --> 01:00:33: So do you students have anything that you would really
01:00:33 --> 01:00:35: want to pass on to this group right now to
01:00:35 --> 01:00:37: take up as their mantle?
01:00:41 --> 01:00:42: One piece and I'll just go quick.
01:00:42 --> 01:00:45: One piece that we mentioned with the Vine Street is
01:00:45 --> 01:00:49: just reaching out to these community groups at the very
01:00:49 --> 01:00:52: beginning before you even create the the first set of
01:00:52 --> 01:00:55: plans. 'cause otherwise you're putting people on their heels and
01:00:55 --> 01:00:57: making them very defensive.
01:00:57 --> 01:00:59: So if you approach him and say hey look where
01:00:59 --> 01:01:02: you know we're hoping to do this new project,
01:01:02 --> 01:01:06: that's going to involve your community or cut their community.
01:01:06 --> 01:01:08: Can we identify key locations that you may?
01:01:08 --> 01:01:11: That should be protective and you know areas for.
01:01:11 --> 01:01:15: Possible expansion or new growth and having that conversation before
01:01:16 --> 01:01:16: you say hey,
01:01:16 --> 01:01:20: there's a highway coming through and you're we're going to
01:01:20 --> 01:01:22: take your church in school.

01:01:22 --> 01:01:26: So having those conversations before the plans and blueprints are
01:01:26 --> 01:01:29: made would be one thing that I think everyone in
01:01:29 --> 01:01:32: this land use and planning world can really look at
01:01:32 --> 01:01:35: going forward.
01:01:35 --> 01:01:36: That was the exact point I was going to make,
01:01:36 --> 01:01:38: so.
01:01:38 --> 01:01:41: Yeah, something something that I always try to that I've
01:01:41 --> 01:01:42: been thinking about.
01:01:42 --> 01:01:46: Actually, as I've been reading more about equity and planning
01:01:46 --> 01:01:48: is just project prioritization.
01:01:48 --> 01:01:50: And that's sort of the one place where we can
01:01:50 --> 01:01:53: start in sort of overcome the constraints and what we
01:01:53 --> 01:01:56: choose to end like is just by choosing and what
01:01:56 --> 01:01:59: we choose to do an in the projects that we
01:01:59 --> 01:02:00: actually choose to engage in.
01:02:00 --> 01:02:03: So I think that's a good place to start and
01:02:03 --> 01:02:07: really understanding our constraints and what's feasible and what's not,
01:02:07 --> 01:02:09: and what we prioritize this.
01:02:09 --> 01:02:12: Cleaners and then the other thing I think is really
01:02:12 --> 01:02:17: important is basing our plans around actionable goals and actionable
01:02:17 --> 01:02:20: outcomes so that we can see the we can actually
01:02:20 --> 01:02:23: put our metrics of equity to to the actions and
01:02:23 --> 01:02:27: outcomes that we're creating and see you know the shortcomings
01:02:27 --> 01:02:31: of what we have achieved and we haven't achieved.
01:02:31 --> 01:02:34: And I think by sort of prioritizing the most equitable
01:02:34 --> 01:02:38: goal of what is feasible for us and then having
01:02:38 --> 01:02:41: sort of actionable outcomes to observe those.
01:02:41 --> 01:02:44: To observe those projects, I think is a good platform
01:02:44 --> 01:02:48: to really understand our limitations in the feasibility of our
01:02:48 --> 01:02:51: projects in ways that we can improve and ameliorate them
01:02:51 --> 01:02:54: in future circumstances well. Or if I if I can
01:02:54 --> 01:02:54: just.
01:02:54 --> 01:02:56: I mean I think to to creams point,
01:02:56 --> 01:03:00: you know, picking the right project at the right location
01:03:00 --> 01:03:03: is absolutely the first first step to trying to get
01:03:03 --> 01:03:03: things right,
01:03:03 --> 01:03:06: but I think a lot of these lessons also showed
01:03:06 --> 01:03:09: that it's more expensive to try to fix things later

01:03:09 --> 01:03:11: than than to design them,
01:03:11 --> 01:03:15: right? Front, but also have to acknowledge that sometimes really
01:03:15 --> 01:03:18: doing things right up front is a lot more expensive,
01:03:18 --> 01:03:21: unfortunately, so at this time is we're also looking for
01:03:21 --> 01:03:25: funding for transportation at the federal level at the state
01:03:25 --> 01:03:25: level,
01:03:25 --> 01:03:29: it's an opportunity really to invest and and do those
01:03:29 --> 01:03:31: right projects in the right way at the right.
01:03:31 --> 01:03:35: The right location. So hope everybody can continue to support
01:03:35 --> 01:03:39: opportunities for investment because I think they can really be.
01:03:39 --> 01:03:42: We have a time now when some of those investments.
01:03:42 --> 01:03:45: Really be transformative. And we're all anxious to see those
01:03:45 --> 01:03:46: happen.
01:03:46 --> 01:03:47: So thank thanks to the student team.
01:03:47 --> 01:03:51: They they really appreciate their insights.
01:03:51 --> 01:03:53: Wonderful thank you so much.
01:03:53 --> 01:03:55: I will wrap us just because it's 1035,
01:03:55 --> 01:03:57: but absolutely is very sad.
01:03:57 --> 01:04:00: This is such an important time for so many reasons
01:04:00 --> 01:04:04: for this work and this information and hopefully we'll see
01:04:04 --> 01:04:07: investments in our region and a CAP on the Vine
01:04:07 --> 01:04:11: Street Expressway and a lot of the recommendations here implemented.
01:04:11 --> 01:04:14: So thank you all so much for listening to DVR,
01:04:14 --> 01:04:17: PC and the students for your amazing work.
01:04:17 --> 01:04:19: And I also need to thank.
01:04:19 --> 01:04:21: They're not here but you allies.
01:04:21 --> 01:04:25: National Curtis Infrastructure Grant supported a part of this work
01:04:25 --> 01:04:27: and some of the aspects where we pulled in some
01:04:28 --> 01:04:29: of the you have a lie advisors,
01:04:29 --> 01:04:31: so hopefully that was valuable.
01:04:31 --> 01:04:34: Will also be featured. A summary of this in some
01:04:34 --> 01:04:36: of the content that you will I put out when
01:04:36 --> 01:04:40: all of these various projects in nine different cities are
01:04:40 --> 01:04:42: completed so will please keep an eye out for that
01:04:42 --> 01:04:45: and hopefully we can continue to push some of these
01:04:45 --> 01:04:49: concepts that are broadly nationally applicable and also talk about
01:04:49 --> 01:04:52: the work that we're doing in Philadelphia.
01:04:52 --> 01:04:54: On the national stage, so thank you again.

01:04:54 --> 01:04:57: Hope to see you soon want to highlight a couple
01:04:57 --> 01:04:59: of upcoming ULI events.
01:04:59 --> 01:05:01: The June 10th one kind of relevant here.
01:05:01 --> 01:05:05: This is actually you'll I normally that's in North Carolina.
01:05:05 --> 01:05:09: I think it's triangle is putting together this gridlock by
01:05:09 --> 01:05:11: connecting development and transportation.
01:05:11 --> 01:05:14: Sorry about my phone demand management,
01:05:14 --> 01:05:17: that's virtual, so open to all folks and here on
01:05:17 --> 01:05:19: June 16th is are you alive?
01:05:19 --> 01:05:21: Philadelphia Virtual Awards for excellence.
01:05:21 --> 01:05:24: Encourage folks to join we have.
01:05:24 --> 01:05:26: An interesting I think I saw Ken on this call
01:05:26 --> 01:05:28: from SEPTA Hollywood speaker,
01:05:28 --> 01:05:31: the creator of the Wework series does is going to
01:05:31 --> 01:05:34: do a fireside chat with Ken Starr from our team
01:05:34 --> 01:05:35: here,
01:05:35 --> 01:05:38: which is really interesting. Hearing his story is like a
01:05:38 --> 01:05:42: total non real estate person learning about that that work
01:05:42 --> 01:05:44: in those founders there and then.
01:05:44 --> 01:05:47: Of course we'll announce our winners of the UI for
01:05:47 --> 01:05:49: Excellence program,
01:05:49 --> 01:05:51: so I want to take just a minute also to
01:05:51 --> 01:05:52: talk about.
01:05:52 --> 01:05:55: I think we have folks that are new and of
01:05:55 --> 01:05:55: course.
01:05:55 --> 01:05:59: Amazing students who we hope you stay in Philadelphia in
01:05:59 --> 01:05:59: the field.
01:05:59 --> 01:06:02: We are wrapping up our UI engagement campaign.
01:06:02 --> 01:06:05: This is the opportunity to learn about a lot of
01:06:05 --> 01:06:06: the work that Alan mentioned.
01:06:06 --> 01:06:10: An R20 almost 20 volunteer opportunities within our organization.
01:06:10 --> 01:06:13: So please if you're interested in getting more involved,
01:06:13 --> 01:06:16: go to our website. You can reach out to any
01:06:16 --> 01:06:18: of our team here on this call or myself or
01:06:18 --> 01:06:21: many of the DVR PC folks who are actively involved.
01:06:21 --> 01:06:24: It's we over the summer we always sort of regroup
01:06:24 --> 01:06:26: and as Alan mentioned at the beginning.
01:06:26 --> 01:06:29: Everything that we do is driven by our Members.
01:06:29 --> 01:06:32: This idea came from a kind of casual conversation that
01:06:32 --> 01:06:33: we had with crag from DVR,
01:06:33 --> 01:06:34: PC at one of our meetings.

01:06:34 --> 01:06:37: So really our Members drive the content and and we
01:06:37 --> 01:06:39: hope to continue work like this going forward.
01:06:39 --> 01:06:42: So please check it out and then finally we would
01:06:42 --> 01:06:43: love your feedback.
01:06:43 --> 01:06:45: Kevin is going to send a link to a survey
01:06:45 --> 01:06:48: we really value hearing from people and this was a
01:06:48 --> 01:06:49: really different format.
01:06:49 --> 01:06:51: So if you could take a few minutes to fill
01:06:51 --> 01:06:53: that out and let us know what you think of
01:06:53 --> 01:06:56: our programming and then I will make a final plug
01:06:56 --> 01:06:57: that I don't usually say.
01:06:57 --> 01:07:00: But to this group. We actually have an open job
01:07:00 --> 01:07:04: at ULI Philadelphia on our team for an associate position,
01:07:04 --> 01:07:06: which is an entry level role with the tons of
01:07:07 --> 01:07:09: opportunity for growth were really small team.
01:07:09 --> 01:07:13: We are not requiring real estate are planning experience so
01:07:13 --> 01:07:17: feel free to spread the word about that opportunity and
01:07:17 --> 01:07:20: I'm happy to answer any questions but it's all on
01:07:20 --> 01:07:23: our website as well. So with that I'll just thank
01:07:23 --> 01:07:26: everyone from again for the work for being here.
01:07:26 --> 01:07:29: Keep an eye out. We'll share all of the summarize
01:07:29 --> 01:07:30: findings as we.
01:07:30 --> 01:07:33: Make them public and I have a feeling we'll be
01:07:33 --> 01:07:36: continuing a lot of these conversations going into next year.
01:07:36 --> 01:07:39: So thank you again. Everyone please stay safe.
01:07:39 --> 01:07:42: Take care.
01:07:42 --> 01:07:44: Hope to see you in person soon.

This video transcript has been machine-generated, so it may not be accurate. It is for personal use only. Reproduction or use without written permission is prohibited. If you have a correction or for permission inquiries, please contact .